

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Cameron Colebatch	general					<p>The documents are good summaries, but what are the implications of the documents? What are the authors seeking policy makers to do with them?</p> <p>Suggest that (at the least) a dot point summary of the 'Recommendations and policy options' be provided at the beginning of each chapter to make this more prominent. If appropriate, it may also be worth preparing a 'summary for policy makers' (SPM) for each document as well.</p>	<p>Thank you for the suggestion. An Executive Summary has been added to the chapter during the revision, and a separate SPM has been made.</p>
LI Qingfeng	General					<p>1, The Report in overall is too academia, too detailed in scientific exploration and descriptions. In consideration of the principal aim "to facilitate the implementation of the National ... and the "Inter-governmental" nature of the organization, the Report has to be more "publicly explicit", rather than "scientifically complicated". If the Report is to be read by the policy makers, and to draw attentions from the public, the content is to be simplified and the volume greatly reduced, one third is more than enough.</p>	<p>Thank you. The summary for policymakers may be a more widely accessible document.</p>
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	General					<p>In some tropical countries in Asia the area designated to sustainable forestry ("forest reserves") exceeds the area under protection. Thus, the implementation of sustainable forest management systems in natural forests by applying FSC standards is essential for effective biodiversity conservation. In reference to conservation of nature it is of particular importance that these forest reserves are at least partly located in lowland areas where otherwise land has been already converted at large extent. The current assessment does not elaborate on this issue. Maybe you could include it in your further work.</p>	<p>Thank you. This is addressed in part in chapter 3 under protected area coverage and future trends and in chapter 6 under governance systems and policy options.</p>
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB & Uta von Witsch	General					<p>Other knowledge-forms such as indigenous and local knowledge are well included throughout the assessment. Maybe you could additionally include a specific sub-section (e.g. in chapter 1) on the current status and use of indigenous and lokal knowledge in the Asia Pacific region (e.g. to what extent does it contribute to the academic knowledge base?; perhaps include some case studies, if available).</p>	<p>Thank you for the suggestion. It is very difficult to have this regional overview due to lack of literature by nature of indigenous and local knowledge.</p>
Stefan Hotes	General					<p>The way the IPBES conceptual framework is referenced in the text should be more stringent, and the IPBES guide on Assessments as well as the other IPBES deliverables including guides should be integrated more clearly. In electronic versions of the assessment, hyperlinks to these resources could be included.</p>	<p>Thank you. The formatting has been corrected accordingly.</p>
Thomas Brooks (IUCN)	General					<p>Congratulations to the authors for all their hard work in producing this FOD.</p>	<p>Thank you</p>
Uta von Witsch	General					<p>Please provide a degree of confidence for the main findings throughout the assessment as laid down in the 'Guide on the production and integration of assessments from and across all scales (IPBES deliverable 2a)' (see IPBES/4/INF/9, p. 60, Figure 4.1).</p>	<p>This has been included in the Executive Summary as per the common practice across assessments.</p>
Uta von Witsch	General					<p>A list of abbreviations and a glossary should be included for the whole assessment.</p>	<p>This has been done.</p>
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	General					<p>We highly appreciate the case studies provided and the regional examples chosen for the assessment. They loosen up the text, and make it more colorful and better comprehensible. Please ensure, though, that they are distributed evenly between all sub-regions throughout the assessment in order to better reflect the different sub-regions and their expertise. Some sub-regions (and/ or countries) seem a little under-represented at this stage. This especially holds true for the West Asian sub-region as well as some tropical countries with a particular high biodiversity such as the Philippines, Papua-New Guinea and countries in the subtropical and temperate zone of the Asia Pacific region like Iran and Mongolia.</p>	<p>Thank you. We have hopefully improved this in the revisions, but acknowledge the difficulty in ensuring even representation of all subregions due to lack of data or expert knowledge.</p>

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB & Stefan Hotes	General					Congratulations and thanks to all who contributed to this first draft version which can serve as a valuable baseline study. Aspects such as SDGs and the Aichi targets, which are of importance also for the global assessment, are explicitly addressed. We therefore believe that this reg. assessment will also be highly useful for the global assessment. Furthermore, the text is well balanced (not biased) and not policy prescriptive (indications are made in the comments below should this not be the case). These aspects are very much welcomed.	Thank you.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					An <u>executive summary</u> at the beginning of the assessment as well as short abstracts/ introductions at the beginning of each chapter would be welcomed. This would, to our opinion, improve the readability of the assessment and also the harmonization between chapters (see also next comment on this aspect). The same applies to the conclusions (especially the key findings and the policy options) which - where already included in the assessment - are very helpful and highly appreciated. Furthermore, it would be welcomed if all main findings within the abovementioned sections could be linked explicitly to the different respective sections of the assessment which they are referring to.	An Executive Summary has been added to the chapter following the common format across assessments.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					It might be a good idea for the different chapter-teams to interact more closely. This could help to harmonize the chapters, to keep up the common thread, and to avoid redundancies and unnecessary repetitions.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					All regional assessments should follow the same definitions and (e.g.) classifications of ecosystem services. These aspects are important for the comparability of the results, especially since they all provide input for the IPBES global assessment (see also next comment on this aspect). Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. Furthermore, sections on classifications and terminology of biomes and ecosystems should make better use of the more stringent ones already compiled for applied purposes e.g. in the case of wetlands (Ramsar Convention).	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this through the internal review of drafts and sharing across assessments

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					Sections addressing general aspects that are of (the same) importance to all reg. assessments - like e.g. "What is a value system" (section 2.2.1, p. 11, lines 425-436), "The concept of living in harmony with nature ..." (section 2.2.1.2, p. 11, lines 438-459) and "Factors affecting the change in value systems" (section 2.2.2.1, p. 13, line 557 to p. 15, line 628) - should be identical for all reg. assessments. This will ensure a common basis and is important for the comparability of the results. Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. These general (and global) sections could furthermore be kept as short as necessary for their understanding within the reg. assessment. They seem a little over-emphasized at this stage. All in all, the assessment might focus more on the Asia-Pacific region.	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this during the internal reviews, and also by incorporating into chapter 1 some introductory text which was standardised across all regional assessments.
Wang Changyong	General					Suggestion: discuss how to further collect data and information from most of Asia pacific countries. For instance, increasing contributing authors, using questionnaire to collect key data (eg status and trend) at national level	Thank you for the suggestion.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	0				Overall length of the Chapter appears too large compared with other Chapters. If not there, all socio-economic data sets should be sourced from single source (as per IBPES guideline). A clear statement should be made in regard to use 'Grey Literature' (unpublished and non-peer reviewed articles for example).	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Paromita Ghosh	Chapter 2	0				The Indian part has been represented only by the Indian Himalayan region. There are other distinct hill region like eastern and western Ghats, Deccan plataue, coastal region and sunderban delta which are extremely rich in biodiversity and have distinct culture and traditional conservation measure are followed there which needs proper representation in the report in order to give a holistic picture.	Thank you. We have prioritised improvement of balance across subregions.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	0				This chapter is quite interesting and provides a very insightful perspetie on nature's benefits and their impacts on a good quality of life in the region. More data is needed to support the assessment of the different services and maybe the different components of a good quality of life. Some reordering of sections might be needed to ensure consistency within and across sections	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	0				This chapter is weakest on nature's benefits to people, which is supposed to be the core, and strongest on prescriptions for improvement, which should be in Chapter 6. Chapters need to stay within scope.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by reducing overlap with chapter 6.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	0				Several sections are strongly biased to the authors' own countries and a lot of the region, including most of Oceania, is largely omitted. West Asia is more than Jordan!	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	0				While there are some excellent ideas here (particularly the strong focus on non-economic values) that I hope spill over into other regional assessments, as it stands this chapter is suffering from a serious lack of focus. Perhaps most seriously, the writing is often far too complex for a non-expert to understand with concepts and terms included without any explanation as to their meaning and little elaboration of the statistics quoted. I have highlighted some of these instances in my review but will not have caught them all. From an economic benefits perspective (which is my expertise so you'll have to forgive my emphasis on it in my comments), I find the content here to be quite thin: the concept of natural capital isn't introduced and the few case studies on the economic benefits of ecosystem services from natural capital are not specific enough as to what services they provide. From my own work on the pollination assessment there are a number of studies that can be included here but the assessment seems very heavily weighted to natural capital rather than specific benefits. There are also some serious misunderstandings of the differences between benefits and values (this was a serious issue in the draft phases of the pollination assessment) and, most critically, between natural capital and ecosystem goods and services (often when the authors say the latter they clearly mean the former). The links between the discussion on value system and the reviews on benefits are also quite vague and should be strengthened to give the chapter a better flow (as it stands you're not introducing the actual benefits of ecosystem services until 18 pages in). A review of the chapter's structure would help the authors address these issues more easily and I would encourage the co-ordinators to make this this highest priority.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	2	52	2	54	Include supporting services	Thank you. The text has been revised in line with guidance from IPBES.
Stefan Hotes	Chapter 2	4	111	5	170	The executive summary currently does not reflect all of the key issues dealt with in this chapter. In particular, the long tradition of reflecting on the relationship between humans and their environment in the Asia Pacific region which is discussed in section 2.2 (p. 11, line 423ff) is not mentioned. Furthermore, it is stated in the executive summary that "... it is only recently that evidence on the interlinkages between ecosystem services and human welfare has surfaced in the region" (p. 5, line 165f). This statement contradicts the findings listed in section 2.2 on the various world views, philosophical and religious approaches that have also been reflected in traditional land management and governance schemes. Please revise.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	4	116	4	117	While food and water security are important, energy security which appears an important factor in contributing to good quality of life. This sections largely misses addressing the energy needs and its link with human live development - espically in the context of energy access (also linking with SDG on energy). While Euroepan region and some sub-region in Asia may be assessed with sustainable energy access, energy access should be assessed in other regional assessment. A good reference will be work from IPCC AR5 WG3 'Energy Access in Chapter 14'.	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	4	117	4	117	Include energy, food and water security	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	4	121	4	121	Include energy, food and water security	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	4	121	4	124	There should be a detailed explanation of value systems	Thank you. The text has been revised taking this into account.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	4	127	4	127	Remove "and nature's gifts"	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	4	133	4	137	Security is considered to have been achieved when a nation or an individual is capable of utilizing enironmental resources sustainable to support and enhance their well-being. The idea of 'security' in this paragraph is however not what holders of TK/ILK consider when reflecting on their knowledge. That is, knowledge and security are not interchangeable.	Thank you. The text has been revised taking this into account.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	4	143	4	144	The Asia-Pacific region, having experienced tremendous progress in economic and human development - a very strong statement without any reference. This concluding remarks should include sufficient references.	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	4	157	4	158	This sentence does not qualify for regional or global scale, requires appropriate qualifier	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	4	158	4	158	Substitute "corporate" with "customary"	Thank you. The text has been revised accordingly.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	5	168	5	168	This contradicts with previous argument on economic growth	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	5	174	5	200	This is a good statement of intent but it is not fully reflected in the contents.	Thank you. The text has been updated.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	5	177	5	184	This section doesn't really introduce the actual idea of ecosystem service benefits. This is also a very listy paragraph. It's not incorrect but those who are unfamiliar with many of these terms will find it confusing. I would suggest simplifying this and introducing the terms used here gradually over the chapter	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	5	191	5	193	Again this sentence will mean very little to those not already familiar with the terms used. It's also not correct to say supporting, regulating and cultural perspectives as these are different categories of ecosystem services rather than perspectives on benefits.	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Dr. Santosh Kumar Mishra	Chapter 2	5	201	5	202	<p>Before start of 2.1.1 Regional social and cultural characteristics (page 5, line 203), add the following text:</p> <p><b>2.2 Conceptual framework of quality of life:</b>  Quality of life (QOL) is important to everyone. It is a broad multidimensional concept that usually includes subjective evaluations of both positive and negative aspects of life. What makes it challenging to measure is that, although the term “quality of life” has meaning for nearly everyone and every academic discipline, individuals and groups can define it differently (<a href="http://www.cdc.gov/hrqol/concept.htm">http://www.cdc.gov/hrqol/concept.htm</a>, accessed on June 11, 2016).  QOL is the general well-being of individuals and societies, outlining negative and positive features of life. It observes life satisfaction, including everything from physical health, family, education, employment, wealth, religious beliefs, finance and the environment. QOL has a wide range of contexts, including the fields of international development, healthcare, politics and employment. It is important not to mix up the concept of QOL with a more recent growing area of health related QOL (HRQOL). When we look at HRQOL we in effect look at QOL and its relationship with health.  Standard indicators of the quality of life include not only wealth and employment but also the built environment, physical and mental health, education, recreation and leisure time, and social belonging. While QOL has long been an explicit or implicit policy goal, adequate definition and measurement have been elusive. Diverse ‘objective’ and ‘subjective’ indicators across a range of disciplines and scales, and recent work on subjective well-being (SWB) surveys and the psychology of happiness have spurred renewed interest (<a href="https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Quality_of_life">https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Quality_of_life</a>, accessed on June 11, 2016).  One approach, called engaged theory posits four domains in assessing quality of life: ecology, economics, politics and culture. In the domain of culture, for example, it includes the following sub-domains of quality of life:  a) Identity and engagement,  b) Creativity and recreation,  c) Memory and projection,  d) Belief and ideas,  e) Gender and generations,  f) Enquiry and learning, and  g) Wellbeing and health.</p> <p><b>Annotations:</b> Since Chapter 2 deals with nature’s benefits to people and quality of life, it would be relevant to give brief description of the term quality of life (QOL). It will enable the readers/users of this chapter to understand the importance of studying various measures/indicators of QOL in the context of Asia Pacific region.</p>	Thank you. The concept has been woven into the updated framework of nature's contributions to people and thus the text has been revised accordingly in summarised form.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 2	5	203	11	421	Less important, move to a later-on place (after the section “Nature’s Benefit to people”),and simplified, not to surpass the main theme.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	5	203	11	421	This section is quite relevant for framing this chapter, in particular for understanding the pressures on the supply nature's benefits, the demand for these benefits, and their links with a good quality of life. Yet I wonder if this should be included here or in the introductory chapter of the assessment	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	5	203	11	421	Sections 2.1.1 to 2.1.6 contain very general information about the region. Therefore, please think about moving these sections to chapter 1.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	6	213	6	217	There needs to be an explanation of why ecotourism has been singled out as a sector here.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	6	213	6	217	The tourism para is out of place here	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	6	213	6	217	While importance of migrant (tourism) population is important in analysing the regional population aspects, there needs further analysis to understand the impact of incoming population, e.g. comparison with other regions, percentage against the local population, historical tourism population growth rate, out-going tourists population.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	6	219	7	250	Data on historical share of urban population against total population would help further understanding the impact of urbanization. Population migration/concentration to coastal regions would also be important in understanding BES impact to population.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	7	240	7	245	Lifted out of poverty is the typical claim made by advocates of contemporary macro-economic structures yet there exist both urban and rural poor. It needs to be stated that such a contradiction exists in the perception of the international agencies. Understanding why it does is one of the planned outcomes of this IPBES report.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	7	255	7	255	As this is a UN project I would suggest that the authors use the UN sub-regional classifications. This better fits the policy remit and will save you having to list all the countries in each sub-region.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	7	275	8	283	While diversity of religion is an interesting topic, this analysis here does not provide any implications to BES. This goes to religion analysis for all sub-regions.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	8	285	8	291	Diversity of language in the Pacific is definitely a unique feature of this sub-region. Shall make reference to possible link between biological and language diversity.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	8	296	8	298	But Aboriginal people control or have access to much more of Australia's landscape. This should be stated. Nevertheless Aboriginal people still have poorer health, education etc.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	8	308	11	421	While this section is on 'key social and cultural characteristics' there are almost only reference to population and GDP, except for the Oceania sub-region. While this is a summary section, a more thorough analysis is expected, highlighting the specific 'social and cultural characteristics' that has impact to BES in each sub-region (E.g. economic center for Northeast, population density and religious diversity (and possibly tension) in South, ethnic/cultural diversity in Southwest.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	8	314	8	316	I think it would be good to include and recognize 'many other languages and dialects' by diverse indigenous minority groups in this Region. Realizing the indigenous minority groups would be important given their role contributing to preserving Nature and many forest, upper watershed landscapes in which those spaces they have long resided and managing the natural resources through years of experiences, uses, practices and customary rules.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	8	321	8	322	Not sure why reference to "high tech industry jobs" here. What is the significance to BES?	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	9	331	9	332	Significance of economy in this sub-region is not the (potentially) temporary slow down of economic growth in 2014, but the aggressive growth in the past decade or so and more importantly the expected growth in the next few decades.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	9	343	9	343	Remove "Republic of China ( Taiwan)", since it is not a country.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Tian Yu	Chapter 2	9	343	9	343	Taiwan is part of China (a province of China), so "Republic of China ( Taiwan)" should be deleted.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 2	9	343			Delete the "Republic of Chian", to follow the UN usage	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	9	347	9	347	It would make the report much readable if these sub-regional summaries were structured in a standard order/contents. Here it talks about indigenous peoples right from the start where as, for instance, IP is referred to at the very end in South East Asia sub-region. Additionally, urbanization, especially in China must have significant impact on BES which is not referred here.	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	9	348	4	348	56 ethnic groups	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Tian Yu	Chapter 2	9	350	9	350	"the total populationPeople's Republic of China" should be "the total population of People's Republic of China".	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	9	352	9	352	Please quote example of "Dai Ethnic in Xishuangbanna, Yunnan"	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	9	370	9	370	Mention "One belt One road' or Silk Road	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	11	419	11	419	People are not units of US dollars. Or are they?	Thank you. The text has been merged into chapter 1
Paromita Ghosh	Chapter 2	11	423	16	687	It is a suggestion/way forward that recommendation be made to introduce exercises in school curriculum world over that will inculcate in children the concept of living in harmony with nature. Some of the region specific traditional values like national pride, respect for authorities and obedience be blended with secular-rational values while preparing such curricula.	Thank you for the suggestion. It has been difficult to accommodate this without literature based evidence.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 2	11	423	18	761	P11-18 L423-761 Section 2.2 This section is not necessary for this report,. It is suggested to be removed.	We consider this section to be important to cover the scope of the chapter.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	11	425	11	437	On 'What is a value system?' This needs a disclaiming few sentences that explain why descriptions used in this report are not meant to illustrate the diversities seen in how values are held and adhered to. also that 'value' encompasses ethics, morals and norms.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	11	425	11	498	This sections is extremely relevant and useful to put into context the links between values and nature's benefits and a good quality of life	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	11	429	11	429	I suggest to search for stronger consistency with the IPBES conceptual framework and the IPBES values guide. When that is not possible or only partially possible please provide more information for readers to be able to see the connections	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	11	438	11	438	More examples of value systems should be added here.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	11	438	12	498	Need to have a section on the Australian Aboriginal people's spiritual beliefs in 2.2.1.2. It is still extant and is the oldest nature-based culture on earth.	Thank you. The text has been revised to include examples from the subregions.
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	11	438	13	554	Why exactly were the specific examples included in these sections chosen? They are not representative for the whole Asia Pacific region. Please ensure to reflect all diverging views and attitudes on cultural concepts from the region. In this context, you might want to have a look at: "Tomforde, M. (2003): The global in the local: Contested resource-use systems of the Karen and Hmong in Northern Thailand. Journal of Southeast Asian Studies, 34 (2) , 347."	Thank you for the suggestion. We hope we have improved coverage through the revisions.
Stefan Hotes	Chapter 2	11	448	11	452	The discussion of activities at UN level seems to have missed the following contribution: "World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED). 1987. Our common future. Brundtland Report of the World Commission on Environment and Development. United Nations, New York." Although it may not specifically deal with the concept of 'Living in harmony with Nature' as discussed in the assessment, it does address harmony between humans and their environment. You might want to include this contribution in your assessment.	Thank you. This has been incorporated.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	11	449	11	459	This is very long winded, it would be much simpler to say that this has international recognition and give some examples.	Thank you. This has been incorporated.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	11	461	12	498	This is a very interesting section and if possible it would be interesting to expand it to other countries and sub-regions.	Thank you. This has been incorporated.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	12	468	12	473	This section is weak, not providing any specific or strong argument on the Japanese concept of 'harmony with nature' rather than pretty much explaining the word 'shizen kyosei' (which is not necessarily a unique concept but rather a general term?) The term 'shizen' could also be more elaborated (such as on its budhisist origin of 'zinen' meaning something like "stable status due to its intrinsic value" or more simply "intact"? This may be a good section to touch on the 'satoyama' or the socio-ecological production landscape/seascape concept.	Thank you. This has been incorporated in a summary.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	12	478	12	478	What are these?	These are the names of the scriptures. Specification added.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	12	483	12	499	While I appreciate the attempt to show the ancient guidance found in Hindu texts, the space given to this is not balanced well enough by what has been mentioned about religious guidance on the nature-human binding in other religions. I think this needs to be corrected.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	12	483	12	499	There are other aspects. 'Shruti' for example is not a text but is a body of knowledge that has been 'heard' and rendered into texts. The animals that are the vehicles of the Hindu gods and goddesses are not merely the closeness of the animal consciousness to ours but represent characteristics and qualities. And so on.	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	12	492	12	498	I think we also need to find out and include the value system that has long been practiced (probably without documentation) of indigenous minority communities; i.e. their belief towards Natural Spirits such as Big tree, Sacred rock, Special mountainous area if that is a source for generating water. In the last meeting in Chiang Mai (ILK for Asia Pacific assessment), I raised this point and the term we often know of is 'Animism'; but if it is too troubling in terms of references/sources of reliability for proof; then we can put this in other words such as Indigenous minority groups' belief system toward Nature. And so the value they appreciate Nature is equivalent to God/Spirit figure. And all their lives and practices and use and management of natural resources have always asked and informed these Natural Spirits.	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	12	499	12	499	Quote "Tagal System in the Borneo"	Thank you. It is used in later section on institutions.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	12	500	12	500	This section is useful and very interesting but I feel it could be shorter as a lot of the information is difficult for non-experts to understand (there's a lot of jargon) and there are a lot of what are essentially case studies to emphasise each point. Some restructuring would make this a lot more concise and reader-friendly.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	12	500	13	554	This section is extremely relevant. Yet, at present it is just a list of evidences available here and there. A more systematic treatment both time wise and geography wise would be extremely relevant.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	12	500	17	697	This section needs to take into account the excellent coverage of this and related topics given in Chapter 2 of Land Degradation which is thorough and offers a very good critique. This section 2.2.2 does not offer the same intellectual rigour.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	12	510	13	524	This is too simplistic. People in Australia and the US and elsewhere consume global natural resources at an unsustainable rate. People might care about the Great Barrier Reef and the adjoining Wet Tropics Rainforests but they will consume palm oil products, beef, soy from the Amazon. Please refer to the reference J.R. McNeill (2000). Something New Under the Sun: An Environmental History of the Twentieth-Century World. Norton for a sobering take on American consumerism and it's impact on nature which would make a lie of this paragraph.	Thank you for the suggestion. We no longer imply this will lead to sustainable choices.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	13	519	13	524	I very much agree that how the general public has changed their views towards how Nature has benefited them given all the factors mentioned. But for indigenous local minority communities specifically, my exposure(s) and observation(s) is that not entire general public including policy arena has appreciated and or giving enough credits towards the worldview as well as practices conducted by indigenous local communities in ways they have managed Nature and our resources. This should be communicated more widely. While we also see on the one hand, the larger part of our general mainstream society still tends to see/value Nature as a separate system, but indigenous minority communities viewing Nature as a part of them and hence much more holistic-bounded than the mainstream.	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	13	527	13	527	Remove "aspects of"	Thank you. This has been revised.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	13	527	13	554	New value of forest should be added to explain what is changed.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	13	557	15	628	This section is extremely relevant and useful and well supported.	Thank you.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	13	557	15	628	On 'Factors affecting change in value systems'. The cultural map of value systems and its accompanying paras are useful insofar as they describe the nature of the changes between individuals, groups, communities and economic paths and nature. But it becomes difficult in this form to find a continuum with what has been written earlier in this chapter. This perhaps needs to be recast to bring out one or no more than two salient shifts in sets of values according to the five sub-regions of the Asia-Pacific region to illustrate the point of this sub-section. The four examples that follow (Japam, Japan and Philippines, two from Australia) are not geographically representative enough.	We have attempted to improve the coverage of examples but it has been difficult to ensure an even subregional coverage due to expertise and source limitations.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	13	559	15	597	While this analysis by WVS on change in value systems is wxtremely example, there is very little analysis in relation to the AP region. Less explanation about WVS and more on regional reference needed.	Thank you we have tried to follow this advice.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	13	565	13	566	Fig 2.2 appears a global presentation, Suggest adopt/modify to present APR only	Figures in the chapter have been extensively revised.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	14	575	14	576	Even after reading the paragraph above this figure is currently very hard to interpret. How are the axes derived? (I presume larger numbers mean more towards self-rational/expression but this isn't clear).	Figures in the chapter have been extensively revised.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	Chapter 2	14	575	14	576	Please provide an explanation for Figure 2.2. You might also want to edit the figure to highlight countries from the Asia Pacific region.	Figures in the chapter have been extensively revised.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	15	602	15	602	What is "residential stability"?	The text has been revised and no longer uses this terminology
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	15	605	15	605	Use "bioindicator"	The text has been revised and no longer uses this terminology
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	15	606	15	606	Again, this sentence assumes that the reader already knows what an EKC is (i.e. how its is calculated and what it represents).	The text has been revised and no longer uses this terminology
Stefan Hotes	Chapter 2	15	627	15	627	An example from the US might not be useful for the Asia Pacific region. You might rather want to include an example from the Asia Pacific region, if available.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	15	630	15	630	More examples of change in value systems in developing countries should be added.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	15	630	17	697	This section is extremely relevant. Yet, it is currently a compilation of study cases. I wonder if the study cases could be presented into boxes with their corresponding details and then a more systematic assessment of the messages emerging from them for the whole region could be included into the main text	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	15	630	17	697	Case studies should supplement synthesis not substitute for it. When there are only case studies the reader has to do the work that the authors are supposed to! Also, there is a risk that the chapter contents will reflect the national origins of the authors rather than the APR as a whole.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	15	630	17	698	It would also be interesting to see, if any, studies on changes in value systems after a large natural disaster such as the earthquake and tsunami in Sumatra, Northeast Japan, Pacifics, for instance, as the region is a natural disaster prone region.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	15	637	17	697	Examples from individual countries may bring example on specific topic for example, value, but this should be kept as limited as possible as the report will not be balanced and the chapter refers regional assessment.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	16	642	16	643	What were the percentages in 1972? How do they compare to 2008?	The text has been revised and no longer refers to these.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	16	644	16	645	This is an interesting analysis as Japan is one of the first country to have saw a steep economic development in modern years. More detailed analysis (per capita income vs. the spiritual value?) would be a good analogy to other parts of the region. More interesting observation could be, how would this change impact BES? Is it valuing nature against conventional economic development (especcially rural parts of Japan?	Thank you for the suggestion. It has been difficult to accommodate this without literature based evidence.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	16	651	16	663	So how does thi s section explain the fact that the Philippines is one of the most degraded landscapes in the region having its timber cleared for Japanese commodities??	This is not an attempt to explain the linkages but only illustrates the divergence.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	16	665	16	687	But Australia has lost more mammals to extinction than any other country. How does any of this explain that fact?	This is not an attempt to explain the linkages but only illustrates the divergence.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	16	665	16	687	This is overly long and filled, again, with terms that most readers will not understand. It also doesn't really fit the the previous two case studies since it's not about a change in value systems and is also very focused on economics concepts that have not yet been introduced or contextualised. I would suggest reworking this to make it more concise and make the point that Tisdell et al and other studies have shown changes and variations in public willingness to pay (taken as a proxy for their valuation, as expressed economically) of different threatened species.	Thank you for the useful suggestion.
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 2	16	686	16	686	<i>These project s</i>	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	16	689	16	689	This also doesn't fit with a change in value systems rather than the value of benefits.	Thank you for the useful suggestion.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	16	689	17	697	Example from State appears not appropriate in the context of the Chapter	Thank you for the useful suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	17	698	17	699	Please include "Ecosystem Services Assessment (ESA) in the Greater Mekong Subregion (GMS) countries by United Nations Environment Programme-International Ecosystem Management Partnership (UNEP-IEMP)"	Thank you for the suggestion.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	17	700	18	748	This subsection appears very short and have limited references. Assessment should be based on a range of references. Fig 2.2 appears not representative in the context of the sub-section.	Thank you. This has been revised.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	17	700	18	748	This section is very interesresting but would need to move away from a theoretical presentation towards the assessment of how some of these issues are particularly relevant to the region and to this assessment	Thank you. This has been revised.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	17	700	18	761	This is also confusing: little of this relates to changes in value systems (e.g. moving from a tradition based one to a utilitarian one) but relates to changes in ecosystem service benefits (which can cross different value systems).	Thank you for the suggestion.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	17	708	17	709	None of the text pertaining to this diagram includes mention of what capital is nor how natural capital produces benefits within different value systems. Indeed this is the first of only two mentions of Natural Capital in this whole review.	Thank you. This has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Dr. Santosh Kumar Mishra	Chapter 2	17	711	17	715	<p>Following information (which appears in the pdf file of Asia Pacific Chapter 2: Nature's benefits to people and quality of life) seems to be grammatically and academically wrong:</p> <p><b>2.2.3.1 Responses to natural systems, are values and responses changing?</b> Widespread recognition of the roles of BES reframes relationship between humans and natural systems. Ongoing research, debates and understanding of these roles, change our value system and the way we respond toward a balance of our assets— natural, financial, individual and social.</p> <p><b>Annotations:</b> According to me, sentence construction is wrong, verb is missing. This leads to meaningless information. There seems to be some missing links. I am unable to correct it, as I do know (a) <i>the exact idea in mind of the person who has authored it</i>, and (b) <i>the source of above information presented in the chapter</i>.</p>	Thank you. This has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	17	717	17	718	"..., understanding and reframing our attitudes is essential to build a sustainable and desirable future for humanity and nature." This part of the sentence seems a little too prescriptive. Please rephrase in a more neutral way.	Thank you. The text has been revised and no longer uses these terms.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	17	753	17	754	After reading the entire section, not fully sure if there were enough analysis/elaboration on what changes in value systems are actually taking place in the region?	Thank you for the suggestion.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	18	734	18	735	For a non-expert this is meaningless. Explain these concepts if you can but I don't think you need to given that the following sentence makes that point.	Thank you. The text has been revised and no longer uses these terms.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	18	741	18	748	I don't know what this text is supposed to convey. The last sentence seems to be the most relevant but it's unclear from this how changes in value systems lead to discovering new benefits or what a "metabolic gap" is.	Thank you. The text has been revised and no longer uses these terms.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	18	744	18	748	We proposed that our Paper conducted by Mr. Whitney et al (together with SPERI colleagues and Indigenous Herbal Healers) for both Lao and Vietnam study-sites and their findings/conclusions may contribute certain good aspects into this Part please.	Thank you. The text has been revised and restructured
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	18	750	18	761	This paragraph needs citations and should be elaborated upon with examples.	Thank you. This has been revised.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	18	753	18	761	The way I observe that the integration of the ASEAN Economic Community (i.e. included of 10 countries in the ASEAN) is now influencing very much changes in our each country value system as well as the whole community of countries, and hence the social-economic and political relationships. I just thought if there is any literature provided, it would be good to analyze this and or view in light with the objective of this Part of analysis.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	18	756	18	758	Millennium Ecosystem Assessment's 'biodiversity-ecosystem services-human well-being' seems to provide more clear link between nature and human well-being?	Thank you for the suggestion.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	18	759	18	761	Perhaps the section needs to start with this premise - talk about history and context from the point of view of establishing policy linked to the SDGs. Overall section 2.2 isn't the critical examination promised. It seems quite selective and doesn't look at the all important historical context at all.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	18	765	33	1314	2.3 is the weakest section and often relies too heavily on case studies. Readers will look to this report for synthesis. The case studies are already in the literature. It is also important not to exclude city dwellers from 'people'.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	18	770	18	770	Please include "... key ecosystems (marine, coastal, terrestrial, <b>and freshwater</b> ) (see also p. 19, line 781). Please include this throughout the chapter and the assessment (see also comment line 14).	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	18	770	18	773	Looking through the text, the authors only actually use the same conceptual framework as Diaz et al and the MEA (which is exactly what they should be using, deviation from this, while possibly valid is likely to put the review at odds with the other regional assessments).	Thank you for the comment.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	19	775	19	778	This is less detailed than the graphic in Diaz et al and is not explained by the text.	Thank you. This has been removed.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	19	777	19	778	In Fig 2.4 presentation of nature assets should be adjusted as this is much greater than ecosystems goods and services. If there no color protocol, IPBES may adopt a color protocol.	Thank you. This has been removed.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	19	780	19	785	The appears methodology description, should be placed in appropriate location or suggest a footnote	Thank you. This has been removed.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	19	787	21	877	The readability of section 2.3.2 (including sub-sections .1 to .3) might be improved by reworking the structur of the text.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	19	790	19	792	The text recognises four categories but supporting services are not listed.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	19	790	19	800	The MEA amd Table 2.1 includes 'supporting services' but these are not all services to people. I recommend removing this category as many subsequent studies have.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	19	792	19	792	Include "Supporting services"	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	19	792	19	792	Add "supporting services". You've only got three categories here.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	19	796	19	796	Substitute "nature's gifts" with "goods and services"	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	19	798	19	800	This is four types of ecosystems and basically covers all ecosystems. While this isn't factually incorrect, it will leave some non-expert readers wondering what other types of ecosystems are not covered so I would suggest saying something along the lines of "we divide ecosystems into four categories [...]".	Thank you. This has been removed.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	19	799	19	799	Four types...	Thank you. This has been removed.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	20	804	20	804	Need description of medical resources, such as Chinese Herbal Medicine.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	20	804	20	804	Use "Provisioning Services"	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	20	804	20	818	More is needed here. What are the temporal trends observed for the different services included here for which information is available? Same question for geographic patterns	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	20	804	20	825	I question the need to have three sub-headings when one will do with the key terms underlined or in bold.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	20	809	20	809	Please include UNEP-IEMP's ESA reports, some key findings in the GMS, Thailand-Pha Taem National Park-Climate Change mitigation China-Nabanhe watershed National Nature Reserve-Ecotourism/Livelihood	Thank you for the suggestion.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	20	812	20	812	Regulating services can also underpin cultural services (e.g. pollination affects the diversity of wildflowers which in turn affects cultural values associated with the landscape).	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	20	820	20	820	More examples of South Asia and North-East Asia should be added.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 2	20	820	22	931	Under 'cultural services' which begins on this page, and under South Asia culture (I address the Hindu/Buddhist/Jaina religions) the sacred groves example is useful but not ubiquitous. A number of plant and tree species that are commonly to be found in the village and in urban localities will be a more recognisable example. The 'tulsi' or holy basil that is part of a Hindu home even in cities, the set of trees (such as peepul, bilva) which have ritual significance or neem, which is a staple of soil and home purification, and medicinal herbs that are used to treat commopn ailments whose use is codified into both ritual observances and customs that may attach to cewrtain dieties, all these are far more common and within recognisable reach of the reader.	Thank you for the insight and suggestion. We have considerably revised and restuctured the text.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 2	20	820	23	998	Section 2.3.2.3 unbalanced paragraphs, too detailed, surpassed the main themes, to be simplified. The case study is not so proper, to be omitted.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	20	820	23	998	Section 2.3.2.3 appears too long in terms of assessment. This section should be reduced and be concise in regards to assessing regional focus.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	20	820	23	998	This section shows one of the dangers of relying on case studies. You cannot mention one religion without mentioned all.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	20	822	20	824	This is the first of three introductions to cultural services (lines 842-848 and 857-859). I would suggest merging these rather than reintroducing the same concept repeatedly.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	20	826	20	826	Please include UNEP-IEMP's ESA reports, some key findings in the GMS, Lao PDR-Ecotourism, historical heritage, recreational	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	20	829	20	829	Include supporting services	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	20	830	20	830	This heading must be an error.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	20	839	20	839	Rephrase, "how ITK helps in preserving regulating or cultural services"	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	20	842	21	877	This section is quite interesting but would need to be much more explicitly linked to the region assessed	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	20	849	20	850	Since this might strengthen the validity of the findings on the under-researched cultural ecosystem services, you might want to include the work done by the German research project LEGATO (Land-use intensity and Ecological Engineering – Assessment Tools for risks and Opportunities in irrigated rice based production systems) on cultural ecosystem services in the Asia Pacific region. E.g.: 'Tekken V, Stoll-Kleemann S, Spangenberg JH, Settele J (in review). Exploring the Role of Cultural Services for the Maintenance of Terraced Rice Cultivation in the Rural Landscape of Ifugao, Philippines. Ecology & Society.' and 'Tekken, V., Spangenberg, J.H., Burkhard, B., Escalada, M, Stoll-Kleemann, S., Dao, T.T., and J. Settele: "Things are different now": a qualitative assessment of farmer perceptions of cultural services of traditional rice landscapes in Vietnam, and the Philippines, submitted to Ecosystem Services.' You might also want to contact Dr. Vera Tekken for further information: vera.tekken@uni-greifswald.de	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter which made it difficult to insert this suggestion.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	20	852	21	855	You haven't introduced the difference between goods and services and benefits (I would recommend doing this early on in the chapter) so this will not be easy for a non-expert to follow.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	21	854	21	904	Missing from the section on ecosystem services is the concept of cultural ecosystem services as enunciated in Comberti et al 2015. Global Environ. Change 34 247--262. Here a case is made for a two way transfer of ecosystem services where Indigenous land management for millennia enhances ecosystem services. Please see Preece, van Oosterzee et al. 2016 Ecosystem Services 154-164 to see how we used this for Cape York Peninsula in Australia.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	21	862	21	864	This quote pertains more the value systems than it does different types of ecosystem services and would be more useful earlier in the chapter.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	21	871	21	874	It's more correct to say that cultural services have primarily been quantified mostly in economic terms. This should also be very slightly expanded to explain how these economic estimates of value are elicited and why they are unlikely to accurately reflect the wider values associated with cultural services (but why they may still have a use). The just briefly mention and describe the methods used to elicit non-monetary values.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	21	879	23	977	This section is very interesting. Yet I wonder if this is the right place for it. Maybe it could be used to expand the previous section on worldviews and values and used as a frame for understanding the trends in a wide range of ecosystem services? Or it could be used to highlight the importance of the different types of services within specific cultural contexts. More structure would be needed to more clearly dissect the key emerging messages for each type of ecosystem services	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	21	901	20	901	Include South East Asian Cultures	Thank you. We have revised accordingly.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	21	903	22	905	I suggest should we add the word 'indigenous' in the "managed by indigenous local communities" as to refer and recognize this practice by ILC please.	Thank you. We have revised accordingly.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	22	926	22	931	You might want to include other forms of managed land-use systems (like rubber, rattan, damar forests) in your analysis. They generally cover a much larger area and host a higher biodiversity than homegardens. For literature review see e.g. Kaya, M. et al. (2002): Agroforestry Systems.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter which made it difficult to insert this suggestion.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	22	933	23	965	Very interesting section on Islam and nature, but very general. Expect to see further analysis as the region has large muslim countries like Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, etc. How is the muslim value impacting the nature in these countries?	Thank you. We have revised extensively to avoid overly focusing on one religion.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	22	948	22	949	"It is well known that one third of the food we eat would not be available without bees." In the summary for policy makers (SPM) of IPBES deliverable 3a (thematic assessment on pollinators, pollination and food production) it is stated that "Pollinator-dependent crops contribute to 35 per cent of global crop production volume." Bees are not the only pollinators. You might want to adjust the sentence accordingly. E.g.: "... would not be available without pollinators, of which bees are part and parcel." Maybe you could also include a reference to the SPM (which would additionally support the relevance of IPBES deliverable 3a): "IPBES (2016): Summary for policymakers of the assessment report of the Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services on pollinators, pollination and food production. S.G. Potts, V. L. Imperatriz-Fonseca, H. T. Ngo, J. C. Biesmeijer, T. D. Breeze, L. V. Dicks, L. A. Garibaldi, R. Hill, J. Settele, A. J. Vanbergen, M. A. Aizen, S. A. Cunningham, C. Eardley, B. M. Freitas, N. Gallai, P. G. Kevan, A. Kovács-Hostyánszki, P. K. Kwapong, J. Li, X. Li, D. J. Martins, G. Nates-Parra, J. S. Pettis, R. Rader, and B. F. Viana (eds.). Publishing Company (to be inserted), City [to be inserted], Country [to be inserted], pp. 1–28."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	23	979	23	979	Rephrase, "Local People-Mediterranea..... in Northern Jordan"	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Dr. Santosh Kumar Mishra	Chapter 2	23	979	23	998	<p>Before start of 2.3.3 Geographical differences in the production and use of ecosystem goods and services (page 23, lines 1000-1001), add the following text/information:  <b>Case Study: Promoting sustainable ecosystem services for human well-being and biodiversity in Asia Pacific Region: contribution of United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)</b>            Asia Pacific has one of most diverse and richest ecosystems in the world. It is also a region of global importance for biodiversity conservation and is home to some of the most diverse plant and animal species in the world. However, extensive coastal development and unsustainable exploitation of marine resources has resulted in the disappearance of nearly half of coral reefs and mangroves over the last 40 years, resulting in declining fish stocks. Illegal trade in wildlife is another challenge in the region, due to high demand for wildlife and wildlife products in East Asia. In Asia Pacific, the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) focuses on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>☐ Supporting the restoration and maintenance of ecosystem services,</li> <li>☐ Strengthening the capacity of countries to integrate an ecosystem management approach into development planning, investments and accounting, and</li> <li>☐ Ensuring that countries are able to utilize ecosystem management tools and helping countries realign their environmental programmes and financing to address ecosystem challenges.</li> </ul> <p>Some of the UNEP's support in the region includes:</p> <p><b>a) East Asian Seas Action Plan:</b> The Action Plan for the Protection and Development of the Marine Environment and Coastal Areas of the East Asian Seas Region, known as the East Asian Seas Action Plan, was stimulated by concerns on the effects and sources of marine pollution and approved in 1981. Today it has nine member countries - Cambodia, Indonesia, Malaysia, the People's Republic of China, Philippines, the Republic of Korea, Singapore, Thailand and Viet Nam. Activities are overseen by the Coordinating Body on the Seas of East Asia (COBSEA). The COBSEA focuses on marine- and land-based pollution, coastal and marine habitat conservation and management and response to coastal disasters. The activities are implemented through four inter-linked strategies: Information management; National capacity building; Strategic and emerging issues; and Regional cooperation.</p> <p><b>b) Global Coral Reef Partnership:</b> The Global Coral Reef Partnership hosted and initiated by UNEP and the Regional Seas Conventions and Action Plans (RSCAP), is the primary vehicle for strengthening implementation of the International Coral Reef Initiative (ICRI). At the global level, tools and policy frameworks are developed and exchange of best practices are supported; at the regional level, adoption of tools and policy frameworks by countries is facilitated through the Regional Seas intergovernmental mechanisms as well as capacity building; and at the national level, uptake and upscaling is promoted through demonstration projects.</p> <p><b>c) Protecting and Conserving Marine Species and Habitats:</b> The Indian Ocean – South-East Asia (IOSEA) Marine Turtle Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) is an intergovernmental agreement that aims to protect, conserve, replenish and recover marine turtles and their habitats in and around the Indian Ocean, working in partnership with relevant actors and organizations. The IOSEA MoU, which now has 35 Signatory States, is a flagship agreement concluded in 2001 under the auspices of the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS). Current activities include the development of a regional network of important sites for marine turtles; working with partner organisations to elucidate and mitigate the impacts of fisheries by-catch; drawing attention to the pervasive problem of illegal take and trade of marine turtles, and providing technical support to member States. The IOSEA Marine Turtle MoU Secretariat is co-located with the UNEP Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific.</p> <p><b>d) Supporting the Implementation of Biodiversity-Related Multilateral Environmental Agreements:</b> The UNEP supports governments in the region in the implementation of biodiversity-related Multilateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs). Current focus includes technical and capacity building support for the implementation of these MEAs at national and regional levels [including support for the revision and implementation of National Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans (NBSAPs)]; implementation of the Nagoya Protocol on Access and Benefit Sharing (ABS); and support to countries to develop and implement Global Environment Facility (GEF)-funded projects that contribute to the implementation of biodiversity-related MEAs.</p> <p><b>e) Combating Illegal Wildlife Trade:</b> There is growing international recognition of the urgency to address illegal wildlife trade, including of timber and other forest products. Wildlife crime, including illegal wildlife trafficking by well-organized criminal networks and non-state armed groups, has become a serious transnational threat to the economy and security of the world, undermining the ability to meet the 2030 Sustainable Development agenda. In response to the United Nations Environment Assembly (UNEA) resolution on "illegal wildlife trade" adopted in June 2014, UNEP supports countries in the region to combat illegal wildlife trade by facilitating collaboration, with specific focus on: 1) promoting policy dialogue and cooperation in illegal wildlife trade; 2) providing technical and capacity building support to strengthen legislation and law and enforcement; and 3) increasing awareness and sensitivity to wildlife crime.</p> <p><b>f) Supporting Regional Global Environment Facility Projects:</b> The UNEP plays a key role in supporting eligible countries in the Asia-Pacific region to develop and execute Global Environment Facility (GEF) funded projects on ecosystem management, biodiversity conservation, access and benefit sharing, sustainable production practices in agriculture and forestry through certification, as well as introducing natural capital accounting and resource economics to countries. A total of 52 GEF supported projects, with a value of US\$530 million with co-funding are undertaken in the region. Most are executed through external partners. Some of the key projects being implemented include:</p> <p><b>g) Forest Certification for Ecosystem Service:</b> The new landmark project ["Forest Certification for Ecosystem Services" (ForCES)] significantly strengthens the business case for</p>	Thank you. We could not use all of this text but have considered in the context of the chapter revision and restructuring.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	23	979	23	998	This case study could be placed in a Box. It's country case example	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter so this is explicit.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	23	1000	23	1001	I would suggest moving this to a later point in the chapter (as it seems to be intended to be a set of case studies to illustrate these overall benefits). There also needs to be more structure to this subsection, including a summary of the contrasts between regions and some discussion on how representative these case studies are likely to be (including the key knowledge gaps).	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
LI Qingfeng	Chapter 2	23	1000	28	1214	Section 2.3.3 It is in doubt that the case studies in this section are widely representative. It is suggested to generally summarize some common sense of the attitudes towards the use of ecosystem, instead of using some separated, uncompleted, and less representative cases.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	23	1000	28	1214	Examples under Section 2.3.3 may not always represent assessment. This section should be re-written> It appears too long and only contain examples rather than assessment (regional and/or sub-regional)	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	23	1000	28	1214	This section does not live up to its title, since it relies on case studies which are each unique and can therefore not be compared.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	23	1000	28	1214	All the case studies themselves here are quite interesting read. However, the section structure needs rethinking to provide context. This should not be a section to exhibit case studies (which each does not necessarily represent the sub-regions) but a sub-regional analysis on ecosystem services provision.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	24	1000	28	1214	More data on the different services would be needed in combination with this set of study cases. Again, moving the study cases to boxes might allow for a synthesis text with key messages to emerge	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	24	1011	24	1047	There have been some exhaustive ES services studies done in Australia for instance for the Murray Darling river system. Also a recent study of Cape York Peninsula which I have cited in another comment above. CSIRO has had recent papers in Nature about Australia that look at biodiversity and difference scenarios. This is state-of-the art material and should be used I think: see <a href="http://www.csiro.au/nationaloutlook/">www.csiro.au/nationaloutlook/</a>	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	24	1016	24	1047	We also proposed that our Paper conducted by Mr. Whitney et al (together with SPERI colleagues and Indigenous Herbal Healers) for both Lao and Vietnam study-sites and their findings/conclusions may also contribute certain good aspects into this Part please.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	24	1025	24	1028	While I appreciate the need to be concise, the authors must state some examples of these products and how these values were arrived at (just a brief accessible overview). I presume these are all provisioning services? State that.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	24	1030	24	1047	Please provide some additional information on the scenarios used in the valuation of Leuser National Park in Sumatra ('conservation', 'deforestation', and 'selective use'). Furthermore, in this section, please differentiate between forest types (e.g. lowland forest vs. montane forest vs. peat swamp forest) which offer different alternative land use options; which, in turn, also imply different carbon emission scenarios (see e.g. "Murdiyarto, D. et al. (2010): Opportunities for reducing greenhouse gas emissions in tropical peatlands. Proceedings of the National Academy of Science, USA, Volume 107, No. 46, 19655-19660").	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	24	1033	24	1047	What services are included in these TEV estimates? How were these values estimated? What are the different scenarios? What does this mean to a non-expert?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	24	1035	24	1035	This is the first time the concept of Total Economic Value has been used and again it will be unclear to a non-expert	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	24	1044	24	1044	Are units per annum?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	24	1048	24	1048	Include "PROECOSERV" project in Ca Mau, Vietnam by UNEP	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	24	1049	24	1049	More examples of cultural services in North-East Asia should be added. Such as traditional agricultural culture in China.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	25	1076	25	1077	Where is this sentence going?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	25	1087	25	1087	Include "umisato" initiative (seascape)	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text incorporating this aspect.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	25	1345	35	1365	Interesting and relevant section. Could concrete temporal or spatial data be provided?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	27	1184	27	1184	No. Australian aboriginal peoples used fire and other management techniques for managing rangelands for 40,000 years. It's the longest continuing culture and still practices managing rangelands. You need to beware the bias toward the northern hemisphere.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	28	1203	28	1203	It would be best to convert to one unit say US\$ for comparison with other case studies.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1203	28	1206	"Additionally, the total indirect..... JD 0.09" (not clear, clarify)	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	28	1216	29	1226	This table comes in quite late into the chapter. Is it possible to say something more specific to the region for each of these services?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	28	1216	33	1314	How this value has been estimated? It appears the section does not provide any assessment, rather simply provide case studies.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	28	1221	30	1225	Table 2.1 includes 'services', such as soil formation, that are not mentioned in the main text.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	28	1221	30	1225	This table needs to be earlier in the chapter and should follow a single (ideally MEA) classification system. Ornamental resources is very debatable (it is essentially a good that provides a cultural service). Also "services provided by shelterbelts" is not a service at all: shelter belts are natural capital that provide an erosion control service. Pollination is almost universally considered a regulating service, not a supporting service (see MEA definitions of supporting services). Nitrogen fixation is included twice: once as a separate service and as an example of mineralization of plant nutrients (which I would argue is correct). Refugia is debatably natural capital rather than a service.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	28	1224	29	table 2.1	In the Cultural services, at Point 17: Spiritual and historic information. We propose that you may want to consider including Ritual ceremonies (which are so important for cultural lives of many indigenous local communities) that are part of the values that community appreciate towards their Nature to credit how Nature has brought benefits to their lives.	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	2. Include resin, gum	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	3. Include resistant genes, bioprospecting	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	5. Include traditional medicine and practice	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	9. Milling transportation. Is the effluent?	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	19. Fruits/Food	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	21. Carbon mitigation	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	28	1224	30	table 2.1	23. Fertile	Thank you. This has been revised to reflect the IPBES updates on nature's contributions to people.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	30	1226	30	1226	Please provide an explanation why there only is one sub-section on Western Asia (and none for the other sub-regions) or include sub-sections for the other sub-regions..	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	30	1226	31	1287	Important section, though its placement in the flow of sections seems a bit odd to me. Would it be possible to find a structure that is more consistent with the values guide?	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	30	1226	31	1308	Assuming there would be analysis on the other sub-regions too on the economic value of nature's benefits?	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1233	30	1234	There is no explanation of that the cost of replacement method is. What was the replacement used?	Thank you. We have revised the text.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1235	30	1235	And throughout: you need to state what year each of these values was taken in. Ideally they should be converted to a single year so as to be comparable throughout.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1236	30	1238	There needs to be an explanation (albeit very concise) as to what the CVM is.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1238	30	1239	How widespread is each forest type in Jordan?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1239	30	1242	How do these values differ between forest types and how are they distributed among the different ecosystem services valued?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1254	30	1257	Again, what services go into this TEV?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	30	1260	30	1260	A box explaining the different valuation methods would be instructive. CVM is just one.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1260	30	1260	Again, what services go into this value?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	30	1266	30	1268	Again, what services go into this value? How many countries does it cover? How was it estimated?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	31	1276	31	1279	Again, what services go into this TEV and how was it calculated?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	31	1279	31	1279	per annum? Need to be clear with units.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	31	1287	31	1287	Total to who? People in the region or nationally or simply visitors?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	31	1291	31	1292	This is demonstrably not the first attempt at this, maybe in Jordan but certainly not globally. The whole case study just seems to be an elaboration on the first paragraph of this section (lines 1236-1242) and could easily be merged.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	32	1293	32	1293	But this 'dwindling' is contradicted in the next sentence which says that the forests are stable.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	32	1309	33	1314	Interesting table, yet I wonder what it is trying to say and what is the best way to synthesize, or if it as all possible to do so, all the information in it.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	32	1309	33	1314	This isn't a review of ecosystem goods and services but a review of natural capital that provides services. There should be a column stating what goods and services are provided by the natural capital or to whom. While it is commendable to see non-economic values here along with the distinction of economic and market values, I note that several studies using Contingent Valuation have their results in the market value rather than economic value column. The first column also includes Marine as an ecosystem category and then as a sub-category under coastal systems. I would suggest that rather than trying to list every sub-category of ecosystem in the top row of the third column, the authors simply leave this as "Sub-Category of Ecosystem" to allow themselves more flexibility.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter to incorporate a more systematic review.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Tom Breeze	Chapter 2	32	1310	32	1310	Part of the IPBES remit for the pollinator study was that this was not supposed to conduct original work (which is what a meta-analysis would be) and in my view a meta-analysis will bloat the chapter massively as you will have to explain the full methods involved too.	Thank you. A systematic review was considered important to give the overview due to lack of such synthesis literature for the region.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	33	1314	33	1314	Add: Terrestrial - Coast - Ca Mau, Vietnam - SEA - Vietnam (Please refer to Full Project Report: PROECOSERV by UNEP)	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	34	1315	34	1344	Interesting and relevant section	Thank you.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	34	1315	44	1672	Section 2.4 Good Quality of Life and food security, water security and energy security - all assessment should be referenced to regional aspects. Especially energy security section should be re-written taking latest references and assessment as per IPCC AR5 WG 3 (refer to Chapter 14) and Uddin & Taplin 2015 Regional cooperation in widening energy access and also mitigating climate change: Current programs and future potentials' Global Environmental Change, Volume 35, pp. 497-504. While these references are only for directing authors towards energy access literature and APR, this comment is also valid for other regional assessment - especially developing countries context.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	34	1320	34	1320	Sentence starting with It is confusing. What is? Human well being, quality of life, biodiversity?	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	34	1325	34	1329	Long sentence, repetitive too. These sorts of sentences are common in the document.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	34	1341	34	1342	This can hardly be believed. Do rich people not live in houses, eat food, breathe air, and drink water. Needs more explanation. Perhaps the key word is 'subsistence' mentioned further down.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	35	1365	35	1365	1.6 million should be billion I think.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	35	1365	35	1366	Should also refer to ecosystem service's contribution to food security generating from fresh water ecosystems as the region holds several world class major river systems, including, for example, one of the most productive lake system - Tonle Sap of Cambodia.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	35	1366	35	1366	Add a box: Livelihood in Tonle Le Sap Lake in Cambodia	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 2	35	1367	35	1367	Relationship between biodiversity and water security should be explained first.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	35	1367	35	1367	Include Mekong Delta under "water security" - saline intrusion	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	35	1367	38	1473	This section is very interesting and relevant More information is needed to be able to read figure 2.6. and understand what the 1 to 6 range means. The example for Jordan is very relevant. Systematic assessment of the key issues per region would be desirable if feasible	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	35	1367	38	1473	You might want to have a look at the findings of the German research project GLOWA Jordan River (a project on sustainable water management in the Jordan River region). The project ended in 2012. The findings might provide additional value for the reg. assessment and can be found here: <a href="https://publikationen.uni-tuebingen.de/xmlui/handle/10900/53308">https://publikationen.uni-tuebingen.de/xmlui/handle/10900/53308</a> . In case you wish to contact the project coordinator Prof. Katja Tielbörger, University of Tübingen, Germany: <a href="mailto:katja.tielboerger@uni-tuebingen.de">katja.tielboerger@uni-tuebingen.de</a> .	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	35	1367	38	1473	Good details analysis on freshwater supplies in the region, but does not give much analysis on the linkages between BES, especially BES in the catchment/watersheds for the region/sub-regions.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	35	1378	35	1383	You might want to include that water scarcity in the tropical Asia Pacific region is particularly common in karst landscapes (see e.g.: "H.E. Legrand, V.T. Stringfield (1973): Karst hydrology — A review. Journal of Hydrology, Volume 20, Issue 2, Pages 97-120").	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 2	37	1428	37	1431	Please include a reference for these statements.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	37	1443	37	1443	Should be "...human movements....."?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	38	1473	38	1473	Add a box: Hydropower development in the GMS - water scarcity	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	38	1473	38	1473	Also: water scarcity in Phnom Kulen, Cambodia - upstream vs lowstream	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	39	1474	39	1503	This section is very interesting and relevant. I suggest dissecting more systematically the different issues associated with energy security and nature into separate paragraphs and then providing available data for each of these topics in the further sections.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	39	1474	42	1597	Good analysis/narrative on the general situation of power supply, access to electricity, etc, and local case studies from Western Asia sub-region, but not enough linkages between energy provision and BES provided in the section. Would help to see the share of energy sources by sub-region, and the negative impacts on nature due to the energy mix by sub-region.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	39	1500	39	1500	You might want to check this statement; we believe that rather Indonesia is the top palm oil producer in the region (as well as globally) (see e.g.: <a href="http://www.indexmundi.com/agriculture/?commodity=palm-oil">http://www.indexmundi.com/agriculture/?commodity=palm-oil</a> ).	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	39	1505	42	1597	This section is very interesting but very unbalanced towards only one small region and one country within the whole region that is being assessed.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the text.
LI Qingfeng	Chapter 2	40	1543	42	1597	Section 2.4.4.3 Unbalanced paragraphs. The case study is not so relevant to the main topics, and surpassed the main theme.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	40	1543	42	1597	Section 2.4.4.3 refers to a case study from Jordan, suggest remove this and include a case on Middle East (non-traditional regional context) or in the context of MENA	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	43	1595	44	1647	These sections are very important but would need to be supported with more systematic data	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	43	1599	44	1672	Assuming there would be more regional/sub-regional analysis on livelihood, health, environmental securities, social relationships and spirituality and cultural identity	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	44	1649	44	1649	What is the relevancy of putting "social relationships"?	It is an important part of non-material contributions of nature.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	44	1649	44	1672	These sections are very relevant but seem a bit out of place. Might be more explicitly related to earlier sections on values. Also, it would be great if they could be expanded	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	44	1658	44	1672	Examples of unique cultural custom for example Gross National Happiness (see Taplin et al 2013, Uddin et al 2007, IPCC AR 5 WG 3 Box 3.11) for refs. Example from Thailand on Sufficiency Economy (Taplin et al 2013), should also be mentioned	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	44	1660	44	1666	This aspect - language - (including implications for biodiversity conservation) might be elaborated by a case study from Papua New Guinea because no other country in the Asia Pacific region has a comparable diversity of languages.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	44	1676	46	1760	These sections are very relevant but come out as a theoretical revision rather than assessments of how these issues are relevant to the area being assessed.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Paromita Ghosh	Chapter 2	44	1676	48	1820	The good practices of one area can be spread out to other areas for conservation, e.g. Uttarakahnd has a very strong Van panchyat system compared to other Indian Himalayan states. So this system needs to spread out to other Himalayan states.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	44	1676	62	2436	This is well-written but it is more opinionated and prescriptive than I think an IPBES chapter should be, and surely most of this belongs in Chapter 6?	Thank you. We have revised to reduce overlap.
Stefan Hotes	Chapter 2	44	1676	62	2436	In the context of historical examples of governance schemes for sustainable land use, it could be reflected more on 'what worked out well' and 'what did not work out so well', including biophysical aspects as well as equity and social cohesion issues. In particular, former institutional arrangements and systems of rules and regulations could be analysed in terms of their effects on biological, physico-chemical, social and economic indicators. Please consider augmenting the findings in section 2.5 in this manner.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	45	1692	45	1692	Substitute "...such outcomes..." with "goals"	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Dang To Kien	Chapter 2	45	1719	48	1810	We would like to propose this link to our past and on-going works in Vietnam and Lao for securing traditional institution of many ethnic indigenous communities. By actual community-based works/projects, customary-law-based resources management through ensuring both land and forest titles/rights to community forest and land and also formal recognition of customary land tenure/rights for many indigenous minority groups in Lao and Vietnam plays a very important role in recognizing and ensuring community fundamental rights to land and forest and hence further promoting sustainable use and management of these resources in the hands of communities. And by that, we indirectly contribute to maintaining ecosystem management and humans collective wellbeing. Please access the link below: <a href="http://lupapa.org/bai-viet/158-why-rights-to-livelihoods-of-indigenous-ethnic-communities-in-the-mekong-region-matter.html">http://lupapa.org/bai-viet/158-why-rights-to-livelihoods-of-indigenous-ethnic-communities-in-the-mekong-region-matter.html</a>	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	45	1719	48	1810	There should be reference to ASEAN in this section, especially with its launch of the Economic Community.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	46	1672	48	1812	These sections are very relevant and the study cases are interesting but might need to be more formally organized into scales of social organization and be accompanied by a synthesis text that allows to see the thread across scales and across study cases	Thank you. The text has been revised and restructured
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	47	1788	47	1791	MRC only has 4 downstream countries excluding China and Myanmar	Thank you. However, they are still partner countries.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	47	1791	47	1791	Include ADB's GMS initiative	Thank you. However we have narrowed down to regional organisations.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	47	1792	48	1810	More recent multilateral environmental governance schemes/institutions (with particular focus on marine) such as Coral Triangle Initiative (CTI) and Pacific Oceanscape may be referred as examples in the region.	Thank you. This has been incorporated.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	47	1803	47	1804	Many want to reference case studies and evaluations/analysis from the Critical Ecosystem Partnership Fund (CEPF), one of the largest international fund dedicated to biodiversity conservation, that supports local communities' and indigenous communities' conservation efforts. CEPF's evaluations and reports includes communities role in the governance of natural capital, local community efforts contributing to national policies, etc. <a href="http://www.cepf.org">www.cepf.org</a>	Thank you. This has been incorporated.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	48	1813	50	1883	These sections are very relevant. I wonder if there are positive examples of institutions that are somehow functional that could be compared with those with strong limitations, or maybe provide a synthesis table of major limitations and advantages of the different institutions assessed.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	48	1813	50	1883	Perhaps, again, role and effectiveness of ASEAN, and the relationship between ASEAN and ASEAN Center for Biodiversity (ACB) may be analyzed here.	Thank you. We have considered in the context of the chapter revision.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	50	1885	52	1979	This section is quite interesting but I wonder if it would be possible to strengthen the links between earlier sections and these recommendations and to provide more explicit links to the different subregions being assessed.	Thank you. We have revised and restructured the chapter.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	50	1885	52	1979	Improving country systems for environmental impact assessments and its enforcements may be added to the required institutional improvement	Thank you. We have revised to reduce overlap with chapter 6.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1895	50	1895	Better as "...Natural Ecosystem services..."	nature's contributions to people is a common terminology used across IPBES assessments
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1896	50	1896	Better as "...ecosystem approach..."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1900	50	1901	Include NBSAP	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1903	50	1906	Include NBSAP and mention about "synergies"	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1910	50	1912	Include Emerald Triangle Initiative by ITTO	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	50	1910	50	1912	China and Myanmar are only dialogue partners in MRC	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	50	1911	50	1912	MRC includes Yunnan Province of PR China not PR China.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	51	1929	51	1934	Include 'mapping MEAs to the Aichi Targets" by UNEP-WCMC	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	51	1940	51	1948	First a clear definition of subsidy requires to be stated. Subsidies varies along sectors and context. For example fossil fuel subsidy often wrongly termed as negative impact on energy security. Subsidies in agriculture sectors need to bring in discussion when considering this both in developing and developed countries context.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	51	1948	51	1948	There is much more recent informaiton than this 1998 reference. Try looking up Christopher Barr's work on forestry in Indonesia. It is excellent.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	51	1950	51	1954	Include PFES policy in Vietnam	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	51	1956	51	1958	Quote successful story from Jingdong, China - Ecosystem valuation	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	51	1956	51	1958	Should refer to the development of natural capital evaluation/accounting in addition to TEEB approach.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	52	1981	52	2012	This section is very important but is currently lacking concrete information for the region	Thank you. The text has been revised to include examples from the subregions.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	52	2006	52	2006	What is that box all about? Clarify.	This has been deleted.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	52	2014	58	2557	Very interesting and relevant section and clearly connected to the different subregions being assessed.	Thank you.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	52	2014	59	2276	Section on access to freshwater, energy (through ecosystem services), and coastal environment needed	Thank you. These have been reorganised as separate sections and further developed.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	54	2048	54	2049	SDG17	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	54	2062	54	2070	Include SDG13 (land)	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	54	2091	54	2092	In Cambodia is called Community Protected Area zone (CPA)	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	55	2111	56	2142	Section 2.5.4.3 should include references from PES (payment for ecosystems services) initiative in the Pacific Islands nations.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 2	55	2111	56	2142	I believe there are abundant studies from the Philippines on the CBFM scheme, including comparison with other forest management schemes	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	57	2189	58	2257	As in the rest of the chapter, huge areas of the region are omitted from the list. This needs to be either inclusive or more general.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	58	2228	58	2231	In Malaysia, ABS BILL is not yet passed at national level	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 2	58	2249	58	2250	Benefit sharing arrangements may need to be entered into depending on the requirements from the range of access points (permits). The Commonwealth (Part8A Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Regulations) requires a benefit sharing arrangement for access and use of Commonwealth genetic resources. Other access providers may not require this as each state and territory has different permitting (access) and/or biodiscovery legislation.  <i>Applicants for a permit to access biological resources may be required to enter into a benefit sharing agreement (BSA) with the Access Provider for the resource.</i>	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	58	2258	58	2258	In Cambodia, a ginger species is underway for bioprospecting (Phnom Kulen National Park)	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	58	2259	59	2276	Very relevant but kind of short. Is there more information available?	The text has been restructured and we have aimed to avoid overlap with chapter 6
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	59	2278	59	2314	Very relevant but kind of short. Is there more information available?	The text has been restructured and we have aimed to avoid overlap with chapter 6
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 2	59	2278	59	2314	Given the pivotal importance of governance and its deficiencies I think this section needs to be beefed up. Is it possible to elaborate on and categorize the innovations?	The text has been restructured and we have aimed to avoid overlap with chapter 6
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 2	59	2305	59	2314	In Australia, Indigenous Protected Areas are part of the Australian Government's National Reserve System, but have distinctive socio-cultural and political characteristics as indigenous people are the primary decision makers and drivers of knowledge integration (Davies et al., 2013). Innovations <b>are</b> evident in <b>this context Indigenous Protected Area management plans'</b> include (1) a focus on customary institutions in governance; (2) strategic planning approaches that respond to interlinkages of stewardship between people, place, plants, and animals; (3) planning frameworks that bridge scales by considering values and issues across the whole of an indigenous peoples' territory; and (4) varied communication modes appropriate to varied audiences, including an emphasis on visual and spatial modes (Davies et al., 2013). These innovations address significant knowledge asymmetries between dominant colonial literate society and Indigenous peoples relying on oral and artistic transmission.	Thank you. This has been incorporated.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 2	59	2312	59	2314	Suggest this comment on knowledge asymmetries have a reference?	The text has been revised and no longer uses the text referred to.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	59	2316	61	2395	Section 2.5.6 should include reference from IPCC AR 5 on Vulnerability, Adaptation and Mitigation	Thank you. This has been incorporated.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	59	2316	61	2396	Very relevant and interesting. Would it be possible to make a more systematic assessment for each of the countries or subregions?	Thank you. We have prioritised other sections under limitations of space.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	61	2394	61	2394	Include: GEF-SSCF Ecosystem Based Adaptation (EBA) project & EBA project in the GMS under Adaptation Fund by UNEP-IEMP	Thank you. We have prioritised other sections under limitations of space.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	61	2397	61	2436	Section 2.5.7 Conflict appears review of literatures only as it lacks any assessment and in regional context, suggest discuss assessment	Thank you. We have restructured and revised the text.
Patricia Balvanera	Chapter 2	61	2397	62	2346	I wonder if conflict is just about conservation. How about conflict with respect to legal vs. Non-legal resources extraction, mining, water related conflicts, resource depletion related conflicts, and the role of power relations and environmental justice?	Thank you. We have restructured and revised the text.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	62	2416	62	2416	Please include UNEP-IEMP's ESA reports, some key findings in the GMS, consulting local people on ecosystem services in PA	Thank you. We have prioritised other sections under limitations of space.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	62	2451	62	2453	Claims on addressing regional assessment appears not correct in the context of the Chapter 2 as most references, examples are from individual countries. It does store a lots of information but the assessment should focus on regions.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this by restructuring and revising.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	62	2452	62	2452	Improve to be "...ecosystem functions, services..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	62	2454	62	2454	Improve to be "...natural resources..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	62	2456	62	2456	Improve to be "...stakeholders, countries..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2461	63	2468	Rephrase to give reader the importance to be resilient	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2470	63	2472	Refer to UNCBD/NBSAP	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2483	63	2483	Add "...political, biological..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2486	63	2486	Better "...tropical rainforests of South East Asia..."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2489	63	2490	Clarify: "The world's top countries....." especially, in terms of	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2502	63	2509	Use: direct and indirect pressures"	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	63	2507	63	2507	Better use "...environmental pressures..."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	64	2537	64	2537	Better: "...a key asset at local, national, regional and inter..."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Richard T Corlett	Chapter 2	64	2542	64	2542	The APR is A cradle of agriculture, not THE cradle. What about maize, wheat, barley, tomatoes, chillis, and many types of beans? All staples in the APR.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	64	2561	64	2561	Include: Capacity Building Platform by UNEP-IEMP in the GMS	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2573	65	2576	Clarify: "This fusion.....relatively intact. Rephrase.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2580	65	2583	Refer to: ecosystem governance	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2586	65	2586	Better use "natural capital" instead of "ecological wealth"	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2588	65	2588	Better: "...promoting green economy..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2589	65	2589	Better: linked to ecosystem services"	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2597	65	2600	Redundancy. Rephrase with new sentences	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	65	2611	65	2611	Better: "...local, national and global..."	Thank you for the suggestion.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	66	2613	66	2613	Better:...civil society, private sector and local community to curb.."	Thank you for the suggestion.
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 2	66	2625	66	2627	<i>"The Chapter also addresses key policy question: How best can we sustainably manage and govern the ecosystems on which the water, food health and energy security of the Asia-Pacific region depends."</i>  This is a very ambitious aim but I'm not sure the chapter achieves this. Perhaps the statement could be rephrased to lower expectations?  <i>The Chapter also discusses addresses a key policy question: How best can we sustainably manage and govern the ecosystems on which the water, food health and energy security of the Asia-Pacific region depends.</i>	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 2	66	2629	67	2711	Capacity Building (institutional and human resources) is an important prerequisite for improvement. This should be elaborated in the text.	The text has been restructured and we have aimed to avoid overlap with chapter 6
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	66	2631	66	2643	Add: climate-smart agriculture	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 2	66	2657	67	2609	There is a need for clear distinction between energy for electricity and energy for cooking needs. While energy for cooking appears traditional biomass, the need for electricity depend on the affordability and need. A light-bulb solution does not mean that the region is energy sufficient. An useful form of energy for all activities is thus needed to be assessed. In addition, aspiration level of energy use should be dicussed as this is strongly linked with improving life index.	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	67	2687	67	2687	Better: ...and multilateral green energy cooperation.."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	67	2691	67	2691	Include:COP21 - climate agreement - UNFCCC	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	67	2692	67	2692	Health security? Clarify.	This has been done in a separate section
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	68	2716	68	2716	Better: "...achieving ecosystem approach and under IPBES, and.."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	68	2719	68	2719	Better: "...to capture the drivers using the IPBES CF.."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	68	2720	68	2720	Better: "Demonstrated leadership, political commitment, stakeholder.."	The text has been revised and no longer uses the phrase referred to.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 2	78	3248	78	3249	REFERENCE: add: 1) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phou Khao Khouay Biodiversity Conservation Area (BCA), Vientiane, Lao PDR 2) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Pha Taem National Park, Ubon Ratchathani, Thailand 3) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phnom Kulen National Park, Siem Reap, Cambodia 4) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Tram Chim National Cao Lanh, Mekong Delta, Vietnam 5) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Nabanhe Watershed National Nature Reserve, Xishuangbanna Dai Autonomous Prefecture, Mekong Upstream, China 6) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment on Myanmar	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest.