

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Cameron Colebatch	general					<p>The documents are good summaries, but what are the implications of the documents? What are the authors seeking policy makers to do with them?</p> <p>Suggest that (at the least) a dot point summary of the 'Recommendations and policy options' be provided at the beginning of each chapter to make this more prominent. If appropriate, it may also be worth preparing a 'summary for policy makers' (SPM) for each document as well.</p>	Thank you for the suggestion. An Executive Summary has been added to the chapter during the revision, and a separate SPM has been made.
Li Qingfeng	general					1, The Report in overall is too academia, too detailed in scientific exploration and descriptions. In consideration of the principal aim "to facilitate the implementation of the National ... and the "Inter-governmental" nature of the organization, the Report has to be more "publicly explicit", rather than "scientifically complicated". If the Report is to be read by the policy makers, and to draw attentions from the public, the content is to be simplified and the volume greatly reduced, one third is more than enough.	Thank you. The summary for policymakers may be a more widely accessible document.
Ludwig Kammesheid, IB	general					In some tropical countries in Asia the area designated to sustainable forestry ("forest reserves") exceeds the area under protection. Thus, the implementation of sustainable forest management systems in natural forests by applying FSC standards is essential for effective biodiversity conservation. In reference to conservation of nature it is of particular importance that these forest reserves are at least partly located in lowland areas where otherwise land has been already converted at large extent. The current assessment does not elaborate on this issue. Maybe you could include it in your further work.	Thank you. This is addressed in part in chapter 3 under protected area coverage and future trends and in chapter 6 under governance systems and policy options.
Ludwig Kammesheid, IB & Uta von Witsch	general					Other knowledge-forms such as indigenous and local knowledge are well included throughout the assessment. Maybe you could additionally include a specific sub-section (e.g. in chapter 1) on the current status and use of indigenous and lokal knowledge in the Asia Pacific region (e.g. to what extent does it contribute to the academic knowledge base?; perhaps include some case studies, if available).	Thank you for the suggestion. It is very difficult to have this regional overview due to lack of literature by nature of indigenous and local knowledge.
Stefan Hotes	general					The way the IPBES conceptual framework is referenced in the text should be more stringent, and the IPBES guide on Assessments as well as the other IPBES deliverables including guides should be integrated more clearly. In electronic versions of the assessment, hyperlinks to these resources could be included.	Thank you. The formatting has been corrected accordingly.
Thomas Brooks (IUCN)	general					Congratulations to the authors for all their hard work in producing this FOD.	Thank you
Uta von Witsch	general					Please provide a degree of confidence for the main findings throughout the assessment as laid down in the 'Guide on the production and integration of assessments from and across all scales (IPBES deliverable 2a)' (see IPBES/4/INF/9, p. 60, Figure 4.1).	This has been included in the Executive Summary as per the common practice across assessments.
Uta von Witsch	general					A list of abbreviations and a glossary should be included for the whole assessment.	This has been done.
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheid, IB	general					We highly appreciate the case studies provided and the regional examples chosen for the assessment. They loosen up the text, and make it more colorful and better comprehensible. Please ensure, though, that they are distributed evenly between all sub-regions throughout the assessment in order to better reflect the different sub-regions and their expertise. Some sub-regions (and/ or countries) seem a little under-represented at this stage. This especially holds true for the West Asian sub-region as well as some tropical countries with a particular high biodiversity such as the Philippines, Papua-New Guinea and countries in the subtropical and temperate zone of the Asia Pacific region like Iran and Mongolia.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this in the revisions, but acknowledge the difficulty in ensuring even representation of all subregions due to lack of data or expert knowledge.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB & Stefan Hotes	general					Congratulations and thanks to all who contributed to this first draft version which can serve as a valuable baseline study. Aspects such as SDGs and the Aichi targets, which are of importance also for the global assessment, are explicitly addressed. We therefore believe that this reg. assessment will also be highly useful for the global assessment. Furthermore, the text is well balanced (not biased) and not policy prescriptive (indications are made in the comments below should this not be the case). These aspects are very much welcomed.	Thank you.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	general					An executive summary at the beginning of the assessment as well as short abstracts/ introductions at the beginning of each chapter would be welcomed. This would, to our opinion, improve the readability of the assessment and also the harmonization between chapters (see also next comment on this aspect). The same applies to the conclusions (especially the key findings and the policy options) which - where already included in the assessment - are very helpful and highly appreciated. Furthermore, it would be welcomed if all main findings within the abovementioned sections could be linked explicitly to the different respective sections of the assessment which they are referring to.	An Executive Summary has been added to the chapter following the common format across assessments.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	general					It might be a good idea for the different chapter-teams to interact more closely. This could help to harmonize the chapters, to keep up the common thread, and to avoid redundancies and unnecessary repetitions.	Thank you for the suggestion.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	general					All regional assessments should follow the same definitions and (e.g.) classifications of ecosystem services. These aspects are important for the comparability of the results, especially since they all provide input for the IPBES global assessment (see also next comment on this aspect). Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. Furthermore, sections on classifications and terminology of biomes and ecosystems should make better use of the more stringent ones already compiled for applied purposes e.g. in the case of wetlands (Ramsar Convention).	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this through the internal review of drafts and sharing across assessments
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	general					Sections addressing general aspects that are of (the same) importance to all reg. assessments - like e.g. "What is a value system" (section 2.2.1, p. 11, lines 425-436), "The concept of living in harmony with nature ..." (section 2.2.1.2, p. 11, lines 438-459) and "Factors affecting the change in value systems" (section 2.2.2.1, p. 13, line 557 to p. 15, line 628) - should be identical for all reg. assessments. This will ensure a common basis and is important for the comparability of the results. Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. These general (and global) sections could furthermore be kept as short as necessary for their understanding within the reg. assessment. They seem a little over-emphasized at this stage. All in all, the assessment might focus more on the Asia-Pacific region.	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this during the internal reviews, and also by incorporating into chapter 1 some introductory text which was standardised across all regional assessments.
Wang Changyong	general					Suggestion: discuss how to further collect data and information from most of Asia Pacific countries. For instance, increasing contributing authors, using questionnaire to collect key data (eg status and trend) at national level	Thank you for the suggestion, which could not be taken on board for the assessment due to time and budget limitations.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	0				This is little more than a stream of consciousness, uninterrupted by empirical evidence of objective analysis. Goes nowhere and needs much work.	Thank you. We have hopefully improved this through extensive rewriting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	2	25	2	25	c.f. § what is this	We have deleted this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	3	67	3	67	BES give is full when appers at first time in text	Thank you this has been done.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	67	3	67	"cut across" is ambiguous - suggest something like "This chapter uses scenarios to integrate the science of BES with the policy landscape of the APR."	Thank you we have rewritten the section.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	68	3	71	"demands close...broadest terms" is very wordy. Suggest "demands close integration of science with broad policy making, as ..."	Thank you we have rewritten the section.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	76	3	79	"Scenarios...policy makers." - I found the tone of this a little hectoring and didactic. I would delete these two sentences and add : "...are often set elsewhere than on the environment."	Thank you we have rewritten the section.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	3	76	3	95	Unreferenced twaddle. Suggest delete all this. I sounds like indulgent guff.	Thank you we have rewritten the section.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	3	78	3	79	Hard to say "key objective of ANY assessment" in general. Suggest to be specific, and focus on the objectives of this assessment.	Thank you we have rewritten the section.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	81	3	81	"THE preceding chapters..."	Thank you we have corrected this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	3	81	3	89	correct the style of refernces eg et al., need comma before year	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	82	3	84	"Projected...formulation." What point is being made here? Perhaps: "but it is the consequences of population change that will drive policy formulation", though this seems like hair-splitting.	Thank you we have rewritten the section.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	3	97	3	99	Why set model projection for "next 40 years"? Any specific reason? I would expect to see a target year of 2030, 2050, or 2100.	Thank you yes we have corrected to 2050.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	3	108	3	108	Remove one bracket	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	111	3	111	suggest: "...is not to invent new policy questions."	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	3	111	3	111	"we set as A policy backdrop..."	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	4	128	4	129	On Figure 5.1: Chapter 4 does not give priority to scenarios (or models) nor does it primarily address these (yet?). When looking at Figure 5.1 one might get this impression, though. Please move the inset 'Ch4' more to 'indirect drivers' and 'direct drivers' to more clearly reflect that these are what Chapter 4 primarily is about.	Thank you we have deleted the figure as it was deemed repetitive.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	4	132	4	137	You may consider to merge section 5.2.1 and 5.2.2, and discuss human and policy dimension of BES in Asia-Pacific	Thank you for the suggestion, we have considerably restructured the chapter.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	4	141	5	148	For IPCC scenarios, better review its AR5 instead of AR4. Other assessment scenarios may be considered: UNEP GEO, OECD, ADB.	Thank you, we have done this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	4	146	4	146	TEEB: write in full if appear at first time in text	Thank you this has been deleted.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	5	144	5	147	It would be helpful to receive some additional information on the scenarios developed by the millennium ecosystem assessment at this point.	Thank you we have provided this in the new section 5.3.2.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	5	151	5	178	So much of this is waffle and ends in motherhood statements.	We have rewritten extensively.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	5	154	5	154	delete , P.2	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	5	173	5	177	et al., add comma	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	5	177	5	177	correct it section ....., we need	We have corrected the format.
Danesto B. Anacio	Chapter 5	5	180	5	180	No descriptive content for "Spatial scale".	We have covered this in the new section 5.3.3.2.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	5	180	5	180	Spatial scale is very critical over diverse regions like Asia-Pacific, and key drivers and priority issues can be quite different from sub-region to sub-region and from local scale to sub-regional and regional scales. Also, increasing regional connectivity and integration make spatial scale even more sensitive in Asia-Pacific. Suggest to focus on following issues in the sub-section: resolution cross scaling spectrum, key drivers, priority issues, spatial connectivity, accumulative effects, etc.	We have covered this in the new section 5.3.3.2.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	5	180	5	180	5.3.2 spatial scale still to come	We have covered this in the new section 5.3.3.2.
Pifu CONG	Chapter 5	5	180	5	180	There is no content in the title of "5.3.2 spatial scale."	We have covered this in the new section 5.3.3.2.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	5	181	5	181	Spatial scale: global - regional - subregional - national - subnational	We have covered this in the new section 5.3.3.2.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	5	184	5	186	"Various...dimensions." complex unhelpful sentence - delete.	We no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	6	194	6	230	give few references and full justification of margins look better	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	6	208	6	208	"There are few examples..." really? Some are given in the text at II 209-213; could also add IAS which may take decades or more following introduction before expansion	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	6	208	6	208	What really is a "temporal scale mismatch"? I assume the authors mean the lag in systems responding to pressures or decisions taking in the short term? It would be good to spell out what we are exploring here.	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	6	208	6	208	"..the impact on human well- being..": impact of what?	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	6	240	6	240	use last name of first author	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	245	7	245	Dodge et al., 2012	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	253	7	266	Worth mentioning that there is a significant component of human well-being that is sensitive to culture, politics, world view etc.	Thank you we have covered this in the new section 5.1.4.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	7	258	7	258	Maybe you could provide some information on the particular application for the Asia Pacific region?	We have identified this as a gap after review.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	7	259	7	259	What indicator?	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	262	7	262	Remove abbreviations for authors here	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	265	7	265	Costanza et al.,	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	268	7	268	remove page number here	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	273	7	273	et al., add full stop and comma	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	273	7	273	"THE third limitation..."	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	274	7	275	"Countries who have A lower ecological footprint, FOR EXAMPLE, need not (DEL necessarily) have high well-being BECAUSE.... "	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	285	7	285	"In such scenario..." Suggest "In such situations..." - scenarios is a reserved word in this Chapter!	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	287	7	287	identify the gaps, (DEL and recognize) linkages and challenges	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	7	290	7	290	..."such assessmentS" plural	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	7	293	7	293	use and or & be consistant	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	8	295	8	327	I don't see the purpose of these paras: "Studies could be conducted...of BES loss" - who are we saying this to? This is all very well for a lit review in which we want to call the research community to arms, but here, should we not be saying what we actually did?	We have rewritten and no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	8	296	8	296	Ferraro et al.,	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	8	303	8	303	Badola et al.,	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	8	309	8	309	delete Cheung the first name	We have corrected the format.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	9	329	9	329	Better use "Methodology and data sets"	We have deleted this.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	9	329	11	330	This table could be very useful if we focus on the case studies from Asia-Pacific or at global scale.	We have deleted this.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Dr. Santosh Kumar Mishra	Chapter 5	10	555	10	585	<p>After end of information given under 5.6.3.1 Impacts of climate change driver on forest ecosystems (page 88, line 585), add following information:</p> <p><b>Case Study: Adaptation of Asia-Pacific Forests to Climate Change</b></p> <p>Climate change is one of the most important threats to the capacity of forest landscapes to provide ecological, economic and social services in the Asia-Pacific region. Meanwhile, the potential of forests to mitigate climate change represents a major opportunity for the forest sector, as forest ecosystems can either serve as a carbon sink or carbon source depending on their level of health and their resilience to climate change. There is remarkably little evidence that science-based decision-making processes are being incorporated into forest management practices in the Asia-Pacific region. As a result, considerable uncertainty exists over management policies aimed at enabling forests and forest-dependent communities to adapt to climate change. The goal of this project is to address this uncertainty and help forest managers and policy makers to develop effective management strategies to maintain resilient forest ecosystems for adaptation to climate change.</p> <p><b>Phase - 1</b> of the project was implemented from November 1, 2011 to October 31, 2014. All research and associated activities have been completed and some have exceeded the original objectives, including the publishing or submission of 28 papers in scientific peer-reviewed journals. Under Phase – 1, objectives were to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o <b>Analyze</b> the current status of climate change studies in forest ecosystems and forest-dependent communities and determine whether existing policies could lead to practices that limit climate change impacts in the Asia Pacific region.</li> <li>o <b>Develop</b> a high-resolution climate model for the Asia Pacific region.</li> <li>o <b>Develop</b> ecological models to predict impacts of climate change on major tree species distributions.</li> <li>o <b>Apply</b> niche-based and process-based models to pilot sites to develop recommendations for sustainable forest management practices.</li> <li>o <b>Build</b> a network that connects scientists, forest managers and policy makers in the region to facilitate information sharing and knowledge transfer.</li> <li>o <b>Develop</b> web-based tools to facilitate data access and spatial visualization to promote information flow and knowledge transfer from scientists to policy makers to stakeholders.</li> </ul> <p><b>Phase - 2</b> of the project is currently in progress, with an expected completion date of December 31, 2018. The second phase of the project aims to expand and improve upon the research and tools developed in the first phase. It aims to apply these tools to a broader range of ecosystems and associated communities, particularly in China and Southeast Asia where afforestation is active and/or forest ecosystems and dependent human communities are particularly vulnerable to climate change. The output of this phase will improve the capacity of local and regional forest managers to develop robust adaptation strategies to address climate change issues in the Asia-Pacific region. Specific outcomes of the project are as follows (<a href="http://asiapacific.forestry.ubc.ca/">http://asiapacific.forestry.ubc.ca/</a>, Accessed on June 11, 2016):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) Addition of future annual climate projections to ClimateAP, as well as addition of new features to facilitate modeling of variability and extreme climatic conditions.</li> <li>b) Expansion of ecological models to include more key forest species and entire ecosystems in selected economies.</li> <li>c) Development of indicators through the integration of ecological models to conduct trade-off analysis at representative pilot areas in Southeast Asia.</li> <li>d) Improvement of the the Google Maps based web tool to include economy-specific maps for better spatial visualization and data access across economies.</li> <li>e) Continued extension of the network built throughout phase one through workshops, communications and extension notes.</li> </ul> <p><b>Annotations:</b> I find the above information on adaptation of forests in Asia Pacific region to climate change (given as case study) informative. This initiative has developed ecological models to predict impacts of climate change on major tree species distributions.</p>	Thank you for the suggestion. We have extensively revised and restructured the chapter and could not accommodate this text in a logical manner.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	11	329	11	330	use proper format for text checl PDF file too	This has been corrected.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	11	330	11	330	<p>1) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phou Khao Khouay Biodiversity Conservation Area (BCA), Vientiane, Lao PDR</p> <p>2) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Pha Taem National Park, Ubon Ratchathani, Thailand</p> <p>3) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phnom Kulen National Park, Siem Reap, Cambodia</p> <p>4) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Tram Chim National Cao Lanh, Mekong Delta, Vietnam</p> <p>5) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Nabanhe Watershed National Nature Reserve, Xishuangbanna Dai Autonomous Prefecture, Mekong Upstream, China</p> <p>6) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment on Myanmar (Subregional - Assessments using IPBES conceptual framework, PA-BAT, Scenario building &amp; National Ecosystem Services Readiness) (multistakeholder analysis - Ecosystem services assessment) (Important of Protected Areas and its ecosystem services to humans) (Gaps intra and inter countries in the GMS on ecosystem management - revealing gaps in understanding regulating and supporting services) (Ecosystem services should not be only about consuming natural resources)</p>	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	11	350	11	350	Lee et al., 2014	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	12	339	12	343	The authors say that ascribing different definitions of human-nature interactions to "world view" is simplistic", but then proceed to do just that. Recast - I guess they need to acknowledge that calling it "world view" is simplistic, explaining why, but go on to say now we need to use it to show the polar opposites and the gradations between.	Thank you. We have removed this phrase in the revisions.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	12	358	13	382	This should be sub-section 5.5.1 and highlight the strong linkages between biodiversity and cultural diversity, right before the discussion on disciplines. Also, globalization, increasing connectivity, and new communication technologies may be discussed as drivers as well.	Thank you for the suggestion. We have extensively revised and restructured the chapter.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	12	361	12	361	This is meaningless.	We have deleted this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	13	391	13	392	examples please	We have rewritten extensively.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	13	396	13	396	Please include: "The social sciences <b>and humanities</b> ...".	We have no longer use this phrase.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	13	402	13	402	correct it we must consider our interactions in the widest context possible, and remove bracket	We have rewritten extensively.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	13	406	13	407	making criteria drawing on wide range of policy objectives related to environment, social engagement: identify literature	We have rewritten extensively.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	13	418	13	418	Refer to PA-BAT tool in ecosystem management	We have rewritten extensively.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	13	418	13	430	Need cross chapter work to bring useful relevant information into this sub-section.	We have rewritten extensively.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	14	432	14	432	The authors need to integrate the Australian National Assessment, published recently in Nature, into this chapter. It is rich in thinking about scenarios and how to use them to inform policy. Nature article and cover:  <a href="http://www.nature.com/articles/doi:10.1038/nature16065">http://www.nature.com/articles/doi:10.1038/nature16065</a>  <a href="http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v527/n7576/index.html">http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v527/n7576/index.html</a>  A simpler entry point to the findings and the economic growth debate: <a href="https://theconversation.com/study-australians-can-be-sustainable-without-sacrificing-lifestyle-or-economy-50179">https://theconversation.com/study-australians-can-be-sustainable-without-sacrificing-lifestyle-or-economy-50179</a>	We have presented the results of a systematic review rather than delving into individual country examples.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	14	443	14	443	Check the numbers of assessments done in AP (include assessments by UNEP-IEMP)	The list has been modified with significant addition of peer-reviewed literature (restricted to Asia-Pacific region) as well as the assessment reports from UNEP-IEMP. Specific search criteria, as suggested following the FOD, have been adopted in order to capture scenario building exercises/case studies from the AP region since 2012, the year when IPBES was established. Systematic review methods have been deployed to understand the trends, scenario archetypes, logic employed such as exploratory, target scenario and policy screening, spatial and temporal extent including sub-regions as well as the key ecosystem services addressed within the reviewed literature.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	14	460	14	460	(MA, 2005a). Correct it may be Ma	We have corrected the format.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	14	470	14	474	You might want to have a look at the German research project GLOWA Jordan River and their findings on the 'Story and Simulation approach': <a href="http://www.glowa-jordan-river.de/uploads/OurProducts/SAS_brochure.pdf">http://www.glowa-jordan-river.de/uploads/OurProducts/SAS_brochure.pdf</a> . You can also contact the project coordinator Prof. Katja Tilebörger: <a href="mailto:katja.tielboerger@uni-tuebingen.de">katja.tielboerger@uni-tuebingen.de</a>	This section has been modified through systematic review of case studies specific to AP region. We depicted the geographical distribution of current trends and approaches based on the literature review.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	14	477	15	482	Talk about time horizon of scenarios, many recent scenarios target 2030, including UNEP GEO-6, World Bank, OECD, ADB. Setting time horizon of 2030 may also be consistent with SDGs.	This issue has been covered within a new sub-section on scenario archetypes which focus on the similarities among the different scenario exercises within the AP region.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	15	481	15	481	et al., add full stop and comma, remove R	We have corrected the format.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	15	487	15	493	You may merge this sub-section into 5.6.1.1 if not much to write here. The contents here are relevant to 5.6.1.1	We have updated with more peer-reviewed literature on Scenario assessment. The number of participatory/multi-stakeholder based approaches are found to be negligible, but we have retained in a box, as in light of inclusion of indigenous and local knowledge in the scenario analysis, participatory approach would be an important process.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	15	487	15	493	Include multistakeholder engagement by UNEP-IEMP in 6 countries in the GMS	Thank you for the suggestion.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	15	492	15	492	et al.,	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	15	511	15	511	Not sure how useful it is to simply reprint this table from the scenarios assessment.	We have deleted this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	15	512	16	513	correct the style of refernces eg et al., in the table, see PDF file too	We have corrected the format.
Lonsdale	Chapter 5	16	517	16	517	"climate change drivers"	We no longer use this phrase.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	16	517	17	530	Climate change can be considered as one of the main drivers, but not all. Other key drivers such as Land use change and natural disasters may also be discussed here. Also,along with DGVM, there are many other models deal with impact of climate change on BES. Suggest to review more literaure and add those models.	Thank you for the suggestion. We have extensively revised based on systematic review.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	16	524	16	524	Correct its style last name of first author only then et al., (DGVMs, Smith, Prentice, & Sykes, 2001)	We have corrected the format.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 5	16	524	17	531	Not sure why we are focusing on DGVMs here.	We have removed this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	17	530	17	530	et al., add full stop and comma	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	18	537	18	537	remove .....	We have corrected the format.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	18	550	18	554	Include initiave by UNEP-IEMP in the GMS	Thank you for the suggestion.
Gensuo Jia	Chapter 5	18	555	18	585	Section 5.6.3.1 is little too specific by discussing only climate change impacts on forest. You may either add sub-sections or expand this one to cover other major ecosystem types such as wetlands, grasslands, tundra, marine ecosystems.	Thank you for the suggestion. We have extensively revised based on systematic review.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	18	555	18	585	Please include an explanation why there is a focus explicitly on forest ecosystems (and no other ecosystems).	We have shifted to a more systematic review.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 5	18	571	18	572	"..., but will suffer reduced photosynthetic and growth rates due to temperature stresses ..." A contradictory statement was made in Chapter 4 (p. 47, line 2186). Please cross-check.	We have removed this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	18	572	18	572	add comma before year	We have corrected the format.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 5	18	583	18	585	You might want to cross-check this statement with more recent monitoring data (see: Richards, D. R. and D. A. Fries (2016): Rates and drivers of mangrove deforestation in Southeast Asia, 2000–2012. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, doi/10.1073/pnas. 15102772113).	We have removed this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	18	585	18	585	remove full stop before comma here	We have corrected the format.
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	18	586	18	586	Include Ca Mau, Vietnam	Thank you for the suggestion.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	19	615	19	615	Barano et al., 2010	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	20	643	20	648	use et al.,	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	20	655	20	659	need correction see pdf file	We have corrected the format.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	21	691	21	692	need to add proper reference not page number	We have corrected the format.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 5	21	695	21	696	You might have overlooked 'Oceania' as the fifth region?	We have corrected this.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	21	697	21	698	page number inside text not recommended	We have corrected the format.



Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
LOO MIN JET	Chapter 5	22	720	22	720	<p>Include 6 references:</p> <p>1) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phou Khao Khouay Biodiversity Conservation Area (BCA), Vientiane, Lao PDR</p> <p>2) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Pha Taem National Park, Ubon Ratchathani, Thailand</p> <p>3) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Phnom Kulen National Park, Siem Reap, Cambodia</p> <p>4) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Tram Chim National Cao Lanh, Mekong Delta, Vietnam</p> <p>5) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment in Nabanhe Watershed National Nature Reserve, Xishuangbanna Dai Autonomous Prefecture, Mekong Upstream, China</p> <p>6) UNEP-IEMP (2016). A Summary for Policy-makers and Stakeholders: Ecosystem Services and Management Assessment on Myanmar</p>	Thank you. The suggestion has been considered in balance with the rest.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 5	22	720	25	872	correct the style of all refernces to a single uniform style. The refernces must be arranged alphabetically according to the last name of first author. Please also check the pdf file. And my comments on other chapters, thanks,	We have corrected the format.