

ID	Reviewer Name	Category	Affiliation	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comments	Response
22	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	9	1	10	The importance of integrating multiple values of nature into decision making is emphasised. Please refer to comments in particular on Chapter 4 in this regard as they relate to incorporating values explicitly in EIA/ SEA and impact significance ratings.	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
23	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	85	3	86	Decision making at different levels can be influenced via targeted actions to include or recognise multiple values of nature and NCPs. (Also p5, lines 153-158, on achieving SDGs and progressing towards a just and sustainable future.) Agreed, but again - how best to do this in the currently used/ standard processes to inform decisions, such as EIAs (now widely referred to e.g. in international standards as Environmental and Social Impact Assessments or ESIA) and SEAs? Some pointers could be gleaned from e.g. IAIA's Best Practice guide on	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
24	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	5	155	5	169	Call for 'cross-sectoral thinking and synergistic planning approaches' - again, SEA and EIA have a potentially considerable role in guiding development paths. What is missing here is the need to improve integration and collaboration within planning and EIA/ SEA processes, between specialists and in particular between public participation/ stakeholder engagement specialists, social impact assessment specialists (including health), biodiversity specialists, economists, etc. This collaboration and communication is simply not happening, and	Thanks, environmental impact assessment is included in section 6.2.2., but the content of this key message changed and not has a different focus.
25	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	10	302	10	305	To me this description of private actors is insufficient - it misses all private consultants and specialists who undertake work in the environmental and social sectors, and who have - potentially - a significant role to play as both actors and influencers. My earlier comments apply in this respect.	Thank you, the explanations have been changed.
26	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	13		13		Table 6.1 does not reflect the role of the private sector players in socio-environmental decisions. See previous comments. I would see them as key influencers.	This table has been eliminated from the final version.
312	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					For the SPM the section of this chapter is unbalanced with respect to the development of its points	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion and significant changes have been made.
313	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2691		2851	For the education part, section 6.3.2.2 (and in the SPM Box SPM.10) it would be important to have a review of government documents that refer to official educational programs on sustainability and formal environmental education	As the emphasis was on larger trends in educational activities towards sustainability, we focused only on meta assessment of pertinent approaches.

314	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2691		2851	In section 6.3.2.2. Pedagogies are discussed, but it would be interesting to see how education has been included in formal government programs, for example in formal education programs for sustainability	As the emphasis was on larger trends in educational activities towards sustainability, we focused only on meta assessment of pertinent approaches.
315	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		150			It is necessary to make changes in decision-making to achieve the goals, for this to design spaces for innovation and shared knowledge, the subject matter in the chapter	Thank you, this is now more clearly elaborated in section 6.4 and 6.5. The key message was also redrafted.
316	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		151		151	Policy support tools which offer space for, also requires creating spaces to generate "conditions of possibility" by Enrique Dussel. Please see "Some principles for a material ecological liberation ethic (Relations between life on earth and humanity)" In: Jorge Pixley, For another world. Alternatives to the global market, Latin American Council of Churches, Quito, pp. 29-44. 374. 2005	Thank you for the suggestion, unfortunately we had difficulties accessing the suggested paper.
317	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		277		277	Nature (as an actor) is a great point, but this forces us to take a position regarding projects that impact nature	Thank you, the current version explains that the Chapter focuses mostly on decision-makers (influencers and key stakeholders) but nature is still listed to highlight that it is an entity which is affected by the decisions.
318	Alejandra Tauro	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The tables presented must be condensed	Tables were simplified and some of them placed to the supplementary material.
319	Sofía Treviño	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The figures are very complex, it would be important that there be a support of graphic designers to present the tables, boxes and figures to make them more intuitive	The figures were redesigned, and some of them eliminated from the final version.
320	Sofía Treviño	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		0		0	It would be important to present the "cost-benefit" relationship of integrating multiple values Vs not integrating them (based on the results of Chapters 3 and 4). What are the benefits (including economic) for governments and productive sectors of implementing policies / practices that consider the multiple values of biodiversity?	Thank you for this suggestion. The revised chapter aims to highlight the differing potentials of more plural values approaches versus more singular ones, but a true cost-benefit analysis was beyond our scope (partly because of the lack of sufficient data)
321	María Francisca Acevedo	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The messages presented in the chapter summary are complex. It would be necessary to homogenize them or write them in a simpler way	The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.

322	Maria Francisca Acevedo	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It would be important to give a space to reflection on added value within the chapter	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here,
323	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					In each of the subsections, it will be good to have a table on the particular messages per section, it is a dense chapter and it is easy to get lost in reading and interpretation.	The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
324	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It's a very comprehensive review, but it's dense	The review has been greatly simplified and the visualization condensed in colour-coded and more easily to follow tables
325	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		241		241	There are 13 categories of actors (which are not mentioned), which are divided into three main categories. Although each is defined, it is not clear on what basis they were divided. It might help to mention that the groups are mentioned in Fig 6.2. It is striking that in demographic groups only young people are singled out, but not other groups that could be relevant	Thank you, the figure and the stakeholder categorization was changed. As the chapter focus on key stakeholders who have considerable influence over decision-making, some stakeholder groups are now considered through representative NGOs. Therefore youth or other demographically characterized groups are not specified in detail any more.
326	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					A bridge is needed to get a message to decision makers and for them to be able to operationalize what is proposed in the chapter	Thanks for the comment, we worked out the chapter and built the bridge.
327	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		405		405	The concept of NCP has not been defined	This can be found in Chapter 1, it's annexes, and the IPBES glossary.
328	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		497		499	It is necessary to refer to the section on capacity building	Thanks, this part has been considerably rewritten and references to the sections are now included
329	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		549		550	The message of the two questions is not different, they seem to be very similar	Thank you, this part has been completely changed.

330	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		553		553	It is not understood what he means by "how is this changing in existing and emerging options"	Thank you, this part has been completely changed.
331	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		899			Table 6.3 The stamps ("of environmentally friendly practices"), do not enter as policy instruments or are they considered within some category?	Certification and labelling is considered as social-cultural policy instrument, and included in table 6.6
332	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		900			In Table 6.3 What is a "commodity future"?	This has now been defined in the text
333	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					In Table 6.7 Proportion of studies: Not clear proportion based on what ... total of studies? it does not add to 1	This table has been eliminated from the final version
334	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					In Table 6.8 some names are in acronyms and others are not, the writing should be standardized	This has been corrected
335	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		1340		1341	In terms of the methodology in selecting the values of certain categories, classification may be subjective to a certain degree and could have been based on personal interpretation. This clarification applies to the entire chapter and should be mentioned from the beginning and better specify what they refer to.	We added a sentence to the introductory session to highlight this potential bias in the assessment
336	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Section 6.3.1 "Policy options" is excessive (or unbalanced) the exemplification of urban systems and urban transformation	Thank you, efforts were made to simplify and clarify the text in this section.
337	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2242			This tool should be framed within the "land sharing / land sparing" debate, specifying which are the (environmental) criticisms of this approach.	This was noted, however this part needed to be reduced so not all the changes suggested could be taken into consideration.

338	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2853		2856	In the part of "The IPBES Global Assessment (IPBES, 2019a) showed evidence that production systems focused on economic growth correlate with environmental impacts in terms of ecological footprint, carbon footprint, greenhouse gases emissions, and energy consumption, both on micro / household and on macro / cross-national levels (Hayden & Shandra, 2009; Rosnick & Weisbrot, 2007)". Would it be assumed that the regulations and tools in this chapter should be in line with the economic tools, if they will not be of any	Thanks for this valuable comment. This section was revised and refined considering the comments received.
339	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2859			In section 6.3.2.3.1 "Policy tools" specify how they consider diverse values. It would be useful to include a type of guide or box on how the different actors, eg, governments or large companies, should integrate these types of tools. Or at least give an explanation. In the "Degrowth" section an explanation of how to implement it is included (L. 2916 - 2922) which is very useful, but is not presented in the others.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in this section, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
340	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2931			Section 6.3.2.3.2 "Gaps and barriers to transformational change" seems to be incomplete. These gaps are also not explained	Thank you for your comment. This section was integrated into a different part of the chapter.
341	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					In general, it would be useful if the tables and figures were more didactic. It is suggested that the titles of these are more explanatory and that they can be understood without having to review the text of the document. The tables are too big and the column titles are lost in the following sheets so you have to be browsing between pages to understand what information is being displayed	Thank you, efforts were made to modify and clarify the figures and simplify the tables.
342	Martha Bonilla	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					In section 6.3.1.3 "Incorporating diverse values in decision-making in oceans, coastal areas and fisheries", these citations do not appear in the references: Cavanagh et al., 2016; Berkes 2015; Charles 2017; Armitage 2017. It is suggested to recheck the bibliographic citations of this entire section	Noted, thank you for pointing this.
380	Michael Bordt	Government	Fisheries and Oceans Canada (comments are my own)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	860	30	861	Referring to Box 6.1: SEEA EEA was launched in 2012. The SEEA Central Framework has been around in various iterations since 1992. The SEEA Central Framework was declared an international statistical standard in 2012. The SEEA EA was declared an international statistical standard in 2021. This should also acknowledge that both manuals were the efforts of many national and international agencies, experts from academia and NGOs.	Thank you for this clarification, the textbox has been moved to the annex due to length limits, but the text has been modified according to your comment.
410	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	25	1	26	This comment on the executive summary is to succinct and vague. It would be enhanced by adding a short description of the policy instruments that you are refereng to and a short list of the valuation methods that have been supported by such policy instruments.	This key message has been fully rewritten.
411	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	263	9	263	You should describe in the caption the acronyms, for instance: IPLCs (indigenous peoples and local communities).	Thanks.

412	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	265	9	271	I believe that indigenous peoples and local communities could also be influencers and not only actors, as they can also influence Actors towards taking decisions, as the can influence how the governance of nature could be done in their territories.	Thank you, the current explanation highlights that IPLCs can also act as influencers.
413	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	16	459	16	469	I think there is missing references for many sentences in this paragraph.	Thank you, this last part of the introduction summed up the main findings from the sections, that is why we did not include references here (all references are included in the respective sections)
414	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	17	506	17	513	I think there is missing references for many sentences in this paragraph.	Thank you, this last part of the introduction summed up the main findings from the sections, that is why we did not include references here (all references are included in the respective sections)
415	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	844	29	846	As transaction cost is a main issue in PES schemes, it would be interesting if they could explain why (through an example) ecological financial transfer has a lower transaction cost.	Transaction costs might be lower in the case of ecological fiscal transfers because existing fiscal systems are used for the transfers (i. e. no new allocation system is generated in most cases). This is now clarified in the text with an additional reference.
416	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	32	899	32	900	When tables are longer than a page, it would be useful to copy the headings into the next pages. This apply to all the tables in this chapter (and maybe entire document).	Thank you for this suggestion, we redesigned the tables.
417	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	35	914	35	914	The final sentences in box 6.2 are describing some descriptive statistics that should be shown in a graph instead of a text.	Thanks, this is corrected
418	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	36	939	36	939	Because there are several challenges on the inclusion of IPLCs and they are such important actors, I consider they should expand a bit more what are the main challenges. It is currently too vague.	Agreed, thanks for your comment. The new structure of the section hopefully makes this clearer.
419	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	55	1297	55	1297	It would be interesting to include in this section figure 6.4 at some point, as it could be useful to identify which policies are located between the geographical-governance with stakeholder space.	Thank you for this suggestion - unfortunately figure 6.4 was eliminated from the final version of the chapter due to lack of space to provide a more detailed explanation.

420	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	63	1359	63	1362	Although the economic valuation may usually target governments and private sector, there is a relative recent paper that tries to value ES targeting indigenous people (Sangha et al. 2018, Ecosystem Services, Volume 31, Part A, Pages 111-125). It might be worth mention it.	Thank you for pointing about this development on ES targeting indigenous people. This is a valuable updates. However, this section addresses status quo, and the large majority of the current situation of ES value still aims private sector and business, so this sentence at the current form is still valid for the closing paragraph.
421	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	79	1802	79	1805	In my opinion, this sentence should be the introductory sentence of the paragraph as it is more general.	This section has been re-organized and the sentences are no longer in the same order.
422	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	81	1865	81	1865	Type error (bold): Decision-making processes fore ecosystem-based adaptation	Corrected
423	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	79	1798	84	1994	I believe the document could greatly be improved by adding a short section about ecosystem disservices in urban landscapes. There are few examples here: (1) Palta et al. 2016 Ecosystem Services and Disservices for a Vulnerable Population: Findings from Urban Waterways and Wetlands in an American Desert City. Human Ecology volume 44, pages 463–478. (2) Döhren and Haase 2015 Ecosystem disservices research: A review of the state of the art with a focus on cities. Ecological Indicators Volume 52, Pages 490-497	Noted, but not possible to go into details or case studies due to space limit.
424	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	79	1798	84	1994	It might be also worth to mention some aspects of COVID (?) For example, how people value green spaces after the COVID. For instance: Effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on the use and perceptions of urban green space: An international exploratory study. Ugolini et al. 2020 Urban Forestry & Urban Greening Volume 56, 126888	Urban biodiversity and linkages to health are highlighted in 6.3. We do mention the importance of having a plural values approach in the light of COVID
425	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	99	2337	101	2374	The agricultural section could also benefit if they include a short section about the perception of farmers about agricultural disservices: Blanco et al. 2020 How farmers feel about trees: Perceptions of ecosystem services and disservices associated with rural forests in southwestern France. Ecosystem Services, Volume 42, 101066	This was noted, however this part needed to be reduced so not all the changes suggested could be taken into consideration.
426	Sofia López-Cubillos	Organisation	The University of Queensland	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	104	2482	104	2487	Missing references	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
511	Diana Sietz	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	86	86	2040	2041	Changing vulnerability patterns resulting from future climate projections are mapped, regarding the near-term and long-term future, in Ethiopia by Shukla et al. (2021 in press). Ref Roopam Shukla et al. (2021) Dynamic vulnerability of smallholder agricultural systems in the face of climate change for Ethiopia. Environ. Res. Lett. in press https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/abdb5c	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.

523	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	23	1	23	It is not clear what 'out there' means. I suggest maybe rephrasing it.	This sentence was rephrased.
524	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	93	3	93	EbA is commonly used to refer to Ecosystem based Adaptation, not Approaches. I suggest revising the term.	Thanks, this abbreviation is eliminated.
525	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	12	364	12	365	In Figure 6.3 it is not clear what the colors are representing	Thank you, this figure has been dropped from the final version.
526	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	30	861	30	861	The authors mention a "third group" of instruments, but I could not find any mention in whatsoever about the other two groups. It was not clear that instruments were separated in groups. Maybe it was before and the authors changed their mind but forgot to change this part of the text? Or maybe by "third group" the authors are referring to the Ecosystem accounting instruments? It is not clear, I suggest revising this sentence.	This should be clearer in the revision - The third group consists of instruments which are more likely to maintain the status quo than induce change towards sustainability. T
527	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	44	1037	44	1045	Under environmental education, I find interesting to account for contextualized (environmental) education, as is the case of ECSAB, i.e. Educação Contextualizada para a convivência com o Semiárido Brasileiro (Contextualized education for the coexistence with the Brazilian Semiárido). Although, this is just a suggestion.	Thank you for the suggestion, this section focuses on the policy instrument and the case study is elaborate in the next section (6.2.3.3)
528	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	45	1061	45	1061	Again, the group subdivision is not clear. You mention a third group of instruments, but the other two groups were not mentioned. Maybe it is a lack of understanding from my part, but still I got confused and I suggest revising this.	The groups are now more clearly denoted with the first and second groups explicitly mentioned in the text.
529	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	64	1574	64	1600	If it is not beyond the scope, maybe the authors would consider mentioning the Articulação Semiárido Brasileiro (ASA)'s programs and projects in the Brazilian semiárid region that follow the Coexistence With the Semiaridity paradigm,	This is unfortunately beyond the scope as a specific methodology was followed to identify the cases explored here.
530	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	111	2683	111	2685	The exact same phrases are just above in the text. I suggest making some changes to not repeat the same thing.	Thanks for you comment. This section was refined for the final version.

531	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	142	3545	142	3545	In Table 6.13., in Social network, maybe you could mention the importance of cooperatives to empower indigenous peoples and local communities. For example, those at the Brazilian Semiarid (e.g. Coopercuc, ASA). This is just na idea, I don't know if it fits in this table.	Thank you for this suggestion - this table was removed from the final version.
532	Julia Niemeyer	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	158	3780	158	3780	In Table 6.5.1., in Goal 4, it could be interesting to include contextualized education in methods, and as a tool example the Contextualized Education for the Coexistence with the Brazilian Semiarid Region (ECSAB), which is paramount to reduce rural exodus by young people and to promote sustainable rural practices that respect the local environment (e.g. agroecological practices).	thanks for the comment, unfortunately and for space reasons we had to short the tables and examples.
563	Francis Agbere	Individual	OXFAM	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	8	241	11	331	One critical stakeholder we need to consider as well is the traditional authority and I suggest that we target them differently as a power wielder. In fact, in some settings like in Ghana, they wield more power and influence than central government when it comes to direct relationship with nature and its impact on the organisation of life. It's therefore important to decouple them from the broader citizenry as stakeholders who draw power from royal bloodlines.	Chapter 4 deals more emphatically on institutions of power. however, we have tried to incorporate various likely scenarios in 6.5 in the section highlighting different contexts of decision making
564	Francis Agbere	Individual	OXFAM	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	34	901	37	971	Increasingly important here as well is the use of marine spatial planning to enforce zoning strategy in the marine ecosystem. This could be looked at further and included in this section. See FAO document here: http://www.fao.org/3/i6043e/i6043e.pdf	Thank you for this suggestion, the reference has been added.
565	Francis Agbere	Individual	OXFAM	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	41	974	42	1020	The concept of natural resource inequality is critical but is not highlighted. It comes in strongly here if there is need to address/manage redistribution aimed at restoring some level of equality in the use of ecosystem services among vulnerable populations. The section mentions vulnerable groups however that is just one form of inequality. We should target social, spatial, economic and income inequality in overarching conservation policy to ensure that we are addressing long-held concerns of equity in the business of	Thank you for this relevant suggestion. Unfortunately due to the strict word limit of the chapter we could not include this addition in the text.
585	Thant Shin	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9				Ethnic Arm Organizatins (EAOs) and State Army supported Political Parties should also included in the figure.	Sorry but the comment was not clear about which figure should include EAOs and state army supported political parties
591	Bernadette Snow	Organisation	One Ocean Hub, University of Strathclyde	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	23	512	23	514	the inherent learning is not clear in the figure or explanatory text above the figure	Sorry, it is not clear which figure/table was perceived as difficult to understand. Figures in the introductory section has been largely modified and some of them eliminated.
592	Bernadette Snow	Organisation	One Ocean Hub, University of Strathclyde	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	1	54	1173	general feedback: the chapter well set out, the most important section is D and not sure the policy steps/implications pop out. In addition under valuation there is no mention of ocean accounting framework development. This may be in other chapters, but have not reviewed these.	Thank you, it has been incorporated in section 6.2.2.

599	Per Strömberg	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	45	32			Insert: However, emerging government proposals call for compulsory standards (e.g. Kvarnstrom and Zurek 2021). REF: Kvarnstrom, A. and Zurek, K. (2021) Trade Policy and Policy for Responsible Business Conduct: Contributing to a sustainable economic recovery. Report. Swedish Board of Commerce. Stockholm. Trade and RBC policy for sustainable recovery Kommerskollegium	This section has now been re-worked and does not contain the original sentence referred to here
600	Per Strömberg	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	53	28			Insert: International environmental law aims to secure the public's right to information, right to participation and right to remedy in environmental matters. Examples include the global Aarhus Convention. Another example is the Aarhus Protocol on Pollution Release and Transfer Registers, which is also an OECD juridical instrument. A recent example is the Escazu Agreement which entered into force in April 2021, a regional agreement for Latin America encompassing twelve countries. Recent studies suggest action paths of	Thank you, this is incorporated in section 6.2.2.
601	Per Strömberg	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	138	20			As an alternative to the above suggestion (No. 2), insert here: International environmental law aims to secure the public's right to information, right to participation and right to remedy in environmental matters. Examples include the global Aarhus Convention. Another example is the Aarhus Protocol on Pollution Release and Transfer Registers, which is also an OECD juridical instrument. A recent example is the Escazu Agreement which entered into force in April 2021, a regional agreement for Latin America	This section has now been re-worked and does not contain the original sentence referred to here
602	Per Strömberg	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	11			Insert: Qualifying the conventional view of transparency (a mere focus on reporting data) into notions of effective transparency that contributes to aligning business incentives to more positive socio-ecological outcomes (information on environmental harm is governed such that it is used and diffused to relevant stakeholders along the commodity chains). (Stromberg and Ituarte 2021). REF: Stromberg, P., and Ituarte-Lima, C., Untapping transparency: Bottom-up environmental information sharing and new technologies for	Thank you, the reference was added.
603	Per Strömberg	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	120	33			Insert "Extensions of the IPBES conceptual framework have been proposed that integrates human rights as both an end, and as a means towards positive socio-ecological outcomes (Ituarte and Stromberg 2018)." REF: Ituarte-Lima, C., and Stromberg, P. (2018) Sustainable Development Goal 16 and biodiversity: mainstreaming biodiversity, ecosystem services and human rights in the mining sector, SwedBio at Stockholm Resilience Centre, Stockholm, Sweden.	This section has now been re-worked and does not contain the original sentence referred to here
610	Cecilia Lindblad	Government	Swedish Environmental Protection Agency	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	45	32			Insert: However, emerging government proposals call for compulsory standards (e.g. Kvarnstrom and Zurek 2021). REF: Kvarnstrom, A. and Zurek, K. (2021) Trade Policy and Policy for Responsible Business Conduct: Contributing to a sustainable economic recovery. Report. Swedish Board of Commerce. Stockholm. Trade and RBC policy for sustainable recovery Kommerskollegium	This section has now been re-worked and does not contain the original sentence referred to here
611	Cecilia Lindblad	Government	Swedish Environmental Protection Agency	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	53	28			Insert: International environmental law aims to secure the public's right to information, right to participation and right to remedy in environmental matters. Examples include the global Aarhus Convention. Another example is the Aarhus Protocol on Pollution Release and Transfer Registers, which is also an OECD juridical instrument. A recent example is the Escazu Agreement which entered into force in April 2021, a regional agreement for Latin America encompassing twelve countries.	Thank you for the suggestion. We've amended the text, but have not included the example as to keep words down.
621	Cinnamon Mittan	Individual	Cornell University	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Genetic diversity is a pillar of biological diversity, and its maintenance is critical for species' persistence and adaptation in the future. However, there is very little mention of this important resource. Identified effects of urbanization in this section include "shrinking green areas, habitat loss and fragmentation, declining biodiversity and extinction of species, loss of ecosystem services, increased risk from natural or climate hazards, and reduced interaction with nature..." Loss of genetic diversity is an important impact underlying decline of	Agreed. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into the recommendation made by the reviewer.

622	Cinnamon Mittan	Individual	Cornell University	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	76	1720	77	1734	The ecological and environmental impacts of systemic racism in urban landscapes was outlined in the recent paper: Schell, C.J., Dyson, K., Fuentes, T.L., Des Roches, S., Harris, N.C., Miller, D.S., Woelfle-Erskine, C.A. and Lambert, M.R., 2020. The ecological and evolutionary consequences of systemic racism in urban environments. <i>Science</i> , 369(6510), several of which stem from habitat fragmentation (mentioned in this section) and subsequent loss of genetic diversity. Concepts from this paper may be informative for this section of the	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in this section, including reducing the text, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
843	Eszter Kovács	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	150	3772	163	3784	In Table 6.14. in collumn on policy tools and methodologies, the given tolls and methods are not consistent and sometimes not clear. E.g. interviews appear more times. It is not clear what the authors mean by comparativce methods. It would be useful if besides abbreviations full name would be given as well. Deliberative methods and participatory methods overlap. Databases can be considered as a tool (e.g. WDPA)? I suggest that the definition of methods is given. It might be useful to categorise the tools and methodologies.	Thanks for the comments. we improved the table, considering your comments.
844	Eszter Kovács	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	150	3772	163	3784	In Table 6.14. in cloumn on policy instruments and interventions some listed instrument seems not to be an instrument: e.g. natural infrastructure, rught to nature, FAO Voluntary Guidelines for Securing Sustainable Small-Scale Fisheries, Empower IPLCs and small-scale artisanal fishers for creating sustainable livelihoods based on healthy oceans., Reduce impacts through people centred actions. Abbreviations should be supplemented with full names otherwise they might not be understood by some readers.	Thanks for the comments. we improved the table, considering different cathegories
845	Eszter Kovács	Individual		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	150	3772	163	3784	For me leverage and entry points are not clear at all. Expalnation would be useful. They seem to be ad hoic and overlap overlap with policy instruments.	Leverage points are further explained in Chapter 5, section 5.3.2.1. Policy instruments are listed in the table only as potential tools to act upon the leverage points.
862	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	135	3352	136	3363	When it comes to discussing bridging capacity - and perhaps this is also germane to other sections that explore options/ tools/ approaches moving forward - I would encourage you to look at the work related to the concept of 'ethical space' advanced by Cree legal scholars Eddie Ermine and Elder Reg Crowshoe. This offers another great example of bridging across different worldviews and knowledge systems particuarly in regulatory and decision-making contexts. Ermine, W. (2007). The ethical space of engagement. <i>Indigenous LJ</i> , 6, 193.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the section, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
930	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	277	10	282	The chapter defined actors as "people and organizations who are directly involved in implementation/ decision making. In the diagram, nature is included as one of the actors. This does not seem to align to the definition of actors. The explanations provided why it is included is not very sufficient.	Thank you, the explanation was specified further.
931	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	12	364	12	365	Figure 6.3 provides a generalization without providing evidence on it. Depending on countries and issues, the types of decision-makers can play different roles. For example, in countries where local communities and indigenous people take part in decision-making, IPLCs can be both actors and influencers. In any case, examples and evidences need to be provided for organizing decision-makers to particular role in the diagram.	Thank you, this figure has been dropped from the final version, and the explanatory text now describes that the categories we suggest are synthetic ones (meaning that there is diversity within each stakeholder group)
932	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	15	425	15	429	Please refer to the previous comment on including nature as actors. In this diagram, it becomes even more obvious that nature should not be part of the actors/stakeholders because it has nothing to do with governance. How can nature be part of governance or how can it act to govern? Like Figure 6.3, Figure 6.4 presents a simplification of reality which may not hold true in many countries. For example, resource users can be international or multinational firms which governance (decision making) are made at international scale. Youth can also	Thanks for this comment. The figures has been changed/eliminated, and the accompanying text is rewritten to highlight that nature is not considered in Chapter 6 as a decision-maker but as an affected entity.

933	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	32	899	47	1093	The Tables 6.3-6.6 provide useful summaries on policy instruments. However, providing examples/evidence of best practice for applying them would be very useful for policymakers, to provide them with some models on what to do and what not to do when implementing those instruments. Few boxes can be added for selected best practices identified for the policy instruments to accompany the tables.	Some examples have been added in the text - however adding examples for each instrument is unfortunately beyond the scope of this assessment
934	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	57	1324	62	1326	Please add the Global Green Growth Institute (https://gggi.org/) in the table. It is an international intergovernmental organization which have been playing an important role in supporting countries to implement sustainable policies and programs, including sustainable landscapes. It is partner to governments in almost 40 developing countries.	We unfortunately cannot add additional instruments as it would not align with the methodology used to obtain these initiatives. However, we do stress that the initiatives are not meant to be exhaustive.
935	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	64	1364	75	1676	Please add the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) in the Place-based implementation of global initiatives: case study assessment. You will find lots of reports (https://gggi.org/reports/) on the Institute's country initiatives that are related to your assessment. This is particularly relevant because chapter 5 discusses in-depth green economy/growth, which is the focus of GGGI's work.	We unfortunately cannot add additional instruments as it would not align with the methodology used to obtain these initiatives. However, we do stress that the initiatives are not meant to be exhaustive.
1013	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					General comment: Guidance on how to improve the inclusion of multiple values (of different stakeholders) and valuation options into NBSAPs would be very much appreciated.	Some information regarding this is included in section 6.2.2.2, as well as in the annex of the chapter. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into this.
1014	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	General comment on chapter 6: This chapter is mature and well written. Congratulations! It provides concrete useful policy options on how to consider plural values of nature in decision-making processes. This information is required in the SPM as well. We strongly encourage the authors to screen the entire 200 pages chapter, and come up with a structure that could support the development of a new Table in the SPM on policy options. The headings under section 6.1 provide useful elements for the structuring of such a table, and the executive	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors. Your suggestion about length and structure was taken into consideration.
1015	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	General comment on chapter 6: The list of recent and diverse publications used to create this chapter is impressive.	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
1016	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	2	41	2	43	This sentence provides clear guidance of what sort of policy instruments are useful for facilitating transformative change, thereby recognizing diverse values. It is strongly suggested to move this sentence into the SPM, and consider it for populating a new SPM Table which provides guidance on options (1) how diverse values can be recognized by policy- and decision-making at different scales, (2) how decision-making processes can consider diverse values (e.g. education, legislation, regulation, public ownership,...), and (3) how to manage	Thanks, we did our best to incorporate this in the SPM, but due to several rounds of revisions the original wordings might have been changed.
1017	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	75	3	79	This sentence also provides guidance on how initiatives and organisations at transboundary level can help "bridging organizations or brokers". Please consider using this ideas as well for populating a new SPM Table on the uptake of plural values in decisions which should provide guidance.	Thank you.

1018	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	87	3	96	This sentence also provides guidance on how novel policy options, such as agro-ecological farming, One Health and community health etc.... approaches can offer robust and replicable processes towards transformation. Please consider using this ideas as well for populating a new SPM Table on the uptake of plural values in decisions which should provide guidance, including the cautionary aspect.	Thank you, this was considered when the final version of the SPM was prepared.
1019	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	4	108	4	119	Please ensure that the knowledge gaps mentioned in this para are listed in a Table on knowledge gaps that should be provided as an Appendix to the SPM. Please check 'Appendix 4' of the SPM of the Global IPBES Assessment on this matter.	Thanks. We have a better articulation of gaps now in 6.4
1020	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	4	120	4	134	Please ensure that guidance on capacity development outlined in this para is also included in the suggested new SPM Table on guidance to policy.	Thanks, in the SPM a separate key message is denoted to capacity development.
1021	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	4	135	4	142	It is suggested to check, whether the aspect of educational approaches that address sustainability can be moved into the proposed new SPM Table on guidance,	Thank you.
1022	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	5	149	5	154	It is suggested to consider the "four specific interventions areas", and associated instruments, which have been identified to be useful for their operationalisation for the proposed new SPM Table on policy guidance.	Thank you.
1023	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	5	155	5	160	It is suggested to consider the need for "sectoral and cross-sectoral approaches" in the proposed new SPM Table on policy guidance.	Thank you, in the final version of the SPM a completely new table was created to summarize some of the major options and opportunities for different types of decision-makers.
1024	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	5	161	5	169	This para provides concrete options that can guide policy for the operationalisation of multiple values of nature in real life decisions. It is suggested to consider this information in the proposed new SPM Table on policy guidance.	Thank you.
1025	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	6	183	6	187	It is suggested to consider the three aspects of governance which provide enabling conditions for systemic changes in the proposed new SPM Table on policy guidance.	Thank you, this part has been explained in more detail in the final version.

1026	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	8	241	8	248	Regarding asymmetries in power, the three stakeholder categories provided here could be useful in decision-making processes. It is suggested to discuss these in the SPM so that they can also inform the proposed new SPM on policy guidance.	Thanks for this suggestion, in the SPM section D we focus on the key stakeholders.
1027	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	265	9	337	Figure 6.2 on "stakeholder typology" is very useful because it shows the diversity of actors/values and power relationship that should be taken into account. It is suggested to consider this Figure in the SPM, with the description provided in L265-337 (pp. 9-11). In fact, please consider, whether the descriptions provided for the stakeholder typology can be included as a Table in more appropriate non-policy-prescriptive language in an appendix to the SPM? We also encourage you to consider a more appealing design for Figure 6.2.	Thank you, the figure has been changed.
1028	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	13	386	13	388	Table. 6.1 lists various policy instruments as available options in different types of decision-making contexts. It is suggested to consider this useful information in the SPM.	Thank you, it was considered.
1029	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	143	3571	143	3573	Please provide the page number in "IPBES, 2019a" for this citation.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1044	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		650		651	re "transformative governance focuses on: 1) the transformation of the ecosystem, which represents the changes in the state of ecosystem" this seems oddly narrow...NCP looks beyond ecosystems	Thank you, this paragraph has been considerably shortened and rewritten.
1045	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2475		2479	re "For 6 decades, local populations were often seen as a driver of biodiversity loss and detrimental to conservation." references/review needed. What are the facts here? I imagine it is indeed partly true that local populations can drive biodiversity loss and be detrimental to conservation	Thanks for pointing this, references were added.
1046	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2482		2486	re "In the past, protected areas were often created on lands that were worth protecting for their ecological and intrinsic values for society, without considering other values for local populations," protection for biodiversity has been about biodiversity option value etc. also, note that spatial planning has for a long time considered regional trade-offs in choosing protected areas, to minimise conflict with other needs of society. see e.g. references in Faith D. P. (2017) Ecosystem services can promote conservation over conversion and protect local	Thanks for your comment, this was revised. However this part needed to be reduced so not all the changes suggested could be taken into consideration.
1047	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2488		2491	is there a claim here that local peoples always protect global values of biodiversity? I do not think it is true.	The new structure of the paragraph hopefully makes this clearer.

1048	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2506		2509	again, is there a claim here that local peoples always protect global values of biodiversity? I do not think it is true.	Thank you. Our evidence shows that largely territories occupied/ managed by IPLCs are more biodiverse.
1049	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		2556		2560	again, is there evidence that they protect global values?	Conservation and sustainable use by IPLCs driven by instrumental, intrinsic and relational values have been reported in literature.
1143	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	15	1	25	This is an important conclusion. Is it included adequately in the SPM?	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1144	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	25	1	26	Could this conclusion be elaborated, like the other conclusions?	This key message has been fully rewritten.
1145	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	263	9	263	Figure 6.2 is challenging to understand. Could "power" and "interest" on the x and y axis be explained. It would be useful with more guidance on how to read the figure.	Thank you, the figure has been changed.
1146	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	846	29	853	This comment also includes box 6.1. The findings regarding possible shortcomings of the policy instrument "ecosystem accounting" should be included and discussed in the SPM, as it is an emerging instrument that is identified as very important for transformational change in the analysis.	Thank you, a sentence on ecosystem accounting has been added to SPM section D.
1147	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	150		163		We can see that these tables are not finished yet, but just wanted to mention that we think this format can be a useful way to summarize information. However its important not to overwhelm the reader with too much information and we noticed that for example the category "policy support tools and methodologies" has a lot of overlap and is perhaps not as suitable to present in table format.	Agreed. Action was taken towards this suggestion.
1148	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	4	114	4	116	Values fungibility and how it is a key challenge is difficult to understand. Can it be explained better?	Thanks, the text has been rewritten for clarifications.

1149	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	19	546	20	578	These questions are challenging to follow for the reader. Can this section be simplified and include fewer questions?	Thank you, this part has been completely changed.
1150	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	22	645	25	740	This is a long description of criteria and the criteria should be more concrete. It is difficult to understand how the criteria are measured and used to evaluate the policy instruments. What constitutes a "yes" in the evaluation tables is not clear. Could this be explained.	Thank you for pointing this out. The different aspects of transformative governance is now rewritten and moved to section 6.1, while the detailed explanation of the assessment criteria and the scoring approach can be found in the annex.
1151	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	27	797	47	1093	General comment: The results of the policy instrument analysis should be better incorporated into the SPM	Thank you, a specific key message sums up the main conclusions from this analysis.
1152	Nina Vik	Government	Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	30	874	30	881	How are environmental subsidies defined in this section? From the text it seems that all subsidies that can affect the environment are included in the definition, both in a positive and a negative direction. Is this a reasonable definition, when comparing environmental subsidies to other policy instruments that are specifically designed to improve the environment?	This has been clarified in the final version, highlighting that some environmental subsidies are counterproductive, and the elimination of harmful subsidies is a key step forward.
1353	Nathalie Hilmi	Individual	Centre scientifique de Monaco	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	118	2874	118	2878	Also behavioral economics	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in this section, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1354	Nathalie Hilmi	Individual	Centre scientifique de Monaco	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	119	2914	119	2914	Also sustainable finance and blue funds	This paragraph had to be reduced. To include the recommendation from the reviewer a cite would have been needed.
1361	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	77	3	77	The Capitals Coalition is one of the key organization to be listed within the global partnerships and networks bridging organizations together to integrate the values of nature into decision makers across business, finance and governments.	Thank you, included in the analysis in 6.2.3., but we deleted the examples from the key message to avoid confusion.
1362	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	Box 6.1			Please, add the Capitals Coalition explicitly to this sentence (as the Capitals Coalition was originally the TEEB for Business) as one of the global initiatives: 'Beside standards, targets and policy frameworks, various knowledge and capacity development programmes are available to policy makers, corporations, non-governmental organisations, and statisticians therein, ranging from global initiatives like the WAVES or TEEB, to professional partnerships (e.g., We Value Nature) and place-based research and innovation projects (e.g. the	We have moved this box out of the main text

1363	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	Box 6.1			Please, mention explicitly the Natural Capital Protocol in this sentence, as the standardized framework developed by the Capitals Coalition: 'The System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA) was launched in 2012 by the UN Statistical Office to provide international standards for national accounts, while the Natural Capital Coalition created standards for corporate natural capital accounting'. Suggested new sentence: 'The System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA) was launched in 2012 by the UN	We have moved this box out of the main text
1379	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	1	172	3994	The chapter mentions the concept of "transformative governance" on numerous occasions, particularly in section 6.2 which includes it as a title. The incorporation of this concept carries the same considerations as the concept of "transformative change". It is a concept that requires further discussion since its scope is not clear. Changing or transforming the practice of governance has multiple implications that must be further analyzed based on a precise definition. On the other hand, it is considered that the initiatives derived from this conceptual framework	Thank you - we tried to explain more clearly our analytical approach to transformation governance in section 6.1
1380	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	1	1	172	3994	In addition, regarding the references cited to substantiate the incorporation of the concept "transformative governance", the following considerations are made: The references are from Pelling, 2015; Chaffin, 2016, Collof 2017 and Kelly 2019. These belong to works published by researchers and / or institutions from the United Kingdom, the United States, Sweden, France, Australia, Peru and Norway. The absence in the bibliography of publications originating in developing countries is observed, even in the focus of these works,	Thank you very much for the comments and the references, we have tried to consider literature also from the south which is difficult to find in international journals.
1381	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	20	594	20	594	Göpel, 2016 is cited in: page 20 l.594, page 24 l.711, page 148 l.3753, however it does not appear in the bibliography list.	Thank you for pointing this out, the reference should be Göpel, M. (2016). The Great Mindshift: How a New Economic Paradigm and Sustainability Transformations go Hand in Hand. The Great Mindshift: How a New Economic Paradigm and Sustainability Transformations go Hand in Hand.
1382	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	17	506	17	513	Repeat the same paragraph on p. 123, lines 3018 to 3025	Thank you for spotting this overlap, this section is now completely rewritten
1383	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	109	2621	110	2628	Regarding the concept of "planetary health, which is based on the concept of" planetary boundaries ", further analysis is required on the implications that its incorporation in this draft may have, since it seems to point towards the dissolution of the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities. On the other hand, Whitmee 2015 et al. is mentioned, but the reference is not found in the bibliography.	Noted and included.
1384	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	110	2633	110	2644	References to the EcoHealth approach should be included.	This reference was added.
1385	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MArDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	134	3312	22	3331	Regarding point 6.4.4.1, an analysis based on the following bibliography is observed: Gagné & Deci, 2005; Lawler & Hall, 1970; Lambin 2005; Balmford, 2002; Cormier & Gordon and Young, 2002. These belong to works published by researchers and / or institutions from the United States, the United Kingdom, the Netherlands and Belgium. The absence in the bibliography of publications originating in developing countries is observed, even in the focus of these works, which do not incorporate, at least explicitly, the perspective of these	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the section, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.

1386	Government of Argentina	Government	Secretariat of Environmental Policy on Natural Resources - MAyDS	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	135	3327	135	3327	Kent & Myers 2001, is cited but it is not included in the bibliography section.	Noted, thank you for pointing this.
1395	Yasuo Takahashi	Organisation	Institute for Global Environmental Strategies	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	27	797	28	820	There is empirical evidence on the impacts of different policy instruments, or policy mix, on values of nature from site-based projects: Takahashi Y, Park KJ, Natori Y, et al (2021) Enhancing synergies in nature's contributions to people in socio-ecological production landscapes and seascapes: lessons learnt from ten site-based projects in biodiversity hotspots. Sustain Sci 1:3. doi: 10.1007/s11625-021-00927-w While this is not specifically about transformative change, creating	Thank you, this reference has been added.
1396	Yasuo Takahashi	Organisation	Institute for Global Environmental Strategies	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	24	722	24	731	The below paper also provides the basis for the main statement in this paragraph: Takahashi Y, Park KJ, Natori Y, et al (2021) Enhancing synergies in nature's contributions to people in socio-ecological production landscapes and seascapes: lessons learnt from ten site-based projects in biodiversity hotspots. Sustain Sci 1:3. doi: 10.1007/s11625-021-00927-w	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1397	Yasuo Takahashi	Organisation	Institute for Global Environmental Strategies	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	44	1024	44	1034	The below paper further supports the utility of co-management for taking into account multiple values in landscape/seascape management: Takahashi Y, Park KJ, Natori Y, et al (2021) Enhancing synergies in nature's contributions to people in socio-ecological production landscapes and seascapes: lessons learnt from ten site-based projects in biodiversity hotspots. Sustain Sci 1:3. doi: 10.1007/s11625-021-00927-w	Thank you. We have included the reference.
1402	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	97	3	107	After this paragraph: "Incorporating a narrow set of values in decision making is more likely to limit the opportunities for transformative change and sustainable futures. Operationalizing plural and multiple values of nature in decision making requires taking into account diverse needs, purposes, processes, capacities, tools, policies, decisions, and knowledge systems of different stakeholders. This further helps achieve sustainable development goals. A progressive shift from a more singular to a more pluralistic value approach can	Thank you for this suggestion. As in our analysis we could not find strong empirical evidence to back this addition, we decided to keep the original wording.
1403	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	8	232	12	351	I suggest incorporating into the text that the "common citizen" can be found in one or more categories. Or even to be given space in an additional category.	Thank you, citizens are now included.
1404	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	11	326	11	330	It is important to recognize the role and efficiency that the media and digital media have in transmitting information and socio-environmental values. However, in its negative aspect, the media can also distort and "implant" values. And in the current context, I would even dare to consider them as "super influencers". For all this, I suggest that towards the end of the chapter (where it is discussed how to operationalize the "values assessment") it is important to point out the need to sensitize and train them to have them as strategic allies for the	Thank you, we considered this comment in section 6.4 on capacity development
1405	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	23	685	23	694	After this paragraph: "Transformative governance requires addressing a wide range of institutional, legislative, social, and economic challenges as the part of persistent problems that inhibit sustainability (Steven and Kanie, 2016). Transformative governance to address these challenges can be stimulated by providing learning and experimenting conditions within social and institutional networks that differ from traditional practices. These conditions can be provided by making decision-making processes open and transparent, engaging more local	Thanks for this very relevant addition. Unfortunately, due to word limits, the whole section on transformative governance should have been shortened, so we did not have the opportunity to incorporate the suggested text.

1406	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	28	835	28	838	After these sentences: "While it can incorporate multiple values and can be accompanied by strong capacity development, high transaction costs, uneven power relations, and unequal distribution of benefits can undermine its transformative potential (Porrás et al., 2012; Salzman et al., 2018; Berbes-Blasquez, 2016; Caceres et al., 2016; Van Hecken et al., 2017) ", I suggest to consider these ideas: "However, this potential can be corroborated by observing that it can also promote pro-environmental organizational behaviors and capacities, depending on	Thank you for the suggestion. While the proposed sentence is very relevant, however we also need to share the remaining space of this section with explanation on other instruments so we can only partially incorporate the suggestion into the existing sentence. (see the proposed revision on Column R beside this response)
1407	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	29	860	30	861	In Box 6.1 I suggest adding "or the cultivation of plants that are commercially valued such as avocado, coconut palm or soybean", after of the phrase "However, due to lack of funds and robust institutional structures, such a mix of green economy policy instruments in many cases cannot make nature conservation more profitable than extraction (Fletcher et al., 2019) ".	We have moved this box out of the main text
1408	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	77	1742	78	1750	After these sentences: "Nature experiences have been identified as critical for people's learning about and engaging in biodiversity conservation and sustainability (Beery et al., 2015; Marcus et al., 2016), but the changes in land-use cover and lifestyle associated with urbanization put people's experiences of nature at the risk of extinction, sometimes referred to as the 'extinction of experience' (Botzat et al., 2016; Soga & Gaston, 2016). Several scholars warn of a negative cycle, where this lack of exposure can result in growing	Thanks for your comment, this was noted, however it was not possible to change the narrative of this part.
1409	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	105	2505	105	2511	After this paragraph: "While the former are accepted conservation 'experts' by governments and policy-makers, the latter are frequently marginalized in their contribution to conservation and their knowledges are not heard, despite having shaped, lived and managed these ecosystems and their biodiversity for centuries (Tauli-Corpuz et al., 2020), in the course of which they have obtained intricate ecological knowledge and developed social norms and rules for a more sustainable resources use (Aswani et al., 2018; Carson et al., 2018);	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed. That said, we have tried to incorporate this idea in the chapter
1410	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	111	2691	116	2851	Throughout Chapter 6 and in other chapters the intergenerational transmission of values is discussed (especially with IPLCs, within the boxes, tables y case studies). It would be good to incorporate it into the text, in a more explicit way. Likewise, it would propose work and intervention teams that are intergenerational. Taking into account that the transmission comes from the ancestors and also comes from current adults, those who are part of an indigenous and local community, and those who come from cities and medium-sized towns,	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into intergenerational transmission of values, however there are some mentions in this chapter and also in Chapter 5.
1411	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	118	2862	118	2876	After these sentences: "There is considerable literature coming out of sociology and psychology addressing why people consume and how nudges or tools can be used to reduce unsustainable consumption (Sunstein, 2015).", I suggest to consider these ideas: "This will require intense intervention work with business organizations and their leaders. Which implies from sensitizing them, informing them, training them and motivating them to reflect on the transformational change that humanity needs to carry out after 2020. As well as on the	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed.
1412	Adriana Saldaña Espejel	Individual	Citizen group, in community and with ecosystems (Grupo ciudadano , en comunidad y con los ecosistemas).	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	167	3841	172	3994	Towards the end of the chapter in the section "6.5 Operationalization of multiple values for transformative change", I suggest that the authors insist on the importance of integrating transdisciplinary teams to advance the change that is needed. If this is not possible within the same institution or group, let them participate through collaborations between institutions (such as those achieved by scientists). In such a way that you can also count on the ideas and participation, for example, of behavioral psychologists, sociologists and artists, etc.	Yes, we agree this is also the part of knowledge weaving and co-production.
1504	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	It is suggested to incorporate a language with a gender perspective that emphasizes the importance of the role of women. Interventions with a gender perspective, not only in theory, but in practice.	Thanks for your comment, this aspect was integrated into the final version of the chapter.

1505	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	More emphasis needs to be placed on fresh waters, especially on issues such as fisheries.	We thank your comment. This topic is now part of the chapter.
1506	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Practical routes are lacking.	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1507	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Address the role of the government to generate enabling conditions for the private sector and financial sector to incorporate new non-economic values.	Thank you for this suggestion. It is indeed important how the key actors can influence each other and enable or constraint the incorporation of multiple values. Unfortunately, due to the limited timeframe and the strict word limits, we could not investigate these cross-links among the actors (incl. governments role to push the private sector), except a few specific cases.
1508	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Recognition of the traditional knowledge of communities: there are examples of collective management of biodiversity and forests such as UZACHI and many more.	We thank your comment. More information regarding this topic was integrated in the last version of the chapter.
1509	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	More emphasis should be placed on local governments.	Thank you for this suggestion, we agree that local governments have an important role and space to act, and we tried to highlight this via local level case studies included in boxes.
1510	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	A strategy of reciprocal integration of the values of nature to facilitate their integration in other sectors is not being considered.	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1511	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	The fundamental role of the financial sector is not considered. It is a fundamental sector to promote transversal changes.	We thank your comment. More information regarding this topic was integrated in the last version of the chapter.
1512	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Territorial management approach as an approach option to operationalize the multiple valuation process.	Thank you for the suggestion, but it would be needed a reference in order to incorporate this recommendation.

1513	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Take into account that there is a lack of competencies in decision makers to read, understand the document and make adequate decisions. They don't have time or resources, especially in local governments.	Thanks for your comment, hopefully the new structure of the chapter makes it easier to read and understand.
1514	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	To raise awareness, consider contextualizing the findings and give practical examples to facilitate better understanding and ownership.	Comment is just a judgement with no argumentation.
1515	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	The lack of transparency in the management of natural resources limits the effective and inclusive participation of relevant stakeholders in landscapes. This also results in the lack of spaces for dialogue to translate the values that favor nature into the language of the values of other sectors with greater decision-making power and which generally have a negative impact on biodiversity.	Thanks for your comment, however a suggested reference would have been needed to incorporate this into the text.
1516	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	There is no capacity in other sectors to analyze, interpret and implement actions to include multiple values.	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1517	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	The executive summary should reflect the key messages it is meant to convey. The executive summary should include key messages stated and add examples, diagrams and data, rather than an explanation of the message.	Thanks for your comment, this section was improved for the final version.
1518	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	It will be necessary to design a very clear toolbox for decision makers. The document alone will not be very useful.	Noted, thanks for your comment.
1519	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	If no recommendations can be made (policy relevant, but not policy prescriptive), at least integrate small case studies so that decision makers can "see themselves" and avoid too ethereal / abstract messages.	Thanks for your comment, section 6.5 aims to give examples and guidelines.
1520	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Be more specific in the recommendations for all scales.	Noted, thanks for your comment.

1521	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	The territorial management approach facilitates intersectoral interactions. It can be a useful approach to operationalize these valuations.	Thanks for your comment, however a suggested reference would have been needed to incorporate this into the text.
1522	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Capacity building is essential, but the impact on public policies through the diversity of who participates and how, is key to make changes.	Thanks for your comment, however a suggested reference would have been needed to incorporate this into the text.
1523	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	A capacity diagram is good to describe the process, complemented with a training program for civil servants.	Thanks for your comment, section 6.5 aims to give examples and guidelines.
1524	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Leave the information on academic studies (eg message 4 line 45-46) as footnotes and include examples that have been applied in local, state, federal governments.	Noted, thanks for your comment. There was an effort for improving this.
1525	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Beyond building capacities, diversity should be incorporated into decision-making groups (governments).	Thanks for your comment, however a suggested reference would have been needed to incorporate this into the text.
1526	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Consider in a clear and defined way the financial sector as a joint part of the business sector. This is already being considered in the CBD's Long-Term Strategy for the Integration of Biodiversity, to be approved at SBI-3.	Thanks for your comment, this was revised. The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
1527	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Examples: Progress such as the integration of values conducted by the WB or the IDB (taking as an example their progress in the decarbonization of their investments).	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1528	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Give more emphasis to local governments, make recommendations for this scale and listen to local governments as they can contribute based on their experience.	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately given the scope of the assessment we cannot delve very deeply into local recommendations. There is however an effort to include case studies along the chapter

1529	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Consider the realities of the different stakeholders. Usually, recommendations are aspirational and difficult to achieve, since neither the institutions nor the localities have the support, resources, capacities, tools to implement them.	Thanks for your comment, however a suggested reference would have been needed to incorporate this into the text.
1530	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Integrate / mention other stakeholders, such as small-scale private owners.	Noted, thanks for your comment. we have clarified the choice of stakeholders targeted by the assessment.
1531	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	0	0	0	0	Consider strategies for capacity building in the legislative and judicial sectors because they are valuable for the design, implementation and compliance of regulatory frameworks (current and / or potential)	The chapter now includes several examples of strategies for capacity building and capacity assessment in a legal and judicial context.
1532	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	3	77	3	77	Include other global NGOs in addition to WWF, such as TNC, WRI, etc.	Thank you, other NGOs were included in the analysis in 6.2.3, but we deleted the examples from the key message to avoid confusion.
1724	Adriana Saldaña	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					A lo largo del capítulo 6 y en otros capítulos se trata el tema de la transmisión intergeneracional de los valores (especialmente en los estudios de caso de los IPLCs y dentro de los cuadros y tablas), en el Ch6 sería bueno incorporarlo al texto de una manera más explícita y visible. Planteando equipos de trabajo y de intervención que sean intergeneracionales. Tomando en cuenta que la transmisión viene desde los ancestros, sí, pero también proviene de los adultos actuales, los que son parte de una comunidad indígena y local y los que provienen de	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1725	Andrea Muñoz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					La educación debe ser un tema transversal para el cambio transformativo hacia la sostenibilidad. Se debería hacerlo más explícito para que se lo pueda incorporar de manera URGENTE en las instituciones de educación, incluyendo niveles de educación primaria, secundaria y superior, formal e informal. Incluir de manera más agresiva lo que sucede en los colegios - falta mucho llegar al cambio transformativo, y será fundamental incluir a los jóvenes y niños en el cambio pues los tiempos de formación son largos en todos los niveles y	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1726	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Hacer comparación de diferentes valores - que parecen difíciles de comparar; análisis multicriterio - grupo de herramientas, para el análisis. En Colombia, biodiversity offsets - metodologías limitadas. Entonces, ¿cuál es el pool de herramientas que se pueden ofrecer a funcionarios de diferentes sectores? Conflicto armado en Colombia requiere incluir la biodiversidad - entonces, un grupo específico de metodologías para la operacionalización	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1727	Ricardo Castro-Díaz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Table 6.2 Vulnerabilización de las comunidades - se ven vulnerabilidades en conflictos, que surgen al momento de la operacionalización. Conflictos que se superponen a las realidades de los pueblos - entonces hacer énfasis en las limitaciones que existen durante los diálogos entre pueblos y gobierno. Esto repercute en la forma de valoración final y en la mejora de condiciones de vida.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1728	Adriana Saldaña	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Pensar en la formación de equipos de trabajo encargados de que la evaluación de valores pudiera internalizarse en la toma de decisiones de instituciones como las gubernamentales y las empresas. Como ejemplo, los grupos de trabajo que se integraron antes de la COP de Biodiversidad con el objeto de transversalizar el tema de la biodiversidad en algunos sectores productivos (iniciativa "Mainstreaming of Biodiversity), en las secretarías (ministerios) de turismo, agricultura, medio ambiente y forestal.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1729	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Debido a que existen conflictos socio-ambientales entre varios sectores, es importante hacer énfasis sobre el acuerdo de Escazú - porque aún es relevante.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1730	Aracely Burgos	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		435			Escalas - implementación en escalas locales mucho más que a escala global.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1731	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					TEEB - retomar el enfoque de escalas local, regional y global. Identificar los pasos metodológicos a escala. Para la incorporación de valores	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1732	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Figura 6.4, mostrarla en otros puntos del documento; para ilustrar la toma de decisiones. Hay otros acuerdos internacionales que pueden retomar para hablar sobre la integración de valores. Por ejemplo, la legislación colombiana ambiental es reconocida como la mejor, pero hay carencias en la implementación. Entonces, hacer énfasis en cómo lo global puede permear lo internacional.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1733	Ricardo Castro-Díaz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Procesos interescalares y repercusión. Faltan diservicios ecosistémicos y cómo se van planteando nuevos mecanismos de diservicios. Pérdida de biodiversidad por fumigación en Colombia.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1734	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Enfatizar cómo herramientas internacionales (i.e. Escazú) podrían reforzar la implementación de herramientas o políticas nacionales	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1735	Aracely Burgos	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					IPLCs - se mencionan como importante y relevante - complementan la necesidad de lo local	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1736	Alessandra Ribeiro de Moraes	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Valoración - considerando fronteras entre países y que los servicios van más allá de las fronteras; hay políticas que no consideran esto. En Brasil hay PSA pero esto puede cambiar de acuerdo con quien está al frente del gobierno. Medidas, como la educación, pueden contribuir a que estos cambios no estén sujetos a la administración.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1737	Alejandra Larrzábal	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Necesidad de generar cambios sustanciales en los programas educativos en los países para incluir trasescalaridad, pensamiento a largo y corto plazo, transgeneracionalidad. Esto, independiente a la edad, es una capacidad que debe generarse desde las edades tempranas. Puntualizar capacidades importantes y urgentes, para que no queden diluidas en el documento.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1738	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Identificar los efectos de la pérdida de especies. Intervenciones internacionales, de comando-control o de incentivar la conservación. Identificar las herramientas que se pueden promover para que participen diferentes grupos y que expresen sus preferencias, para que tengan una participación efectiva	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1739	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Cómo las empresas valoran a la biodiversidad. Algunas empresas están interesadas, pero no tienen claros los conceptos.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1740	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Reto estratégico: cómo aproximarnos a los diferentes sectores y grupos de tomas de decisiones: IPLCs que definan diferentes reglas y aproximarlos para que puedan apropiarse de los puntos que se exponen en el SPM	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1765	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Great job in the coverage of different policies. The chapter would benefit from looking back into chapter 4 to identify important policies and policy instruments to recover in Ch. 6.	We cross-checked Ch4 and did a systematic analysis of the bright-spot valuation uptake cases identified by Ch4 in section 6.2.2.
1766	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				The assessment of policies would benefit from providing a sense of how many people they have impacted, which ecosystems, for which drivers of change.	Thank you for this suggestion. As section 6.2.2 was based on a meta-analysis of previous IPBES assessments, we found it difficult to incorporate such level of detail. However, section 6.3 provides policy options in a much contextualized way.
1767	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Reasons for uptake of valuation can relate to costs, risks and institutions	Thanks, agree. This is addressed partly in 6.4 (on gaps), and partly in chapter 4

1768	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Literature on disasters can provide an opportunity for improved environmental opportunities. The COVID aspects could be discussed in that context.	Thanks for you valuable comment, both aspects are now incorporated in the text.
1769	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Natural capital is described as a capitalist approach. Language should be used carefully with regards to this aspects.	Thank you, modifications were made.
1770	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Discussions on GDP and other indicators (related to policy) are missing.	We added a short explanation on alternative measures of economic welfare.
1771	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The chapter confuses the use of 'flow' and 'wealth'.	Sorry but the comment is not specific enough in terms of which parts of the text are confusing. Many of the sections have been redrafted for the final version.
1797	Michaela Faccioli	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					I haven't read the Dasgupta report, but is it maybe contributing by illustrating some real world examples where the Nat Cap approach has been adopted by policy-makers over the last decade and has (can) delivered change? I don't know - just thinking of the experience in the UK (where the natural capital concept has made its way into legislation etc.)	Thank you for this suggestion. Due to word limits only a brief explanation is included in the main text about natural capital accounting without exemplary cases. Some more details are included in the supplementary material, though.
1798	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The first inclusive wealth report from UN (140 counties) is from 2014, novel?	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference to the text or explanation provided.
1852	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		3771		3771	The Table shouldl also include participatory action methods such as Photovoice or creativevoice. Rivera Lopez et al.2018. Finding CreativeVoice: Applying Arts-Based Research in the Context of Biodiversity Conservation (Sustainability , 10(6), 1778; https://doi.org/10.3390/su10061778	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into the recommendation made by the reviewer.
1853	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	University of Reading, UK	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	2	49	2	55	socio cultural or customary and rights-based instruments often include a)values for non-humans and b) consider habits habits and routines that can be themselves objects of deliberation and decision - absence of discrete moment of decision should not be confused fro lack of deliberation	Thank you, we did not intend to say that socio-cultural, customary and rights-based instruments lack deliberation, on the contrary, we found that these instruments better capture multiple values and interests. The key message was reformulated.

1854	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	University of Reading, UK	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	4	108	4	119	key gaps: should here be added also lack of knowdeg how to create appropriate context that would empower quiet voices to express traditional knowledge? Doe sknow-how refer to aproprate process?	Thanks, the final version includes much more detail on the gaps.
1855	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	University of Reading, UK	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	9	277	10	282	Nature (actor) - should better speak about Non-Humans (actors) or Non-Human nature (actors). If we are - very correctly - argueing fro moving beyond the cutlruee - nature dualism then we cannot refer to humans and nature as humans are separate from nature. you could say humans and the rest of nature. i think this is a imporant point.	Thank you, corrected.
1856	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	University of Reading, UK	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	8	232	12	351	add arts and artists (both practitioner and researchers) as influencers and actors - art can elicit and create values, can influence decisions and provoke and change perceptions. See historic examples in the publication Saratsi, E., Acott, T., Allinson, E., Edwards, D., Fremantle, C., Fish, R. 2019, Valuing Arts and Arts Research. Valuing Nature Paper VNP22. available at https://valuing-nature.net/valuing-arts-and-arts-research i could present more hsitoric examples	Thank you, arts are included in the final version.
1899	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	48	1104	50	1105	Table 6.7 - How was this analysis preformed? If it is based in Chapter 4 please note what data management report is associated with the analysis	The methodology is explained in the methodological section, and this is now explicitly referred to in this section
2042	Adriana Saldaña	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Throughout chapter 6 and other ones, the intergenerational transmission of values is discussed, although it is mentioned mostly in IPLCs' case studies and within the tables and figures. So, I suggest to incorporate it into the text in a more explicit and visible way in this chapter. Also, it would be interesting to make intergenerational work and intervention teams. Moreover I consider the transmission comes not only from the ancestors but also from adults from recent generations, who are part of indigenous, local communities, even of	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into intergenerational trasmission of values, however there are some mentions in this chapter and also in Chapter 5.
2043	Andrea Muñoz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Education must be an imperative topic for a transformative change towards sustainability. It should be more explicit, so it can be URGENTLY incorporated into educational institutions, including different formal and informal education stages, from the most basic to the highest ones. I consider it should be Include, in a more wide way, what happens in schools due to the long way that exists to reach a transformative change, so it will be important to include young people and children into the change, since training times are long at all	Thank you, a separate subsection was developed for educational approaches.
2044	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It should be good to make a comparison of different values, because they seem difficult to compare, doing a multicriteria analysis and giving a group of tools to make an appropriate analysis. In Colombia, biodiversity offsets - llimited methodologies. So, what would be the group of accurate tools, which can be offered to the several stakeholders or decision makers from different sectors? I consider the armed conflict in Colombia requires to include biodiversity, therefore a specific group of methodologies to do so would be a good help.	Assessing the specific methodologies and tools to assess diverse values were outside the scope of this chapter. However, we did, in our assessment of values in section 6.2., consider how different methodologies/tools - and how they are used - can contribute to the inclusion or exclusion of diverse values
2045	Ricardo Castro-Díaz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Table 6.2 I suggest it is necessary to take into consideration the vulnerabilization of communities, especially during the operacionalization, in which it is possible to find vulnerabilities during conflict situations. There are overlap conflicts on the realities of communities, so it should emphasize the limitations that exist during the dialogues between communities and government. This type of issues could have repercussions on the final assessment and on the improvement of living conditions.	Thanks for your comment. This is further discussed in Chapter 4.

2046	Adriana Saldaña	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It would be good to broach topics about making team works which could make values assessments specialized in decision-making of institutions such as governments and companies. An example might be the work groups formed before the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity (COP), in order to work on issues of biodiversity in some productive sectors ("Mainstreaming of Biodiversity" initiative), in the ministries of tourism, agriculture, environment, among others.	Whilst we didn't cover specific examples of what make teams work, we have included consideration of these in section 6.2. (see figure 6.6) and also in section 6.5, relating to the operationalization of diverse values in different context, including the contexts mentioned here.
2047	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					There are several socio-environmental conflicts between different society sectors, it is important to consider the Escazú agreement, because of its relevance even today.	We referred to the Escazú Agreement, thanks for the suggestion.
2048	Aracely Burgos	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature		435			There is a lack of scales, it would be helpful to use local scales even more than global ones.	Thanks, more cases on local implementation were added to sections 6.2.3 and 6.3.
2049	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Taking into consideration The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity (TEEB), go back to an approach of local, regional and global scales would be useful. Also, to identify methodological steps at every scale, in order to the incorporation of values.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
2050	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					The Figure 6.4 is important. So I suggest showing it throughout the document to illustrate decision making. There are other international agreements that can be considered to talk about the integration of values. As an example, Colombian environmental legislation is recognized as one of the bests, although it is not well implemented at all. It would be interesting to emphasize how the global aspects can permeate the international ones.	Unfortunately this figure was eliminated from the final version.
2051	Ricardo Castro-Díaz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					An important issue to take into consideration is processes at different scales and their impact. The "Ecosystem disservices" are an interesting matter to analyze, also how new "disservices" mechanisms are being developed. I suggest to take a look into loss of biodiversity due to fumigation in Colombia.	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed. However different case studies were integrated to the chapter.
2052	Sofía López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Emphasizing how international tools (i.e. Escazú Agreement) could strengthen the use of national tools or policies.	Thank you for your comment, this reference was added to the chapter.
2053	Aracely Burgos	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					As an important part of this topic, the IPLCs can be a complement to do an assessment at local scale.	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.

2054	Alessandra Ribeiro de Moraes	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					About valuation, taking into consideration borders between countries and how Ecosystem Services go beyond borders, there are policies which do not take into consideration this. An example might be Brazil, which has environmental services payments, but this type of policies can change according to the elected government. The education is a fundamental tool to ensure these policies could not be changed depending on the government.	Whilst we do not discuss this example specifically, we do make the point that Scale mismatches occur widely and lead to 164 implementation gaps and cross-scale conflicts
2055	Alejandra Larrazábal	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					There is a need to generate substantial changes in educational programs within the countries, in order to include different scales, long and short-term thinking, and transgenerational issues. Thus, regardless of age, it is a skill which must be developed from early ages. Pointing out important and essential skills, to these not be lost throughout the document.	Thank for your comment. This topic was expanded and refined.
2056	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It is necessary to identify the effects of species loss. Include international interventions, about command-control or promoting conservation issues would be helpful. Moreover, identify the tools which can be promoted to warrant and increase the joining of different groups showing their opinions.	These drivers of biodiversity loss are mentioned in several places in the chapter.
2057	Sofia López	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					It should be useful to include how companies value biodiversity. There are some companies interested about that, although they do not have a clear knowledge with respect to it.	Thanks for pointing this. A reference to this can be found in section 6.2.2.3.
2058	Jaime Erazo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					A strategic challenge is how to approach the diverse social sectors and decision makers. The IPLCs can define different rules, and if they get closer to this topics, so they could know and learn more about the concerns exposed in the SPM.	Agreed. Hopefully the new structure of the chapter helps highlighting this.
2114	Arantza Murillas	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					One of the main problems in terms of operationalisation are data gaps. By covering larger areas you can consider more ecosystem services, but you need to focus on a single ecosystem service for practicality. Methodologies are not very good to estimate multiple ecosystem services at a larger scale. These are data gaps. Another gap is the cost of methodologies, which mainly for large areas are very high, rendering it not operational.	Thanks for your comment, this was noted.
2161	Jeroen Arends	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					How can the uptake of the diversity of valuation be enforced in decision making?	Section 6.5 in the final version provides a detailed guidance on how to operationalize diverse values in decision-making, although the main focus is on opportunities, principles and tools and not on enforcement because we felt that would go beyond the chapter scope.
2163	Eeva Primmer	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Need to include sectoral roadmaps and sectoral pledges	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.

2195	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Suggested ref on Transformation Folke, C., Polasky, S., Rockström, J. et al. Our future in the Anthropocene biosphere. <i>Ambio</i> 50, 834–869 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1007/s13280-021-01544-8	There would have been needed a specification for the section the reference was suggested for.
2203	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature	76		120	Section 6.3 is very long and not very practical. The cases should be presented in a mor synthetic way and highlighting connections to values and valuatin. A synthesis table or something similar could identify what are the main points that you are trying to get across with this cross-sectoral review	Thank you for your comment. This section was revised and refined.
2336	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Congratulations on a veyr compelling and highly informative executive summary	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
2337	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				This section provides a remarkable framing of the analyses of the chapter, very clear definition and a remarkable effort to link different domains and typologies.	Thank you.
2338	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				A remarkable summary of the chapter's finding, as is the executive summary	Thank you
2339	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				could link here to the recent biodiversity and pandemics report (IPBES 2020)	Thank you, unfortunately, due to lenth requirements this section had to be shortened, so the link to the pandemic has been eliminated from this paragraph.
2340	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				The quality of this chapter is overall outstanding in terms of the conceptual structuring of the analysis, the material synthesised and the evidence base it provides regarding policy tools for incorporating diverse values and supporting transformative change. However the current draft (even not totally complete for some subsections) is overwhelming in terms of detail and length and will need to be reduced for the final draft of the assessment report.	We thank the Reviewer for her feedback, the new structure of the chapter hopefully makes it easier to follow.
2341	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Overall section 6.2. is a well conceptualised (set of criteria presented in 6.2.1), robust, relevant and well-presented analysis.	Thanks.

2342	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				The systematic analysis of policy instruments affecting transformative governance is a strong basis for identifying options for incorporating diverse values of nature. The synthetic tables are particularly useful.	Thank you for this positive feedback.
2343	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Please consider incorporating elements from the IPBES 2020 report on biodiversity and pandemics.	Thank you, unfortunately, due to length requirements this section had to be shortened, so the link to the pandemic has been eliminated from this paragraph.
2344	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Likewise the analysis of the 'bright spots' from Chapter 4, structured by the set of analytical criteria of transformative change is of high value. It is perhaps still a bit descriptive. Could the writing please better highlight key results and messages to be retained from this analysis?	A summary at the end of the subsection is now included in the final version.
2345	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				What is the objective of the detailed case study descriptions? The synthetic information from this subsection starting from Table 6.9 is what readers will be seeking from the report.	The objective is explained in Line 1378-1381, which states that "The objective was not to assess the transformative potential of initiatives (which sometimes have hundreds of different projects managed and administered in diverse ways), but to use them as lenses to assess diverse value approaches in policy instruments used in governing social-ecological systems towards transformative governance."
2346	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				What should one conclude from the fact that criteria are scored are either Yes or N/A, with a single No?	Thanks for the comment, it should be Yes (1) or No (0) to describe how many transformative criteria is embedded in each initiative. This will be revised accordingly
2347	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				could the information from Table 6.10 be synthesised as a Figure? The table is raw data rather than results.	It is true that Table 6.10 will be easier to understand in a figure format. we will present this as a figure
2348	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				This introductory part about urban transformation aims to set the context for the following development on policy tools for integrating urban values and gaps and barriers to transformation. Whilst very informative and incorporating relevant material from a general perspective, it needs to be reduced keep the focus of the subsection on incorporating diverse values in decision-making for urban transformation - for which the material that follows is exhaustive and excellent.	Thank you for your comment. This section was revised and refined.
2349	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				How does this (however excellent) analysis of human perceptions of biodiversity in cities fit with with the policy tools focus of subsection 6.3.1.1.1? Is it in any case the baseline for the following development on biocultural approaches, in which case both could be combined, with a more compact presentation of the former?	Thanks for your comment, this was noted when revising the section.

2350	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Whilst the nuclear waste management (lengthy) example is quite compelling in itself, how does it relate to 1) transformative change, 2) incorporating diverse values of nature per se vs. integrating indigenous knowledge and values on environment?	This was revised and refined.
2351	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				This analysis of a set of options and initiatives for decision-making in agriculture is more like a catalogue of selected cases of varying importance and with varying levels of detail, with some of the more important ones like sustainable intensification receiving little detail as compared to other more lengthy treatments (e.g. African corridor). How were options / initiatives selected? How to explain some potentially impactful ones with current traction like regenerative agriculture are not considered? How does one draw a synthetic	Thank you for your comment. This part of the section was revised and refined according to the different comments received.
2352	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Whilst important, Indigenous and Community Conserved Territories and Areas are by far not the only options for incorporating diverse values in conservation. There is prolific literature on various forms of nature conservation with consideration and linkages with local populations. Why were these not considered? Initiatives in developed countries with local communities are important too.	Good point. we have tried to include more local actors in various contexts especially in 6.5
2353	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Admitting this was published after this was drafted, elements from the IPBES report on biodiversity and pandemics will still need to be considered here for completeness and coherence.	Noted and included
2354	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				This really interesting section on transformative learning will need to be shortened.	Thanks for your comment, this text was shortened.
2355	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Is degrowth the only option for the economy? Why focus on that only in this report. The lack of a more comprehensive consideration of alternatives and their relative merits risks to jeopardize the credibility of this report by having it considered as advocacy rather than synthesis.	The subsection on economics has been largely expanded (incl. sustainable consumption and production, circular economy, degrowth and caring economy)
2356	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				Congratulations on a very compelling and highly informative executive summary	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
2357	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature				This section provides a remarkable framing of the analyses of the chapter, very clear definition and a remarkable effort to link different domains and typologies.	Thank you.

2358	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					A remarkable summary of the chapter's finding, as is the executive summary	Thank you
2359	Sandra Lavorel	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					could link here to the recent biodiversity and pandemics report (IPBES 2020)	Thank you, unfortunately, due to length requirements this section had to be shortened, so the link to the pandemic has been eliminated from this paragraph.
2407	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Congratulations, very clear and well written assessment and Chapter 6. Great that you have linked straight from the beginning to Transformative change. But I question myself if as far as we have developed a Value's assessment, a Nexus, assessment,...we will continue building Business assessment, Capacity building, Technology, Governance and Political Will Assessments towards Transformative Change (in a perhaps gradual ongoing capacity development in front of pervasive downward biodiversity and NCP's trends. Do we have time to	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
2408	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Extend the line to the left because Resource users can be Public as well!	Thank you, this figure has been dropped from the final version.
2409	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Place (Sub) National Government on the right-lower cell as a "Main Influencer" as well!	Thanks, the figure was redrafted
2410	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Cross Scale should present a 4th opposite arrows between the National and the Local Scales	Thanks for this comment, this figure was eliminated from the final version.
2411	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Scale jumping a 4th line from international to Sub National opposing the Local Scale	Thanks for this comment, this figure was eliminated from the final version.
2412	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Work to be included in due time (despite the fact that scope and information to be included is well identified and localized within Assessment corpse.	Thanks for your comment.

2413	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Review if Holland and New Zeland have approved its new way to assess GDP and if so, include it...or indicate their efforts into that direction.	Thank you for the suggestion. For now this is the most update information that we can acquire. The statement refers to the Gross Happiness Index from Bhutan and New Zealand in 2019 (https://www.forbes.com/sites/jamesellsmoor/2019/07/11/new-zealand-ditches-gdp-for-happiness-and-wellbeing/?sh=74e176781942), and most likely due to COVID-19 not many updates on the respective plan.
2414	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Land and Marine Spatial Planning (LSP and MSP) legal instruments are missing as a Tranformative change legal instrument all over the analysis of this section. It work iteratively within policy cycle as a Planning-management-planning instrument. It is incluyent, participatory, transparent, science based, in a conflictual situation it diminish conflicts, build communication and trust, accountable, cross-sectoral ending up with intervention zonifications (where interventions can be prioritized) and regulatory plans and frameworks with responsibilities	Thank you for the reminder, this section is based on the policy instruments identified in the catalogue of IPBES Global Assessment (2020). LSP and MSP is not included as it might be confusing with the spatial plan at the status quo. However, along the policy instruments we noted and highlighted the participatory and inclusive planning for protecting biodiversity on land and in marine areas (i.e. protected marine areas)
2415	Antonio Diaz de León	MEP		Chapter 6. Policy options and capacity development to operationalize the inclusion of multiple (plural) values of nature					Land and Marine Spatial Planning legal instruments are missing in all the Table.	We considered marine spatial planning as part of the toolbox for marine protected areas.