

ID	Reviewer Name	Category	Affiliation	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comments	Response
2	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	12	342	12	354	The topics bulleted on this page do not readily slot in livelihoods - i.e. subsistence or income generating activities.	These bullets refer to the IPBES typology of values measurements, which was originally used in the Preliminary Guide to Values and is also part of this assessment's typology.
3	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	95		96		Environmental impact assessment (more frequently now describes as Environmental and Social Impact Assessment or ESIA), described as a planning tool, is generally undertaken to inform decisions on proposed development projects. Decision making in EIA hinges on the 'significance' of impacts, which is widely recognised as being related both to values and to scientific/ technical information. However, many approaches to evaluating impact significance appear to ignore values entirely, looking only at measures like 'extent, duration, magnitude/ severity' of impacts. At the opposite extreme, it has been proposed that significance of impacts refers to 'acceptability' which would span a wide range of different values. In the body of 'sustainability assessment' (e.g. Robert Gibson, Jenny Pope and others), a number of 'sustainability criteria' and 'trade off rules' have been proposed to guide decision making and - seemingly - to incorporate values. Is there merit in this type of approach, perhaps? Any pointers for EIA Practice? [I note that Chapter 4 deals with uptake of valuation - in Environmental Impact Appraisal, which I assume is the same as EI Assessment?]	The executive summary is completely rewritten for the TOD. Hence, the specific formulation no longer exists. Regarding EIA, it is covered in Chapters 3 and 4. Chapter 2 does not engage with any in-depth analysis of methods.
30	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	12	348	12	354	An important dimension is missing here: psychology. It would be appropriate to quote an earlier publication Shmeleva, I.A. (2006) Psychology of Ecological Consciousness, St Petersburg University Press, 208pp. (Психология экологического сознания), where the theories of values of Shalom Schwartz have been applied in the context of different stakeholders for the first time.	We agree that psychology is fundamental to the understanding of multiple values of nature. We appreciate the citation provided by the reviewer. To a similar end, we do highlight how psychology's interpretation of values and value development applies across contexts in sections 2.5 (and Annex 2.21)
31	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	20	540	20	555	A reference should be made to the following contribution that escaped the literature review: Shmeleva, I.A. (2012) The Systemic Psychological Description of Ecological Consciousness in the Context of Global Environmental Problems. In Shmelev, S.E. and Shmeleva, I. A. (eds). (2012) Sustainability Analysis: an Interdisciplinary Approach, Palgrave, pp. 129-148	Thank you for this suggestion.
32	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	20	540	20	540	A reference should be made to the following contribution: Shmeleva, I.A. (2017) Human Values and Sustainable Development. In Shmelev S.E. (ed). Green Economy Reader: Lectures in Ecological Economics and Sustainability, Springer, pp. 333-365	Thank you for this suggestion.
33	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	262	6472	262	6472	The name of this tribe is spelt as Dongria Kondh (not Dongaria Kondh).	Thanks for detecting this error. Fixed.
34	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	262	6470	262	6474	Do these (scheduled) tribes enjoy the special protection, which they are eligible for and entitled to? The relevant text only says that they are eligible for special protection.	We have clarified the language to make more clear that though the tribes are granted protection de jure, that protection is not fully realized de facto. As the case demonstrates, scheduled tribes do not fully enjoy the rights they are eligible for. This particular case was very high profile but in general abuses are rife.

35	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	262	6477	262	6482	It may be mentioned here who had deputed the CEC on this mission.	We have added this information (the court tasked the CEC with the fact-finding mission).	
36	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	265	6592	265	6597	If I understand properly, this discussion is hinted at (some form of) the carbon-credit, which however is much-debated in its implementation, although justified in its formulation and role as a useful incentive to protect natural ecosystems and environment. Hence, I guess appropriate would be a better adjective than proper.	We have removed this discussion from the annex, so this comment is no longer relevant.	
37	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	269	6707	269	6708	This sentence is not very clear and probably misleading. It may be rephrased.	We have removed the section of the annex in which this sentence appeared, as the section is now tangential to the point the annex is making	
38	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	269	6711	269	6712	Please clarify if it is for the first time in India or globally, or at some other scale.	We have removed the section of the annex to which this comment refers, as the section is now tangential to the point the annex is making	
39	Pramit Kumar Deb Burman	Organisation	Indian Institute of Tropical Meteorology Pune	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	265	6581	265	6583	Fig. 1 seems to be missing from this document which has been referred to several times.	We have removed references to Figure 1 (and much of the text that referred to Figure 1), so this comment is no longer relevant.	
60	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				NA	NA	Dear Author, thanks for all the work you put into this very interesting and well written chapter	Thank you very much for your appreciation
61	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	25		NA	NA	While I understand that the term value is seen in a positive way, we should also explain that valuation can also result in the attribution of low value	We thank the reviewer for this comment. In section 2.3 we now note: "The life frames are also each associated with different understandings of sustainability and can express different sustainability-aligned values. Conversely, when overemphasised they can lead to situations where people live against nature."
62	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	32		NA	NA	I hope that the chapter will explain what instrumental, intrinsic and relational values are, what theoretical assumptions this classification is based on, and why this classification was chosen. Earlier you mention ecological, economic, spiritual, aesthetic. How do different classifications of values relate and differ?	Instrumental, relational and intrinsic values are clearly defined in Table 2.3. Ecological, spiritual, aesthetic values etc. are value types that can be related to the instrumental, relational and intrinsic value categories.
63	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	35		NA	NA	That seems like an overly general statement. Also before 2016, there were different discussions about different ideas of values. The concept of relational values should be clearly distinguished from or defined in relation to a conception of values as relational, and from relational ontology.	Agreed, we now note: "We provide typologies and frameworks to organise the diversity of values, showing areas of convergence and overlap, fuzzy conceptual boundaries and points of difference. Our conceptualisations are grounded in the 'relational turn' in environmental policy and decision-making which recognises not only the instrumental and intrinsic values of nature, but also principles embodied in relationships between humans and the non-human world"

64	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	25	2	53	What is currently under number 1 seems to contain a lot. Perhaps remove references to methods for elicitation here and the text about ranking values as well and focus on what values are and why diverse values are important?	The Executive Summary has been restructured. This is now KMS, and in the edition process the different elements identified by the reviewer have been highlighted in specific KMs.
65	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	92	NA	NA	Perhaps a bit of a minor point, but I would consistently try to connect values to knowledge systems and worldviews and to practices, and emphasize that knowing, enacting and valuing are inextricably entwined	Thank you, we now note that knowing, enacting and valuing are inextricably entwined.
66	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	105	NA	NA	What I miss here is a discussion of how literature conceives values in individualist/behaviourist versus structuralist and post structuralist approaches. It would be important for this assessment to show that values mean different things in relation to agency. The dominant focus on values in economics and psychology risks overemphasizing policy interventions that focus on behavioural change, or education and information. I am sure that the assessment reviewed this literature, and it is perhaps worth considering putting this as a separate bullet point	While we do not explicitly refer to structuralist/post-structuralist positions, the distinction between 'individualist' and 'social' understanding of values - how they form and are expressed - is key to the presentation in Chapter 2, including the Executive Summary. While this is a complex field with many specific positions in the literature, we have chosen to exactly build contrasts around the 'dichotomy' as argued by the reviewer
67	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	188	NA	NA	Add quantitative and qualitative, also add that different approaches use different metrics and categories/units.	Now added
68	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6	220	NA	NA	In this key message, it should be clearly indicated that values can reside in people's minds, but also in institutions and structures. These latter two actively promote and reproduce specific values, thereby shaping individually or socially held values. Policies to modify them can (should) focus on each of these simultaneously. Currently, the focus is too much on individual or behaviourist approaches and there. And it comes across to me as too 'manipulative' or 'indoctrination' (for lack of better terms, I do not mean to be insulting). We need a multi-tiered	In the TOD, we recognise that change in people's values are informed by socio-cultural processes. We have reduced the 'interventionist' language. For example, in 2.4.1, and 2.4.2 there is explicit reference to practice theory. Also, in 2.5, there is an effort to make more explicit the social processes, in the figure particularly. Plus, in the KM related to formation/change we explicitly mention that it is not always necessary (or ethical) to 'change' peoples values, but rather change the institutions that allow the expression of existing (but
70	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	9	311	NA	NA	I do understand that the concept of intrinsic value cannot be avoided. But I struggle with it as well and I wonder if the assessment will clarify its problems. The idea that the concept often conveys (philosophical discussions are much more nuanced, but these have not (yet) been presented in the assessment) is that value exists without a valuer. In practice, the use of the term is often very elitist, and it has mostly been ecologists that defined and valued nature and expressed this as 'intrinsic'.	We recognise three different understandings of intrinsic values in 2.2.4
71	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	12	334	NA	NA	comprehension of these four approaches to valuation (biophysical, economics, socio-cultural, health) will benefit from a more general introductory discussion of theories of value (see earlier comment). The current discussion is uneven (it does not discuss them symmetrically) and incomplete. I miss behavioral and social psychology (important fields in this domain), and I miss poststructuralist and humanities perspective that propose a relational ontology (which are very relevant for this assessment). I am not an expert but I was also surprised about	Thanks for this comment. In the TOD revisions, we have made more clear that our analysis draws on work from a wide array of epistemological perspectives (e.g., we draw on political ecology, sociology (e.g., practice theory) and ecological psychology (e.g., affordances) which have very different assumptions). This is difficult to convey in this type of document, however, as the document is designed to summarize academic work for policy-makers; thus, it is not appropriate to detail the epistemological foundations, or even
72	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	54	1343	NA	NA	"relational human-nature relationships" Remove relational	Thank you for your comment. Text has been revised.
73	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	54	1325	NA	NA	I miss the work by Morgan Robertson here who has critiqued ES with explicit reference to value (what is valued and how value is expressed and attributed), classification and measurement. So beyond the more simple critique of neoliberalism/commodification. See particularly <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2011.00476.x">https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2011.00476.x</a> , <a href="https://doi.org/10.1890/110292">https://doi.org/10.1890/110292</a> , and the more recent article with Patric Bigger: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/10455752.2016.1273962">https://doi.org/10.1080/10455752.2016.1273962</a>	Thank you! We have now added ideas related to values as practice to the introduction 2.1.

74	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	66	1592	NA	NA	I am not the best person to judge figures, but figure 2.1.7 comes across to me as too much focusing on individualist and social approaches, with insufficient attention to how structures reflect, promote and reproduce values. What this figure can better convey is that values are formed and expressed as the interaction between wider structures (institutions, paradigms, discourses) and individual or group preferences. This is why, even if people or groups can change values (in their minds), this does not necessarily scale up, or stick. Does it does	This figure has been reworked to attend the reviewer's comment. We hope it is now a better representation not so much of the 'mechanism', but rather the structure of the topics to be addressed in the section and its links to the previous section.
75	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	67	1596	NA	NA	And vice versa, how do practices influence values. This demonstrates that the assessment itself has chosen a particular theoretical position. It is really important to be more sensitive to the limitations. A useful reference is Shove, beyond the ABC: <a href="https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1068/a42282">https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1068/a42282</a>	We have not excluded any specific positions, while space limitations makes it impossible to go into any in any depth. There are references to Shove and Giddens in 2.4.1.1 (SOD 2.3.1.1 - sections are renumbered) where we comment briefly on the practice position. There are also references to the position in 2.4.1.2 (SOD 2.3.1.2) and more specifically, the issue of values being situated in practices are addresses in multiple places in 2.5 (SOD 2.3.3)
76	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	96	1680	NA	NA	This is a problematic statement for two reasons. First, there is actually very little evidence that values influence behaviour. The theory of planned behaviour lacks a solid foundation. Second, the assumption that if values do not translate into behaviour this is due to factors that mediate that relationship is still based on a linear relationship between values and behaviour. There are other poststructuralist theories out there (pragmatism, practice-theory). This statement would need qualification so that it refers to studies in psychology only (and theory	We have carefully edited this section to avoid implying that values influence behavior - that is, to clearly reflect the analysis done. We have also made clear the proportion of the analysis that was based on theories from psychology. Practice theory (and a number of other non-psychological theories) are part of our analysis, and we have made this more clear in our description.
77	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	71	1709	NA	NA	Looking at the title of section 2.3.1.3, I would propose retitling the previous as values as embedded in individuals and social groups'. That would make it more specific. I really miss the third perspective on values as situated in practices (drawing on pragmatism, practice theory, and post structuralism).	We have chosen to emphasize the concept and perspective of institutions. As the concept is used it overlaps practices - see glossary. There are two major reasons for our choice. First, we found it to be easier to also include formal rules when choosing the concept of institutions instead of practices as main entry for the presentation. Second, length considerations implied that we had to choose one language on this matter.
78	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	73	1774	76	1858	This section as a whole does not make sense to me (apologies if this comes across as unnecessarily harsh). The discussion of power is difficult to follow, imprecise and incomplete, and I cannot really understand what point it wants to make and why it is included. Such a discussion would require a more thorough treatment of agency and structure. How social, individual, and structural change occurs is of course the key question in social science, and fundamentally unresolvable because of the incompatibility of perspectives with which it is	This section is very important for the assessment. Instead of skipping, it has been reworked. An Annex in Chapter 2 was also developed to support the rather short presentation in the main text. Indeed, a working group on power was developed across chapters to improve the analysis and communication of this topic and its links to valuation and justice issues. The annex include a discussion about agency and structure debate and how this influence power conceptualizations. The classification of power dimensions was also
79	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	76	1858	NA	NA	use of terminology becomes difficult to follow here. What are value expressions? The chapter has not presented an overarching introduction of the concept of value to define key concepts that will be used to structure the review of literature. This should include this concept of expression of value, but also valuer, and object or bearer of value. Such a discussion could also explain what is meant by relational, and how values relate to knowledge, worldviews and actions/practice. Science, including ecology, should be included as a way to express	We have revised in iterative ways the TOD. Now the introduction should provide the basic structure and notion of the concepts that will be developed throughout the chapter, which are subsequently treated in depth in specific sections. While clearly not all concepts are presented in one place, the introduction should provide the reader with the 'way' to get to the relevant information. Plus, the KMs will sever a similar purpose, via Figure 2.1 which is largely structural and as a skeleton to place the different ideas in one place
80	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	80	1958	NA	NA	Again an interesting choice of title. Why not 'from valuation to values'? Valuation is the process of producing values I would say. I also have difficulty with the term express or elicit, as if these values are discovered instead of produced. In various places, the assessment implicitly reflects a single theory or paradigm, which is I think inappropriate for an assessment of values; the language used in the assessment should be inclusive of this diversity and more care can be taken to avoid specific assumptions about how values, valuation,	Thanks for this comment. Yes, it goes both ways, so we have changed the title to 'Values and valuation methods'. We still think people may adhere to values independent of any valuation process. However, the formal as well as informal processes of 'valuation' certainly influences what gets expressed and next may work back on people's values. This perspective was included also in the previous text, but it is strengthened not only through changing the title
81	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	86	2067	NA	NA	similar to my previous comment, the titles should not reflect linear unidirectional relationships. Those are highly contested in literature	Thanks! The title is changed to 'Values and decision-making'
82	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	87	2082	NA	NA	What does expressed mean? Reflected, produced, promoted. Expression seems to point to explicit articulation, but this is not necessary. Often the values that will dominate in practice are implicit and hidden (for example behind win-win promises).	The section of 2.4.2.3 (SOD 2.3.2.3) has been completely rewritten and backed by a new Annex. This headline is hence not there anymore. We agree with the argument - as also was expressed in the section on value expression - the distinction between implicit and explicit value expression

83	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	91	2204	NA	NA	It seems strange to distinguish economic from political decision making. What is the difference here? The nature of decision making (depoliticized versus politicized) or the actors that make the decisions (businesses versus governments), or the types of decisions (incentives versus regulation)? Also given the content of the two sections, this seems problematic, as if economic decision making does not affect rights.	We base the analysis of political vs. economic decision-making on their role or functions in society and the kinds of power involved. Certainly, economic actors influence political processes. Economic and political decisions are still different types of decisions.
84	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	93	2247	NA	NA	I appreciate the discussion of epistemic and recognition justice. I think this articles will help to set the scene for the example: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2020.102181">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2020.102181</a> ,	We appreciate being alerted to this highly relevant reference, and have added it to the box.
85	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	94	2270	NA	NA	as I indicated earlier, I do not follow the logic of the titles. How are these forms(?) or topics (?) of decision making distinguished? Economics and Environment are known sectors in government, but where does political come in?	We understand. As already noted, titles have been changed. Moreover, due to reorganizing and shortening heavily the whole SOD 2.3.2.3 (now 2.4.2.3), these subtitles have been cut.
86	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	96	2319	NA	NA	Also in 2.3.3 and the subheadings, I have not been able to follow the logic and structure, why what things are discussed and how they connect. Why is 'meaning for policy in a different section than' expression in decision making? Why does this distinction matter? Of course this may be due to limited attention and understanding, but it may be worth to consider if simplification is possible.	This now section 2.5, which has only two subsections and an annex. The two sections highlight 2.5.1: the 3 levels of the 'processes' of formation/change and 2.5.2: the combination of these in policymaking.
87	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	111	2684	NA	NA	Figure 2.22 should present a synthesis of the chapter, but I am not sure it does. The choice to foreground one classification of values (intrinsic, instrumental and relational) has not been properly discussed and justified, and I have a hard time following from the text how they are linked with with the economic, socio-cultural and biophysical domains. It has been argued that non-material values can be instrumental and economic values can be relational. And how are intrinsic values expressed and attributed? This is closely tied to social-	We have completed remodelled the synthesis figure in 2.6. We have clarified in the specific values section (2.2.4) why the triad of specific values were foregrounded.
95	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	4	139		140	"The world is losing spoken languages at a comparable or faster rate than it is losing species." Can you really talk about a "comparable or faster rate"? Is there any proof of that?	There is evidence on the rate of loss. This has been substantiated in text.
96	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	26				"Devotees of East Asian religions (often called Dharma traditions) believe that through meditative or ritual practices one can discover the nature of reality and moral obligations." The sanskrit word "dharma" has several meanings. In the present context, it seems to refer to the religions that appeared, at first, in India. But it is not representative of the diversity of Asian religions. Furthermore, the expression "Dharma tradition" is unclear, you should explain it.	This has now been edited in the text to reflect South Asian traditions and not all Asian traditions
97	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	62	1503			In modern Japanese, it is "fūdo" and not "fudo" (see modified Hepburn romanization). This notion was philosophically discussed by Watsuji Tetsurō. See for instance his book: 『風土—人間学の考察』, Tōkyō, Iwanami shoten, 2015 (Or. 1935). The best specialist of his work is currently Augustin Berque (a French geographer and orientalist).	Corrected
98	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	100	2433			On "how people relate to nature", see also: BERQUE, Augustin, Poétique de la Terre. Histoire naturelle et histoire humaine, essai de mésologie, Paris, Belin, 2014.	We did not have a French-speaker available to 'process' this information.

99	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	242	6037			The term of "ideology" is highly connoted. Maybe you should prefer something like "conception" or "way of thought".	The word 'ideology' is used once in this annex, in relation to 'eco-fascism', where we feel it is the appropriate term
100	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	369	9114		9114	"Indigenous leaders and intellectuals have created global dialogue across traditions, using English, Spanish and other dominant languages". It seems a little bit weird here to mention "English" and "Spanish", and to talk after that about "other dominant languages". Why do you mention specifically these two languages?	Thanks for your comment. This text was provided by Kyle Whyte, a Contributing Author. He meant that Indigenous intellectuals and leaders are communicating with each other and with the world using mainstream, dominant languages, citing English and Spanish as examples. This is an example from the author's own experience, and it is not based on information or evidence presented in Ch2.
101	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	395	9830			In modern Japanese, it is "fūdo" and not "fudo" (see modified Hepburn romanization).	Corrected in both annex and main text
102	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	395	9839		9840	It is "fūdo" and not "fudo"; it is Watsuji Tetsurō and not "Watsuji Tetsuro".	Corrected in both annex and main text
103	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	395	9841		9847	The term "climate" in this type of literature is a translation of the word "fūdo", but it is a very bad one. Watsuji means by "fūdo" (風土) something like "milieu": it refers to the human environment in its entirety including the other living beings, the biophysical world and the human cultures.	Removed 'climate', we already referred to milieu and explain it similarly to the reviewer's suggestions.
105	Ian Bateman	Organisation	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					I feel that the use of the term 'intrinsic value' in Ch2 (and more generally) is misleading. Ch. 2 refers to it as "Values of entities expressed independently of any reference to humans as valuers". While this is an interesting philosophical concept, the word 'intrinsic' means something that is held by the entity concerned. So the intrinsic value of a whale is held by the whale and cannot be held by a human. As soon as a human expresses what they call an 'intrinsic value' then by definition it is now a human value and therefore NOT an intrinsic value. Rather it	see answer above
149	Emiliana Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		758			Indigenous languages imply knowledge, like any other language. It is important not to put indigenous languages as species, not all indigenous people agree with that comparison	Thanks for this comment. The text has been revised accordingly, with a more nuanced and integrated approach to languages, which does not differentiate indigenous languages from any other language. New examples have been included, to diversify the information provided, such as the example of the Basque Language in Spain.
150	Emiliana Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Interesting to see the linguistic part in the text. But it is difficult not to arrive at the romanticism from the oversimplifications. Changes in relation to nature are not always well reflected in the text. It is important to think that indigenous languages are being lost (which can also be a vision of rarification) and not to put them as a species, if not to frame them in the contributions and knowledge that they provide.	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly.
151	Emiliana Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					It remains to document the studies that indigenous peoples have made in relation to the environment; that contributes the knowledge and it is not only a cultural question	Thank you for this comment, Chapter 3 presents diverse examples of IPLCs studies and valuation experiences.

152	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				It is a document that puts many elements on the table that are not easy to digest or to make operational. The chapter is very long and difficult to read. It is a very academic document (from academics to academics). It is not purposeful of how it should be	We tried to simplify the language, please consider the the Annexes are expressed in a more academic language than the main body
153	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The figures are at the limit of understanding; they can be understood, but could be improved to be much more intuitive	We redesigned the figures
154	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Antagonization present in the text. On the one hand, there is the mainstream world (of the understanding of things as it has been) and, on the other hand, there is the great package of other understandings. Dualities are created that fail to project the relative weight of the different interpretations	While it is impossible to expound upon the full diversity of understandings, indeed often there is a duality between 'powerful' or 'predominant' and 'other' perspectives. This is given better treatment, however, by understanding the different dimensions of power (now developed in 2.4 and also an annex).
155	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				There is a romanticization, very hidden, but brutal, to the economic valuation. Much of the evaluation has to do with the understanding of economic science, which has been instrumental and methodological development for a long time and continues to be the leader, so many policies are linked to that logic. There is a very marked overexposure to the instrument of compensation of payment for environmental services. They are fashions, but it also has to do with the people who engage in these exercises. Currently there is a lot of criticism about it	Thank you for this comment. We have provided a more balanced representation of economics and economic valuation in the TOD with a box that specifies the use and meaning of values in economics (preferences) and its limits.
156	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				It is necessary to reflect on vicious circles of assessment exercises, which fail to incorporate values. You have to look for other more inclusive valuation methods, make an effort and ask yourself "for what?" evaluate	Thank you for this comment. Chapter 3 provides a comprehensive overview of more inclusive valuation methods.
157	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Methodological aspect is very complicated. The conceptualization of how the evaluation has to be done does not allow the narrative to be made explicit about the meaning of the human relationship with nature. No Figure in the chapter reflects being or being	The life frame section (2.3) aims to illustrate how certain ways of 'being and inhabiting' the world affect how we prioritize certain values. The figure in section 2.5 also intends to show how ways of being/living affect values.
158	Eduardo García	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The information included in boxes (the meanings of relationships in different contexts) always have the same examples, successes or failures; and they are on a very large scale so the meaning does not land for an individual, with specific characteristics.	We have included a greater diversity of cases and clarified meanings, where appropriate.
159	Ricardo Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		997		Historical review does not have much room. It is difficult to read	Due to length we eliminated the historical review
160	Ricardo Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		figura 2.7		It is not clear what approach, application or criteria should be covered so that all these values presented could be met or applied? Do they depend on some spatial or temporal scale? It remains to be included in the figures	Thanks for this comment. The operationalization of values through diverse methods and decision-making processes is presented in the further Chapters of this assessment. Chapters 5 and 6 present criteria and examples of how the diverse values are met or applied. Ch2 presents some examples through the Live Value Frames in 2.3.2 of the TOD.

161	Ricardo Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Fuzzy goods are considered, but they are given a more economical weight	Apologies, but it was unclear to what this comment referred.
162	Ricardo Cruz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The text needs to be simplified, so that it is not only understandable for academics	This general suggestion was shared by other reviewers and our own evaluation. We have attended this issue throughout the final version of the chapter to make it shorter and more policy-relevant.
163	Tanya González	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					On well-defined spaces and transitions, the idea remains that there are only few options left, due to the flows and transitions within the networks. On the other hand, there is no specific mention of rural spaces that are important in many ways.	Thank you for your comment. It is not entirely clear to us what with flows and transitions within the networks. Many of the examples that we refer in the section are about rural spaces.
164	Tanya González	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		18		19	For greater inclusion, it is necessary to visualize the knowledge and produce a brief policy so that there is more communication and that the messages reach different sectors of society. A more graphic synthesis could help to better understand the text of the chapter	We have now added graphic pieces (2 figures and a table) to the executive summary, which has been revised to be more brief and policy-relevant
165	Tanya González	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			fig 2.17		The transmission of information today and associated values go through the experiences that we live. This part is not explicit	In TOD section 2.5 there is explicit mention of social-ecological processes of valuation formation that explicitly deal with ways of 'living'. In addition section 2.3 deals with the way different ways of being/living affect our value systems.
166	Tanya González	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					It is necessary to continue in the application of these concepts. It remains to do so and say how far the scope of the document goes	Apologies, but it was unclear to what this comment referred.
167	Frida Murillo	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					In general, the document is good, but it still shows an excessively academic discourse. It would be necessary to avoid being redundant in the first part and to try to go directly to solution proposals	This general suggestion was shared by other reviewers and our own evaluation. We have attended this issue throughout the final version of the chapter to make it shorter and more policy-relevant.
168	Frida Murillo	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					It is redundant in the first few pages about the situation and the context. It would be necessary to go from an academic discourse to proposing solutions. If the discussions do not land, there will be no interest from decision makers to know these findings	This general suggestion was shared by other reviewers and our own evaluation. We have attended this issue throughout the final version of the chapter to make it shorter and more policy-relevant.
169	Quetzalcoatl Orozco	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					It is difficult to do an exhaustive review because the subject is so broad. The great effort on the part of the team that went into summarizing the knowledge in this regard is recognized. Regarding traditional knowledge, it should be noted that most of the studies are done by outsiders (academics). Then the knowledge that there is about traditional knowledge passes through the filter of an academic author ( <a href="https://www.msd.govt.nz/documents/about-msd-and-our-work/publications-resources/journals-and-magazines/social-policy">https://www.msd.govt.nz/documents/about-msd-and-our-work/publications-resources/journals-and-magazines/social-policy</a> )	Many thanks for this important comment. In the Values Assessment, despite IPBES structural limitations, we made an additional effort to include IPLCs (direct) perspectives by opening-up a Call for IPLCs contributions. Also, we had 2 IPLCs Lead Authors in Chapter 3, who contributed to bring perspectives and studies from IPLCs regarding valuation approaches and methods developed by them. In Chapter 3, authors also worked directly with ILK holders to specify experiences, approaches, methods and tools used in IPLCs contexts. The

170	Quetzalcoatl Orozco	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		pág 1		pag 2	The comment is about the simplification of what is the vision of indigenous groups about nature (that they are part of nature and are on the same level as other living beings). It would be better to emphasize the diversity of visions that local communities have about the values of nature.	Thanks for this comment and suggestion. In Chapter 2's revised version, we highlighted IPLCs (Indigenous peoples and local communities) perspectives on the values of nature. However, we think that it is important to understand that nature as a concept separated from humans does not exist/ or make sense in many IPLCs worldviews and perspectives.
171	Quetzalcoatl Orozco	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			Figuras en general		The texts in the Figures are small and there is space in the figure that is not used	All figures were reworked for the TOD, including several that were prioritized for a workshop in design software with the TSU.
370	Mostafa Madbouhi	Government	Morocco	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	212	5722			The map at the Figure 2.27 shows Morocco divided into two parts. Please, unify the colors to represent all the territory of Morocco including the non-colored part.	Thank you for your comment. Maps have been developed according to the IPBES guidelines and this disclaimer has been added: "The designations employed and the presentation of material on the maps shown here do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the IPBES concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries."
376	Michael Bordt	Government	Fisheries and Oceans Canada (comments are my own)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	84	2022	85	2023	Box 2.10. Suggest also including "Bordt, M., & Saner, M. (2018). A critical review of ecosystem accounting and services frameworks. One Ecosystem, 3, e29306. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3897/oneeco.4.e31420">https://doi.org/10.3897/oneeco.4.e31420</a> " it addresses several of these issues as well.	The box on Natural capital accounting is deleted from Chapter 2 as it overlapped heavily a similar box in Chapter 3.
381	Jennifer Castañeda-Navarrete	Individual	University of Cambridge	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	31	871	32	881	Maybe adding a couple of lines about the role of structural discrimination (a residual of colonialism) as a constraint for the transmission of indigenous languages. See for example: Alice Bloch & Shirin Hirsch (2017) "Second generation" refugees and multilingualism: identity, race and language transmission, Ethnic and Racial Studies, 40:14, 2444-2462, DOI: 10.1080/01419870.2016.1252461; Dockery J2020= Inter-generational transmission of Indigenous culture and children's	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly.
382	Jennifer Castañeda-Navarrete	Individual	University of Cambridge	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	32	NA	32	NA	The roots of the tree could also make reference to an enabler environment (e.g. addressing structural discrimination of indigenous peoples since it is one of the main reasons why parents do not teach their language to their children, at least in Mexico)	Thanks for this comment. We are revising the figure and will include this relevant aspect on the Root of the tree Figure.
389	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		121	3	137	There is significant under-inclusion and failure to include IPLC and ILK in national law and policy and across international law and custom as well.	Thanks for this comment and insight. We have revised the Executive Summary accordingly to reflect this reality, with the evidence we were able to collect for this Chapter. Further description of this issue/gap is provided in Chapter 4.
390	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		202	6	219	Consider stressing the role that joint governance mechanisms that involve governmental actors and IPLCs can play in these goals.	Thanks for this comment. This aspect was highlighted in the revised version of the Executive Summary, based on evidence presented in the Chapter. This issue is also approached in more depth in other Chapters, especially Chapters 4, 5 and 6.
457	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	15	5	15	Add after 2.1.1 ... as 2.1.3 ... 'Values' consideration during Human Settlement planning'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.

458	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	17	5	17	Add 2.1.3.1 ...'Choices'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
459	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	17	5	17	Add ... 2.1.3.2 ... 'losses'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
460	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	27	5	27	Add... 'culture' with language	Addressed.
461	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	50	5	50	Add 2.2.4.6 ... 'worth of values'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
462	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6	80	6	80	Add sub-head ... 2.3.2.2.1 ... 'cost and worth of valuation'	The section is rewritten with a new structure
463	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6	106	6	106	Add sub-head ... 2.3.3.5 ... 'compounding effect of Human System and Natural Systems'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
464	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6	106	6	106	Add sub-head ... 2.3.3.6 ... 'Circular Economy and Natural Resources'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
465	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6	117	6	117	Add Head 2.5 ... 'FAQs'	It is unclear how to attend this comment, which refers to the table of contents.
466	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	22	394	22	394	Fig. 2.2 in Box 2.1 .... Add 'Complex and Compounding Stages'	This figure was eliminated.

467	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	38	820	38	822	Add ... 'culture' with Language	Thank you for this comment, the text has been revised accordingly.
468	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	40	881	40	884	Add ... 'Indigenous Practices'	Thanks for this comment. This Figure was removed from the TOD/final version of the Chapter. The content was moved to a synthesis table. I was not sure about where to include Indigenous practices, but the concept of Indigenous and Local Knowledge is broad enough to include beliefs and practices.
469	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	452	11275	452	11282	Consider... 'importance to social, Human settlements and integrated Socio-Ecological systems'	The reference to Annex 2.16 (Methods for analysis of discussions of framing in the environmental values literature) and in particular page 444 (which refers to a figure) does not seem to relate to this comment. We are unclear how to respond.
470	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	470	11824	470	11825	Add Title to Fig. 2.5.3	Thank you for your comment.
533	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Remaining comments in this response are cared out per warning in cell C3, but are continuous, to all of Ch 2.3 dealing with definition and typology of NCP and with Figure 2.3.1 depiction and description. Pieces correspond roughly to paragraph breaks. Following Diaz et al is a step backwards for any attempt to generate economic measures that must avoid double-counting of ecosystem-service benefits or that if double counting must develop and cite byzantine rules to correct for such double-counting. By Figure 2.3.1 text, realized NCP are (almost	Please see responses below.
534	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	The Diaz et al approach moves focus from distinguishing that which is predominantly what the envt/ecosystem does or makes without direct human guidance. Without that attention, there is no clear intention to separate the measure of the new (ES or NCP) from the old (monetized values in GDP or CBA) that had left ES/NCP out of key measures. Those separations are hard enough with well-structured intentions, but without these separations an inability to helpfully distinguish what to measure in the chain from deep ecological processes to human well-	Thank you for this comment. We did not articulate in Chapter 2 the difference between ES and NCP, but, for example, the explanation of relational values as particularly apt to capture contextual NCP seems to go in a similar direction as your comment. In the Life frame section, we expanded the perspective to more than an instrumental consideration (or living from) and referred in the table to NCP. We hope that these additions partially address your comment.
535	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Endorsing the Diaz et al approach, particularly without discussion of how it pairs or fails to pair with "final ES" approaches (see next paragraph), voluntarily risks pushing fall-of-Babylon cacophony into a field that had with great effort begun to understand the need for comparable metrics across research efforts so that economic values could be grouped and compared in ways that policy makers and the general public understand. Not all possible values yet, we all acknowledge, but key ones necessary to further alarm deniers of	In this assessment, we propose three pathways of integrating values: direct comparison, compatibilisation and parallel use. Thus we offer a more nuanced understanding than what the reviewer suggests.
536	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	To be clear, I agree with all of the limitations to economic approaches that are listed in 2.3.4.3, but nothing there infers any advantage to breaking from ES to embrace the NCP model of Figure 2.3.1, or the non-hierarchical list of 19 NCPs. The figure has many points that could be challenged. Simply naming one or two to demonstrate, there would have to be an arrow from the "Inst & Anthro Assets & Drivers" bubble to the "Potential NCP" square, and another from Substitutes to before realized NCP. So the figure wants for a lot, being unclear in its basics.	We have fully revised all the Venn diagram figures. We have shown points of convergence, overlap and difference across different conceptualisations of value and identify multiple ways in which this plural understanding can inform environmental policy and decision-making
537	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Consider from 2.3.5.4 Information Gaps: (NCP is poorly understood due to) "The lack of understanding arises for several reasons. First, it is often hard to disentangle nature's contributions from other contributions. ... Second, understanding of key links between nature and impacts on good quality of life may be missing. ..." By beginning with Figure 2.3.1 that mixes joint production within the base model of how to split potential from realized NCPs and Outcomes (when some sort of direct joint production does not always happen and some sort	Thank you for this comment. Chapters 2 and 5 connect the diverse values of nature to different pathways of sustainability, called sustainability aligned values. This is different to the NCP approach articulated by the reviewer.

538	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	This leaves 2.3 with no model for doing the disentangling that is highlighted in this last quote as a key gap in the field. IPBES identifies key information gaps, and offers an NCP concept and typology that are fundamentally incapable of addressing those gaps, while rejecting key progress offered by NESCS Plus, and CICES, and even the SEEA EA List of ES (see again 'Mikado', end of last paragraph) to address the same gaps. There is at least one baby in the gutter with the bathwater following the current approach and text.	Chapter 4 recognises the important contributions made by SEEA, and shows how SEEA can inform decision-making. SEEA is viewed as a complementary rather than competing values framework.
539	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	It is at least a misdemeanor to not cite Boyd and Banzhaf 2007, and at least another misdemeanor to not discuss how the Diaz et al approach connects or fails to connect with the concerns they voice, because these concerns were taken as central premises by UN Stats Division (in SEEA CF and SEEA EA), by US EPA ES classification in the antecedents to the current NESCS Plus system, and by every economic valuation effort concerned with any legitimate articulation of measure to separate background ecological processes and elements from the actual use of	Please refer to Chapters 3 and 4 for more detail in the methodological issues involved in the application of ES and NCP valuation exercises.
540	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	This "final ES" move to help the field evolve from atomized ad-hoc approaches to ES or NCP economic valuation is essential to increase data access and lower the cost of making ES or NCP assessments over time in industrialized and developing countries. Digging in on Diaz et al without explicitly considering problems that follow from casting onto the ice the approaches to standardization of what ES are in economic and accounting frameworks lacks respect, inclusion, vision, and dedication to progress on a decadal level starting now. Pinning the first	The UNSEEA box is no longer a part of Ch2, but is developed more in Ch4. We also have done general editions throughout to better develop the conceptual foundations regarding strengths and weakness of these approaches, but the details 'sought by the reviewer are perhaps best found in Chapters 3 and 4.
541	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Simply noting a difference between potential NCPs and realized NCPs, and an even less defined difference between realized NCPs and Outcomes is fundamentally inadequate treatment to deal with having traded away the advantages of a "final ES" approach. Holism of relevant measures is a laudable goal, but sacrificing advances toward next-wave measures that are clearly needed and even demanded in policy circles today is an unwise, even retrograde choice. The criticism based on assumption that the final ES path will remain incapable of	Thank you for this comment. In Chapter do we have provided a wider conceptualisation and typology of values which includes NCPs and other value constructs. We have removed references to potential and realised NCPs.
542	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	The final ES approach addresses essential and present measurement challenges covering a great swath of the current challenge set for the field. The areas where the final ES approach is weak, including relational and intrinsic or absolute values as they are not quantitatively accommodated in frameworks that look to average national values (SEEA EA) or marginal ES-user values for an additional ES (NESCS Plus and any ES classification, including CICES) as their staples, should be explored for how they may come to address those weaknesses, rather	Thanks for this suggestion. We don't seek to dustbin ES but rather provide a pathway for understanding and constructively draw on more diverse values of nature in environmental policy and decision-making. ES continue to have an important role alongside NCPs.
543	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	The NCP approach following Diaz et al. is presented as an alternative, and superior to the final ES approach followed by SEEA EA and NESCS Plus because it is more holistic in scope of intended measure. But it is clearly flawed in its capacity to meet objectives for ES/NCP measures now (articulation along the chain from eco-to-well-being, focus of measure, and double-counting issues at least), so it's superiority is far from demonstrated, let alone axiomatic. Chapter 2.3 whether intentionally or not fetishizes the poorly articulated Diaz et al	We have removed references to superiority of NCPs over other frameworks from Chapter 2. Rather NCP provides a framework that is complementary to ES, SEEA EA and NESCS Plus.
544	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	[So an "Output" in Figure 2.3.1 is just a wider span of economic effects from a benefit of a realized NCP? Isn't that just ES to different users (as would be in SEEA EA or NESCS Plus)? Can you say that that is or isn't true from the text in 2.3? Then why divide Output and Realized NCP when they are the same combination of the eco- and econ- parts with different users, that is, are simply variants within a class defined by its left- and right-side termina in the figure?] This risks abandoning progress in key areas of measurement for a promise that everything will	Chapter 2 is about conceptualisation. Chapter 3 addresses the indicator and measurement concerns presented by the reviewer.
545	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	With inadequate investment in measuring a micro-suite of ES or NCP even in the most forward countries now, the investment to undertake full-scale boutique measurements of value everywhere will come from where? Diaz et al have said the cow's milk is poisoned, and therefore traded the cow for a handful of beans that do not to my reading appear magic in any ability to solve the problems of the field in an orderly sequence that will move government decision-making as soon or as much as the SEEA EA approach will, despite the limits and lacunas	Thanks for this comment. We have clarified the policy relevance of the plural values framework across Ch2 and other chapters of the assessment.
546	Charles Rhodes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	There is a reason humanity went to the moon before Mars. There is a reason we expand CBA and environmental accounting before attempting to include every value for every population in every culture using methods that defy premises of the maths endemic to CBA and NCA – which like it or not for all their flaws do and will dominate certain decision-making heuristics and portfolios for the foreseeable future. On our common journey can we help but start from where we are?	Society risks dystopian futures unless we can rapidly transform the types of values that are privileged in environmental decision-making. Starting from current economic approaches presents many risks. Those risks are clearly communicated across the assessment. Also, concrete pathways for embedding the multiple values of nature in decision-making are presented.

562	Linda Laikre	Individual	Stockholm University, Dept Zoology, Swedish Scientific Council on Biological Diversity	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Genetic diversity, one of the three main elements of biodiversity has been almost entirely omitted. There are 14 instances of the word 'genetic' and these are primarily genetic resources, genetic modifications, or medicinal uses, which neglects the rich array of services genetic diversity provides (for comparison, 'species' is mentioned 126 times). Recent reviews have highlighted how genetic diversity strongly influences ecosystem services and nature's contributions to people, with numerous examples: Stange, M., Barrett,	Please see relationship of genetic diversity as part of 'biophysical' measures of nature in sections 2.1 and 2.2.
566	John Finisdore	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					just a quick general comment on the chapter and therefore what flows on from it. Effectively, I think your argument could be strengthened with more reference to literature (from the BES space or outside it).  The discussion on different values (instrumental, intrinsic and relational) is strong, as well as the discussion on the limitations of different approaches. where more discussion could add value is using literature and or example to demonstrate that classification science	Thank you for this suggestion.
571	Sean Hoban	Individual	The Morton Arboretum, GEO BON	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Genetic diversity, one of the three main elements of biodiversity has been almost entirely omitted. There are 14 instances of the word 'genetic' and these are primarily genetic resources, genetic modifications, or medicinal uses, which neglects the rich array of services genetic diversity provides (for comparison, 'species' is mentioned 126 times). Recent reviews have highlighted how genetic diversity strongly influences ecosystem services and nature's contributions to people, with numerous examples: Stange, M., Barrett,	Please see relationship of genetic diversity as part of 'biophysical' measures of nature in sections 2.1 and 2.2.
573	Simon James	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	23	631	23	632	Many biocentrists do not hold that each organism has a right to life. It would be more accurate simply to state that 'Biocentric worldviews emphasise the intrinsic value of individual organisms.'	Thank you, this is a relevant comment and we have made the suggested changes in the document.
574	Simon James	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	23	640	23	641	Many ecocentrists do not hold that collective entities such as ecosystems have rights to exist. It would be more accurate simply to state that 'Ecocentric worldviews emphasise the intrinsic value of collective entities such as ecosystems.'	Thank you, this is a relevant comment and we have made the suggested changes in the document.
575	Simon James	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	37	999	37	1002	Reference is made to a study which found 'that before 2016 only two environmental value types were referenced in academic literature: intrinsic and instrumental values'. That claim is false. Prior to 2016, some academic authors argued that some environmental values are neither intrinsic nor instrumental. For instance, in 2013 I argued that some such values are constitutive (and hence neither intrinsic nor instrumental). (See Simon P. James, 'Cherished Places and Ecosystem Services', Ethics, Policy & Environment 16 (3) (2013), pp. 264-6.)	Other authors (David Griffin) spoke about extrinsic values for example. We mostly refer to the mainstream discourse on ecosystem services/biodiversity and not to philosophical literature. Due to length issues we cannot describe accurately details, but we added an 'predominantly, albeit not exclusively' to leave room for other possibilities. Apologies if we cannot address the nuanced debate on environmental values. My own work on relational values dates back to 2006, but it did not gain any relevance in the mainstream
576	Jinfeng Zhou, Linda Wong	Organisation	China Biodiversity Conservation and Green Development Foundation	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	36	765	36	768	1. The Chinese government valued highly to the study, use and development of local languages. The law <the decision of the Tibet Autonomous Regions on the study, use and development of Tibetan language>> has already passed and implementation since 1987. 2. The geographical distribution of the author is unreasonable. There are no experts from China at all. China is not only one of the countries with the richest biodiversity, but also one of the four ancient civilizations. The absence of experts from China and the lack of regional balance of	Thank you for this comment. We certainly regret that no Chinese experts were involved in this assessment, which is of course not the responsibility of authors. We agree that more inclusive and democratic participation always ensures greater academic rigor and political legitimacy. However, the experts nominated in the formal IPBES process have worked to develop methods to seek regional representation of literature and examples without favoritism to particular countries.
578	Alla Aleksanyan, Levon Aghasyan	Government	Ministry of Environment of the Republic of Armenia	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1			475	the chapter is too large it should be shorten to be more attractive for readers	This general suggestion was shared by other reviewers and our own evaluation. We have attended this issue throughout the final version of the chapter to make it shorter and more policy-relevant.
612	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	58	1439	58	1440	In the box at the intersection of Most relevant NCP and Living in Nature, an important example is children's well-being and development. Children needs more visibility in this document and provide a unique way to think about NCP and diverse values of nature.	We have added additional content in 2.3.2.3 in relation to this

613	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	62	1496	62	1514	Just as with the previous comment, Children need to be more visible. It is not enough to use the phrase "human"...there are unique relationships and unique contributions when we consider children, child development and nature. A good source is a soon to be published (under final review) article by Beery & Lekies in <i>Frontiers: Ecology and Evolution</i> .	We have added additional content in 2.3.2.3 in relation to this
614	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	95	2288	95	2300	This is another place where the unique well-being and development (being and becoming) of children could and should be used. Many excellent sources exist to support this example.	The text has been heavily cut from the SOD to the TOD version. Hence, we were unable to bring in this dimension in any sensible way.
615	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	97	2243	97	2243	In this box at the intersection of Key concepts or mechanisms of value formation and change and Individual-focused processes the more specific terminology would be: human evolution.	Evolution is included within human biology, as described in the subsequent text.
616	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	103	2522	103	2525	Another excellent spot in the text to emphasize children, consider: Lekies, K., & Beery, T. (2013). Everyone needs a rock: Collecting items in nature in childhood. <i>Children, Youth and Environments</i> , 23(3), 66-88.	We have incorporated the suggestion.
617	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	105	2551	105	2551	This is another place where the unique aspect of early childhood must be highlighted—so as to combat the lack of children's visibility in these discussions. Many excellent sources, including: Beery, T., Chawla, L. & Levin, P. (2020). Being and becoming in nature: Defining and measuring connection to nature in young children. <i>International Journal of early childhood environmental education</i> , 7(3), 3-22. ISSN 2331-0464	We have incorporated the suggestion.
618	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	105	2547	105	2549	The Swedish cultural traditions of allemansrätt and Friluftsliv have elements of cultural practices associated with interconnectedness and embeddedness. See: Beery, T. (2013). Nordic in nature: Friluftsliv and environmental connectedness. <i>Environmental Education Research</i> , 19(1), 94-117. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2012.688799">https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2012.688799</a> and Beery, T. (2018). Connection to nature: The experience of the right of public access. <i>Environment &amp; Society Portal</i> , Arcadia, 18. <a href="https://doi.org/10.5282/rcc/8451">doi.org/10.5282/rcc/8451</a>	Added to form-change annex.
619	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	106	2576	106	2576	In along with ecological grief, the concept of Solistalgia should be noted, see Albrecht (2007) and Galway, L.P., Beery, T., Jones-Casey, K., & Tasala, K. (2019). Mapping the solistalgia literature: A scoping review study. <i>International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health</i> , 16, 2662. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16152662">https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph16152662</a>	Galway et al. 2019 was added to form-change annex.
620	Thomas Beery	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	112	2697	112	2697	In the example indicators of Table 2.8., the importance of reciprocal responsibilities of care for other-than-humans section should include early childhood connectedness to nature and the reciprocity that it develops (see Beery and Lekies 2021).	Thank you for pointing us to the important literature on connectedness to nature. We have added the following to the "living with nature" frame: "as well as connectedness to nature, such as the physical and multisensory experiences that children have when moving through forests, seashores and even backyards (Beery and Lekies, 2021)."
626	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11	323	11	323	Avoid using acronyms in the figures and if this is not possible, indicate the meaning of the acronym in the figure legend. This will facilitate its quick understanding.	Changed.

627	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11	327	11	327	Add indigenous and local knowledge next to the acronym ILK.	Changed.
628	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11	323	11	323	Figure 2.1 shows many disciplines and 15 color categories, which makes it difficult to interpret. Perhaps some of them could be merged to reduce them to 10. For example, the "Life Sc" category (red) could be merged with another similar category.	These were self-identified categories of the journals in the database. They also largely overlaid onto the knowledge domains we subsequently describe. While it is complex, we are not able to provide a reduced categorization that would be meaningful.
629	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	14				Figure 2.2 of Box 2.1 can be simplified. The paragraph on the left side of the figure "Life frames of nature's .....", should be taken out of the figure and put in the figure legend.	This figure was eliminated.
630	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	23	630	23	630	Clarify in this paragraph, that the % of papers indicated below for each category are indicative, and do not necessarily represent the real importance of each of these visions as there may be a bias. For example, the biocentric vision is scarcely relevant on a global scale because it has 11% of papers?	It has now been clarified by adding this sentence "These percentages are based on reviewed literature and do not necessarily reflect the importance of worldviews in reality, as the literature can have several biases on the worldviews that were chosen to be studied, as well as how they were interpreted."
655	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The authors do a great job of distinguishing between values and valuation and the diversity of these in general and in reference to decision making. But at times the value characterization and valuation provided by people or populations is not distinguished from the value or valuation embodied in nature. This is most obvious in the frequent use of the phrase 'nature's multiple values' (e.g., throughout chapter 2 and beyond). To the extent it is possible to clarify this point or suggest how these differ and how this is dealt with in the report, please do.	thank you for this helpful comment. We tried to briefly address that we are mostly referring to how people express the values of and about nature, while also accounting for objective value approaches
656	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		321		394	Terrific summative characterization of the values literature across fields and literally thousands of papers	We appreciate the comment and acknowledgement of the effort.
657	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		410		433	Nice discussion here and above on incommensurability and tradeoffs, a problem deserving a report in its own right.	We appreciate the comment and acknowledgement of the effort.
658	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	19		19		Terrific figure -- Roadmap figure 2.3	We appreciate the comment and acknowledgement of the effort.
659	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	21			29	I have a little trouble with using epistemic worldviews without more clearly references ontology. Yes, term is over-used and cumbersome, but in the end, epistemology is driven by what people assume the world is made up of or what reality is. Can you offer this distinction even briefly? I found this problem got louder when reading the section on pluricentric non-dualist worldview and biocultural diversity that beings on page 28. I would suggest that Pluricentrism is an ontology and its not just that there are co-existing classifications, I don't really	Thank you for this comment. We have revisited this section, and removed epistemic worldviews. We now refer to the human-nature worldviews as just worldviews. We have also incorporated the concept of knowledge systems which captures what people know or assume about the world. The section on pluricentric worldviews has been edited for clarity and condensed.

660	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	29		29		Most people also consider biocultural diversity as both a characterization of things in reference to language-meet-biodiversity and cultural meanings. This is well captured in this section. But might biocultural value be, also, its own measure of value where value is made up of physical and metaphysical properties expressed through language and manifest as a combination of the tangible and intangible composition of nature? Perhaps this comes up later on, but overall, I would consider biocultural diversity both a form of value and a	Thanks for this comment. We included this aspect of biocultural diversity seen as both a value and a means to valuation in the revised text of subsection 2.2.2, and provided supporting references.	
661	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			822		837	The prior point about biocultural diversity is the well described but in these lines. That point is: might biocultural value be, also, its own measure of value where value is made up of physical and metaphysical properties expressed through language and manifest as a combination of the tangible and intangible composition of nature? Perhaps this comes up later on, but overall, I would consider biocultural diversity both a form of value and a possible means of valuation.	Thanks for this comment. In attending to other reviewers and reducing the length of this subsection, the extensive explanation of biocultural diversity has been placed in a new Appendix. I took note of your relevant insight here, and this is reflected in the revised text presented in the Appendix.
662	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	69		69			figure 2.18 is terrific and great work on the values-action gap overall	Thank you!
663	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people						Terrific work on value formaton	We appreciate the positive feedback.
798	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			0		0	Executive summary well written and really informative, although too long. Carefully consider if all details are necessary at this level.	We have reduced the length to approx. 5,000 words.
799	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			180		180	replace "cultural NCP" with "non-material NCP" (all NCP have a strong cultural component)	Thanks for catching this error. We have checked throughout for such consistencies in the final edition.
800	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			186		186	"epistemic justice" is a bit too technical for an executive summary. Suggest defining in brackets or, even better, replacing with a more user-friendly expression.	This term now only appears in Table 2.1, which we think will not divert reader attention to terms that are not readily understandable.
801	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			220		224	In tis formulation, this is too abstract to be useful in an executive summary, especially as headline paragraph. Suggest replacing with something clearer, simpler and concrete. It can then be elaborated in the paragraph.	Please see KM11, which has been reformulated.
802	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			745		757	About the correlation between high diversity of languages and high species diversity: my understanding is that while the correlation is undeniable, there is debate as to whether there is causality links between them. It would not harm to spell this out.	Thanks for the comment. The new text has been revised accordingly for the final version. We actually cite the IPBES Land Degradation and Restoration Assessment, and a map included there, that shows co-occurrence of Biological and Linguistic diversity.

803	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2713		2722	Paragraph on the IPBES definition of nature. Note that, while the brief and simple definition cited there was used in the beginning (attending to the brevity needed by a decision document that required word-by-word discussion by the IPBES Plenary in 2013), the unpacked definition used in the Global Assessment is much more comprehensive, and much closer to the view of the VA: "Nature: (also referred as "living nature") the nonhuman world, including coproduced features, with particular emphasis on living organisms, their diversity,	Thank you for this suggestion. We have now included this definition of nature in the glossary.
804	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2741		2743	"The IPBES conceptual framework distinguished between a 2741 generalizing perspective, such as NCP, and a contextual perspective, whereby knowledge 2742 does not need to extend or validate itself beyond specific geographic and cultural contexts". This is not totally correct. Indeed the generalizing perspective and the context-specific perspective are two lenses to which to see NCP. Context-specific categories are also considered NCP categories, just different, with no intent to be generally applicable beyond certain geographic areas and	Thank you. We have clarified this point in the introduction 2.1.
805	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2701		2701	Section 2.4.1. Implications of diverse understanding of nature's values for IPBES conceptual 2709 framework. I congratulate the authors for this excellent section, that shows how values (addressed in the CF but in a slightly general and sketchy way) can map onto and enrich the CF. I only have a couple of comments of substance: 1. one potentially important, about the need to recognize the unpacked version of the definition of nature used in the GA, and the other a minor issue with the definition of context-specific NCP.	In 2.6 we now show how the diverse conceptualisation of values maps on to the IPBES CF.
806	Sandra Diaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					the many conceptual figures are each clear and useful in themselves, but I wonder if such proliferation of diagrams is really necessary. The reader might get confused as to how the different diagrams relate to each other in an integrated picture. Perhaps they can be consolidated/simplified/coordinated together a bit more?	We reduced the number of figures
807	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	13	373	13	373	Additional reference about values as relationships, Rawluk, A., R. M. Ford, F. L. Neolaka, K. J. H. Williams, (2017) Public Values for Integration in Natural Disaster Management and Planning: A Case Study from Victoria, Australia. Journal of Environmental Management, 185, p11-20	Thank you for these suggestions.
808	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	36	948	36	954	Additional references about broad values underlying ecosystem management, Anderson N, R. M. Ford, C. Nitschke, L.T. Bennett, K.J.H. Williams (2018) Core Values Underpin the Attributes of Forests that Matter to People, Forestry, 91, p629-640 Williams, K. J. H., R. M. Ford, A. Rawluk, (2018) Values of the public at risk of wildfire and its management, International Journal of Wildland Fire, 27 (10), p655-676 Rawluk, A., R. M. Ford, F. L. Neolaka, K. J. H. Williams, (2017) Public Values for Integration in Natural Disaster Management and	Thank you for these suggestions.
809	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	36	974	36	978	Additional references about the 'valued attributes' concept. This is more specific than broad values and more plural than 'assigned values' Ford, R. M., N.M. Anderson, C. Nitschke, L.T. Bennett, K.J.H. Williams (2017) Psychological Values and Cues as a Basis for Developing Socially Relevant Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management, Forest Policy and Economics, 78, p141-150 Kendall D, R. M. Ford, N. M. Anderson, A. Farrar (2015) The VALS: A new tool to measure people's general valued attributes of landscapes. Journal of Environmental Management	Thank you for these suggestions.
810	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	47	1206	47	1207	Additional references about diverse values in policy (sustainable forest management) Ford, R. M., N.M. Anderson, C. Nitschke, L.T. Bennett, K.J.H. Williams (2017) Psychological Values and Cues as a Basis for Developing Socially Relevant Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management, Forest Policy and Economics, 78, p141-150	Thank you for these suggestions.
811	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	81	2011	83	2012	Additional reference describing how problems are framed in terms of values that can be quantified within institutional norms 3. Ford, R. M., A. Rawluk, K. J. H. Williams, (2019) Managing values in disaster planning: Current strategies, challenges and opportunities for incorporating values of the public, Land Use Policy, 81, p131-142	We appreciate this helpful reference, and have added it to the discussion of framing.

812	Rebecca Ford	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	108	2660	109	2661	Additional references about values in wildfire management Williams, K. J. H., R. M. Ford, A. Rawluk, (2020) The role of collaborative research in learning to incorporate values of the public in social-ecological system governance: case study of bushfire risk planning. Ecology and Society, 25 (4) 31. Rawluk, A., R. M. Ford, K. J. H. Williams, (2020) Applying social research: How research knowledge is shaped and changed for use in a bushfire management organization, Environmental Science and Policy, 106, p201-209. Ford, R. M., A. Rawluk, K. J. H.	We added: Ford, R. M., A. Rawluk, K. J. H. Williams, (2019) Managing values in disaster planning: Current strategies, challenges and opportunities for incorporating values of the public, Land Use Policy, 81, p131-142.
816	Himangana Gupta	Organisation	United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	25	707	27	717	It is known that religion and values promote conservation of biodiversity. But it has not been made clear How do they hinder conservation? Can an example or instance of it be given?	Thank you for this comment. We have now included text on how religions can hinder conservation, along with a few examples.
838	Robert Winthrop	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	I am a cultural anthropologist with extensive experience in assessing environmental values in the context of distinctive groups and world-views, but I'm also quite familiar with economic approaches to environmental valuation. The authors of chapter 2 demonstrate a strong understanding of multiple social science research traditions bearing on value. Congratulations!	We appreciate the comment and acknowledgement of the effort.
839	Robert Winthrop	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	For good reason the term "stewardship" is used extensively in chapter 2. I recommend you add a brief discussion of culturally reflexive stewardship, a more specific application of the stewardship concept which brings together several themes of this chapter, including relational value and reproducing values through cultural practices.  Culturally reflexive stewardship (CRS) "entails actions to promote the appropriate and sustainable use of nature that are motivated in part by	Please see Chapter 5 for a more specific treatment of stewardship. It was not developed further in Chapter 2.
840	Robert Winthrop	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	28	751	28	756	"1,622 languages are spoken in high biodiversity wilderness areas" (line 751). The term "wilderness" is inappropriate in this paragraph. Wilderness is not a technical term of the environmental sciences, but a value-laden expression of western environmentalism, a space supposedly undefined by human intervention. The regions described in the paragraph (the Western Ghats, the Amazon Basin, and Congo forests) are not empty, but filled with societies and their languages. As William Cronon says in a memorable essay, "There is nothing natural	Thank you for this insightful comment! The text has been revised accordingly, and the term "wilderness" has been removed. It was originally used in the article, which is not used in the shorter, more focused revised version presented in the final version of this Chapter.
841	Robert Winthrop	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	49	1231	60	1455	In complex documents, diagrams are particularly helpful in summarizing key ideas, including causation and relationship. This chapter uses many diagrams, some of which are clarifying, others not. Figure 2.15 tries to illustrate the relationship between sets of environmental values and the four frames of living (from, with, in, as) nature. I find this and other figures of this type baffling, because it's not clear what I'm supposed to learn or what it adds to the text. In contrast, Figure 2.11 is useful, because it distills a complex message	We have reduced the number of images in this section and clarified captions
890	Lilbeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	The chapter is extremely long and needs to be significantly reduced.	This general suggestion was shared by other reviewers and our own evaluation. We have attended this issue throughout the final version of the chapter to make it shorter and more policy-relevant.
891	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	56	1400	58	1440	The introduction of the Life Framework in this section is not clearly justified, none is it referenced. It is introduced by saying, "Drawing on a systematic review of 512 scientific publications (Annex 1402 2.14), and ILK sources, this section shows how diverse human-nature relationships, values and NCP 1403 can be represented by four main life frames of nature's values (LFs): Living from, living with, living 1404 in, and living as nature (Table 2.3)." The following text then lays out how it can be represented. What is strikingly missing here is - why is	As noted in response to a previous comment by the same reviewers, a review was conducted of organising frameworks which identified specific gaps that the life framework addresses. This is now made more explicit in 2.3.1 and the introduction to 2.3.2
892	Lilbeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	58	1440	59	1449	The life frames was introduced as a framework to organize environmental values literature and commented that the nature futures framework (NFF), which is being developed by IPBES through the task force on models and scenarios, while congruent with life frames, does not distinguish between living in and as nature. There is a good reason for not making a distinction between "living in nature and living as nature" because there is a huge overlap between them, which will pose difficulty when applying to scenarios and models. When	As noted above, living in and living as presented distinct clusters in the environmental literature. It is important to understand that the frames are not analogies for intrinsic, relational and intrinsic values. In this, the LF takes a different approach to the NFF. The potential purposes of the LF are now made more explicit in the text and an additional section has been added to annex 2.14 to clarify the relation between the LF and the NFF

893	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	59	1449	60	1457	Using a sample of 512 for literature appear to be small. How do you ensure that with this small sample size, there is no bias on the information to come up with a framework? What were the criteria for selecting the samples? The results presented in Figure 2.14 show that there is only less than 10% of the sample that can be clustered to "living as". Is it because of the lack of sample, or is it because of weakness in developing criteria? For example, how could you clearly and exclusively distinguish "living in" from "living as", which, as I previously	Interdisciplinary systematic searches for reviews of environmental values and human-nature relationships resulted in 7204 sources being screened. A final sample of 499 review articles and editorials were coded for life frames and values and value related concepts and quantitatively assessed. Additional sources were used for qualitative narrative synthesis. A detailed description of the search methodology is described in Annex 2.14.
894	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	111	2682	111	2695	The overlap between living in and living as that I commented above becomes very obvious in Figure 2.22, as both values are represented by socio-cultural and relational. A very important characteristic of conceptual or methodological framework is that, while the components are interrelated, they should not be overlapping or representing the same ideas. Otherwise, it will be difficult to identify specific indicators to represent each of them. Obviously, the figure is implying that you can use the same indicators for living in and living as,	By suggesting a no-overlap criteria is imperative, the reviewers take a particular implicit epistemological position in relation to what they define as a valid conceptual framework. However, in framing theory it is common for frames to overlap. For example, living from and living with can overlap in ways that organic agriculture are sometimes framed, or living from and living in nature may interlink where fisheries also contributes to the cultural identities of coastal communities. It is clear from the text and the underlying literature
937	China	Government	China	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	211	5686	211	5687	Except Tibet, the other examples listed in this paragraph are all countries, such as Rwanda, Iran, Finland, etc. Tibet is a province of China, and in addition to Tibet, other provinces in China also has many sacred landscapes. Therefore, it is required to amend "Buddhist monks in Tibet" to "China".	Thanks for this clarification and suggestion. This Annex was revised accordingly to include China.
938	China	Government	China	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	28	765	28	769	The Constitution of the People's Republic of China guarantees the equal rights of ethnic minorities and the autonomy of ethnic autonomous areas and guarantees the freedom of all ethnic groups to use and develop their own spoken and written languages. For example, the local government of ethnic autonomous areas have the right to use one or several commonly used local languages to perform their duties. The Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law further protects the aforementioned rights of all ethnic groups and ethnic autonomous areas. The Education	Thank you for this comment. The example has been deleted accordingly. The new text is more succinct and focused more clearly around the interlinkages between languages and values of nature.
948	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	General comment				General comment: The distinction between chp.2 and chp.3 content (values vs. valuation) is blurry in some places (e.g. TEEB Box p.51 and subsection 2.3.2.2. "from values to valuation"). Please ensure to avoid duplications with chapter 3.	Thanks for your comment. Section 2.3.2.2. (now section 2.4.2.2) is intended to reflect on the the conceptual aspects on how valuation methods influence valuation outcomes. See also section 2.4.2.1. for the emphasis on the process of how valuation methods influence valuation outcomes instead in empirical findings. We provide some examples without providing any assesment of the relevance/realibility of these methods in the context of nature valuation. Chp3 is focused on the empirical aspects on how valuation
949	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	6		7		Key messages No 8, 9, 12 have substantial overlap with themes and topics of other chapters (e.g. valuation, decision making, role of institutions, governance and power). It is suggested to avoid duplication and focus on the key messages of chapter 2 exclusively.	Message 12 is cut. Messages 8 and 9 are rewritten, while the main content is still included. These messages are based on analyses in Ch 2 and cover basic issues not covered in Chapters 3 and 4
950	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	20	551	20	555	Please consider providing references or some background on why this typology of worldviews is used and if there are further classifications of worldviews.	This typology was based on reviewed literature (i.e. the mostly common descriptors of worldviews, which were compiled for this typology). It is explained in the text that it is based on the three stage 2 literature reviews.
951	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	30	838	30	838	Please provide the same level of detail for the Kusaa example as with the other case studies for which single countries are mentioned. "Africa" as geographical background is way too broad.	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly.
952	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	47		47	Box 2.5	It is suggested to provide some geographical background when case studies of IPLC are presented in the assessment. In this case, for the example of "good life" as basic principle among Anishinaabe and Cree people.	Thanks for this suggestion! This Box was revised accordingly, and additional information of geographic locations/background was included in the revised text.

953	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	49	1235	49	1279	These paras discuss many aspects which also belong to the valuation part (ch. 3) of the assessment e.g. debates about the pros and cons of preference-based-approaches. Thus, there's potential for reductions.	thank you for your comment. We did reduce the section on preferences
954	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	82		83		It is proposed to give some explanatory remarks to Table 2.6. for a better understanding.	This is now Annex 2.16.
955	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	89	2159	89	2161	It is suggested to also consider in this regard the concept of the "Economy of the Common Good" (Gemeinwohköonomie) which explicitly emphasizes values other than profit maximization in business management and has also developed a common good accounting tool which includes dimensions such as human dignity/rights, solidarity and justice, ecological sustainability, transparency and co-management. See here: <a href="https://www.ecogood.org/what-is-ecg/ecg-in-a-nutshell/">https://www.ecogood.org/what-is-ecg/ecg-in-a-nutshell/</a>	We note the comment and proposal. There are many initiatives in this direction - which is great. For space reasons, we decided to link the argument to a specific development in the business sector called 'eco-social businesses'.
956	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	92	2223	93	2247	While the first two "main strategies and discourses" are differentiated along the lines of state vs. market, the third discourse is characterized by completely different dimensions (e.g. economic growth, degree of change, questions of scale) which could also be integrated in the two other strategies. Therefore, the distinction between the three discourses seems a bit arbitrary. As a general remark, when providing a typology or categorization it is suggested to give some insights along which lines distinctions are made and also, if this is based on some	Yes, we agree. That does, however, not imply that they are not distinguishable. The text is based on distinctions found in the literature, including an emphasis on more civil society engagements. However, the section 2.3.2.3 (now 2.4.2.3) is entirely rewritten and this part is moved to an Annex backing the new text.
957	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	116	2802	117	2852	We welcome the authors' efforts to present knowledge, research and skill gaps identified in the chapter in a comprehensive way. Considering overall time and resource constraints it would be interesting to know if some gaps are deemed easier to close than others and have more expectable impact with regard to valuation in decision-making.	Please see Ch6 for further development regarding how to confront these gaps.
958	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	240	5990	240	5993	We are not aware that the IPCC has named the "capitalist system" as a cause of the environmental crisis. Please check and provide a specific reference.	Thanks for this comment. A specific reference was added to this statement.
1035	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		0		0	NCP 18 seems to be referred to only in the sense of ecology; but IPBES CBD and others use it in sense of biodiversity option value	Thanks for this comment. We also add a point about options values in 2.2
1036	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1345		1346	re "though the degree to which NCP departs from the instrumental and dualistic tendency of ecosystem services has been disputed" it will help the reader to have more key references here, including Faith, D. P. (2018) Avoiding paradigm drifts in IPBES: reconciling "nature's contributions to people," biodiversity, and ecosystem services. Ecology and Society 23(2):40. <a href="https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-10195-230240">https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-10195-230240</a>	We now note in 2.2.4: "Biodiversity may be treated in NCP through the 'maintenance of options' to demonstrate the importance of biodiversity as variety, as well as aspects of ecological integrity and resilience (Faith et al., 2018)"
1037	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2340		2343	under social-ecological, it says "Relationships: The relational values concept recognises that values arise from connections and bonds between people and ecosystems." it should be noted that this is a restricted notion of relational values - it may be people-to-people and may be people to other aspects of nature including evolutionary; biodiversity options/ NCP 18 links to relational value in this way see for review see Faith, Daniel P., "Biodiversity", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2021 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.)	We highlight that social-ecological relationships are not only social relationships in nature, but also human-nature connections (or how biodiversity affects values).

1038	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2496			this entire para seems unjustified in tying NCP to social-ecological (where are the references justifying this?) "Ecosystem services and NCP are prominent examples of social-ecological systems frameworks t... These are interdisciplinary concepts and combine biophysical and social measures of ecosystems to understand nature's values" NCP18 biodiversity optioin value forexample is not about ecosystems	We were unsure what the suggestion was in this comment. We see NCP as almost definitionally related to social-ecological systems, so we have not made changes in response to this comment.
1039	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		7808		7813	re "vii. The paradigm of conservation seems to be getting twisted into biodiversity vs. ecosystem services corresponding to the intrinsic/instrumental dichotomy, with only a few, tenuous, attempts to bridge. Biodiversity is framed as something that should be protected for its own sake whereas ecosystem services stress benefits to humans. Interpretation: It is interesting to note how/whether the relational value domain can help bridging between them" this dichotomy was a bit of a false creation the ealry history of "biodiversity" concept shows	We have sought to reduce and where possible remove this dichotomy by showing points of convergence between value concepts, and the potential for overlaps and fuzzy boundaries.
1040	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		7849		7851	re "Relational values and the NCP paradigm may be able to bridge the gap between approaches." yes - see Faith, Daniel P., "Biodiversity", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2021 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.) <a href="https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/biodiversity/">https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/biodiversity/</a>	Thanks for the suggestion.
1050	European Commission	Government	European Commission	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	61	1476	61	1495	the paragraph starts relating "living with nature" strongly to the intrinsic value and peoples contribution to nature, which is quite a different world view than "Natures contribution to people". From line 1482, its only about the total economic value and how this can actually NOT reflect the intrinsic value. If you emphasise and elaborate here on the intrinsic value as independed from any worldviews and human intrests, than a better balance could be brought into the other parts of the assessment and the SPM.	We have sought to improve the balance between intrinsic value aspects of this frame and how it relates to TEV in this part of the text
1092	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		631		698	Sentientism is missing from the description despite its very central role in many worldviews as describing the sphere of moral considerability in human-nature relations. Also, introducing the term 'non-anthropocentric' (now it comes around line 1010) would be good.	Thank you for your comment. We recognize that this concept is essential in environmental ethics. However, as this assessment is focused on biodiversity and ES, we have excluded this element.
1093	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		631		632	Please consider correcting the definition: A biocentric view does not need to involve thinking in terms of (moral) rights: it may also be consequentialist/utilitarian. The moral worth as an end-in-itself does not imply having rights. Rather: biocentrism is defined by the moral sense of each living organism's good as having value in itself, making each living organism being worthy of moral consideration and respect.	Thank you for your comment. This has now been addressed
1094	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0				The chapter tends to assume that relational values always promote biodiversity. This is not necessarily the case with all place-based/related values, they may also support 'monoversity', 'monoculture', and 'human domination'. Please pay attention to this and clarify when speaking of relational values.	We highlight in the life frame sections how values can be 'overemphasized' or 'underemphasized' in a way that causes such problems as overconsumption or 'living against' nature etc.
1095	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0				Attention should be paid more to the different manifestations of biodiversity in nature.	The Global Asessment did more specific treatment of different dimensions of biodiversity per se. Here we have acknowledged its different values and perspectives, but do not delve deeply into the 'ecological hierarchy' of biodiversity or what it 'means' in that sense.
1096	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		640		681	Please consider correcting the definition: 1) ecocentric worldviews do not necessary entail thinking in terms of (moral) rights. There are ecocentric thinkers who reject the idea of rights. 2) Definition on lines 641-642 is a bit misleading, should be for example: "It is distinct from the biocentric worldview because of its focus on ecological systems, including ecosystems and species (or lineages) or populations, rather than on the individuals of different species." This is important because many ecocentric philosophers pay much attention to the value of	Thank you for your comment. This has now been addressed

1097	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		682		698	Please clarify. According to the present description of pluricentrism, it is an ontological or epistemic worldview, not a normative one as the three other worldviews described just before it. As the text states, viewing the world as related, interacting, and being built in relations may lead to different sets of valuations. Hence this view is of different type than the previous normative views. In ontological/epistemic terms, also ecocentric and even anthropocentric views for example can be very relationship-oriented. The 'centrism' in their name does not	Thank you for your comment. There is also a normative assumption in pluricentrism, i.e. that relations count and not single entities like in the ethical understanding of biocentrism and partly in ecocentrism, but pluricentrism challenges classic normative theories' hierarchical assumptions (center/periphery). We also acknowledge with weak anthropocentrism relational dimensions.
1098	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		790		805	The present framing seems to provide an idealising assumption that closer connectedness with nature (less distancing) automatically implies higher valuing of nature and NCP. Empirical research in many continents, both Western and non-Western does not validate such an idea. Results are mixed: rural people living close to nature have also been found to be less concerned about environmental hazards and possess less environmentally oriented attitudes compared with urban (e.g., Yu 2014 'Is environment 'a city thing' in China?; McMillan et al.	Thank you very much for this insightful comment. The text was revised accordingly. Especially in the new Box on Eco-literacy, this idealised assumption has been put in check, and the reference provided has been used.
1099	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		969		970	Backward-looking forms of justice should involve both retributive justice (punishment as a response to previous wrongdoings) and restorative justice (a 'constructive', positive approach as a response to previous wrongdoings).	Thank you for the helpful comment. we added restorative justice to the text and left the reference to wrongdoing neutral
1100	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1010			Table 2.1: Comment to Value type 2.a/association ii.: non-anthropocentric forms of utilitarianism exist, especially in the field of sentientist ethics.	Absolutely! As instrumental values towards nonhumans exist. Table is a short version of full table in Annex
1101	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1026			Table 2.2: Relations are of crucial importance to most ecocentric approaches that equally question the separation between human and nonhuman nature; I recommend adding ecocentrism to 3.a / point (i)	Thank you for the comment. We presented association based on the literature review. The strongest association of ecocentrism we found was with intrinsic values. We agree with your comment and this is the way some of us understand ecocentrism as well, but this does not seem to be salient enough in the literature.
1102	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1106		1142	ethics of care is missing from the relational values discussion/definition although it has been the first significant approach that brought relations at the forefront (see V Held book 2006, for environmental ethics of care Whyte & Cuomo 2016 in Oxford handbook of env ethics).	Thank you for your comment. We refer to care as essential category both for broad relational values and specific relational values. We also refer to Kyle Whyte repeatedly. A more detailed reference to care ethics would have unfortunately required too much space in the text
1103	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1439			Table 2.4: Please remove the dimensions of justice from life frames (in the second row); distributive, recognition, procedural, and epistemic justice are equally a concerns in all the different 'Living x nature' frames and the present way to associate them with distinct frames is misleading.	We agree that all these aspects of justice can be relevant within each of the frames, but the table shows which elements were emphasised within the literature in association with the frames. This is made clear in the table row heading.
1104	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1811			Figure 2.19: Should material power also include the present disproportionate distribution of material wealth?	The figure is reformulated after a complete revision of the text. See also Annex 19 on power. Material power was reframed to operational power in terms of (de facto) who has access to Nature which implies a distributional dimension of power. See also the link we make between operational power and distributive justice in figure 2.19. Further, power dimensions refer to general forms of power exercise which may rely on different resources such as wealth. This is stated in annex 19 as: "It is, therefore, necessary to understand how these
1105	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2320			Clarification needed: it could be equally well said that environmental policies often seek to make the present world and societal actions and their impacts more consistent with values. (For example: safe and clean water is of importance -> environmental policies established to respond to perceived water quality deterioration).	The sentence now reads: In addition to better aligning outcomes with extant values, environmental policies often seek to directly or indirectly create or modify values (e.g, promoting greater awareness of or care for biodiversity and nature, section 2.1.2, Annex 2.3).

1106	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2697			Table 2.8: (1) Please correct: 'Values embodying or articulating a duty to protect a species' are not biocentric, because biocentrism is individual/organism-oriented and sees biodiversity loss only a problem insofar as it demonstrates the suffering of individuals. Rather, the worldview here should be Ecocentric / weakly anthropocentric. (2) Importance of reciprocal responsibilities can also represent ecocentric or biocentric worldviews.	Corrected.
1255	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1159		1162	There is not consensus on that. References here appear to be very single-sided, and hardly any env economists cited here. See for example Kling et al. 2012; Johnston et al. 2017	References have been updated
1256	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1268		1269	There is not consensus on that. References here appear to be very single-sided, and hardly any env economists cited here. See for example Kling et al. 2012; Johnston et al. 2017	References have been updated
1257	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1272		1276	There is not consensus on that. References here appear to be very single-sided, and hardly any env economists cited here. See for example Kling et al. 2012; Johnston et al. 2017	References have been updated
1258	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Box 2.6. on TEEB: TEV does not express SP and RP - expresses both stated and revealed preferences	Reference to SP and RP was cut out of the section. In general, there is now only a box on values and preferences in economics with little reference to TEEB.
1259	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Box 2.6. on TEEB: indirect use value is rather values such as pollination, nutrient cycling, watershed protection, e.g. in relation the value of forests - by the indirect use, i.e., the conditions that enable use and satisfaction, from others generated by future use or by non-use	this is object of discussion within the TEEB community itself. For example, Hansjürgens considers so-called primary values (supporting services) outside of scope of the TEV. The key assumption of the TEV is that it focuses on preference satisfaction and therefore on values that in principle substitutable and commensurable. This might not always be the case for some supporting services
1260	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Box 2.6. on TEEB: Why is this the case? - TEV remains anthropocentric, but can dialogue with weak anthropocentrism (section 2.2.1) and can help building bridges in practice with biocentric or ecocentric solutions	I am not sure I understand the question, but in the reformulation of the new box we tried to reflect why preference-based approach is anthropocentric.
1261	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Box 2.6. on TEEB: the framing of this seems to suggest that the anthropocentric approach is wrong, or that the biocentric or ecocentric are better. Why not just say that they differ? - it using a language rooted in individual satisfaction and the assumption of trade-offs and commensurability.	in the reformulation of the box I hope that this impression is no longer as strong
1262	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Box 2.6. on TEEB: In the economics literature (which it seems very strange to omit here), TEV is clearly defined in terms of utility-based welfare to society (in the anthropocentric sense). This statement seems based on a very narrow reading of the literature - spiritual values, or other non-use values related to moral, religious or aesthetic properties, that hinders them being framed/identified in terms of direct, non-consumptive use-values or as individual preferences. However, they present a greater challenge for valuation (Kumar, 2011; see Chapter 3).	Box 2.6 on TEEB has been reworded to recognise that other value types in some cases be indirectly identified by framing them in the language of preferences

1263	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: TEV is a framework or concept, not a method. It is not in itself intended to solve env conflicts! CBAs which incorporate changes in TEV can be used as part of the decision-basis, guiding policy makers in such situations. - In these cases, the TEV concept and method fails to represent the complexity of environmental conflicts, thus leading to inadequate policies to address them based on epistemic and recognitional justice	We agree. It has been updated to a framework.
1264	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: Seems very opinionated. Where are the sources for this? Only ref here is a single authored paper in a German language journal! Is there general agreement? What does the economics literature actually have to say on this? - they are less robust and more inadequate to capture the full meaning of other values regarding human-nature-relationships (for example in the absence of markets or of established forms of exchange or when future benefits or benefits to other people become relevant TEV is based on a broad understanding of	the TEEB box has been eliminated. The references were almost exclusively TEEB ones (Kumamoto 2011 is the reference of the big TEEB foundations book; the other two references are the TEEB general summary and the summary for policy makers. The German reference is Hansjürgens, one of the coordinators of TEEB. The reference is from an English document written for policy makers on biodiversity, which is why it was chosen.
1265	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: unnecessary since it has already been explained that TEV is anthropocentric - monetary assessments do not consider how distribution inequality affects prices and their meaning for people	TEEB box has been eliminated. Reference to TEV has been cut
1266	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				BOX 2.6. on TEEB: Which is also not the purpose. Why is this relevant to mention? value types can be only indirectly identified by framing them in the language of preferences, when legitimate, via proxies (Figure 2.12): Accordingly, a proxy can help identify that a preference for a value is present, but not estimate or measure the strength of that preference in comparison to other ones.	yes, good point - it is mentioned because not everyone understands the purpose of TEEB
1267	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: unnecessary since it has already been explained that TEV is anthropocentric - self-organisation of ecological systems cannot be captured adequately, because these types of value 'are not ascertainable via individual preferences of human beings and therefore they cannot be assessed monetarily on the basis of certain economic methods	yes, good point - it is mentioned because not everyone understands the purpose of TEEB
1268	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: Seems somewhat far-fetched and pointless. There's a reason why (and a strong theoretical underpinning) that this called total ECONOMIC value - In all these cases, non-economic indicators can be used instead of or to complement TEV (Figure 2.12).	this is accurate, but not everyone reads the function of the TEV this way, which is why we have to specify it
1269	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: you can focus on individual preferences after cooperative consensus-building and other collective decision making - focusing on individual preferences underestimates interactions in valuation and might infringe upon other decision-making processes, such as cooperative consensus-building or collective decision-making (Gowdy & Erickson, 2005; Kumar, 2011).	Thank you for your comment. We have significantly reduced the part on TEEB and mostly referred to the TEV. Section 2.3 and 2.4 refer more to collective decision making and the role of institutions
1270	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Box 2.6. on TEEB: Whats the purpose of this? TEV and economic valuation by definition only makes sense if substitutability is assumed, so this seems first of all pointless, but also not rooted in the literature. Sensible to recommend complementing TEV with other approaches (just as TEEB also suggested), but suggesting to replace it with other approaches seems unsubstantiated by literature - The blue dashed lines refer to a possible, indirect use of TEV categories as proxies to identify values whose full meaning and strength can normally not be assessed	thank you for your comment. We totally and definitely agree. We made this explicit in the text because it is not necessarily a shared or widespread point of view. Also, given the amount of comments we received defending that the TEV can capture other types of value, we tried to depict the spectrum of the debate
1271	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		228	234	L. 228 – 234. deliberation would not solve the issue that some people may reject commensurability. It would seem fair here to refer to the massive amount of economic valuation methodological literature addressing ways to present valuation scenarios in ways that enable commensurability. Also important to mention that economic valuation methods are primarily used for marginal changes to nature/environment, and given the plethora of env economic valuation studies where 100000s of people have actually accepted the	Thank you for your comment. Chapter 3 discusses in more details valuation methods. In Chapter 2 we only address in very general terms and briefly values in economics.

1272	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2046		2048	The Exxon Valdez oil spill in Alaska, USA in 1989 illustrates the issues raised above (Fourcade, 2011). 2047 A contingent valuation method was used to litigate a claim for the loss of non-use values. A survey 2048 among the English-speaking US population showed that the aggregate monetary loss of non-use values ranged from 2.8 to 7.2 billion (1990) dollars (Carson et al., 2003). On the other hand, a 2050 "talking circle" was developed with members of the Inuit communities (Centemeri, 2015; Picou, 2015 2000). It is a non-hierarchical, traditional	Issues pointed out by reviewer are highlighted in the text.
1273	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2050		2066	The talking circle probably didn't produce monetary estimates that could be used in court Contingent valuation was instrumental in establishing compensation levels and seems to have influenced the reduction of large oil spills in the US (Carson et al., 2003). However, this method was not able to capture the worldviews and values of the Inuit communities concerned. For them the talking circle was a better way to express the multiple values involved (Centemeri, 2015). To conclude, the choice of a valuation method is not neutral. Scholars in	Issues pointed out by reviewer are highlighted in the text.
1277	The Danish IPBES Office	Organisation	The Danish IPBES Office	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Figur X, needs further development of interdependency/differences between the terms intrinsic and existence value. As it is stated at present, the instrumental values is defined as excluding.	We are unclear to what figure the reviewer is referring. However, we can say that all figures in what is now called 2.2 (values typology, which refers to the specific values of instrumental, intrinsic and relational) has been totally updated with better figures.
1297	Alexandra Lavrillier	Individual	CEARC	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	30	823	30	828	Please be so kind to include a reference to the source of this text copied from Lavrillier A. 2012, 'Spirit-charged' Animals in Siberia, in V. Grotti, O. Ulturgasheva, M. Brightman (eds), Animism in Rainforest and Tundra. Personhood. Personhood, Animals, Plants and Things in Contemporary Amazonia and Siberia, Oxford, Berghahn Books, pp. 113-129. Thanks	Thanks for suggesting this reference. We based the text on your important Contribution, explored in more detail on the Appendix presented, but now we also revised the text and included reference to this Book, as you suggested.
1298	Alexandra Lavrillier	Individual	CEARC	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	160	4247	160	4247	Please be so kind to insert the reference of the material about the Evenki and Even used in this chapter Lavrillier A. 2012, 'Spirit-charged' Animals in Siberia, in V. Grotti, O. Ulturgasheva, M. Brightman (eds), Animism in Rainforest and Tundra. Personhood. Personhood, Animals, Plants and Things in Contemporary Amazonia and Siberia, Oxford, Berghahn Books, pp. 113-129. and, for the language situation vs nature: Lavrillier A., 2005 Dialectes et norme écrite en évenk contemporain [French: Dialects and written norm in contemporary	The 2012 is now cited in the text, and the 2005 citation is in the language review (see DMR)
1324	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	2	62			Could the term 'biocultural framework' feature more prominently in the first chapter to offer an alternative to the concept of 'ecosystem services'? Otherwise the ethos of pluralism seems undermined?	Thanks for this comment. Although this is an interesting suggestion, the IPBES framework adopts the concept of "Nature Contributions to People" as an alternative to ecosystem services. Previous attempts to use "biocultural diversity" as a framework in IPBES assessments were rejected by the UN countries.
1325	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	90			Consistency: Is it social-environmental (chapter 1) or socio-environmental (as here)	Thank you for your comment. We have looked throughout the assessment and ensure consistency of terms.
1326	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	13	392			"Values pyramid": It is not justified why this term is used or if it is a new term or not. If not, it should be cited.	This term has been replaced by values typology
1327	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	14				Living frames are only explained in the figure. These concepts should be also explained in the main text because are very important within this chapter.	The figure has been removed from the introduction. Life frames are now clearly explained in 2.2.

1328	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	56				Living frames are explained here but the figure where they were presented is too far from this explanation. This should be clarified previously in the figure (i.e. that concepts related to the four living frames will be explained later in the text) or the explanation should be done where the figure is set.	the life frames are now introduced at the beginning of the chapter
1329	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					It would be enlightening to include a paragraph telling to the readers what concepts are going to appear during the text in order to have in mind the logic sequence of the chapter.	Thank you for this comment. We have briefly introduced the key concepts to appear in the body text as part of the road map in 2.1.
1330	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Figures should be improved in relation to letter size, colors and size in general.	We worked on figure to improve them
1331	Florencia Rositano	Organisation	Facultad de Agronomía (UBA)/CONICET	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Annex 2.2: the bibliographic review should be deepen in relation to its explanation (i.e. key words, type of manuscripts, etc).	Thanks for this comment. The literature review reports were revised, and present sufficient information, so that the reader can understand the procedures taken and the results obtained.
1340	Nigel Cooper	Individual	Anglia Ruskin University/Diocese of Ely	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	4	121	4	137	I am concerned that too great a dichotomy between IPLCs and 'broader society' is being presented. There is a considerable difference in outlook between ILK and scientific/economic knowledge used by powerful decision-makers. However, between these two ends of a spectrum lies 'broader society', strung out along the whole length (actually, of course, this is multi-dimensional, not two dimensional). In my experience as a priest, 'ordinary' people in England hold diverse views of nature, which, for many people, are more akin to the spiritual views	Thanks for this important comment. This is, in part, reflecting what was found in the Literature Review: a polarisation between different knowledge systems and sociocultural perspectives. We know that reality is much more nuanced than that. In the revised version of this Chapter, we strive to dismantle this strong polarisation by using other examples and making explicit that some values and perspectives can and are shared across different societal groups. This is a challenging but important exercise, which has been taken into
1341	Nigel Cooper	Individual	Anglia Ruskin University/Diocese of Ely	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	338	8212			It would be important here to discuss manifestations of value that are expressed within the landscape or by other 'cultural productions'. A particularly good example of a paper that used this is Claudia Bieling & Tobias Plieninger (2013) Recording Manifestations of Cultural Ecosystem Services in the Landscape, Landscape Research, 38:5, 649-667, DOI: 10.1080/01426397.2012.691469. I have attempted to examine other 'cultural productions' to see if the values that lie behind them can be	Thank you for your comment. We had to significantly reduce the length of the chapter and to exclude more detailed considerations, also of spiritual values. We appreciate very much the suggestion.
1342	Nigel Cooper	Individual	Anglia Ruskin University/Diocese of Ely	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	26	713	26	714	Text Box: This reads as a very external perspective on religion and, even allowing for shortness of space, a simplistic one at that. This gives the impression to religious people that they have not really been heard or taken seriously. For instance, paragraph 2 sketches the difference between Western and Eastern religions. It perhaps has to ignore the great diversity and nuance within these two broad groups. As a Christian, I would certainly take issue with the description of Western religion (which is really Middle-Eastern, isn't it?) - "God revealed	We thank the reviewer for this comment. This is a scientific assessment, and we do indeed take a perspective that is not an insider's perspective, but one informed by a wealth of qualitative and quantitative and historical study. There is a huge debate in religious studies between 'insider' and 'outsider' perspectives, of course, and insiders have valuable information and points of view. The text provided by Contributing Author Bron Taylor acknowledges that some religions thinkers have been developing more environmentally
1347	Lena Dempewolf	Government	Trinidad and Tobago	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	17	465	17	477	The roadmap, perhaps, could appear earlier in the chapter.	We have honed the length and message of 2.1. The roadmap now hopefully better orients the reader in the context of the overall introductory section.
1364	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11		11		I would add a figure that shows the origin of the studies collected in the literature review (where the studies mainly come from) and what kind of organizations they come from (universities, ONGs, companies, etc)	We did not have the capacity to conduct this analysis.

1365	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	35				Fig. 2.7- Add the value of "Identity"	we added the reference to identity to the figure and it is highlighted in the table
1366	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	9	308			Correct "natural capital"	Corrected.
1367	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	14				Fig.2.2- The explanation about what the "Life frames of nature's values" I would place them with another color or give them another location, not to accumulate so much text in the diagram. One option would be to place the meaning of each Life Frame in parentheses below each Archeotype.	The figure has been completely redesigned
1368	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	15				Indicators: would include as qualitative descriptor (ranking values) since there are studies that rank the degree of importance of SE	Thanks for this suggestion.
1369	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	15				Indicators: for quantitative measures would place (value per unit of area, or value per individual or household (ex: US \$ / household)	Thanks for this suggestion.
1370	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	35				Fig. 2.7- Difficult to understand the differences between Broad and Specific Values. I suggest changing the location of these terms, in such a way that it is understood which concepts are defining each type of value	the whole figure has been reworked
1371	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	35				Fig. 2.7- I would add on those circles the presence of people, since we are talking about people's worldviews	thank you for your comment. We redesigned all the 2.7 series but could not add people to the figure, because it would have rendered the figure difficult to understand. But we did hopefully make this clear in the text
1372	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	38				Table 2.1- I would divide the table on two columns, so that you can clearly visualize the differences between "intrinsic values" and "instrumental values" each with the respective association with broad values and worldviews	thank you for your comment. We reworked the table and distributed it into three column. We hope this makes things clearer
1373	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	38				Figure 2.8- Again, Difficult to understand the differences between Broad and Specific Values. I would add on those circles the presence of people.	thank you for your comment. We redesigned all the 2.8 series but could not add people to the figure, because it would have rendered the figure difficult to understand. But we did hopefully make this clear in the text

1374	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	38				Figure 2.8- Increase word size	Thank you for your comment. Figures have been reworked.
1375	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	39				Table 2.2- I would join this table with the Table 2.1	thank you for your comment. We joined the tables
1376	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	59				Figure 2.14- I would put legends to the axis of the graph	this figure was removed
1377	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	60				Figure 2.15- Very small letters. Perhaps, just leave the name of the values in each circle, without the content of each one	Thank you for your comment. Figures have been reworked.
1378	Nadia Selene Zamboni	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	61		62		Summarize texts	we are unsure what this refers to
1400	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	59	1450	59	1450	Improve the visual clarity of Figure 2.14A. Literature review on life frames of natures values (Clustering of the life frames and key values and value-related concepts in the systematic review sample of 510 review papers and editorials in the environmental values literature (Annex 2.15).	the figure is completely redesigned
1401	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	68	1645	68	1656	Can you consider including this statement on the connect between psychology, and the human-nature interface which influence pro-environment behaviour. "The science of psychology applied to issues of human-environment relationships can contribute in important ways to evaluating and shaping environmental policy as well as generally increasing awareness of the connection of humans to their social-cultural and physical environment" (Cvetkovich & Wener, 1994)	We have mentioned the contributions that psychology makes to this field throughout the chapter. We hope that we thus address the ways that psychology contributes to understanding human behavior.
1420	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Gaps in terms of gender and intergenerational perspective. Specific treatment is lacking. It has to be based on a rights perspective. Include intergenerational and gender vision, differentiated participation and assessments associated with traditional practices and knowledge. For example, maize which illustrates differentiated values.	The TOD has sought in various places to increase emphasis on gender, youth and inter-generational perspectives.
1421	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Values may not be "translated" in the best way to all stakeholders, including indigenous peoples.	While we agree with this statement in a general way, we are unclear how to address it. Various places in the chapter discuss the issue of 'knowledge weaving' and the issue of dialogue between knowledge systems.

1422	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Include the respect for indigenous peoples in deciding on their knowledge and sharing it.	Thanks for this comment. In Chapter 1, and throughout the assessment, we convey the need to respect Indigenous peoples self-determination in making decisions and sharing their knowledge. IPBES ILK dialogues also include a formal Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) process, to make sure that participants agree in sharing their knowledge, and they can add specific points related to that in FPIC agreements.
1423	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	While the nature of IPBES and the document is understood, it is necessary to include a human rights approach, including the international normative framework that recognizes the rights of indigenous peoples.	Thanks for this comment. In Chapter 1, and throughout the assessment, we convey the need to respect Indigenous peoples self-determination in making decisions and sharing their knowledge. IPBES ILK dialogues also include a formal Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) process, to make sure that participants agree in sharing their knowledge, and they can add specific points related to that in FPIC agreements.
1424	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Beyond the relational value, communality in indigenous peoples is a transversal approach in their relationship with nature.	Thanks for your comment. We noted these particularities in the revised text of Chapter 2.
1425	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Make it clear that when speaking of "people", we are not speaking exclusively of individuals, but rather of peoples / collective entities.	Yes, we have tried to address this throughout the text.
1426	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	The conceptualization does not include a territorial approach.	We are unclear what a 'territorial approach' would be, but we do in various places make reference to the fact that different ways of living/being (e.g., life frames associated with living with nature) include understanding human-nature relationships as part of one's identity and conceiving territory as part of 'self' (living as nature). At the same time, we have highlighted territorial rights and the need to allow 'space' in decision-making for values to not only be 'integrated' but also 'woven' in the sense that sometimes in one's territory
1427	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	The notion of social devices, referred to situation, condition and position of the different sectors, places and sections is key to recognizing the social representations of the natural.	Thank you for this comment, we have adopted a common language across the assessment, and this term did not appear prominently in the various literature reviews conducted, hence it was not adopted in Chapter. 2
1428	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Lack of legitimation, full and effective participation of IPLC.	The issue of participation and representation of IPLCs is treated in Chapter 2 (see 2.2.3), but it is also part of the 'challenges' identified by Ch3 in the application of integrated valuation methods. We also refer the reviewer to Ch1 and Ch4 that deals with issues of justice. While indeed these topics are treated in Ch2, there have also been assessment-wide decisions to make deeper treatment to occur in other chapters.
1429	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	The approach has a teleological cut of the natural, since it does not make a contribution, but rather has socially assigned functions, content forms or semantizations.	We are sorry, but we are unclear what this comment means or how to address it.
1430	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	The epistemological insufficiency of the concept of vision is clear, the notion of social representations is more binding.	We appreciate the reviewer's opinion and also acknowledge the use of 'social representations' in certain disciplinary traditions. However, at the assessment-level this is not a commonly used term, and we have not integrated it into Chapter 2.

1431	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Failure to consider human rights in decision-making is a problem.	This is mentioned in 2.4.
1432	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Include ecoliterature transversally in the document since it seems to be only recognized in this section and not in the rest of the chapters or in the section for decision makers.	We were unclear how to address this comment, since ecoliterature is not a category or discipline we are familiar with.
1433	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Examples: In the Tsotsil and Tzeltal peoples there are several notions of nature, but a similar notion does not exist.	There is specific treatment of the 'buen vivir' and related concepts to highlight the diversity of ways of knowing and inhabiting the world, which of course we cannot explore each individual cultural group. However, there is also specific treatment and geographic representation of diverse languages (see 2.2.X)
1434	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	0	0	0	0	Examples: A Tzeltal organization dedicated to the production of coffee does not dissociate its language, its knowledge, or its spirituality with the production and sale of its coffee; it is holistic.	Thanks for this example. We revised the text to include specific examples like this across the Chapter, and specifically in the Philosophies of Good Living Box and in 2.2.3
1435	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	21	1	21	When speaking of academic, indigenous and local literature, a different epistemological approach should be considered for the approximation of knowledge, which must be carried out in what is known as "dialogue of knowledge", that is, to recognize knowledge from other epistemological and horizontally, for which I recommend including: -Escobar A. (2012). A minga for post-development: place, environment and social movements in global transformations. Peru: Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos.	Thanks for this comment. In Chapter 2, one of the appendixes was written by Indigenous scholar Kyle Whyte, who discusses knowledge dialogues. Your suggestions and indication of literature are very relevant, but especially relevant to Chapter 3, which discusses approaches, methods and tools for valuation and for bridging and weaving diverse knowledges. We have passed your comment and suggestions to Chapter 3 authors. Plus, we cite Leff in the Buen Vivir Annex/Box, in reference to knowledge dialogue. Additionally, we
1436	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	1	25	1	25	The valuation of "good" or "bad" should not be given, but rather "important depending on the variety of worldviews", therefore it is suggested to change the wording to "Values can be broadly understood as what is important, considering there are nature's diverse values, and they ... ". In any case, it would be better to link values to human rights than to a connotation of good or bad.	We have updated the definition to say "good and important"
1437	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	88	3	91	When finishing talking about the different points of view, it would be appropriate to change this part of the text to key message 3 to give more force to said message, since the diversity of epistemologies is related to this idea.	Thanks for this comment. The Executive Summary was completely revised in the final version of Chapter 2. All KMs were revised to be consistent with the order with which topics are treated in the Chapter, as well as considering inter-message flow, consistency and evidence presented in the Chapter's sections.
1438	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	105	3	106	With the study carried out, it is known that the concept and economic valuation have been predominant for decision-making, so it is suggested to change the wording of "Economic concepts, including monetary valuation, markets and economic incentives, play a key role in" to "Economic concepts, including monetary valuation, markets and economic incentives have played a key role in ..." the above as a precedent to the predominant role these economic concepts have played but that with this new revision of the values should not	Thanks for this suggestion. We have revised.
1439	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	4	105	5	137	The first paragraph seems to have more force than the second, still referring to the importance of the economic component, it is suggested that the same paragraph indicates that the importance of the economic element has been preponderant and then indicating the importance of including other valuations, highlighting the evidence of the values given by the IPLCs.	Thanks for this suggestion.

1440	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	4	154	4	164	A4. Key message 4 recognizes the importance of economic concepts without clearly pointing out their insufficiency	This KM has been updated to address the concern.
1441	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	7	267	7	267	At the end of the line include "in a framework".	Done
1442	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	32	877	32	88	After the reference to Pérez Báez, indicate "as mandated by the General Assembly of the United Nations International Decade".	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly, and mention to the International Decade of Indigenous Languages was included.
1443	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	32	882	32	884	In fig. 2.6 regarding options to support linguistic diversity related to biodiversity, the participation of indigenous peoples in any of the aforementioned axes is not considered, which should be transversal for these actions	Thanks for your comment, the Figure has been revised accordingly.
1444	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	33	904	33	904	In the section that addresses national and international policies, also mention the International Decade of Indigenous Languages and the importance of linking it to these discussions.	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly, and mention to the International Decade of Indigenous Languages was included.
1445	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	50	1269	50	1269	Include Boff, L (2002) Essential care. Ethics of the human Compassion for the Earth. Madrid: Editorial Trotta	Thank you for your comment and the important suggestion to refer to Boff. IN the particular passage that you mention we mostly refer to economic literature and immanent critique by other perspectives within economics. We do not refer to other literature that is, similarly to Boff, generally critical of economic approaches not because it is not important, but because it is referred in other sections more extensively.
1533	Lidiamar Barbosa de Albuquerque	Individual	Embrapa	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	22		22		Box 2.1.(Figure 2.2.) - In this picture (left side), please justify the text that begin in: Life frames of Nature...(Just like the one on the right).	Addressed
1534	Lidiamar Barbosa de Albuquerque	Individual	Embrapa	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	27		27		Figure 2.3 -This figure is difficult to see, especially the dotted parts on the left and right sides. I suggest working with background colors, with border in continuous lines.	Worked on increasing font size and line weight.
1535	Lidiamar Barbosa de Albuquerque	Individual	Embrapa	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	33		33		Figure2.4. - This figure looks spectacular. Cogratulations.	Thank you, the figure has been improved based on other comments and on further work developed by the authors while revising the text.

1536	Lidiamar Barbosa de Albuquerque	Individual	Embrapa	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	40		40		Figure 2.6 - This figure is out of focus, needs to improve resolution.	Thanks for your comment, the Figure has been revised accordingly.
1537	Lidiamar Barbosa de Albuquerque	Individual	Embrapa	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	68		68		Figure 2.15 - I congratulate the beautiful and innovative figure, I suggest improving the sharpness of the writing on the small green ball on the left (A and C) and on the right side the small blue balls on the right (B and D).	the figure was redesigned
1542	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Even though knowledge (local and Indigenous) systems are addressed, there is a lack of representation of Indigenous scholars.	Thanks for this comment. We also share this concern, and this has been voiced to IPBES leadership and to IPBES ILK task force. In this assessment, we have strived to increase the representation of Indigenous scholars as authors and/or contributing authors, as well as opened up the opportunity for IPLCs contributions to the open Call for Contributions.
1543	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	10	54	10	56	Separation between Indigenous and academic knowledge, could be added that some academic work reflects the IK of Indigenous scholars	Thanks for this comment. This is highlighted in our literature review reports and in Chapter 1 and 3 as well. Although there is representation of indigenous scholars in academic work, the great majority of the papers that came out of ILK-focused literature reviews was academic.
1544	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	221	5837	222	5838	Besides this table, and table 2.19 youth is not mention in text again. What are the youth's values to nature?	Thanks for this comment. This Annex is presenting information that came from the ILK-focused literature review. Thus, the inclusion (or lack of thereof) of youth perspectives reflects what was found in the literature, and not the authors' own work or perspective.
1545	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	229	5964	239	5865	Besides this table, and table 2.19 youth is not mention in text again. What are the youth's values to nature?	Thanks for this comment. This Annex is presenting information that came from the ILK-focused literature review. Thus, the inclusion (or lack of thereof) of youth perspectives reflects what was found in the literature, and not the authors' own work or perspective.
1546	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	47	1224	48	1225	It would be illustrative to show that market integration could affect (erodes or not) LEK/TEK and how this affects biodiversity. Check: Lima da Silva et al. 2019; and Gómez-Baggethin et al. 2010	Thank you for this suggestion. We added reference to Gomez-Baggethin in the box on economic value and valuation
1553	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	33	904	33	914	Although international agencies have regarded culture and science (biological diversity) as separate policy portfolios, some early work (Posey 1983, 1985; Declaration of Belem, 1988) have started to show links between culture and biodiversity for the preservation of indigenous local communities.  Bridgewater, P, Rotherham, ID. A critical perspective on the concept of biocultural diversity and its emerging role in nature and heritage	Thanks for this relevant insight! The text has been revised accordingly, and key references were added.
1554	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	59		59		Figure 2.14 C) Please specify a label for the x axis to be able to understand the diagram.	The figure was removed

1555	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	211	5677	211	5699	Based on the authors' articulation this statement is better fitted under the Knowledge and policy gaps, which could follow after line 5646.	Thank you for this relevant comment. This Annex contains the synthesis of the ILK-focused Literature Review conducted for the Assessment. This is, indeed, a knowledge and policy gap and should be reflected in both CH2 and CH6 Knowledge and policy gaps. We have revised our Knowledge and Policy Gaps Box (presented in section 2.6 of the revised version of CH2, and passed this comment along to Chapter 6 as well.
1556	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	313	7808	313	7815	Comment: One should note that Ecosystem Services (ES) continues to be a major mechanism driving Biodiversity developmental finance instruments (OECD 2020 Brochure: Tracking economic instruments and finance for biodiversity).	Thank you for your comment. Our consideration is based on the literature we have collected and reviewed based on a search for intrinsic, instrumental and relational values of nature. The consideration only refers to that literature
1557	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	319	8002	319	8002	(#27) and (#31) should be in a single statement since both statements mirror on the importance of plural valuation for policy ...	thank you for the comment. This is a general summary of the literature and presents different articles, which is why they are two separate paragraphs. The text is not finalized
1558	Noel M Unciano	Individual	Industrial Technology Development Institute - DOST	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	319	8018	319	8020	(#31) and (#27) should be in a single statement since both statements mirror on the importance of plural valuation for policy ...	see above
1569	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	2	62			Could the term 'biocultural framework' feature more prominently in the first chapter to offer an alternative to the concept of 'ecosystem services'? Otherwise the ethos of pluralism seems undermined?	See response in 2446
1570	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	3	90			Consistency: Is it social-environmental (chapter 1) or socio-environmental (as here)	Thank you for your comment. We have looked throughout the assessment and ensure consistency of terms.
1571	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	9	286	9	290	Another pertinent reference is Mike Hannis's Freedom and Environment: autonomy, human flourishing and the political philosophy of sustainability (2015) Routledge, New York.	We were not able to access and evaluation this work.
1572	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11	Fig 2.1			It is striking that in this scoping review, no humanities articles have been examined, when this is where the nexus of society, culture, and environment is often examined from historical and phenomenological and ethical perspectives.	We agree that the humanities are an important source of knowledge about the complexity of human values. As mentioned in the document, our attempt was to conduct a census of all value-related abstracts in the literature database. This included several humanities journals such as History of Humanities, Humanities and Social Science Review, and the International Journal of Humanities, etc.
1573	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	12	348	12	354	Reference is made to the humanities here; but I cannot see how this research field is reflected in fig. 2.1 above. This lacuna appears significant, given that the way the humanities frame world views is specific to these disciplines (see chapter 2, p. 21, 564-665).	For the purposes of the figure, Humanities was included as a part of the Social Sciences but as noted above the analysis does include several Humanities journals. It is also important to note that it was not the authors' decision to classify these journals as social sciences but rather it was the classification to the journal in the metadata.

1574	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	13	392			Define 'archetypes'? As this whole report is structured around these 4 archetypes, it would be worth explaining that archetypes are meant to facilitate communication between different knowledge communities. But that it is important that each community understand what (fuzzy) concept these terms are placeholders for.	This term is not included now.
1575	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	21	564	21	665	Reference is made to the humanities here; but I cannot see how this research field is reflected in fig. 2.1 above. This lacuna appears significant, given that the way the humanities frame world views is specific to these disciplines (see chapter 2, p. 21, 564-665).	This has been revised.
1576	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	22	598			Clarify that religious and linguistic affiliations inform people's framing of ontology (being; how nature and people come into being; and also process-ontology or becoming as articulated by philosophers including Deleuze and Guattari), which informs how their understanding of their relationship with nature (in, from, etc) is conceptualised?	We thank the reviewer for this comment. To avoid excessive complexity and the use of difficult comments, which have been criticized in previous drafts, we convey the same idea though the use of concepts such as Worldviews, to convey that religious and linguistic affiliations shape people's views / understanding of the world, which also include being in the world. This text is mainly developed for decision and policy-makers, thus the excessive theorization would not be helpful to get the main messages across, as
1577	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	23				For Francophone readers, an excellent overview of biocentric/ anthropocentric/ecocentric ethical world views is offered by Gérald Hess. <i>Ethiques de la Nature</i> . Presses Universitaires de France. 2013.	We did not have the ability to evaluate the suggestion in French.
1578	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	24	686	24	687	Another valuable, and foundational, pluralistic reference is Eduardo Viveiros de Castro's article 'Cosmological Deixis and Amerindian Perspectivism' <i>The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute</i> 4 (1998) 469-488. Author(s): Eduardo Viveiros de Castro Source: <i>The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute</i> , Sep., 1998, Vol. 4, No. 3 (Sep., 1998), pp. 469-488	Thank you. We have included this reference in the edited text.
1579	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	32	891			The references on this page deserve updating, in light of the Ecosystem-based adaptation/ Nature-based solution policy advanced by UNEP and the IUCN. I see this is introduced on p. 45; but maybe there's a way to anticipate this topic here?	Thanks for this comment. The text was revised and shortened to attend to reviewers and Co-chairs guidance, and this specific text was removed from the present version.
1580	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	52				Individual satisfaction must be linked to their receptivity to nature, which in turn needs to be cultivated particularly in increasingly urban audiences. This shifting between what is later called 'different life frames' (p. 61) might be identified as a challenge to the TEV approach. A comparatist approach potentially requires people to move through different perspectives of valuing Nature; in/ from/ with/ as... allowing their target of well-being shift from - financial health; physical health; emotional; spiritual health...	It is unclear to what part of the chapter this comment is referring to. In consequence, it was not possible to provide a response.
1581	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	56	1405	56	1406	These lines, defining different framings of nature should appear in the introduction to this document. 'Nature can be interpreted in...'; they are very clear and would be helpful in orientating the argument made in these pages from the outset.	Agreed. These are now integrated in the introduction to the chapter, and indeed in the first key message of the SPM
1582	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	56				It should be noted that 'thinking like a mountain' involves either personification and possibly prosopoeia- a rhetorical device in which a speaker or writer communicates to the audience by speaking as another person or object. This is often undertaken by a biocultural mediator performing a spiritual role.	This has been added to section 3.4.1. of annex 14

1583	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	58				Table - row 1, column 4 (living as nature) sentence is missing a word: 'nature matters because it is who human beings (ARE?), physically, mentally, and spiritually.	corrected
1584	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	58				Table row 3, values associated with living from/ as/ in nature might be 'target-centred' aimed at bio- or eco-centric ends; Swanton (Virtue Ethics: A Pluralistic View (Oxford: OUP, 2003).	worldviews were associated to frames based on emphasis in the clustered literature (see annex 2.14)
1585	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	60				I find the colours in this figure are very hard to read. Is it possible to use more contrasting colours?	figure was redesigned
1586	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	66				What about cultural productions as a socio-cultural interventions that catalyse change using their discursive power (see p. 74; fig. 2.19)? Think of books by Barbara Kingslover or Rachel Carson, or dystopian novels about socio-ecological collapse, like The Road. One attempt to synthesise the intersection between the environmental humanities, values and pluralistic policy is Greg Garrard's article 'The Environmental Humanities: Notes Towards a Summary for Policymakers', in The Routledge Companion to the Environmental	This is an excellent suggestion, and we have added a brief reference to this article in this section.
1587	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	76	1879	76	1880	Referencing Care & values - See Thom van Dooren 'Care: Living Lexicon for the Environmental Humanities 5 (2014) pp. 2921-294, who argues that care is 'an ongoing critical engagement with the terms of its own production and practice'.	Thanks for this valuable reference suggestion. However, in this section we were not able to expand references because the section was rewritten and the little space were devoted to the concrete examples/references of IPLC.
1588	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	98		table entry embeddedness		It is probably more accurate to say that painting and narratives represent nature, with artists acting as mediating figures	In table 2.8 this is now described as practices that 'embed' values as social-ecological processes.
1597	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Algunas de las gráficas no tienen la misma resolución que otras, facilitaría tener la misma resolución y editar los pies de figura para que incluyan una descripción de todos los elementos de la figura, en particular los acrónimos.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1598	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Diservicios de la naturaleza como abordan esta categoría?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1599	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Se reconoce que tenemos en los IPLC como si fueran todavía muy puras y no hubiera mestizaje lo que dificulta poner los límites entre un grupo indígena y otro que ya tiene mestizaje y sincretismo. En el caso del Cacao, hay prácticas ancestrales y por otro lado hay prácticas con mayor sincretismo, en el caso de los servicios ecosistémicos que proveen estos sistemas productivos. Hay resistencia a asumirse como grupo originario lo que genera una gran complejidad tanto de prácticas como de problemáticas.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1600	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				En cuanto a los diservicios, cómo incluirlo en políticas públicas e instrumentos para toma de decisiones, contemplando también esta parte de sincretismo y IPLC.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1601	Florencia Rositano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Life Frames en página 14, dónde se muestra la figura y los cuatro LF, y que después en la página 50-60 a penas se definen, esperaba una definición más temprana y no sólo su inclusión en la figura, o mencionar que se definirán más adelante, hay una desconexión en el texto.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1602	Florencia Rositano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Cómo primer párrafo en la introducción hacer un hilo lógico con los conceptos que se presentarán en el capítulo, ya que es difícil recordar todos los conceptos conforme se van leyendo las secciones. Una pequeña guía a la que regresar fácilmente sería muy útil.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1603	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Diservicios incluir algún ejemplo que ayude a facilitar la visualización de este tipo de problemas	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1604	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	41		41	En la Página 41 sería interesante incluir los nombres de los tipos de valores en el centro de la figura ya que ayudaría a visualizar y entender los límites.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1605	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	56		56	Figura página 56 ejemplos de los LifeFrames, explicar los términos ya que comprender los life frames en la parte central es un poco difuso.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1606	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Cuándo llegue esta información a un tomador de decisiones, tal vez el documento es demasiado largo, se está pensando en una guía o documento más didáctico que facilite la lectura por parte de los tomadores de decisiones?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1607	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Agregaría un gráfico que muestre el origen de los estudios recopilados en la revisión de literatura (de donde vienen principalmente los estudios) y de que tipo de organizaciones provienen (universidades, empresas, ONGs, etc)	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1608	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Incluir tablas de limitaciones y que métodos son útiles para los tomadores de decisiones y la robustez de cada método sería fantástico.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1609	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Para los gobiernos municipales, hay muchos tomadores de decisiones hace falta una cosa más práctica, que permita dar énfasis en la participación más local, trabajando con métodos participativos, para gente que tragaja con tomadores de decisiones un documento que nos de instrumentos para facilitar la inclusión de los múltiples valores por parte de los tomadores de decisiones.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1610	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				observando los gráficos sobre revision de literatura, talvez podria agregarse un gráfico mostrando el origen (de que países) vienen principalmente estos estudios	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1611	Lizeth Lozano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Sobre tema específico dentro con complejo contexto de Latinoamérica. Como se abordan los diversos enfoques de pueblos que se encontraran cercanos y pueden tener definiciones complejas. Cómo incluir las distintas cosmovisiones cuando son contradictorios en la toma de decisiones.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1612	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Hay algunas gráficas que necesitan distribuir los conceptos en una misma línea para que parezcan cosas similares, ya que da una lectura de cosas diferentes (figura 2.7) jugar con las proporciones y colores para facilitar la lectura y cuidar tamaño de letra y espacio entre las palabras	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1613	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				2.1 y 2.2.3 los conceptos son muy similares y en la 2.2.3 hablamos de tipos no sé si valdría la pena mencionar los tipos que se están trabajando	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1614	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Agregar el valor de "Identity"	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1615	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Grupo ILK y eran parte del panel de expertos, este documento está más dirigido a los tomadores de decisiones, qu pasa con los tomadores de deciones a escala local? se generará una guía u otro documento similar para guiar a los tomadores de deciones locales?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1616	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	45		45	En la página 45 el color rojo (oscuro) de la figura dificulta la lectura	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1617	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	41		41	También en la figura 2.9 de la página 41, el círculo morado oscuro hace difícil leer las palabras dentro del círculo	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1618	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Corregir "natural capital"	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1619	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				La explicación sobre que son las "Life frames of nature's values" las colocaría en otro color o le daría otra ubicación para no acumular tanto texto en el diagrama. Una opción sería colocar el significado de cada Life Frame entre parentesis debajo de cada Arquetipo	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1620	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Indicators: incluiría como qualitative descriptor (ranking values) ya que hay estudios que ranquean el grado de importancia de los SE	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1621	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Indicators: para quantitative measures colocaría (valor por unidad de area, o valor por individuo o vivienda (ex: US\$/household)	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1741	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Economic values seem to be presented in a negative or antagonistic way. The chapter would benefit from avoiding this type fo language.	We tried to reformulate the section on economics to account for this
1742	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The chapter should distinguish between price, value and accounting, which are distinct in economics.	Thanks. We have followed the advise
1743	Andreas Kontoleon	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				It is not clear what the chapter is trying to put on the table, what is the message it is trying to convey. The chapter could clarify the main point that is being tried to be made.	Please refer to the Executive Summary for the overview of what the chapter offers. Also, section 2.6 attempts to highlight its novel contributions to IPBES and generally.
1744	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The chapter is missing discussions on the 'intergenerational' aspects of value	This is not entirely accurate - section 2.2 refers to intergenerational aspects of values in the context of broad values and justice.
1745	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The chapter seems to convey an oposition between values plurality and 'singularity', mentioning that economic touches just on one of them (singularity). This is not right.	Among other editions, we have reframed the entire section on economics and accounted for the TEV.

1746	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					There is conflation between economic and market values, this needs to be distinguished.	We have worked on making this distinction clear throughout the entire chapter.
1747	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The added value of the chapter perhaps is the discussion not only about the values that exist, but about the values that are currently shown by available institutional structures.	Please see KMs1-3 and also section 2.4.
1772	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Figuières-Sacredness poses a problem to standard economic approach of preferences. They are supposed to be complete. But this axiom is dropped out when it comes to sacredness	We added a reference to Dasgupta and sacredness, hoping that it addresses the comment
1773	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Figuières-Completeness is also related to the issue of commensurability. I have written a paper about that.	Thanks for this suggestion. Commensurability section has been revised.
1774	Ian Bateman	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					I feel that the use of the term 'intrinsic value' in Ch2 (and more generally) is misleading. Ch. 2 refers to it is "Values of entities expressed independently of any reference to humans as valuers". While this is an interesting philosophical concept, the word 'intrinsic' means something that is held by the entity concerned. So the intrinsic value of a whale is held by the whale and cannot be held by a human. As soon as a human expresses what they call an 'intrinsic value' then by definition it is now a human value and therefore NOT an intrinsic value. Rather it	see answer above
1799	Martin Quaas	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					there seem to be an imbalance in the values presented where some values are more important than others, and when including multiple values this imbalance is maintained. The chapter should avoid giving this impression.	Indeed, different stakeholders will impute different importance to values, and indeed power dynamics, social norms, etc. will affect which values are expressed (i.e. imbalances). This is treated in section 2.4.
1807	Ben Balmford	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					In the meeting the issue of "value" and what it means came up – the reason why this came up as an issue and a source of confusion is mainly a combination of:  1) semantics (IPBES calling things "economic value" wrongly)... which in part is more broadly true of the science community not understand that cost, price and value are all different things. Examples include: Line 147: "Dominant political and economic decision-making logics	We discussed how TEV can capture some values directly and others indirectly and hope that this partly addresses the issue
1824	Ian Bateman	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					I feel that the use of the term 'intrinsic value' in Ch2 (and more generally) is misleading. Ch. 2 refers to it is "Values of entities expressed independently of any reference to humans as valuers". While this is an interesting philosophical concept, the word 'intrinsic' means something that is held by the entity concerned. So the intrinsic value of a whale is held by the whale and cannot be held by a human. As soon as a human expresses what they call an 'intrinsic value' then by definition it is now a human value and therefore NOT an intrinsic value. Rather it	The discourse on intrinsic values is very complex and entails different meanings and perspectives (see, for example, O'Neill summarizing them). There is an anthropogenic understanding of intrinsic values (as assigned by humans to the natural world) and a non-anthropogenic or objective understanding of them. Because in the chapter we could not enter the details of this decade-long debate, we chose the most general definition that states that intrinsic values are expressed without any reference to people as valuers, whether they
1826	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	2	42			text refers to biophysical preferences, while biophysical indicators, or biophysical approaches is used in other parts of the chapter, what authors mean by biophysical preferences here is unclear.	We have clarified the differences between indicators and preferences.

1827	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	75	342	75	347	Monetary valuation is not a pre-requisite of PES, see Wunder S. (2013) When payments for environmental services will work for conservation. Conservation Letters, 6(4):230-237, on this misconception. Or introduction in Wunder Wunder, S., et al (2018) From principles to practice in paying for nature's services. Nature Sustainability, 1: 145-150.	We agree. We note that the text does not say that it must be based on monetary valuation, just that it is an example of a case where it has been. In the revised text, we mention other instruments. Again as examples and not as necessity. Certainly, one can use economic instruments as incentives independent of monetary valuation.
1828	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	84			85	This Box 2.10 on environmental accounting needs to be updated for the recently launched SEEA Ecosystem Accounting <a href="https://seea.un.org/ecosystem-accounting">https://seea.un.org/ecosystem-accounting</a> . On inclusive wealth a key paper are Kenneth J. Arrow, Partha Dasgupta, Lawrence H. Goulder, Kevin J. Mumford and Kirsten Oleson (2012). Sustainability and the measurement of wealth. Environment and Development Economics, 17, pp 317-353. Lange G-M. et al. (ed.) (2018) The Changing World of Nations 2018: Building a Sustainable Future. World Bank. A recent	The box was in the end not included. It was overlapping a box in Chapter 3
1829	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Revision for clarity in the concept of economic value and at places there seems to be confusion with financial value, as for example in line 8547, or that this only exist for provisioning ecosystem services	Thank you for your comment. In the particular passage that you mention (Annex) we changed the word financial and replaced it with economic, as the term is not intended there in technical sense. We have also made similar changes to the main text
1830	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	347			354	Quai-option value and insurance value, as distinctive values of preserving nature, seems to be suggested in Figure 2.40, but their definition and literature could be mentioned in the text.	thank you for the comment. We refer to this in the main text in the section on TEV
1846	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	42	1081	42	1082	Perhaps there is a need to explain why monetary valuation cannot be used to assess intrinsic values.	thank you for your comment. We discussed this briefly in the section on TEV by referring to substitutability
1847	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	45	1195	45	1202	This section is not linked to the model of comprehensive values. Why is this section here? Isn't this an instrumental value - protect nature to mitigate climate change? Since nature-based solutions are mentioned for Urban areas, it might also be worthwhile mentioning ecosystem-based adaptation that emphasizes protection of nature and human-nature relationships to support climate adaptation among indigenous and local people. E.g. Hausner, V. H., Engen, S., Brattland, C., and Fauchald, P. (2020). Sámi knowledge and ecosystem-based adaptation	This section has been updated.
1848	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	62	1515	1535	63	It is unclear how to use life frames for agrobiodiversity and traditional farming. For example in Mexico farming of native maize is an integral part of the national identity, but for preserving the genetical diversity of maize, the practices of indigenous farmers need to be preserved through intergenerational transmissions of knowledge, practices and beliefs. Indigenous small-scale farmers are custodians of native diversity through living with nature, from nature or as nature? (see e.g. Rivera Lopez et al. 2020 Bridging different perspectives for biocultural	more than one life frame can be applied to any particular case. this has been made clearer in the text.
1860	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	4	146	4	147	Add 'by biocultural approach' after 'intercultural' because the work that analyses language-nature-culture co-evolution, is bioculturality	Thanks for this comment. This was noted and the text of this KM was revised accordingly.
1861	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	5	191	5		Specify what does external pressures like another way of influencing valuation	The KM is rewritten taking account of this comment. More importantly, the order and content of other KMs is changed so the issue the reviewer raises should be clarified by the time the reaser gets to the KM in the revised Ex Sum that most resembles the actual one

1874	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11	322	11	323	Thank you for making the data behind this figure open (I think). The figure should be reproducible though so that the code used to produce the figure is made available if possible.	Thank you for this comment. The code is provided as part of the data archive process.
1875	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	64	1535	64	1536	Are the datasets (MERP data and data from Marine Conservation Society) adequately cited? It is not clear if there is a data deposit package associated with this analysis. If there is not one already completed, please add it so the analysis and figures are reproducible.	Thanks for this comment. This was noted and the text of this KM was revised accordingly.
1876	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	255	6326	259	6390	It is not clear if there is a data deposit package associated with this analysis. If there is not one already completed, please add it so the analysis and figures (Figure 2.32/2.33/2.34) are reproducible.	The KM is rewritten taking account of this comment. More importantly, the order and content of other KMs is changed so the issue the reviewer raises should be clarified by the time the reaser gets to the KM in the revised Ex Sum that most resembles the actual one
1877	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	212	5721	212	5723	The maps should be projected to the robinson projection ( <a href="https://ict.ipbes.net/geoinformation/technical-guidelines/conversion-to-the-robinson-projection">https://ict.ipbes.net/geoinformation/technical-guidelines/conversion-to-the-robinson-projection</a> ). The colors between 5 and 6 are very difficult to tell apart. Would it be possible to increase contrast between the categories? There are some nice sequential color palletes available here ( <a href="https://personal.sron.nl/~pault/">https://personal.sron.nl/~pault/</a> ) that are color blind friendly.	Thank you for your comment. We have modified the maps according to IPBES guidelines.
1878	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	278	7002	278	7004	The layers used to create the map need to be properly attributed and if possible the figure should be made reproducibly.	Thanks for this recommendation.
1879	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	381	9433	382	9446	Figure 2.42/Figure 2.43 / Figure 2.44 - the step from literature review to figures (cluster analysis) is not reproducible. How was this cluster analysis done? How were these values presented in Table 2.27 arrived to? Is there code behind this?	The steps from coding to cluster and correlation analyses are described in Section 2 of Annex 14 in a reproducible way.
1880	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	439	11196	439	11197	The code and data used to produce Figure 2.50 should be made available	We have shared these data with the TSU.
1909	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Some of the graphs do not have the same resolution. Edit figure captions to include a description of all elements of the figure, particularly acronyms.	All figures have been improved in this final version, including some important ones that were workshoped in design software with the TSU.
1910	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					nature di-services how do you approach this category?	this has been made explicit in 2.3.2.2

1911	Alexander Rincón Ruiz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		1774			In Rincón-Ruiz et al 2019 we link how valuation can be a Link between socio-environmental conflicts and Ecosystem Services: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2019.100924">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2019.100924</a> and in Rincón-Ruiz et al 2021 <a href="http://fce.unal.edu.co/media/files/CentroEditorial/Libro_VIPBE_Alexander_Rincon_Ebook.pdf">http://fce.unal.edu.co/media/files/CentroEditorial/Libro_VIPBE_Alexander_Rincon_Ebook.pdf</a> (chapter 8), we include an study case where we link the same concept (ecosystem, services, environmental conflicts and valuation) (Book: valoración plural en América Latina)	Thanks for this recommendation. We have included the suggested references in this section
1912	Alexander Rincón Ruiz	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		2189			In 2015 the humboldt institute in Colombia published a proposal on Integrated valuation and in 2019 a review of cases associated with integrated valuation was published for Latin America: <a href="http://www.humboldt.org.co/es/component/k2/item/835-vibse-en">http://www.humboldt.org.co/es/component/k2/item/835-vibse-en</a> <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2019.100901">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2019.100901</a>	Sorry, but as far as we could see, this reference did not fit the purpose of this paragraph.
1913	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					IPLCs are considered without miscegenation, this makes it difficult to set the limits between an indigenous group and another that already has miscegenation and syncretism. In the case of Cacao, there are ancestral practices and others with syncretism. There is resistance to assuming itself as an original group, which generates a great complexity of both practices and problems.	Thanks for this comment. The nuanced and hybrid nature of IPLCs is noted on Chapter 1 and is also conveyed as a knowledge and policy gap in CH2.
1914	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Regarding di-services, how to include it in public policies and instruments for decision-making, also considering this part of syncretism and IPLC.	We have considered the possibility for living against nature and disservices with reference to an over-emphasis of life frames.
1915	Florencia Rositano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		14			Life Frames: four LFs are shown in BOX 2.1, which are not clearly defined later on page 50-60. It is recommended to define the concept before box 2.1.	The box has been moved to 2.2. Life frames are now clearly defined.
1916	Florencia Rositano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					In the introduction make a logical thread with the concepts that will be presented in the chapter. It is difficult to remember all the concepts as the sections are read. A little guide to easily return to would be very helpful.	We have introduced some 'skeletal' figures in the Executive Summary, which provide some of the key concepts that are then developed throughout the chapter. We also try to reflect these in the 'road map' figure at the end of 2.1.
1917	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Di-services: include an example that helps to facilitate the visualization of this type of problems	Addressed
1918	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		41			Including the names of the types of values in the center of the figure, would help to visualize and understand the limits.	Sorry, we don't understand this comment as the page to which it refers does not have any figure
1919	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people		56			Explain the LifeFrames terms with examples in the text not just in the figure. It is difficult to understand the concept only with the figure.	this is done

1920	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	11			Add a graph that shows the origin of the studies collected in the literature review. Which institutions wrote them by types NGO, universities, companies	We did not have the capacity to conduct this additional analysis.
1921	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Including tables of limitations, which methods are useful to decision makers, and the robustness of each method.	Please see chapter 3.
1922	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				It is necessary a document that provides tools to include multiple values (include the local vision), focused on people who work with decision makers.	The executive summary provides guidance on: Overarching theme: Understanding diverse conceptualizations of nature's multiple values and expressing them in decision-making can support outcomes that are more conceptually robust (i.e. more complete, based on evidence and knowledges), practical (i.e. more sustainable, more effective, more legitimate, less conflict-ridden) and ethical (more just, more democratic, more equitable). Specific theme 1: Decision-making is not achieving its environmental
1923	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Graphs on literature review: add a graph showing the origin (from which countries) these studies come.	While desirable, this new analysis was not feasible given our team's capacity to evaluate further this large database.
1924	Lizeth Lozano	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Within the complex context of Latin America. How the various approaches to nearby towns that may have complex definitions are addressed. How to include the different worldviews when they are contradictory in decision-making.	This is addressed in Chapter 4, which deals specifically with decision-making and conflicts.
1925	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Distribute the concepts on the same line to identify that they are similar (figure 2.7). Check proportions and colors to facilitate reading and take care of font size and space between words.	the whole figure has been reworked
1926	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Sections 2.1 and 2.2.3 The concepts are very similar, in 2.2.3 you talk about types, it would be good to mention the types that are being worked on.	The chapter was reviewed to better create a flow between sections.
1927	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	35			Fig. 2.7 Add the value of "Identity"	we added the reference to identity to the figure and it is highlighted in the table
1928	Angélica Trujillo	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				This document is more aimed at decision makers at the regional and national level. What about local decision makers? Will a guide or other similar document be generated?	The IPBES mandate certainly is for decision-makers at national scales, but there are various findings that can be applied at any scale (e.g., conceptual clarity on the dimensions or types of values being addressed, management of power dynamics, etc.).

1929	Rita	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	45				The dark red color of the figure makes reading difficult	the figures have been reworked
1930	Ena Mata	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	41				Fig. 2.9 The dark purple circle makes it difficult to read the words inside it.	the figures have been reworked
1931	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	9	308			Correct "natural capital"	corrected
1932	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	14				Fig. 2.2 The explanation about what "Life frames of nature's values" are should be in another color, or located in another place (the figure looks very dense). One option would be to place the meaning of each Life Frame in parentheses below each Archeotype.	Thanks for this suggestion. We have updated the figure.
1933	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	15				Indicators: it is recommended to include as qualitative descriptor (ranking values), there are studies that rank the degree of importance of ES.	Thanks for this suggestion.
1934	Nadia Zamboni	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people	15				Indicators: for quantitative measures I propose (value per unit of area, or value per individual or household (ex: US \$ / household)	Thanks for this suggestion.
2088	Rebecca Ford	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					In Australia, we have done work measuring and incorporating values in bushfire decision-making to protect the array of values. We have a body of literature that can be included, also including case-studies. Evidence covers values in institutions, and values being (or not) because of institutional rules, effectiveness in decisions.	We thank the reviewer for this suggestion. There is reference to bushfires now in the final box in 2.5.
2094	ESP - AF	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AF)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					How can the assessment provide a view like TEV for economic values but for other types of values. Or provide a cross-disciplinary way to look at values. This will be particularly important to 'speed up' the consideration of other values into the valuation landscape. At the moment, much of the other values are 'scattered' and there is not clear guidelines for how to harness them into neatly packaged value subdimensions (as is done in TEV)	TEV is addressed and discussed in the chapter
2097	Kremena Gocheva	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					While I acknowledge that having a single measure for nature might be harmful to understanding the complexity and lead to biases, it is at the same time a very useful tool for raising general awareness. A case in point is carbon equivalent in the climate change debate which tends to make carbon more visible than other greenhouse gases but also helps spread the message and foster an uptake in the visibility in a way that isn't happening for BD and even less for ES right now. On a related note, having a single value would facilitate setting an	We articulated a spectrum from single metrics to multiple metrics depending on scope and conditions

2099	Marianne Thomsen	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					In relation to the green economy, or pathways to transit to a more inclusive or a more distributive economy, and what can be transformed or how could move towards a new type of economy? Economists are not only living from nature [taking things from nature] some are maybe moving beyond living as to living collaborating with or mimicking nature.	this is discussed in 2.3.2.2 and also an additional row with concrete steps to nurture sustainability is included in Table 2.5
2101	Carmela Cascone	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Assigning an intrinsic value to nature is a human way to measure its importance and stimulate interest towards environmental topics - there's a need to move from an anthropocentric to a nature point of view. In the title of the assessment there is an imbalance towards importance of nature for people	Thank you for your comment. we address this when we explain the importance of intrinsic values. Nature's point of view is something quite difficult to assess and consider. In the intrinsic value community the term is used to mean both epistemic anthropocentric view (human assign intrinsic value to nature) and a non-anthropocentric view (intrinsic value is objective and not assigned/attributed). Because we cannot enter the debate we opted for a compromise solution that represents the whole spectrum,
2105	Katerina Kaprova	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people			1433	1433	I love this figure, seems that it depicts well questions I struggled with lately. Cannot wait to read more in the text around!	Thank you!
2106	Sebastian Wolfrum	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Present in a more evident way the definition of worldviews.	Thank you, the worldviews are now explicitly defined in the Box 2.1, and the main text has also been revised accordingly.
2108	Vera Helene Hausner	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Section 2.1 - Regarding the pyramid with value concepts, it is not clear if concepts are nested and how do these relate to beliefs, and to other concepts. Why did you move away from the established concepts of held and assigned values?	In section 2.4, we now discuss how values relate to 'other value-related concepts' including beliefs and norms. Assigned values, when referred to as opinions about the importance of something, can be seen as both held and assigned. Specification of values as specific or broad thus provides for greater distinction.
2109	Vera Helene Hausner	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Section 2.2. Compatible measures - monetary valuations can be compatible, but if they are not monetary, how to make them commensurable? Can the concepts in the value pyramid be considered? How to think about the relations with these topics?	When considering the plural values of nature, the main goal is not always to commensurate values. Indeed, in section 2.2 we recognise three pathways - direct comparability (commensurability), compatibility and parallel use. When values are directly comparable they adopt the same metric and thus rankable. In other cases values are only compatible because they cannot be measured by the same metrics, but it is possible to technically join the underlying data. There are also cases in which different types of values are neither
2113	Sebastian Wolfrum	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Section 2.3 - Is there an approach to look at the different scales at which values can be produced and how they interact with values at other scales?	There is a discussion in Chapter 3 about values aggregation, which deals with scale integration on valuation, but not values formation per se. We note conceptually the role of temporal, spatial and organization scale, but do not propose from the literature 'an approach' to scale per se.
2178	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					I suggest the following reference as potential evidence <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2020.101132">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2020.101132</a> 'Are relational values different in practice to instrumental values?' by Ching See et al., (2020)	Thanks for this suggestion.
2183	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Suggested reference for Ch. 2 <a href="http://repository.essex.ac.uk/29713/1/azaa109.pdf">http://repository.essex.ac.uk/29713/1/azaa109.pdf</a>	Thank you for this suggestion

2184	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Suggested reference for Ch. 2 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/14623528.2020.1771998">https://doi.org/10.1080/14623528.2020.1771998</a>	Thank you for this suggestion
2185	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Suggested reference for Ch. 2 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2017.1397631">https://doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2017.1397631</a>	Thank you for this suggestion
2188	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Suggested ref. Spiritual values shape taxonomic diversity, vegetation composition, and conservation status in woodlands of the Northern Zagros, Iran	Thank you for this suggestion
2214	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Overall, my first comment is to highlight the vital importance of the conceptualization of the diverse values of nature including human / nature relationships. This is also relevant because also chapter 2 is based on academic practices, previous governance, political traditions and research on ecosystem services, among other important aspects. For these and other reasons, the use of this information will be mandatory, essential or necessary for the formulation of regulation and decisions on the conservation of biodiversity, ecosystem services and	thank you very much for your comment. We tried to streamline and simplify terminology.
2215	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Figure 2.2 This figure is very illustrative, however it is not very legible, the format of the words is very small. I suggest reviewing it in this and other figures of the document	We have updated this figure.
2216	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					A very important but very ambitious roadmap, because it constitutes an excellent mechanism that will support towards a just and sustainable future.	Thanks for the comment and acknowledgement of the efforts to date.
2217	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					I suggest also including policies on disaster risk management	Please see final box in 2.5.
2218	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					also address political challenges	Thanks for this comment. The issue of political challenges is noted in this case-study, and specifically dealt with in Chapter 4.
2219	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Emphasize through chapter 2 on the urgent need to increase the creation of institutional capacity, especially on values related to the formulation of environmental policies.	thank you for your comment. We do address this in other sections of the chapter on institutions.

2220	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Justice and sustainability are also broad values, generally shared between cultures. This section should be a subject very well learned by experts in environmental law, who will put into practice the concepts of various values, within the framework of their work in defense of the environment, specifically in relation to justice and sustainability.	thank you for your comment. IN the central text we did address explicitly justice as a broad value and what we call sustainability-aligned values
2221	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				agreements and conventions, from.....From The United Nations Conference on the Human Environment. Stockholm, 1972, Declaration of Rio etc.	Thank you for your suggestion
2222	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				On the life Framework of nature' values. 'The many traditions of values use many diverse, often abstract and challenging taxonomies of values, that can be difficult to communicate to policy makers, stakeholders and citizens'. This section should be a topic very well learned by experts in environmental law, who will put into practice the concepts about the life Framework of nature' values, during the exercise of their functions in defense of the environment, specifically in relation to The life Framework of nature' values	Thank you for noting the relevance of the framework to environmental law practitioners
2223	Venecia Álvarez	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				specify that it is about the quality of sea water	done
2265	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				"have important similarities and differences" sounds rare. Or similarities or differences	Thank you for your comment. We found both synergies and contrasts in the literature review conducted. We clarify what are those in the message's text. This KM has been revised for clarity.
2266	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				¿Why are responsibility, care, reciprocity, respect, stewardship (custodianship) and kinship with nature identified as intrinsic values of the IPLC that are transmitted to western people? Many people from western societies also have these values without receiving them from indigenous people. The IPLC as the only guardians of nice feelings to nature is a bit naïf and not just for so many people that care and defend nature from other origins.	Thank you for this important comment. This aspect has also been highlighted by other reviewers. We revised the text to convey the idea that these values are shared/present across society, and are not exclusive of IPLCs. For example, in the text we also refer to care from a feminist perspective or stewardship as spiritual value present also in so-called western religions.
2267	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				and religion and gender?	The text was provide by a CA, who did not dwell in more detail on the issue of Gender and Religion. Reference to Gender is made/provided in other parts of the Chapter and the assessment.
2268	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				No necessary such detailed description in a Executive Summary. I still maintain that life frames understood as different forms of relationship with nature have an epistemic problem. Even if you are an ascetic person who lives in nature, considering yourself part of it, when you eat you live from nature. A human being can operate and be in several frames at the same time and the same action can represent two frames at the same time. There are numerous opinions on the epistemological problems that this concept has that have already been presented in	It has been made explicit that people can express or relate to nature through more than one frame in the SPM, the chapter summary and chapter text
2269	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				GENERAL: The executive summary contains a lot of academic jargon and phrases of excessively complex structure. It should be a much friendlier text that invites to delve into the chapter reading. We must think of the readers of this assessment that they will be mainly policy makers seeking help to plan plural valuation. A reader with that profile can be scared by this summary.	We have worked over the past year to improve flow and reduce the complexity or academic language.

2270	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		0	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					"There are recent positive signs of such transformations in academic research, government programs..." not correlated with changes in real life	We highlight in various places the fact there are positive signs, but indeed predominant frameworks and paradigms continue to prioritize a subset of values.
2271	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		0	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					change capita to capital	Thank you.
2272	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					"This literature is mostly published...." in English, in the global NORTH	The assessment undertook various strategies to achieve coverage of academic literature, policy documents and case studies.
2273	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		0	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The search and handling of references is very impressive, it would be important to point out how many of these are in English and published in global north journals. They reflect an intellectual academic group.	Indeed, the assessment methods are explicit, both in their scope and limitations.
2274	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Worldviews include RELIGION and POLITIC IDEOLOGIES	Worldviews are shaped by a range of factors including political ideologies. In this text we primarily focus on Knowledge systems, Religion, and Languages as there were deemed most relevant for the assessment (by expert opinion). Further what is considered an ideology and how it influences worldviews is tricky, which we preferred not to dwell into as we felt it a distraction from the present text.
2275	Luthando Dziba	MEP		0	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					And political ideas? It is not the same worldview for a liberal than for a marxist in relation to nature. Liberal ecology exists, ecosocialism exists. Ideology and nature mix. Can we treat this in a respectful manner? Without taking any position just describing it?	Worldviews are shaped by a range of factors including political ideologies. In this text we primarily focus on Knowledge systems, Religion, and Languages as there were deemed most relevant for the assessment (by expert opinion). Further what is considered an ideology and how it influences worldviews is tricky, which we preferred not to dwell into as we felt it a distraction from the present text.
2276	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The figure is nice and clear	Thank you, it has been improved based on other comments and on further work developed by the authors while revising the text.
2277	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		0	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The drastically reduced workforce in agriculture, forestry, fisheries and other natural resource-based economic activities can be a consequence of the industrialized of the rural productive work as well as the lower salaries in rural activities in relation to urban activities and urban confort living.	Thank you for this comment! This will be highlighted in our nex Box on Eco-literacy, presented in the Languages and Values subsection.
2278	Bibiana Vilá	MEP			Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					The text on language, contextualized in the various world views and relationships with nature, is very interesting and pertinent and necessary. But, it is repetitive, can join examples with common views and should be reduced it lengh by at least 50%. The description of some groups such as thejoti and the non-existence of the word nature is very interesting, I find a bit long and too descriptive the Maskoke's box	Thank you! The text has been revised and reduced and it is much more focused on the interlinkages between languages and values of nature. The Maskoke box has been replaced by a Box on Eco-literacy. The Maskoke story has been used as an example in the revised text, and the full Box is now an Appendix.

2279	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Fig 2.7. it is not clear in what it intends to show	The figures in the sections have been reworked and we hope they are now somehow clearer
2280	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Fig 2.3. The same as 2.7 it is not clear in what it intends to show	figure has been reworked
2281	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Fig 2.4. is not clear. The UFO is nice	figure has been eliminated
2282	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					much of the information in point 2.2.4.2. it has already been presented in 2.2.4.1. Definitions are repeated and it would be necessary to make a synthesis between these two points and turn them into one with fewer examples. A couple of good and clear examples for each type of value	The section has been reworked to eliminate repetitions
2283	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					fig 2.10 is clear and complete. Nice	Thank you for your appreciation - we are glad you liked it
2284	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					this figure must be associated with the postnormal science figure, in chapter 1	This comment seems to be directed to Ch1, as Ch2 does not discuss such a topic.
2285	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					BOX TEEB is already explained in chapter 1. So here, would be necessary just to describe aspects not presented in the previous chapter	box on TEEB had been eliminated and replaced with a more general box on values in economics
2286	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					domination over nature. This concept is deeply developed in the ecofeminist ideas The patriarchal mode of domination of nature and women have coincidences.	This sentence has been removed from the updated text, and thus the comment is no longer relevant
2287	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					That figure that has everything compartmentalized does not reflect the conceptual links that have been presented in the text. Somehow the "worldview anthropocentric", "living from", "instrumental value" and "economic indicator" must be related and non in separate boxes, the same with all the others possible concept associations.	They're associated by being in the same columns in the table

2288	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				fig 2.14. I would delete everything referred to literature review on life frames of natures values	We have reconsidered what are the most essential figures and tables to maintain within the section
2289	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				I would delete this figure is very unclear and complex. The assessment is written for policy makers is important not to forget that	We have reconsidered what are the most essential figures and tables to maintain within the section and the main figure for the section has been redesigned
2290	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Life value frames must be reduced at least in 50%, delete the analysis in the literature	The section has been shortened. However other reviewers have specifically questioned the literature basis, hence a brief description of the methodology is maintained
2291	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Fig 2.18 is not clear	The figure has been revised and re-done by a professional designer. We hope that this has increased its clarity and effectiveness.
2292	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				regarding values that influence behaviour is important to include gender values that are omitted in the text	We are not sure what "gender values" are, as this concept did not appear in our literature review. There is some evidence that women in some contexts hold stronger pro-environmental attitudes than men, but that is not relevant to our analysis of behavior theories. And the issue of gender-specific values did not arise in that review. Thus we have not included any mention of "gender values". Yet, there was also an overall effort throughout the assessment to highlight gender-related issues, which we hope also helps attend the reviewer's
2293	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				"In some contexts, corruption may exacerbate power imbalances" corruption exacerbates power imbalances in ALL the context, this is the main objective of the corrupted system	We agree. Thanks for highlighting this. The section was rewritten and and the new version we do not make reference to corruption.
2294	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				GENDER is not a institutional structure	You are right. The whole section is rewritten and this specific sentence is not included
2295	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				power must analysed in a deeper framework. I can suggest some ideas: 'Power' is central to em-power-ment, in every sense of the word. Power can be defined as "control over human, social, material, or intellectual resources" (Oxfam GB 2005). There are different types of power. There is invisible power – the beliefs and attitudes that shape our understanding about who we are; visible power – that we can 'see' demonstrated in things like structures and behaviours; and hidden power – the 'rules' that determine who has power. Some people (i.e.	Thank you very much for these ideas around power. The section on power is now completely rewritten and backed by the Annex 19 on power. The annex offers much more depth to the analysis. We have include five dimensions of power: discursive, framing, structural, rule-making and operational power. Discursive and framing power converges on what you describe as invisible power, structural and operational power converges with your description of visible power and rule making power converges with hidden power. In relation to
2296	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				In several places of the world people can not chose the food to buy	The text is changed so that it becomes clearer that this is an example - referring to 'may buy'. The point is to explain how values are expressed also implicitly - through actions.

2297	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Delete BOX 2.9. Number of papers seems not very important for policy makers	We have moved this box to an annex (effectively deleting it from the main text, as suggested by the reviewer). We have also (in the annex) modified the results to not provide an uncontextualized list of number of papers, but to make the policy-relevant messages more clear.
2298	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Political actors also influence and usually are economic actors themselves	Public actors are often economic actors - e.g., state owned firms. However, we reserve the term 'political actors' to the function of defining the formal rules of a society
2299	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				disconnects between scientific and indigenous epistemic worldviews is not the RULE by the contrary the ethnobiology reserch connect both science and indigenous epistemic worldview in relation with nature	We thank the reviewer for this comment. Our text reveals what was found in the literature. We, and other chapters do note the importance of promoting knowledge dialogues and connecting knowledges through research approaches, in which ethnobiology plays an important role. We passed your comment to Chapter 3, since it can be valuable there. This text was moved to an Appendix and has been re-written.
2300	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				only wealthy consumers can choose. Eco friendly products are always more expensive	The relative power and dynamics of economic and political weight are taken into account in various sections of the chapter, including explicit treatment in an annex that develops the power categories further and relates them to issues of justice.
2301	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				degrowth is a very interesting concept I would be to read about in the text	We agree, but heavy restrictions on length (texts have had to be substantially cut), made it impossible to expand on this concept.
2302	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				This paragraph is very convoluted, a more linear wording would be better YPOR ACA	Thanks. The paragraph has been reworded based on the comment
2303	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Similarly, psychology focuses on "universal values" (akin to broad values) that appear to be common among all humans. I AM NOT SURE ABOUT THIS. I have several psychologists in my family that don't say that	While we agree that universal values is not the only conception within the psychological literature. As Kohlberg, Schwartz and others note, it is one of the widely held premises of moral/value-based reasoning.
2304	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The social context of collective norms and rules includes political regimes, as democracy and political ideologies, like liberalism, marxism...also	Thank you. We agree that social context is inclusive of political context and have made a note in the main text to that effect.
2305	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				If the shift from materialistic values to increased environmental consciousness is REAL, why are we living the current huge environmental crisis.? Interesting to dive in it...doesn't it?	We now cite 2.4.1 and chapter 5 to precisely highlight this 'values-action gap'.

2306	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				2.3.3.4. Combining value formation and change pathways for policymaking. THIS is a good synthesis of previous paragraphs that can be shorten a lot	Thank you, we have shortened this section.
2307	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				the figure is a good synthesis	Thank you for your comment
2308	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Check info of the table. Existing values is intrinsic	Table has been updated.
2309	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				IPLC and ILK were studied in: Agricultural/ Agroforestry / Agroecological landscapes. Pastoral lands, and pastoralisms is missing. Ethnobiology as discipline, and ethnobiology references are not mentioned. Also, the reserch was done in English. The mexican journal in Spanish "Etnobiologia" is full of papers and ideas exoressing values	We thank the reviewer for this comment. The results presented in the Chapter and in this Annex reflect what was found in the literature review, according to the methodology used. Since this aspect of reference was nor prominent in our literature review, we did not include it in this Annex. However, we noted the missing referce to Ethnobiology as an integrative field of knowledge, which is especially relevant for Chapter 3.
2310	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				the collaborative work between authors of different chapters looks very interesting especially with the theme of good living. It is essential the use of texts in Spanish with American origin, which abound on this subject and it is very nice to find them in the annex. Perhaps it would be interesting to add the ideas of happiness from Bhutan origin, that have a lot in common with vivir bien	Thanks for this comment and for the kind words regarding the Philosophies of Good Living case-study. This is indeed interesting and important. In this assessment we are committed to representing what was found in the literature. In the case of Philosophies of Good Living, Butnan philosophies did not emerge in the literature review.
2311	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				GENERAL OPINION on the chapter: 1) It is excessively long and should be shortened a lot. 2) it is not synthetic 3) You can see the style of the various authors, in that sense, it feels like "patched", it would have to be edited so that it flows. 4) It treats VERY WELL, the subject of IPLC and ILK, making it transversal and permeating in numerous moments of the text. Very nice detailed case studies in the annexes. No reference to pastoralism, although it is	GENERAL OPINION on the chapter: 1) Systematic efforts were made to shorten the text, but there were also simultaenous pushes to extend certain sections. 2) We hope the reviewer finds the TOD more synthetic. 3) We hope the reviewer finds the TOD more homogenous among authors' contributions. 4) We appreciate the positive feedback regarding ILK/IPLC. Regarding pastoralism, we have attempted to make our case studies balanced
2328	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				This section on reasearch gaps is very important, unless I missed it I don't think it has made it to the SPM which seems to focus on capacity gaps	The gaps identified by each chapter were compiled for Ch6 and then subsequently are reflect in the SPM.
2329	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Please refer to and reference the map in the IPBES LDR SPM on links between biological diversity and indigeneous languages, this is a key original map which as authors of the SPM we developed specifically to highlight this topic for the LDR Assessment	Thanks for the comment. This map has been cited in the revised text.
2330	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Figure 2.7 part 1 is an excellent figure and would really enhance understandings if included in the SPM, it is an excellent visual representation of a complex topic	thank you, we appreciate the comment. We reworked the figure to reduce them and to address other comments but hope that it is still good enough

2331	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					This text and reference is very much outdated. There are numerous more recent referencnes which will demonstrate the opposite to this, please let me know if you would like me to share some	Thanks for this important comment. This text is now an Annex, and it has been revised accordingly, to reflect obstacles faced by IPLCs for engagement in natural resource management.
2332	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					mention here again of research and capacity gaps, need to include research gaps in the SPM , sorry if I missed that	Thanks for this suggestion.
2333	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Research gaps again relevant fro inclusion in the SPM	Thanks for this suggestion.
2334	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Institutions - many decisions made by policy experts and institutions are also governed by legislation, is it possibel to bring mention of how legislation may influence the values and decision making processes discussed in this section?	Here we cover how values are supported by institutions like norms and legislation (note that we define institutions different from the reviewer - as 'rules' not as actors - including legislation). In a later section - TOD 2.4.2.3 - we explain exactly how these values through institutional structures influence decision-making. Here we do not only focus on the law, but also administrative structures
2335	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					An excellent chpater which really sets the direction for all the other chapters, with some quite innovative reasoning and interpretataions. I have read all Chapters, and say well done to all authors at this stage	Thank you very much for your comment. We are very happy that you appreciated our work
2360	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					what is new here? instead of "important", suggest to use "distinct"?	Please see KM9 for the way this KM was reformulated. The word "important" was removed in the revised version of this KM in Ch2's Executive Summary
2361	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					which framework? - ILK's or academic's?	Please see KM9 for the way this KM was reformulated. There is no longer an unclear mention of framework.
2362	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					Suggest to provide Reference after IPLC and better to provide numbers or percentage of people who share this view or number of groups out of the total population group?	Thanks for this comment. Tis KM has been revised accordingly, and the evidence for this statement has been included. However, it is not possible to make a general conclusion regarding percentages of the total population.
2363	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people					which type of conflict? social, political, economic?; not sure it will help address the political type of conflict?	Thanks for this comment. This is in reference to social conflicts. We have revised the text of this KM accordingly.

2364	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				can monetary measurement be avoided in any diverse value estimation? I do not think so as economic valuation is most dominant?	We illustrate that economic and biophysical approaches are dominant in biodiversity assessment (see also Ch3). However, it is certainly the possibility that alternatives are possible, which is the point of the assessment. We are requested to provide alternatives for decision-makers. Not merely reaffirm what they are already doing.
2365	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The conceptual framework is well designed and described but how does it relate to or is informed by the IPBES CF? would be useful to show this as a link to IPBES's broader framework that in my view will indicate common thread that joins IPBES values and the assessment approach	We now show the relationships to the IPBES CF in 2.6.
2366	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				This also raises the issue of governance and equity as the former view might exclude the customary or legitimate access and benefit sharing rights of IPLCs ( e.g. IUCN PA type V) protected area and underemphasis might lead of also "tragedy of commons"	Thanks for this comment
2367	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				General Comments: This Chapter is too long with 475 pages; There are unnecessary repetitions that might not be reader friendly; I also find the Chapter is bit academic and therefore less than expected level of policy relevance	There was a systematic effort over the last year to 'hone' the message and reduce words and overlaps. There were also simultaneous tensions to 'extend' certain sections and content. We have substantially reduced word counts and hope that beyond that the reviewer will find the TOD more readable.
2378	Luthando Dziba	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				It should be mentioned that the valuation of biodiversity contributes very significantly to its conservation. But, to be conserved, biodiversity must be valued and to be valued it is necessary to know it and to know it, it is necessary to build the capacities of taxonomy and taxonomists	Does not need to be answered by Ch2
2379	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Remove borders between countries for all chapters	Does not need to be answered by Ch2
2380	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Regarding the actors, it should be emphasized that the level of knowledge on biodiversity could influence its valuation	Does not need to be answered by Ch2
2381	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Nature base Solution (Nbs) could constitute an important support for the value assessment and the valuation of biodiversity	We briefly refer to the NBS policy initiative in Section 2.1
2396	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				In the chapter values are in several places explicitly and implicitly presented as the interface between other social sciences and nature. I would like this to be reconsidered, since what is the interface depends on the perspective is applied, i.e. what lenses are used. Practices is an alternative lense, senses another one etc. One suggestion is to clarify that in this assment, the relation humans-nature are regarded from a values perspective.	Thank you very much for your comment. I totally agree on the importance to also focus on practice or institutions (which we do in the second part of the chapter), but the assessment is explicitly addressing the multiple values of nature.

2397	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Clarify that this statements refers to literature on nature's multiple values, not to all literature on understanding human-nature relationships	This has been clarified
2398	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				I am fine with this comment, but would like to also see a comment on long-term, place-based human-nature relationships in other groups of people	We have attempted to appease the multiple (sometimes conflicting) demands of reviewers and the scoping document of course. In this case, we have tried to provide balance in the representation of different groups, considering regions, but also not create dualities of 'Western' versus 'other'.
2399	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				This section is not fully coherent. Please clarify that the literature review focus on certain aspects and dimensions of human-nature relationships, on the literature search, namely related to values, or that values is the lens through which the literature review is carried out. The review does not fully cover all human-nature relationships, such as practices memories, senses etc.	As the literature review is a census of all value-related content, it is quite likely that individual articles mention the sorts of topics mentioned by the reviewer. That they are not reflected specifically in the main assessment is more a reflection of the disproportionate impact of the life and physical sciences in this literature. Concepts such as practices, memories, and senses are likely covered within a specific discipline within social sciences, already a much smaller piece of the entire work on values of nature.
2400	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Figure 2.2 - the torches are confusing. Not sure if there is a meaning behind where the four torches are in the figure.	We have now addressed the meaning of the torches in the figure caption
2401	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				The sentence 'Nature's diverse values are well-established in biodiversity and environmental policies, and the trend towards a value-pluralist perspective in the science-policy discourse is increasing (Craig et al., 419 2019)' seems to contradict the one before that states that 'databases developed to implement ecosystem services policies showed them to largely focus on economic indicators'.	This has been clarified
2402	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Rephrase the statement that Chapter 2 is intended to 'identify, characterize and assess different conceptualisations of nature's diverse values, including human-nature relationships, from different academic and socio-cultural traditions and perspectives'. The assessment is written from a values perspective, and that is also the profile of the systematic research reviewed and assessed. It would not be purposeful, and most likely not possible, to include all other human-nature relationships.	There is no inconsistency to say the chapter assesses different h-n relationships. In no way does this imply it is exhaustive or comprehensive in describing all of them.
2403	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Consider rephrasing, Environmental values work as "boundary objects" between 'philosophy, economics and other social sciences and humanities, and ecology and environmental sciences in the context of this assessment, where the focus is on values. There is not a common recognition in all social sciences and humanities that environmental values is a boundary objects - the bridging concepts rather depends on the perspectives. (it could be landscape, practices, the future etc.)	Thank you for your comment, the term has been deleted
2404	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Figure 2.13 does not communicate. It is too complicated.	The figure has been redesigned
2405	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				Section 2.3.1.2. I suggest adding the constraints-oriented approach to understanding human activities introduced by time geography. For an overview, see Miller, H. J. (2016). Time geography and space-time prism. International encyclopedia of geography: People, the earth, environment and technology, 1-19.	We appreciate the suggestion, but this article did not appear in our systematic review. Therefore, it would be methodologically inappropriate to include.

2406	Marie Stenseke	MEP		Chapter 2. Conceptualizing the diverse values of nature and their contributions to people				I suggest adding the constraints-oriented approach to understanding human activities introduced by time geography. For an overview, see Miller, H. J. (2016). Time geography and space-time prism. International encyclopedia of geography: People, the earth, environment and technology, 1-19.	We appreciate this suggestion, but after reviewing the literature seems more appropriate for behavior and outcomes, which is addressed in Chapter 5. Here we focus on value formation and change, which are often linked tightly with behavior (at least in theory, but see that discussion in 2.4 and Chapter 5).
------	----------------	-----	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	--	--	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------