

ID	Reviewer Name	Category	Affiliation	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comments	Response
1	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	10	1	11	The 'protection' of nature could be seen as different from 'conservation' (as defined in the CBD), and to imply strict setting aside (i.e. protected areas) rather than sustainable use. Is its meaning made clear? I note that elsewhere in the documents the term 'conservation' seems to be used more consistently.	Thank you for your comment, the text has now changed. The comment is no longer relevant.
27	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	10	285	10	291	The text should include a reference to an important contribution to the ecosystems literature: the book Shmelev S.E. (2018) Ecosystems: Complexity, diversity and nature's contribution to humanity, Environment Europe Press, 302pp., which has received letters of acknowledgment and support from HH Pope Francis, HE President Macron, HE Prime Minister Rutte, HE Prime Minister Modi, Sir David Attenboroug, the Honorary President of the Club of Rome, Prof. Ernst Ulrich von Weizsäcker, former Director General of IUCN Julia Marton-	Thanks. As much as we would love to be make sure to include all such books we have limited amount of space in the introduction. Ch2 did undertake a systematic review of most prominent seminal papers and books
28	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	16	472	16	472	Typo: The title of the report should read 'Regional Assessment of Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia'	Fixed
29	Shmelev, Stanislav	Organisation	Environment Europe Foundation	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	684	24	684	A reference should be made to an important contribution based on the author's report to IUCN issued in 2008 that was made available during the preparation of the TEEB report and was later published as Shmelev, S.E. (2012) Biodiversity Loss: New Methods for Evaluating Ecosystems. In Shmelev, S.E. (2012) Ecological Economics: Sustainability in Praticce, Springer, pp. 155-173. Here an important point about incommensurability of values in the assessment of ecosystems was argued very strongly very early on and multi-criteria approaches have	The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
40	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	NA	NA	NA	NA	Dear Authors, thank you for all the work that was clearly put into this chapter. The chapter reads well and provides a useful starting point for the assessment. I know that reviewers generally tend to skip the first chapter, but to me this first chapter is really important. I congratulate you on a great job, but I do have a couple of high level comments (and some more concrete ones as well) about the definition and conceptualization of values which I hope are helpful in revising the text.	Many thanks for your thorough review of our chapter which helped us refine our theoretical approach to values.
41	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	6	182	6	197	This comment will be relevant not just here, but perhaps particularly for other chapters and the SPM. It should be really clear, that when you propose a values-centered theory of change, you are not proposing focusing on individuals. Values do not just reside in individual minds, but are sedimented in rules, instutionns and structures. The theory of change should address those simultaneously. To avoid misinterpretation, leading to overemphasis on individualist approaches (behaviour change, information, nudging etc), I would	Thanks We revised the text but the societal emphasis and the role of institutions understood as rules and norms is quite clear
42	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	13	386	NA	NA	If anything this figure shows the problematic bias of assessment processes where all non biological assessments focus on economic values. I would rephrase the caption to make this point more explicit. "overview of non-IPBES biodiversity and economic assessments". This is not a coincidence of course, it shows where most of the focus has been and what gap this assessment fills.	This observation has been included in the text (rather than the caption)

43	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	18	524	18	531	I would rephrase how the TC assessment is introduced: "...aims to understand different conceptualizations of and approaches to TC, including what factors at individual, institutional and structural level they identify that catalyze or obstruct change, how these factors can be leveraged to bring about transformative change for the conservation, restoration and wise use of biodiversity, and how potential risks and costs can be addressed in a fair and equitable manner". Then, the sentence about building on the values assessment	This entire subsection has been deleted due to length considerations
44	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	23	654	NA	NA	Replace with: "Values reflect the character, importance or relevance..." We should try and avoid the terms construct or ideas unless we can properly explain them. Not all theories of values are rooted in constructivism. I would find it very important to recognize that the attribution of value is also at the core of ecology and natural sciences. Description, analysis and valuation are not completely separate things. So, I would add a couple of sentences that highlight that, knowing, doing and valuing are inextricably connected. All knowledge systems	We have replaced "values are constructs..." by "values reflect the character..." as suggested here. We have also added the following sentence as suggested: "Knowing and valuing nature and NCPs are intricately connected. Culturally-specific ways of relating to nature shape worldviews, knowledge-systems and practices (Barrera-Bassols and Toledo, 2005). We can therefore understand "value-systems" as sets of values according to which people, societies and organisations regulate their behaviour" (Pascual et al., 2017) and which are
45	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	23	656	NA	NA	Remove 'moreover'	OK. has been removed.
46	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	23	662	NA	NA	I understand this focus, but would appreciate a better justification of this focus (it excludes positivist approaches to valuation, but I am not sure you intend to say here that you only consider constructivist approaches). Perhaps this will follow in chapter 2. And, I would try and rephrase to avoid an overly voluntaristic conception of values. What people and societies care about is difficult to change, because they are constantly reproduced in powerful institutions and structures and in everyday practices. So, de-emphasize the 'mental' and put it	We have now justified the constructivist approach to valuation as follows: "In building the Values Assessment, one major challenge was to create a transdisciplinary dialogue (that is, a dialogue between stakeholders that may or may not be involved in disciplinary academic work). This entailed recognising that different stakeholders (academics from different disciplines, decision-makers /NFPs and IPLCs) may understand differently what values of nature are. These divergences are not a detail. Sometimes, they relate to profound
47	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	668	NA	NA	Perhaps the assessment is not the place for such a philosophical discussion, but I find it a bit problematic to foreground the constructivist approach to valuation, and it may also not be helpful. The point is that nature itself also matters for value, this is not just in people's minds. The assessment has the opportunity to reconcile approaches by better explaining where they meet and how they differ. This sentence could be off-putting.	It is beyond the scope of the Values Assessment to go into a theoretical discussion of what value is and is defined in different disciplines. Rather, we build on IPBES existing definition and expand it as needed. We have now better justified our constructivist approach to values as follows: "In building the Values Assessment, one major challenge was to create a transdisciplinary dialogue (that is, a dialogue between stakeholders that may or may not be involved in disciplinary academic work). This entailed recognising that
48	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	677	NA	NA	I am sure you realize this as well, but this is where this becomes really tricky. So, IPLC do not share this constructivist approach to value. You can't reduce their worldviews to perspectives and in so doing, contain it in the realm of epistemology. This is about ontology. These are of course highly theoretical comments and I only raise them here because the assessment itself has foregrounded the constructivist approach.	Thank you for this comment. We didn't mean to reduce IPLC worldviews to perspectives. We are not using worldviews as a synonym to perspectives or knowledge. As we mentioned, we removed the focus on epistemology, and provide definitions and examples that convey the diversity and complexities represented among Indigenous peoples and local communities. We have tried to better reflect their worldviews by providing more examples of IPLC worldviews, as well as expanding the Buen vivir. Thanks for your
49	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	688	NA	NA	To say that worldviews are lenses is problematic (at least without further discussion). The distinction between ontology and epistemology is a key characteristic of Western worldviews, to try and cast other knowledge systems and worldviews in these terms is counterproductive at best and entirely misses the point. I get that compromises must be made, at least until the conceptual discussion, but my solution would be to de-emphasize epistemology in the text as a whole.	Thank you for this comment. Worldviews are a single category that refer to anthropocentric, eco/biocentric, and pluricentric worldviews. We have removed the category of epistemological worldviews from the text. We now define worldviews as "ways through which people perceive, conceptualize and modify the world, rooted in cultures and languages".
50	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	726	NA	NA	a proposal for more inclusive terminology could be: "know, enact, and value", because you link knowing valuing and action.	Change has been made.

51	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	27	757	NA	NA	As also elsewhere in the assessment, the notion of value is employed in a very positive way. But values can also be negative, and a lot of valuation is presented in a more neutral way (as knowledge production). Maybe this is a good place to be more explicit about this and for example say that dismissing the importance of something is also an act of valuation.	Ch1 does not get into this topic but it is addressed in ch2
52	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	40	1192	NA	NA	Add enacting: "diverse ways of knowing, enacting, and valuing"	Although we value this comment, we're also trying to make the language of the chapter more accessible to respond to other additional comments. Therefore, this comment wasn't integrated.
53	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	41	1200	NA	NA	I don't want to overstate the point, but just to be clear. Conceptualizing worldviews as lenses could certainly be seen as a form of epistemic injustice	We removed the word "lenses", but the idea is to convey to the general reader that worldviews are ways through which people may perceive, act and interact with the world around them. This was not a term forged by us, but rather from the literature. We agree with you about the discussion of ontology and epistemology, but this discussion was considered too theoretical and complex to be approached in the Assessment in an accessible way to a general audience. Based on literature review, we have focused on
54	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	43	1222	NA	NA	Rephrase the title, it currently does not read well and is confusing (perhaps remove "of the values assessment")	Noted
55	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	43	1250	NA	NA	Please provide a brief explanation of 'lever' (like you did for 'leverage point').	The section has been reworked and shortened
56	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1331	NA	NA	I may have missed where the term 'relational' was first mentioned and discussed. But in literature this term is used in different ways and I hope that this assessment explains this properly. If relational is meant as in 'relational ontology', it is a third approach to or theory of valuation (next to positivist or constructivist ones). According to such an approach, values result from the interaction between humans and nature. And, importantly, in the act of valuation, not just values are constituted, it is also constitutive of humans and nature	The term relational is first used on lines 205-206 and refers to IPBES conceptual framework. "relational values, which denote something whose worth originates from the relationships humans have with nature or with other humans through nature (Chan et al., 2018);"
57	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1648	NA	NA	I appreciate very much that this section is included. I wonder if readers will understand what is meant by post-positivist, constructivist and pragmatist epistemologies. I am personally curious about how pragmatist is used here (as 'practical' or a compromise between positivist and constructivist - this is how it is used most often in my experience, or with reference to political and social theory (Dewey, Rorty, etc). The latter comes close, in my view to a relational (and non-essentialist) approach or ontology as I describe above.	We have deleted the word "pragmatist" to avoid including a discussion on the definition of this concept.
58	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1653	NA	NA	A crucial sentence, perhaps important to include earlier as well when you discuss IPLC worldviews.	We have now included important ILK content earlier in the document; although, we have kept the section in the same place for coherence

59	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	62	1698	NA	NA	I don't think it is sufficiently clear what the purpose is of section 1.4.5 (but I may have overlooked things). Where will I recognize this narrative thread, where did the policy themes and challenges come from, what is the point of the clusters? Should I use these to make sense of the subsequent chapters? Is this a structure that I will recognize there? A bit more text will be helpful (also as a nice ending of the chapter potentially).	Thanks. We have deleted this section as it was hard to operationalize
69	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	280	NA	NA	Perhaps this will still follow later in the chapter, but I would say that this is the place for a more in depth introductory discussion of the concept of values, including its relation to valuation, bearers of value and valuers, the different theoretical conceptualizations of value (in terms of ontological and epistemological assumptions), and its relation to knowledge and practice. This would (in my view) serve as useful basis to clearly describe and compare different values-frameworks in literature (because they will differ in terms of these dimensions). The	We thank you for this thoughtful comment. Indeed, huge can of worms. We decided to just describe this heterogeneity. The typology of values described in Ch2 is supported by a thorough examination of these different perspectives.
88	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					General considerations about the first two chapters. It does not seem very inclusive. The explanations about the value of nature and the valuation of nature in East Asian culture are rare and very general (and sometimes exaggerated). Even if this is an international and collective work, the diversity and profoundness of Asian thought (particularly Indian, Chinese and Japanese ways of thinking) concerning the value and valuation of nature are mostly ignored. For instance, the Indian idea of "dependant co-arising" (pratitya-samutpada) spread across Asia	We very much appreciate your comment and your willingness to contribute. This is a gap to recognize, even though we have done several literature reviews and calls (e.g., on the philosophies of good living of indigenous and local communities), Asian examples were underrepresented (see the new ILK annex and the case study of good living). We will contact you to follow up on this issue. It will be very interesting to have other contributors who can expand on Asian philosophies.
89	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	8			The expression "nature crisis" seems arguable. Maybe you should prefer "environmental crisis". Many occurrences of this expression appear in this work.	We appreciate your comment, the authors changed this term for "biodiversity crisis".
90	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	8	250			What is "a good quality of life"? This expression needs a clear definition.	As a default we use the definition in the IPBES global framework. We also add in an appendix a discussion of the very diverse ways in which this expression may be defined
91	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	8	251			It seems a little bit restrictive to talk about "knowledge systems". Maybe you should prefer something like "knowledge and representation systems" (idem for box 1.1, "valuation"). Many occurrences of this expression appear in this work.	We agree and this is further expanded in Ch2.
92	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	275			From perception to judgement, there is an extra idea of understanding or interpretation. Maybe you should prefer something like "This is because people perceive, understand and judge" or "This is because people perceive, interpret and judge".	We have edited accordingly
93	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25				Figure 1.4: It seems a little bit restrictive to talk about "knowledge systems". Maybe you should prefer something like "knowledge and representation systems".	This figure has been replaced with figure 1.3. Whilst we retain 'knowledge systems' we now emphasis a more encompassing emphasis of knowledge systems.

94	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	35	1102			It could be useful to explain the expression "Pachamama concept".	Reference to Pachamama has been deleted from the chapter.
118	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	83	5	83	no dash in "distinguishes"	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
119	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	7	218	7	223	The first sentence may be easier to follow if it were two shorter sentences.	This sentence was removed.
120	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	276	9	277	"These values are incommensurable..." It is not clear what specific values are referenced, and some values, (e.g. instrumental value of commodities) are not incommensurable. I think the sentence just needs re-written or a qualification needs to be added.	We have edited accordingly
121	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	10	290	10	290	remove the close parenthesis	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
122	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	12	268	15	343	The summaries of previous/other assessments seem a little extraneous and don't have enough context. Suggest providing more narrative context for including them so that they flow with the rest of the chapter or maybe just including the paragraph descriptions in an appendix and refer to the figure 1.1. only.	This section has been reworked
123	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	19	557	19	557	The sentence seems to contradict the previous examples of valuations of nature. I think it just needs to be re-written to clarify the authors are referring to a more complete valuation of nature.	The text has substantially changed
124	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	0	0	0	0	I think parts of section 1.1 could be greatly abbreviated since they are covered in the summary.	This section has been significantly abbreviated

125	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	0	0	0	0	The values pyramid and the life frames seem disconnected from the rest of the chapter. I suggest they be better integrated in the subsequent sections on valuing and valuation. It is easy to imagine how the values pyramid may interact with valuation, e.g. value indicators and/or preferences are the subject of valuation and different specific values can be better articulated with different valuation methods and approaches? Maybe plural valuations are better at capturing diversity of broad values and worldviews underlying indicators? However, I	The life frames section has been rewritten at the end of 1.2.1. We introduce them in chapter 1 in connection with the value typology and signpost to the relevant section of chapter 2 where additional content can be found
126	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	45	1280	45	1288	Very nice articulation that seems to sum up the thesis of the assessment.	Thank you
127	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	49	1373	49	1377	This is very good.	Thank you
129	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The chapter could benefit from a diagram (at the beginning of the text) of how it is organized and how it articulates the concepts in the chapters	Thanks we have now added such a diagram
130	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The gender issue is very absent from the diversity and values approach, despite the fact that the process was carried out with a paradoxical large number of authors. It must be present in a transversal way in the evaluation	Gender and age encompass two of the many cultural ways of identifying and treating social differences and the corresponding diverse values attached to them, but both are crossed by other multiple categories, such as ethnicity, cast, body capabilities or identity traits. The resulting intersectionality is a very rich and rapidly evolving human typology (just to mention, the LGBTIQ+ community or the youth global movements), but also a very complex one, where the many emerging faces poses a challenge and a
131	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The work is monumental, it is an epistemological, axiological challenge	Thank you for your positive feedback.
132	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The summary connects with the introduction to Chapter 1. But the PMS should be explained more generally and less technically and Chapter 1 more comprehensive and comprehensive	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary of this chapter was removed and the focus of the chapter, in the new version, is to present the core ideas that the reader can find on the rest of the assessment. As Chapter 1 presents an introduction to the overall assessment, key findings are not summarized in an executive summary as it is common practice in introductory chapters of IPBES assessments'.
133	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The gender topic is not, nor does it incorporate new bibliography. It will be important to see how the issue is seen from a gender perspective and its reflection in values, in indigenous and local communities (notion of "mother earth")	Gender and age encompass two of the many cultural ways of identifying and treating social differences and the corresponding diverse values attached to them, but both are crossed by other multiple categories, such as ethnicity, cast, body capabilities or identity traits. The resulting intersectionality is a very rich and rapidly evolving human typology (just to mention, the LGBTIQ+ community or the youth global movements), but also a very complex one, where the many emerging faces poses a challenge and a

134	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It is necessary to incorporate the theme of aesthetics and affectivities	These are values that are discussed in chapter 2.
135	Ana Isabel Moreno Calles	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Missing (analytical) positioning of the text that would be useful	The chapter provides an explicit account of the positionality of experts.
136	Enrique Pérez Campuzano	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The text of the chapter is repetitive and repetitive. It is necessary to synthesize the information to put the messages in an explicit and synthetic way. It remains to think about the audiences of the report	Fixed. Thanks for pointing this.
137	Enrique Pérez Campuzano	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The urban aspect is clearly neglected. It remains to explicitly touch the point of the importance of cities for the issue of biodiversity. There are redeemable Mexican and Brazilian examples and cases in this regard, which could be made visible	We thank the reviewer for this comment, however this topic is out of scope for Chapter 1 of the Values Assessment, which is a methodological assessment on the diverse values of nature. We aim for the findings of all chapters to be pertinent for urban and rural areas alike.
138	Enrique Pérez Campuzano	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The allocation of value is presented in the chapter as a construction (from human to nature), but the intrinsic value of nature is not clear	We refer to intrinsic values as a specific value. See 207. These concepts are expanded in Chapter 2.
139	Enrique Pérez Campuzano	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The notion of power is not explicit (countries more powerful than others, actors more powerful than others). Politics need to be included as a category of analysis	Power is a complex concept and the chapter only introduces it at a broad level. Other chapters, e.g., chapter 2 and chapter 4 focuses on different notions of power and its relationship to values.
140	Roberto Muñoz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The biocultural aspect does not appear in this section and is very important	We agree with the reviewer. On the Annex 1.1 on how the concepts of Biodiversity, Nature, and Nature's Contributions to People's, as well as Good Quality of Life are interpreted in the Value Assessment in connection to nature's diverse values, we tackle biocultural diversity and its importance.
141	Roberto Muñoz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The content of the executive summary document and the chapter are not accessible to decision makers. Do not consider the mechanisms of how to get the message to these spaces. How are they mainstreamed with other documents that are addressed to decision makers (international and national agenda)?	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary of this chapter was removed and the focus of the chapter, in the new version, is to present the core ideas that the reader can find on the rest of the assessment. As Chapter 1 presents an introduction to the overall assessment, key findings are not summarized in an executive summary as it is common practice in introductory chapters of IPBES assessments'.

142	Rebeca Martínez	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The theme of youths is very marginal and isolated, it is presented throughout the text as a vision of a single adult, the diversity of youths is lacking and how these values change in different generations	Gender and age encompass two of the many cultural ways of identifying and treating social differences and the corresponding diverse values attached to them, but both are crossed by other multiple categories, such as ethnicity, cast, body capabilities or identity traits. The resulting intersectionality is a very rich and rapidly evolving human typology (just to mention, the LGBTQ+ community or the youth global movements), but also a very complex one, where the many emerging faces poses a challenge and a
143	Enrique Martínez Meyer	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The effort and depth of the chapter are extensive, in addition to the consultation of the information. Teamwork is also seen	Positive feedback is appreciated.
144	Enrique Martínez Meyer	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Up to page 43, the chapter is very repetitive, the types of values, the evaluations are defined in various ways. It is dense to read and long (unnecessarily). It is very academic, with many concepts presented. You have to think about the audiences that are not academic and for this simplify the language	Thank you, the whole chapter was reduced in length and overlaps were avoided.
145	Enrique Martínez Meyer	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It remains to be made explicit how IPBES would land the strategy presented to carry out the transformative changes necessary to face this crisis.	Chapter 5 explores the types of values that are associated with different futures, and the mechanisms and approaches that facilitate transformative change and shifts towards more sustainable and just pathways
146	Álvaro Hernández	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The bias towards anthropocentric perspectives and much less towards biocentric ones is present. Throughout the document, despite the emphasis on indigenous peoples and local populations, there are only two mentions of constitutions that recognize rights to nature. It is suggested that the reference to the constitution of Ecuador be included as an example of the process of how certain types of values can be included in legislation and public policies.	We thank the reviewer for the comment and agree with you. We have now developed a cross assessment case study of good living philosophies where a number of examples are highlighted across chapters. The emblematic case of Ecuador have special attention in chapter 5 and 2.
147	Álvaro Hernández	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					In point 1.2.2.1. the discussion of the scales should be incorporated into the conceptual framework	We do not incorporate scales to retain simplicity in the CF
148	Álvaro Hernández	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					On page 38 the link of sustainability with indigenous peoples is presented, which in reality are conceptions alien to each other.	Indigenous groups may be alien to the hegemonic discourse of sustainable development, but we would disagree that indigenous groups are inherently alien to the concept of sustainability as defined in our assessment.
367	Mostafa Madbouhi	Government	Morocco	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	57	1586			The map at the Figure 1.14 shows Morocco divided into two parts. Please, unify the colors to represent all the territory of Morocco including the non-colored part.	Noted.

368	Mostafa Madbouhi	Government	Morocco	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	105	2878	2879		The map at the Figure 1.22 shows Morocco divided into two parts. Please, unify the colors to represent all the territory of Morocco including the non-colored part.	Noted.
369	Mostafa Madbouhi	Government	Morocco	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	105	2882			The map at the Figure 1.23 shows Morocco divided into two parts. Please, unify the colors to represent all the territory of Morocco including the non-colored part.	Noted.
375	Michael Bordt	Government	Fisheries and Oceans Canada (comments are my own)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	14	403	14	413	The revised manual will be entitled "SEEA Ecosystem Accounting" (SEEA-EA). It has been declared an international statistical standard in March 2021.	Adjusted
383	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	40	2	40	The statement about values seems a bit weak without an upfront definition. While there is a definition offered in a text box later on in the chapter, allowing the reader to clearly understand the frame of reference from the beginning could be quite helpful and avoid confusion.	We appreciate your comment, this has been modified according to your suggestion.
384	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	83	3	83	There is a spelling error: "disting-ushes".	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
385	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	596	21	606	These statements are very general and wide-ranging - perhaps better to add context?	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
386	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	606	21	606	Each of these has laws, customs and norms that are reflected in them and should be taken into account.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
387	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	647	22	647	Consider explicitly adding in references to intergenerational equity in this paragraph overall, as much of its contents seems to hint at the concept without referencing it.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened

388	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	37	1080	37	1081	Might also add the just transitions policy framework and funding mechanism in the EU	This is an interesting idea but we had to cut the length of this section as the chapter was already too long. We had no room to explore this suggestion.
427	Demian Willette	Individual	Loyola Marymount University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	81	3	83	Adding an upfront definition for 'typology' would be helpful as it is not commonly used. The subsequent sentences describe how it works but don't specifically state that a topology is a classification/organization scheme (if this is indeed the intended meaning by the authors). Understandably, the meaning is clarified starting on line 862 so perhaps this upfront definition is not needed.	This paragraph has been deleted.
428	Demian Willette	Individual	Loyola Marymount University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	10	288	10	291	Phrasing of these two sentences is somewhat redundant, although this may be due to the typographical errors. Am I correct in understanding the Assessment will (a) examine values, (b) highlight those seen as most important for a sustainable future, and then (c) leverage those most important to plan how to reach the sustainable future? Also, curious about the aim to create a single map to multiple 'futures' - I read this paragraph to suggest their is 'a' more sustainable future, yet the road map allows off-ramps for less sustainable futures?	The text has substantially changed
429	Demian Willette	Individual	Loyola Marymount University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	37	1069	37	1073	Separate from the tropical versus temperate comparison, the impact of heat waves has been documented to be more severe in urban locations than rural (for example: Gabriel, K.M. and Endlicher, W.R., 2011. Urban and rural mortality rates during heat waves in Berlin and Brandenburg, Germany. Environmental pollution, 159(8-9), pp.2044-2050); and may also be the cause for stormwater/flooding due to complications of grey (stormwater) infrastructure (Zhou, X., Bai, Z. and Yang, Y., 2017. Linking trends in urban extreme rainfall to urban	Thanks, these references have been added to reflect the disproportionate impacts of heatwaves and rainfall in cities.
430	Demian Willette	Individual	Loyola Marymount University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	1	63	1733	General comment - There is a lack of discussion or mention of value/valuation of Urban Ecosystem Services (UES) in chapter 1. A word search reveals 'urban' is only stated once and is reference to coastal urban areas (Grand Challenges 3), not the urban landscape. 'Urbanization' is mentioned three times (Lines 1059, 3001, and in the Grand Challenge box) in reference to the damage or rate of the process. Chapter 2 speaks to the urban environment and UES in greater depth, but with more than 50% of the world's population living in cities	Thanks for this comment. The purpose of Chapter 1 is to present the main themes of the VA. The VA is not a thematic assessment on ecosystem services, but a methodological report on different valuation methods. We had to be succinct in Chapter 1 and decided to favour the presentation of other topics besides the urban/rural divide. However, the findings presented in the VA overall are pertinent and applicable to urban contexts.
434	Jan Kunas	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	23	650	23	651	Values changing in time, hinted at in Figure 1.3. IPBES conceptual framework. Ignored? Here environmental historians could have a lot to contribute, see for example: http://www.whpress.co.uk/EH/papers/1863-Kunnas.pdf on how values have changed in time.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
435	Jan Kunas	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	23	663	23	665	"Further, it is assumed that it is possible (using a wide range of methods and 663 approaches) to identify if people hold a certain type of value, whether it is individually held or 664socially shared, whether it evolves over time, or whether it can be compared to other values or not 665using a given scale and metric." But then again the time aspect is ignored.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
436	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	7	5	7	Add point 1.1.1 Why valuation of values	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.

437	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	19	5	19	Add before 1.1.5... Identification of Values _ contribution of nature/ Nature based solution	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
438	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	19	5	19	Add after 1.1.6 ... Benefits and limitations of the Value Assessment	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
439	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	19	5	19	After above additional head ... Add 'worth of Valuation of Natural Resources'	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
440	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	21	5	21	Add 1.2.2.1 ... Social	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
441	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	23	5	23	Add 1.2.2.2 Economic	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
442	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	37	5	37	Add 1.2.4.2 ... Using Value Assessment in Policy and Governance	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
443	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	37	5	37	Add 1.2.4.3 Circular Economy and Values	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
444	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	55	5	55	Add 1.4.3 ... Adopted methods of Values Assessment	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.

445	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	62	5	62	Add 1.4.6 ... Economic and Social cost of Valuation Process	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
446	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	62	5	62	Add FAQs	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
447	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	40	9	40	Add contents on ... 'Ways to incorporate Diversity'	Thanks The text has change dramatically
448	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	19	368	22	434	Add comparative Table of limitations and advantages	Beyond the intended scope of the section, which is merely meant to provide a descriptive overview
449	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	435	24	500	Add comparative Table of Limitations and Advantages	Beyond the intended scope of the section, which is merely meant to provide a descriptive overview
450	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	501	25	516	Add contents on how limitations of earlier Assessment methods have been addressed	In line 62, we state how the VA enhances and expands on previous assessment through an emphasis on a greater plurality of values, and considering different perspectives.
451	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	517	26	545	For Future add contents on the 'Available-Consumption-Science-Technology' simulation scenarios	This subsection has been removed due to length considerations
452	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	53	1302	53	1302	Table 1.1.... 'Questions addressed ... theory of change' Should have an aspect of Scenario building	Scenario building can be regarded to be part of valuation itself

453	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	54	1326	54	1329	Fig. 1.1.2Add Resultant aspect of 'changing Science/Technology to handle change'	This is not needed as it would focus the attention on science and technology. The chapter is broader than that.
454	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1516	60	1520	Fig. 1.1.3.... Add dimension of handling diversity ...varied capacity of system/s and level of Governance at grass roots'	This figure reflects a process that was followed, we cannot add steps that were not considered or assessed in that process.
455	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	130	3026	130	3032	Add discussion on 'Indigenous' and also on 'Local Knowledge' for uniform consideration, globally	We have stick to the IPBES definition of Indigenous and Local communities and included a foot note on the section of ILK on this chapter.
456	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	132	3037	132	3038	Add with Table 1.10....Pie chart to represent the composition in numbers and Expertise of contributors	Thank you for your suggestion. Given the extent of the data, a pie chart is not the best way to reflect the data.
512	Diana Sietz	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	12	15	368	434	In addition to the global reports outlined here, the Global Environment Outlook GEO-4 (UNEP 2007) highlights biodiversity as a key pillar for sustaining a common future (Chapters 5 and 6). It provides a synthesis of state and trends of global biodiversity and links biodiversity and ecosystem resilience to archetypes of social-ecological vulnerability (Chapt. 7). Opportunities offered by the environment to build resilience are explicitly considered and policy implications discussed explored.	Given the need to significantly shorten the chapter we had to pick a limited selection of assessments and policy documents to cover, meaning that some important ones were inevitably left out of this brief overview
513	Stephen Kashinde	Organisation	Macedonia Development Group	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	40	2	55	The concept of biodiversity, I argue, is poorly suited as an indicator of conservation value. An earlier concept, natural diversity, fits the role better. Natural diversity is broader than biodiversity not only in moving beyond taxonomic categories to encompass other patterns in the tapestry of life, but also in including abiotic, but valuable, aspects of nature Pikas are rabbit-like creatures which in Utah live only in alpine and subalpine zones. For the pika, the mountain peaks are quite literally	Thanks we agree and we use the expanded concept to nature that encompasses what you mention here. The discussion on these issues is found in the appendix to allow the reader to get a simpler overview
561	Linda Laikre	Individual	Stockholm University, Dept Zoology, Swedish Scientific Council on Biological Diversity	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Genetic diversity, one of the three main elements of biodiversity has been almost entirely omitted. There are 3 instances of the word 'genetic' and these are primarily genetic resources, genetic modifications, or medicinal uses, which neglects the rich array of services genetic diversity provides (for comparison, 'species' is mentioned 18 times). Recent reviews have highlighted how genetic diversity strongly influences ecosystem services and nature's contributions to people, with numerous examples: Stange, M., Barrett,	The chapter provides a concept note (annex) on the term biodiversity. It recognizes that biodiversity captures genetic diversity.
570	Sean Hoban	Individual	The Morton Arboretum, GEO BON	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Genetic diversity, one of the three main elements of biodiversity has been almost entirely omitted. There are 3 instances of the word 'genetic' and these are primarily genetic resources, genetic modifications, or medicinal uses, which neglects the rich array of services genetic diversity provides (for comparison, 'species' is mentioned 18 times). Recent reviews have highlighted how genetic diversity strongly influences ecosystem services and nature's contributions to people, with numerous examples: Stange, M., Barrett,	Thanks We have included it somehow in the appendix. We alas could not cover it in depth

572	Simon James	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	703	24	704	It is stated that relational values 'denote something whose worth originates from the relationships with nature or with humans through nature.' For the reasons just given, I would recommend rewording this to give, 'denote something whose worth originates from non-instrumental relationships, either between humans and nature or between humans through nature.'	This text is now in line 205. The text has been slightly modified, but also it is based on the Chan reference.
577	Alla Aleksanyan, Levon Aghasyan	Government	Ministry of Environment of the Republic of Armenia	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	12		15		list of global assesments which can directly or indirectly be connected to the topic is incomplete	This section does not aim to provide an exhaustive list of assessments but rather to give an overview of some key assessments. An exhaustive list is beyond the intended scope
579	Alla Aleksanyan, Levon Aghasyan	Government	Ministry of Environment of the Republic of Armenia	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1		142		there are many repetitions in the text	Fixed. Thanks for pointing this.
583	Thant Shin	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	43	2	44	There should be possible solution between diverse nature of values.	Thanks we slightly changed the wording to make this more comprehensive
584	Thant Shin	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	4	134	4	135	there are many obstacles for practical implementation of strengthening IPLC and their knowledge systems. International community and organization should encourage practically, it should not be a construction site in air, but on ground.	Thanks. We have now deepened this discussion
623	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	8	1	8	Given the relevance of the term "nature" in the full report, the definition used by IPBES (and expanded in Annex 1.1) should be briefly presented at the beginning of this executive summary. It should be clear from the outset that it is a broad definition and is not limited to living components. In particular, it should be noted that it also includes the abiotic component that is part of ecosystems (e.g. water and atmosphere). This is obvious to an ecologist, but may not be obvious to many stakeholders.	We have now revised the annex that takes care of this. Given the complexity of the discussion we did not want to place a short and trivialized version in the main text and rather send the reader to the appendix for the corresponding discussion
624	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	8	252	8	252	Because of the importance of the term "nature" in the entire report, the definition used by IPBES (and expanded in Annex 1.1) should be briefly presented at the beginning of this first chapter. It should be clear from the outset that it is a broad definition and is not limited to living components. In particular, it should be noted that it also includes the abiotic component that is part of ecosystems (e.g. water and atmosphere). This is obvious to an ecologist, but may not be obvious to many stakeholders.	Thanks. While we understand we deliberately decided to keep this discussion in appendix to allow for a diverse readership to read easily through this first introduction
625	Claudio Valdovinos	Individual	Universidad de Concepción, Chile	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	80	266	80	266	It seems correct to me to incorporate references to the abiotic aspects of "nature". However, given the relevance of this, I recommend expanding this explanation a bit more, incorporating 8-10 additional lines highlighting the mutual dependence between biotic and abiotic components, which are inseparable. I would also include a brief simple example of this. Perhaps it could be the life and composition of the atmosphere (in 3-4 lines).	Thanks. We have quite limited space though.

638	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	10	86	10	86	b) private actors - I would include aftertheir own resources +land tenure / management and nature reserves	Thanks more details are provided in the appendix. Here we only make a very succinct summary
639	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	31	671	31	671	Considering humans are spread throughout the world I would rather write / say NATURAL WORLD - BIO WORLD - BIOLOGICAL WORLD instead of non - human world.	Non-human world refers to the natural world that is not human. This points that humans can also be considered to be part of nature. This term is used in the literature and thus we prefer to keep it in chapter 1.
640	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	33	732	33	732	The sentence: Living with sees nature as non-human beings with their own interests,untilresponsibility - is not very clear . It would refer to Living together with other beings ...plants and animals ?	We stick to the "living with" as this is the term used in the literature and changing this term risks creating confusion. An in depth explanation of the use and interpretation of the terms can be found in chapter 2.
641	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	39	900	39	902	Referring to examples of resources of private sector I would include LAND and NATURE RESERVES	The chapter deals with natural resources generally (these resources can be associated with land, oceans, etc.)
642	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	46	1132	46	1133	I would add plant and animal before species and follow with geomorphological features / landforms such as: rivers and mountains	references to rivers and mountains as subjects of justice has been added in section 1.2.4
643	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	96	2471	96	2481	I would also quote as a sub-category landowners who are responsible for preserving / protecting nature reserves	The DMT provides a general description of types of actors. The rest of the chapters uses this and include a large diversity of actors, including farmers, landowners, fishers, etc.
644	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	125	3007	125	3007	I would not use the expression " Fence and forget" as Protected Areas need permanent monitoring - protection - restoration .	We have now change this section and omitted this expression
645	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	128	3012	128	3012	I agree that in fact in several cases the creation of Protected Areas have been done without the participation of local communities and that affected the acceptance and protection of the area. Protected areas should be involving local populations in programmes to incentive local economy and environmental education.	We thank the reviewer for the comment. We have tried to highlight the issue of real participation and involvement of local and indigenous communities in Protected Areas in this and the other chapters

646	Alfred Oteng-Yeboah	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	48	1055	48	1056	Table SPM 3: Arrows and Shades need further clarity	Ch1. No response
647	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	16		16		Figure SPM 3: should have a title eg. 'Linkage between valuation method families and valuation disciplines'	Ch1. No response
648	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	16		16		Figure SPM 3: is difficult to comprehend. Let's simplify them for easy uptake by policy makers	Ch1. No response
649	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	16		16		Figure SPM 3: What is referred to as arrows are not obvious. Valuation method families and disciplines appear to be represented by bands	Ch1. No response
650	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	16		16		Figure SPM 3: The scale depicting the bandwidth could be better appreciated if made more legible	Ch1. No response
651	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	18		18		Figure SPM 5: The presumption is the NCPs could mean Natures Contribution to People, but it would be helpful if the full wording appears in the explanatory note	Ch1. No response
652	Jewel Kudjawa	Government	Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	18		18		Figure SPM 5: Placing specific values and corresponding value justification in clear boxes could make their connectedness more obvious. As it stands the specific values may be perceived as not really having any direct linkages with the value justifications	Ch1. No response
653	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	13		13		Terrific summary of prior assessments	Positive feedback is appreciated.

654	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	14	401-402			It is accurate to say that TEEB used economic valuation and that this is not sufficient. But it is not accurate to say that TEEB/TEV does not include ethical values. Rather TEV does include bequest, altruistic and existence value in its framework (it's just that these practitioners then conduct valuation of these using a single \$ metric). Please qualify here and throughout report when TEV is described as not addressing ethical dimensions.	The text has been amended
691	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	40	2	55	The paragraph refers indistinctly to "values" (in general) and to "values of nature". A better differentiation / relationship between values in general and "values of nature" could be needed in order to better understand how both types of "values" have an impact on people's relation with nature.	This paragraph was deleted.
692	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	89	2	98	Despite the fact that, in general terms, the differentiation of three types of decisions and three types of decision makers seems correct; in reality it could be a somewhat simplistic differentiation. Political decisions have a high economic component; likewise, those of civil society are probably more socio-economic than socio-environmental. The prevalence of one or the other of these approaches to decision-making is a differentiating factor between types of populations (urban, rural, indigenous) and their level of relationship or dependence with nature;	This is correct and the chapter explicitly mentions that the DMT typology is necessarily fluid. The DMT offers a general approach that is flexible enough to identify how a given type of decision making is related other types of decision making. Details about this appears in chapter 2.
693	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	4	120	5	149	Although ILK and IPCL stand for "Indigenous & Local Knowledge" and "Indigenous People & Local Communities", the paragraph seems to refer mainly to Indigenous People and Knowledge (emphasis common to various IPBES documents) a better identification and characterization of non-indigenous local communities (rural, semi-urban and urban communities.) could be included, taking into account that these communities represent the vast majority of the world's population and, consequently, their value systems and forms of decision-making	This paragraph was deleted.
694	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	6	182	6	197	It is very appropriate to propose a theory of change centered on values; But the question arises: is it about including nature's values or about including nature in values in general? Is it the same?	There are several steps involved. Much more detail is provided in Ch5 and in the SPM
695	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	12	368	15	434	To overcome the division between rural and urban and strengthen the inclusion of biodiversity in urban areas, I suggest reviewing antecedents such as CiTieS ANd BiodiverSiTY oUTLook, A Global Assessment of the Links between Urbanization, Biodiversity and Ecosystems (CBO, 2011)To overcome the division between rural and urban and strengthen the inclusion of biodiversity in urban areas, I suggest reviewing antecedents such as CiTieS ANd BiodiverSiTY oUTLook, A Global Assessment of the Links between Urbanization,	This report is pertinent but out of scope for our Chapter 1 of the Values Assessment which aims to present the principal themes of the VA which is a methodological assessment on valuation.
696	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	582	22	649	Very well developed link between the IPBES Framework and the values; somehow, the "values" seem the code needed to really navigate the framework and to associate it with "decision making" which is, in practice, the real link between the components of the conceptual framework.	Positive feedback is appreciated.
697	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	30	858	30	859	Figure 1.7 introduces the concept "interests", not used in the text above. The relation between values and interests in decision making is a complex one, that could need further development in the assessment. Likewise; "motivation"	These issues (e.g. conflicting interests/values) are dealt with in more detail in subsequent chapters, however given that CH1 is only meant to provide an introduction we cannot expand on these topics here.

698	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	37	1052	41	1218	In order to contextualize the role of values in sustainability and justice; It would be interesting to analyze the link between values and quality of life, which seems to be the most direct and obvious motivation for decision-making. Recognizing that Quality of life also has different meaning and implications for different actors in different contexts and is reflected in different ways in decision-making.	Agreed, this is the scope of chapter 2.
699	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	44	1258	44	1259	Very clear and helpful	Thank you
700	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	50	1416	52	1478	This section adequately characterizes and measures indigenous and local communities, especially the former, in relation to values: without ignoring the importance of these population groups, their territories and values in the preservation of bi-diversity and vital ecosystem services, or The risks to its conservation, other local populations, especially urban communities, cannot be ignored either at this point or as a particular group in that of Civil Society Actors. Graphing and mapping these populations (quantity, % of total population, territorial	Thanks for the comment. We have now define Indigenous people and local communities, following international agreements. We also highlight how much of the total indigenous population live in urban areas.
701	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	53	1516	53	1517	Figure 1.13 or similar should be used for urban communities	Indigenous and Local People are a recognised stakeholder of IPBES which is why we devote so much place in explaining their inclusion. Inclusion of IPLC in the elaboration of the VA is part of the assessment's mandate.
702	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	55	1557	56	1585	The overwhelming majority of scientific sources (92%) is worrying in relation to the general objective of the science-policy interface of IPBES and, consequently, in the generation of responses and public policy proposals and, as a result, in the effective incidence in decision making processes. This is aggravated by the prevalence of scientific backgrounds in the team of experts (a common characteristic of other IPBES Assessments).	In an effort to increase the transparency of the process and source of the literature reviewed in this assessment, section 1.4.3 includes an overview of the plurality achieved in the assessment, as well as a reflection on its limitations. We hope this section (and others like this in the future) help to ammend the concern noted
703	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	57	1586	57	1587	Section A of the figure does not contain useful information to visualize and analyze the numerical and percentage composition of the various disciplines randomly included.	We agree that this figure was not essential. It has now been moved to annexes.
704	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1607	59	1626	The paragraph talks about "scientific disciplines" and "reserchers"; what about other non-scientifica disciplines (practitioners, civil servants, etc) .	These dtails are provided in Annex 1.5
705	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1648	62	1697	The fact that the scientific bias is explicitly knowledge and analysed in it's implications, is both and alert and a positive step towards developing new ways to include a broader realm of lectures and experts in the IPBES assessments.	We thank the reviewer for this comment.

706	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	62	1698	63	1732	Very interesting approach to link values, valuation and politics as a storyline through the assessment. However, the link between "targeted policy themes", Grand Challenges" and cluster is not clear enough.	Thanks. We have deleted this section as it was hard to operationalize
710	Yildiz Aumeeruddy-Thomas	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	42	2	42	"Values are representations of what people and society care about", but also what people do not care about or are bound to accept due to law. I guess no value system can be assessed if we know only what people care about!.	Agree We changed the text slightly to address this
711	Yildiz Aumeeruddy-Thomas	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	95	3	95	culturally accepted perspectives about nature: this piece of text does not portray the fact multidirectional-directional dimensions of how culture affects how people care about nature, BUT also how Nature affects culture (see work on Nature-Culture Ontologies By Descola 2005). A majority of the worlds population incl IPLC (Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities) but not only, also urban people, develop this multi-directional Nature-Culture perspective. Worth rephrasing I guess. Within IPBES Global Assessment, the concept of NCP	Thanks This has been addressed at different points of the text
784	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Executive summary very good, very clear	Positive feedback is appreciated.
785	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		386		386	Fig.1.1. It would be useful to add a box summarizing the characteristics of the VA, for ease of comparison and to show diagrammatically what is new and different about it.	We have added a new figure (Figure 1.11) to provide a synthesis of the assessment
786	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Fig.1.2. In the box related to the Global Assessment, note that it focused on how emphasis on material NCP was in detriment of both non-material and regulating NCP. This is wrongly stated.	The text has been corrected
787	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		620		621	"Broader approach to nature" - broader than what?	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
788	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		630		630	"Anthropogenic assets' co-construct NCP" add "together with nature"	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened

789	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		641		642	"Alternative definitions of wellbeing exist" - alternative to what?	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
790	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		670		671	"we expand on the concept proposed by Díaz 668 et al. (2015) by recognizing that individual and group understandings of nature are socially constructed, and that different social groups have different conceptualizations of the relationship between the human and non-human world." Two comments: actually ALL categories (nature as well as the vast majority, if not all categories used in this assessment) are socially constructed. So while the first statement is correct, it should not be made explicit just for nature (I suggest either to drop it and say	This comment now refers to line149. Annex 1 now provides more discussion of the major categories.
791	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					"we expand on the concept proposed by Díaz et al. (2015) by recognizing that individual and group understandings of nature are socially constructed, and that different social groups have different conceptualizations of the relationship between the human and non-human world" Second comment: while this is perhaps an expansion of the simple definition in the Díaz et al. 2015 CF (suitable-by-word approval in Antalya; need to be short and standard), it is fully in line with the expended definition already present in the Global Assessment	We have strongly edited the text since
792	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		701		702	"in principle substitutable" - add "by similar entities that perform similarly towards a given end"	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been shortened and therefore we have not included your comment in the revisions
793	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		946		946	Fig. 1.8. The meaning of the "civil society milieu" bubble in black line is unclear. Please remove or explain in the legend.	This figure no longer appears in the chapter, thank you for your comment.
794	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1166		1168	"Equitable distribution of biodiversity and NCPs" this expression is a bit conceptually confusing because biodiversity (nature) per se is heterogeneously distributed and there is little we can do about it. I believe this equitable distribution refers to the BENEFITS arising from nature, including NCP in general and also specifically CBD's ABS, which I think is about the legal rights and money income derived from such NCP (ie. in the case of a medicinal plant useful to industry, who are the legitimate owners of the NCP). Please clarify conceptually.	Thank you for your comment. Your comment is correct and was considered, however while reducing the length of the chapter the section you are referring to has been lost.
795	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1465		1465	Recent paper arising from the GA IPLC/ILK learning process may be useful and relevant to include here: McElwee, P., et al. (2020). "Working with Indigenous and local knowledge (ILK) in large-scale ecological assessments: Reviewing the experience of the IPBES Global Assessment." 57(9): 1666-1676.	Thank you for your suggestion, this reference has been considered.
796	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1947			References to the Global Assessment as a whole and to SPM and individual chapters incomplete or out of format. See the GA in the IPBES website for formal citation.	All references will be reviewed before submission, especially for IPBES deliverables.

797	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		0		0	General about Chapter 1: very well written and highly comprehensive. Useful in itself as well as an introduction.	We thank the Reviewer for her/his positive appraisal of our chapter.
853	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	18	1	18	consider replacing 'capture' with 'document' as the former has an undertone of imperialism and/or colonialism	The reference to 'capture' is no longer made in this piece of text
854	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	83	3	83	there seems to be an unnecessary hyphen in 'disting-uishes'	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
855	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	4	120	4	120	I couldn't help but be reminded of this ICC Policy Paper on "Local Communities" which discusses how the use of IPLC continues to undermine Inuit Rights - https://www.inuitcircumpolar.com/news/icc-policy-paper-on-local-communities-chronicles-opposition-to-the-undermining-and-erosion-of-inuit-rights/ While noting here this is applicable to the entire assessment.	Thanks. This is extensively addressed in Ch2. The final version has dramatically changed
856	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	47	1327	47	1327	Figure 1.12 - it wasn't clear what the different colours signified in the three different decision making scenarios (grey, red, and various hues of green/blue)	The figure in question and associated text has been removed
857	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	51	1426	51	1426	When I think of the work that Ostrom 1990 wrote about 'ancient' isn't the word that comes to mind. 'long enduring' might be more appropriate.	We agree with the reviewer. We have change this statement to the following: "Indigenous people and local communities (IPLCs) own, manage and/or occupy at least a quarter of the global land area under several property regimes (IPBES, 2019), including collective property regimes that have adapted and innovated rules and institutions, some of which go back centuries or even millennia"
858	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	54	1538	54	1542	This paragraph starts by noting that 600 materials were received and concludes by noting that 236 contributions were further reviewed for this assessment. It was unclear what the process was for further consideration/inclusion? If those details are included elsewhere in the report than perhaps either a footnote or a parenthetical reference could be made.	We have now move this content to the ILK annex explaining in more detail the process of the "Call for contributions" of the Values Assessment. Because this Call was launched for more than one Assessment, some of the materials were directed to contribute to the Sustainable use.
859	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1602	58	1603	It would be great to include more information linking the number of reviews to specific chapters and questions. In addition to the summary table - a full list of all 40 literature reviews with key meta-data information (chapter/ section, question, type of review, reason for review, inclusion of other languages, inclusion of non-academic knowledge) would be super helpful! In addition, perhaps a version of this table that is included in and specific to each chapter as it was challenging to follow when and where different reviews were	This will be addressed in each chapter (which describe at length the literature review methods), as this is beyond the scope of chapter 1.

863	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	0	142	0	General comment - the chapter is very long and often repetitive, with the material being used at different points. It could likely be half the length if tidied and made more concise without losing any context. This would also make it more accessible to readers. This is the introduction to the assessment, so it should focus not on summaries detailed content that will be presented in each chapter, but rather focus on the key objectives of the assessment, and key linkages of values with IPBES conceptual framework.	Fixed. Thanks for pointing this.
864	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	15	433	15	434	Referring to the Global Biodiversity Outlook report, this introductory chapter mentioned that the report uses "Nature Futures Framework" which is being developed by IPBES and has been used in previous IPBES assessments. The IPBES task force on scenarios and models has been developing this framework (also called NFF) for several years to support the IPBES assessments. The NFF will be a relevant framework to use in this values assessment. The chairs and authors may want to consider using the NFF in this assessment report considering the comments	At this stage it is unfortunately too late to include additional frameworks in the VA
865	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	15	446	15	453	The comments w.r.t. the Methodological Assessment on Scenarios and Models are incorrect - these reflect the current work by the task force, rather than the summary of the 2016 methodological assessment. The task force on scenarios and models can support the replacement text.	The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
866	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	17	498	17	499	Figure 1.2 bullets w.r.t. the Scenarios and Models assessment should be revised to reflect approaches in the 2016 assessment rather than the current work of the task force on scenarios and models.	we refer to all the work of the Scenarios and Model assessment and task force
867	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	19	536	19	536	Suggest adding an additional section here on work on the current task forces, specifically indicating the work by the task force on scenarios and models, and including the content on the Nature Futures Framework that was misallocated to the Methodological Assessment on Scenarios and Models.	This entire subsection has been deleted due to length considerations
868	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	722	25	725	Preferences are included at the top of the pyramid but omitted from the discussion in the text. The differences between Broad and Specific Values is quite vague, as is potentially the separation between Broad Values and World Views. These need to be more clearly explained as separate entities as portrayed in the pyramid. I anticipate this will be further explained in Chapter 2.	Pyramid figure is replaced with Fig 1.3. Yes, these concepts are more fully explained in chapter 2
869	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	726	26	743	The Life Frames framework is somewhat difficult to interpret and should be noted that prepositions may not translate well outside of English. With much of the rest of the concepts presented as triumvirate, e.g. intrinsic, instrumental and relational values, as already introduced, and as more commonly accepted terminology, it is unclear why this particular values framework is singled out in this assessment? I would note for many ILK worldviews, there is no difference between Living in and Living as. Place itself is part of identity	Now line 234. We have tried to make it clearer the role of the life frames here. Also, it is further explained in Chapter 2
870	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	27	756	31	861	This section on Valuation methods seems to be missing reference to the concept that many valuation methods poorly represent the diversity of existing values and are often focussed on economic/market values for nature that are easily quantified. These valuation methods themselves can be disenfranchising to stakeholders who do not see their values represented in a particular valuation framework, and the power dynamics can be influenced by the choice of valuation framework. See e.g. Tadaki, M., Sinner, J., Šunde, C., Giorgetti, A., Glavovic, B.,	This section is a summary of a topic that is well developed in Ch. 2 and 3. This reference is thus considered in both of those chapters.

871	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	30	859	31	861	This is quite simplistic - I have never encountered a low complexity case where values could be ignored and intermediate complexity where there are many stakeholders, and this implies that values could be simplified to singular values. Rather all decision making processes with respect to the environment typically includes multiple stakeholders with a plurality of values. Possibly what you are trying to say instead is that in some simpler cases, values are more aligned, as all stakeholders have the same objectives? But even with few stakeholders, they are	The figure and text have been reworked
872	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	38	888	39	896	Particularly useful to emphasise that individuals can express different public vs private values. Particularly in indigenous communities (with NZ as an example), an individual representing one iwi (indigenous tribe) can represent a political unit (tribal/Treaty authority), a commercial actor (tribal units invest in fisheries, aquaculture, forestry), and a public good/environmental sustainability/guardianship (kaitiakitanga) actor. Possibly add a bit more here, as diversity of individual's values is important in the valuation of nature.	This is a very good point that is addressed in chapter 2. In chapter 1 the idea that individual values are manifold is now also mentioned. The chapter now explicitly mentions that worldviews may help to shape an individual's broad and specific values (in plural), while those broad and specific values may also inform peoples' worldviews.
873	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	32	912	32	931	Here are three constructs of decision making - these align well with instrumental, intrinsic and relational values - however, they do not align with the 4 Life Frames presented earlier.	The DMT is not intended to align with types of specific values or life frames. Any type of decision maker or type of decision can involve more than one type of value or life frame.
874	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	33	932	33	934	It would be useful here to also include a discussion of the power of different actors - for example, private actors often have more power to influence decision making, whereas civil society and sometimes public actors may have less influence.	Added. Thank you for pointing this.
875	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	47	1327	47	1330	Figure 1.12 is a much better representation of complexity in decision making and how valuation and values can be incorporated to move toward transformative change. This is much preferred to the figure on page 30, which conflicts with the message in Figure 1.12.	Thank you
876	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	50	1393	55	1556	Lots of repetitive content on worldviews that was presented earlier. It is necessary to go into so much detail to define IPLCs and ILK? Could not a short section be added on about page 15 when discussing assessments to also introduce the role of the ILK task force collaboration in this assessment, and remove much of the extensive detail here about IPBES and ILK, which is not required for expressing values of IPLCs and ILK? I do, however, like Figure 1.13 and its text description, which showcases the involvement of ILK communities in	Thanks for the comment. We have substantially reduced this section and move detailed information in to the ILK Annex. We kept this section because its an important mandate from IPBES to have emphasis in Indigenous peoples.
877	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	57	1586	57	1588	This figure does not add anything to the chapter and could be deleted. Author affiliations are part of the chapter header material. This also ignores the larger role of CLAs and Las, which are by IPBES mandate geographically balanced, and instead suggests the inclusion of CAs have resulted in dominance by particular areas, whereas this is likely just inclusion of experts known to CLAs and LAs to provide additional small sections of content.	This figure has now been moved to an annex. It only includes data from cochairs, CLAs, LAs and fellows. Data from CAs are not included. This figure forms part of the argument that the geographic balance of the experts selected to write the assessment does not necessarily results in the balanced inclusion of literature from different regions of the world.
878	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1589	58	1612	This page is particularly repetitive and could be substantially shortened.	Thank you, the whole chapter was reduced in length and overlaps were avoided.

879	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1603	58	1607	Suggest delete lines 1603-1607 - unnecessary detail.	We believe this information is of importance.
880	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	58	1647	58	1647	Table 1.3 is somewhat repetitive of the earlier figure with ILK consultations. Is it necessary? Do assessments normally list dates of government review and the number of comments addressed and review process? I feel this material is extraneous.	Yes, it's been moved to Annex 1.5.
881	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1656	60	1656	Unlikely that most readers will be familiar with the term 'emic' - suggest replacing it with a more accessible term.	We have now removed this and other jargon terms.
882	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	60	1648	62	1697	The section of biases and limitations is very repetitive and jargon-heavy and could be reduced to one paragraph.	This section was reorganized and shortened. Most of the content was moved to a new section called "The plurality achieved in the Assessment and its limits"
883	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	78	2219			This Annex 1.1 seems to have already been introduced briefly (and sufficiently) in the main text. The concept of nature/distinctions between nature and humans reflects specific worldviews and is not shared by all cultures. However, I feel the IPBES definition of nature is inclusive of this diversity of definitions of nature, and I am unclear why this annex appears to refute the definition, whereas it appears to not have read the definition for which it states four limitations. Recommend delete this annex.	Thanks. We do not agree. We feel that it is very important to make visible the complexity inherent to the very diverse interpretations of these concepts.
884	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	80	2271	82	2314	This annex again refers to the triumvirate instrumental/relational/intrinsic construct and not the four-part Life Frames. It seems much of the chapter appears to match up with prior constructs and is not explained with reference to the Life Frames. Also, I disagree with much of the text from lines 2286 onward in this section, and it is not clear how the generalising NCP perspective puts nature and humans as separate or how context-specific is only seen as IPLC perspective. It is unclear why the authors think cultural ecosystem	Thanks. We do not agree. We feel that it is very important to make visible the complexity inherent to the very diverse interpretations of these concepts.
885	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	83	2315	83	2355	Redefining good quality of life is beyond the scope of this assessment. Personally, I prefer the shorter, less prescriptive official IPBES definition over this one which recognises the context-specificity of quality of life but does not include extraneous detail. Recommend remove this annex.	In this new version of the Chapter, we have removed this section while adding a concept note in the annexes about quality of life. We think this is a better organization of this and other topics such as nature and biodiversity.
886	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	85	2356	100	2815	This material already sufficiently detailed in the main text. Unclear why this is repeated here, in slightly longer text. Annex could be omitted. While I do like the idea of a figure that illustrates different interactions between actors, Figure 1.18 (line 2631) is difficult to interpret with different colours and different sized arrows, and probably just as usefully explained rather simply in a text that actors can cooperate, conflict, command, or trade.	This figure has been reworked.

887	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	101	2816	113	2943	Repetitive of some earlier content, unclear why it is here. Delete this annex. Similar comments with respect to main text in that this is an overly detailed summary of both authors and of the literature review that includes too much extraneous information. Reduce in length in the main text. Remove Annex.	The annex has not been removed because it provides important background information that may be helpful to the reader. However, both the main body of text and the annex have been edited to avoid repetitions.
888	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	114	2944	122	3013	Instructions for chapter author use of grand challenges and TPTs not required in the assessment. The lack of correspondence of the listed GCs and TPTs in the main text and that of this section is concerning.	Thanks. We have deleted this section as it was hard to operationalize
889	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	123	3014	135	3331	Annex of review and ILK workshop feedback could be included on IPBES assessment website but not to include in the chapter.	We thank the reviewer for this comment. Because the results from the workshops are linked to the content of the Values assessment it is worthwhile presenting them in a summarized version at the annex.
936	China	Government	China	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	124	3037	124	3038	Taiwan is part of People's Republic of China. However, in table 1.10 (Contributor's country of residence), Taiwan is wrongly listed as a country. Therefore, a correction to the table is required to incorporate the number of contributors from Taiwan into China.	Thank you for your comment, the table has been deleted, and the data is now presented in a map.
940	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	6	209	7	201	The IPBES Global Assessment defines transformative change as "a fundamental, system-wide reorganization across technological, economic and social factors, including paradigms, goals and values." This points to the fact that indirect instead of direct causes or drivers are at the heart of transformative change. It is suggested to adjust the sentence in brackets accordingly.	We agree. Yet for brevity and to leave room for the results of the following chapters we do not go deeper. More details on this can be found in Ch2, 4, 5 and 6
941	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	8	241	8	243	It is not correct that the IPCC does not "focus on the interlinkages between people and nature" please delete the reference to the IPCC.	Deleted
942	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	8	266	8	268	This is a strong statement. It is suggested to substantiate it with at least one reference.	It has now been removed from Ch1 and is substantiated in ch2
943	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	13	385	13	385	The Dasgupta Review on the Economics of Biodiversity was only released recently, in Feb 2021. Please adjust the figure accordingly.	Adjusted

944	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	37	1063	37	1065	Please be aware that this needs to be updated according to the language of the Updated Zero Draft, the First Draft or the post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework adopted by the COP-15 of the CBD (depending on date of final editing of the Values Assessment).	Thanks. The final text is not available yet so we did not change this
945	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	37	1069	37	1073	The well balanced messages of the IPCC are not properly reflected in this text. Please modify as follows: "The link between the climate crises and social justice has also been emphasized by the climate science community (Klinsky et al., 2017), as reflected in the IPCC Special Report on Global Warming of 1.5°C (Masson-Delmotte et al., 2018). Countries with larger economies and larger population contribute most to the generation of greenhouse gases in absolute terms while the wealthiest countries contribute most in terms of per capita emissions.	Thanks we have added this text
946	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	44	1258	44	1259	Leverage point 3 addresses decision making & governance. However, implicit or explicit decisions are made at each leverage point. Maybe this needs a more clear-cut distinction.	The figure in question and associated text has been removed
947	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	62	1698	63	1733	It is proposed to consider knowledge, research and skills gaps as an additional cluster for targeted policy themes and grand challenges which needs to be treated in a cross-chapter process.	Thanks. We have deleted this section as it was hard to operationalize
1030	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		414		425	re The Dasgupta Review on the Economics of Biodiversity, this review perhaps should be referred to as focussed on "nature" and not on "biodiversity"; the review takes a conventional perspective that "biodiversity" is just a factor within ecosystems. for example, nowhere in the review is there any consideration of economics of global "biodiversity option value"	For increased clarity we use the term "biodiversity" as it is the one favored in the Review
1031	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		668		671	re "Values of nature: When referring to values of 'nature', we expand on the concept proposed by Diaz et al. (2015) by recognizing that individual and group understandings of nature are socially constructed" an important addition/clrification may be need concerning "biodiveristy", which has a biological definition which is not socially constructed; for discussion see Faith, Daniel P., "Biodiversity", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2021 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.)	Thank you for the useful comment. In the main report, our focus is on the values of nature as highlighted in the IPBES conceptual framework. However, in Annex 1 we now explore further the concepts of both nature and biodiversity. The Annex includes Faith reference.
1032	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1093		1096	given that the "flows" idea often is restricted to ecosystem functions/services, it would be good here to note how brundtland tied it to a constraint of preserving biodiversity-variety for future unanticipated benefits	This is an interesting idea but we had to cut the length of this section as the chapter was already too long. We had no room to explore this suggestion.
1033	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1171		1174	re "future generations will suffer from the loss of the options that biodiversity provides (NCP18)", for clarity note here that this extends beyond idea that the collection of species includes current uses/resources, to cover the idea of biodiversity option value, defined by the IPBES Conceptual Framework (Diaz et al. 2015: 14) "the "option values of biodiversity", that is, the value of maintaining living variation in order to provide possible future uses and benefits." this reflects ideas of biotic diversity and inter-generational justice in	We agree with this point and think it is already addressed in the text.

1034	Daniel Faith	Organisation	Values Assessment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1216		1218	this of course is not just about individual resources....may be informative here to highlight the biodiversity aspect of this - biodiversity option value see line 1171 comment	The section has been reworked and shortened
1079	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		89		92	Political decisions should be defined in broader terms than just rights-related decisions; it also includes the various regulatory and economic incentives that determine the permissibility and profitability/practicability of different private and civic sphere activities;	We provide a quite comprehensive decision making typology in 1.2.3. that addresses all the different issues highlighted here
1080	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		914		922	The present formulation seems to suggest that regulations are always 'derived from rights' which is not the case; please reformulate.	We would prefer to stick to the definition and interpretation of political actors and political decisions in connection to protecting or establishing rights to access and control over natural features, e.g. NCP. While this is a general formulation the assessment, e.g., chapter 4, opens up further the interpretation of what political actors are and do regarding nature.
1081	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		630			word anthropocentric assets should be anthropogenic assets. This is a conceptual not just typological error, hence commented	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1082	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		998		1000	power to tax exists also at the local scale in many municipalities, not just at the state / natl level	The idea of power to tax has been removed from the chapter.
1083	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1028		1028	figure in its current form may give wrong impressions to readers, because the arrows and linear alignment may be interpreted to suggest a linear process while this is not the case in what figure demonstrates; also, knowledge generation is equally much a content in the 'types of interaction between actors'	Figure has been modified to depict a circular (rather than linear) approach to decision making.
1084	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1051		1081	Addresses justice and sustainability only from a distributive view, which is a narrow angle compared to other parts of the report. J+S are addressed multidimensionally quite soon, on lines 1127-1221. Clarification is needed to not confuse the reader. (Lines 1127-1221 are good and clear.)	Our text reflects the literature insofar as sustainability's relation to justice has mostly been approached from a distributive point of view. We will look for further literature and would happily receive further recommendations.
1085	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1051		1081	ecological justice / justice to nature discourse / interspecies justice should also be mentioned here. E.g. Schlosberg 2007 and Wienhues 2020 book; for justice to all sentient beings Nussbaum 2006 (Frontiers of Justice) and Cochrane 2018 book on sentientist politics	This is addressed in lines 1127-1221.

1086	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1158			environmental justice is generally considered as social justice (i.e. justice between humans) with a particular domain, focusing on particular sets of issues -> "environmental as well as social justice" is an odd phrasing. Within environmental justice the view now described on rows 1158-1159 (other-than-human entities as bearers of rights etc.) has not been a mainstream view. Draft lines 1146-1152 now describes what still constitutes the mainstream of environmental justice. Historically, environmental justice began as an initiative that actually	Thanks for this precisions. We have amended the text.
1087	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1176		1181	it's important to mention just transition here but I suggest making it more generally than just via France example. For example: "While reducing the losses of NCP (by for example biodiversity and climate actions) alleviates the aforementioned inequities, such actions may have undesired socioeconomic impacts that fall disproportionately on the disadvantaged groups. Just Transition discourse pays attention to the need to address the equitable distribution of the costs and burdens of the sustainability transition." + then, France could be a	We mention two separate examples, that of France and that of indigenous territories lost to conservation programmes. We have added a reference to the Katowice just transition declaration.
1088	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1176		1181	because Schlosberg 2007/2009 has been among the most influential contributions in this discussion and is more detailed + cited much more than Schlosberg 2004, it should also be referenced here.	Thank you for your comment. The reference has been considered, however while reducing the length of the chapter the section you are referring to has been lost. Scholsberg however is cited in other parts of the assessment.
1089	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1191		1202	An important reference missing: Martin, A., Coolsaet, B., Corbera, E., Dawson, N. M., Fraser, J. A., Lehmann, I., & Rodriguez, I. (2016). Justice and conservation: the need to incorporate recognition. Biological Conservation, 197, 254-261.	Martin 2016 was considered, however a more updated citation was brought to the chapter Martin 2017. The suggested reference is also considered in other parts of the assessment
1090	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1219			Figure 1.10 illustrates different components of justice in a bit confusing way on the 'cylinder outside': some of the terms consider a particular temporal or spatial aspect of justice (intergenerational, intragenerational, planetary), others concern the question of who can be recipients of justice (environmental justice, other-than-human justice), and then there are also simply principles or sub-aspects of e.g. any view of environmental justice (fairness, restorative justice, epistemic justice). I think that omitting some aspects from the figure	Thank you for pointing this out, this figure has changed.
1091	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1327			The role of SDGs in the Figure 1.12 is currently hard to understand. It almost implies two very misleading readings: a) a 'see-saw' or a balance between SDGs and transformative decision-making, or b) SDGs something that is even less transformative than business-as-usual decision making.	The figure has been modified
1288	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	8	1	9	Re: the statement that 'Nature touches upon every dimension of society and yet people conceive and value their relationship with the natural world in diverse ways.' Perhaps it could be foregrounded here that people are of nature too (I know this happens elsewhere in the review). Also, whilst I appreciate the framing of 'Nature's contributions to people' (in preference nature as a service-provider, for example), I still wonder about the split between 'nature' and 'people' that runs through this frame. I know that this is engaged with elsewhere in the	We appreciate your comment, this sentence is no longer included in the Chapter. The relationship between Nature's Contributions to People's, and the dichotomy "nature and people" are discussed in more depth in Chapter 2.
1289	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	42			re the assertion that 'values are 'representations of what people and society care about' - I would disagree with this statement. In my view values are not 'representations' - they are basic and fundamental beliefs that guide or motivate attitudes or actions and determine what is important to us, of which there might be representations. This point relates too to p23 l662.	We agree with you that this is a complex issue. In fact the Values assessment makes a typology of all this and distinguishes different layers of complexity of values, ranging from world views, to broad values or principles, to specific values about things and to the indicators used to depict this.

1290	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	84		85	re: the framing that 'a) public actors are assumed to serve the 'public interest', b) private actors are organized around serving their own private interests...' I wondered if this is a bit misleading or even naive? i.e. it is not necessarily the case that there is a strict divide here between these interests. Public actors may often overlap with and be lobbied by private / corporate interests.	This paragraph has been deleted.
1291	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	6	203			'current unsustainable 'business as usual' conditions.' Needs clarifying re causation - i.e. why is BAU unsustainable? What makes BAU unsustainable? I think a lot more could be said about contexts here.	Thanks Yes we could say much more but decided to be very succinct. More is found in Ch2, Ch4, Ch5 and Ch6. We have slightly changed the text to make this a bit more visible
1292	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	645			re: 'Linking values with the future visions' - this is important but also future visions need to be connected with understandings about the past? This is especially important given contexts of colonisation / violence / extraction / displacement etc.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1293	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	677		678	re: the statement 'nature is often viewed as inextricably linked to humans, not as a separate entity' ... Again, humans are part of nature and evolution - perhaps more acknowledgement of this would be helpful in terms of considering possibilities for systemic transformation	This has been moved to line 159. The section has been shortened, but we refer to chapter 2 where these ideas are expanded.
1294	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	34	966		967	Regarding the issue of value antagonisms and conflict, it would be helpful to draw here on the concept of 'value struggles', as articulated by economist Massimo de Angelia and drawn on in analysis value disagreements over biodiversity offsetting proposals in England in the following paper: Sullivan, S. and Hannis, M. 2015 Nets and frames, losses and gains: Value struggles in engagements with biodiversity offsetting policy in England. Ecosystem Services 15: 162-173 (special issue on 'Biodiversity Offsets as MBIs? From discourses to practice',	Thank you. We have edited this part. We deal with value conflicts throughout the assessment and provide additional references on this issue.
1295	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	39	1144			On different conceptions of justice regarding biodiversity (distributive, procedural, recognition) an additional reference that would support arguments here for diverse conceptions / practices of justice would be Martin, A., et al. 2013 Global environmental justice and biodiversity conservation. The Geographical Journal 179(2): 122-131.	Thanks. We have decided to refer to Adrian's more recent paper (2016) which presents the different dimensions of justice in relation to conservation.
1296	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	48	1382			There seems to be a theory of change here that assumes a rationality and pragmatism that history does not necessarily demonstrate to be real. Is it really the case that better information will in itself engender / lead to transformative systemic change? History does not really demonstrate this to be true, in my view: especially in a context in which the drive towards the production and accumulation of surplus value is so politically accepted and normalised.	We have removed the text and figure associated with the ToC
1314	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	44			suggest: 'conceptualize and interact with'	This sentence has been removed.

1315	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	90			suggest: 'capabilities and rights'	This sentence was deleted.
1316	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	158			address the fact that reviewing 97% of sources published in English must inherently introduce bias, as this translation away from source languages will necessarily result in a loss of place-based vocabulary?	Thanks We cannot really address this fact. Just acknowledge it as we have already done so.
1317	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	7	214			pluralistic perspectives on human-nature relations' - this is a really helpful formulation. Perhaps it should appear earlier in the document?	The chapter has changed greatly since the Second Order Draft, this sentence has been removed from the document, yet the idea is now presented early in the chapter.
1318	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	Box 1			Suggest 'natural entities contribute' rather than 'nature contributes' as 'nature' is an abstract noun.	The text has substantially changed
1319	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	607			How do values relate to desires? (open question - thinking about this in relation to environmental virtue ethics, where desire orientates the goal - what we seek to value).	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1320	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	616			Conceptualized' rather than 'conceived'?	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
1321	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	636	22	644	From the outset of this paragraph, establish a clearer binary between a focus on individual wellbeing, and focus on 'collective wellbeing' (line 642).	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1322	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	38	1102			on p 38 reference is made to Pachamama, without defining this allegorical figure. A useful reference is found in Joni Adamson 'Indigenous Literatures, Multinaturalism, and the Avatar: The Emergence of Indigenous Cosmopolitics' American Literary History 24 (2012) pp. 143-162.	Thank you for your comment. The chapter no longer makes reference to Pachamama, however, the reference has been considered to support reviews in other chapters.

1323	Rachel Hosein Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	111				5.7 % of sources from arts and humanities seems disappointingly low for a study focussed on values. Does this reflect the disciplinary expertise of the authors involved?	10% of authors have at least a degree in a humanities subject (see p.103 of SOD). This means that the percentage of sources cited in humanities is lower than the percentage of authors having studied the subject.
1339	Nigel Cooper	Individual	Anglia Ruskin University/Diocese of Ely	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	126	3056			Local communities: Although it is quite right to focus on local communities with very special connections to their natural setting, I believe that much more attention (both in this assessment and in valuation work generally) should be given to local communities within developed nations and cultures. I have lived within villages in southern England most of my life and 'local' people (their own term for themselves) have a special connection to their locality and its nature and a good deal of local knowledge passed down amongst them. This	We thank you for the comment. We agree that local communities are equally important in developed nations and cultures. Although a lot of emphasis has been given to indigenous people in the Global South, a great number of local communities in the Global North contribute to create diverse human-nature relations. In this new version of the manuscript we have included the definition of local community that encompass all local communities around the world. Although, we still have a greater number of examples and experiences from the
1344	Lena Dempewolf	Government	Trinidad and Tobago	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	1	7	234	The executive summary doesn't do the document justice. The executive summary should focus less on the functional mechanics of the value assessment and concisely state what can be found in the following documents. Particularly, it should emphasize that while the chapters focus on outlining evidence and exploring case studies, that key guiding messages are a core feature of these documents.	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary of this chapter was removed and the focus of the chapter, in the new version, is to present the core ideas that the reader can find on the rest of the assessment. As Chapter 1 presents an introduction to the overall assessment, key findings are not summarized in an executive summary as it is common practice in introductory chapters of IPBES assessments'.
1345	Lena Dempewolf	Government	Trinidad and Tobago	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	53	1517	53	1520	This should appear far earlier in the document.	We have now included important ILK content earlier in the document; although, we have keep the section in the same place for coherence
1346	Lena Dempewolf	Government	Trinidad and Tobago	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	1	7	234	The executive summary should also provide a breakdown of the chapters that follow and the intended purpose of each chapter - as it stands, one has to read approximately 80 pages before the "shape" and "feel" of the product become clear. For practitioners trying to consume this, navigating it could become frustrating.	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary was removed from this chapter and the chapter has been modified to make it more concise.
1355	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	32	1	32	In order to cover the audience reference in the next line (including Business), this list should include the Natural Capital Protocol which is the internationally accepted framework for business decision making.	This section was removed.
1356	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	58	9	58	Valuation is the process of recognizing or determining the importance of nature's values' This appears to be a definition and yet is not consistent with other text (e.g., 1.2.3 Valuation line 756-765' and the Glossary.	We have revised the text and it is now consistent with Ch3
1357	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	13	385	13	385	This is covering important movements and should include the development of the Natural Capital Protocol in 2016, which built off TEEB (originally developed by TEEB for Business) and provides an internationally accepted framework for the practical application of natural capital assessments by the private sector. The Protocol Harmonized the 40 different approaches being used by the private sector at the time and is following the same route as the SEEA to become standardized. Whereas the SEEA is included from a public	Many additional assessments have been suggested for inclusion in this section however it is beyond the intended scope to be fully exhaustive given the limited length of this introductory chapter.

1358	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	14	423	15	428	The economics of Land Degradation is important but this does not appear in Figure above. Either it should be included in the figure above like all the other work that is highlighted or it should not be covered in the text.	The reference in text has been removed
1359	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	28	795	28	801	Within this expression of valuation the agreed commonly used definition from the private sector could also be referenced in order to provide the aimed for balance between public and private approaches. The definition used is 'The process of estimating the relative importance, worth or usefulness of natural capital to people (or to a business).' Ref. Natural Capital Coalition. 2016. "Natural Capital Protocol"	Added
1360	Mark Gough	Organisation	Capitals Coalition	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	33	940	33	944	It is worth noting that the SEEA uses market values, whereas most private sector application of valuation focuses on the value to society rather than the value to business. At present this text does not recognize this.	Not clear what this comment refers to in page 33. In line 403 (whole paragraph) the way SEEA uses values is mentioned in an introductory way. Chapter 1 annex offers more explanation about SEEA as well as chapter 4.
1398	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	11	322	11	325	Suggest the replacement of "methodological assessment" with "methodological approach"	We use the term "methodological assessment" because this is what this assessment is (and is mandated to be by IPBES).
1399	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	11	336	11	337	This should readnature's contributions to people (NCP) across economic, ecological and socio-cultural contexts. The explanation is that social and cultural conditions are strongly linked	The text has substantially changed
1413	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	15	438	17	499	Figure 1.2 is not mentioned in the text. I think it could be mentioned at the end of the paragraph in line 438.	Adjusted
1414	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	630	22	630	I think it is better to replace "anthropocentric" with "anthropogenic".	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1415	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	688	25	723	Figure 1.4 could also be mentioned between parenthesis, because it deals with values concepts.	This figure has now been removed from chapter 1

1416	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	33	946	33	946	I suggest inserting a color legend in the figure, to make reading easier.	This figure no longer appears in the chapter, thank you for your comment.
1417	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	42	1219	42	1219	The font of the figure is too small and makes reading difficult.	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
1418	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	0	0	0	0	The valuation of values and weighting of values depend on the stakeholders and often their quantification.	The methods for estimating weightings appear in chapter 3 and chapter 1 directs the reader for such technical issues to chapter 3.
1419	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	0	0	0	0	I believe that it is always important to specify what kind of justice is discussed in each decision-making process.	We agree, and we have tried to address this. For instance, on line 199, justice is understood as a "broad value". Section 1.2.4 outlines the different dimensions of justice that are considered throughout the Values assessment.
1538	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9		9		Box 1.1. There should to mention that the definition of "Diverse values" also depends on time (temporal context, please consult Franquesa, Jaume. (2019). Resources: Nature, value and time. 10.4337/9781788116107.00010.)	The box no long exists
1539	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	17		17		It is recommended to include numerical data on the results of all evaluations, as was done with Pollinators, pollination and food production assessment. For example, for the Land Degradation and Restoration assessment it could be mentioned: "Human-induced soil degradation was found to affect 1,964 million hectares worldwide (15% of the terrestrial land)". Taken from: Scholes, R. J., Montanarella, L., Brainich, E., Barger, N., Ten Brink, B., Cantele, M., & Willemen, L. IPBES (2018): Summary for	This figure is not intended to provide a detailed description of specific findings but rather a broad overview of how past assessments have framed the values of nature
1540	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	603	21	604	Since there is no global government, it is suggested to change the phrase: "... the contributions of various levels of government (global, international, regional, sub-national and local)..." to "the contributions of public actors in several levels (international, regional, sub-national and local)..."	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1541	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	612	21	615	It is suggested to change the phrase: "Some of the key drivers of biodiversity loss, land degradation and climate change are directly linked to the values that underpin ..." to "Some of the key drivers of biodiversity loss, land degradation and climate change are directly and indirectly linked to the values that underpin ...", in order to emphasize the influence of both drivers.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened

1559	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	2	44			suggest: 'conceptualize and interact with'	This sentence has been removed.
1560	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	3	90			suggest: 'capabilities and rights'	This sentence was deleted.
1561	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	5	158			address the fact that reviewing 97% of sources published in English must inherently introduce bias, as this translation away from source languages will necessarily result in a loss of place-based vocabulary?	Thanks We cannot really address this fact. Just acknowledge it
1562	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	7	214			pluralistic perspectives on human-nature relations' - this is a really helpful formulation. Perhaps it should appear earlier in the document?	The chapter has changed greatly since the Second Order Draft, this sentence has been removed from the document, yet the idea is now presented early in the chapter.
1563	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	9	Box 1			Suggest 'natural entities contribute' rather than 'nature contributes' as 'nature' is an abstract noun to which a range of meanings can be attributed.	The text has substantially changed
1564	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	21	607			How do values relate to desires? (open question-thinking about this in relation to environmental virtue ethics, where desire orientates the goal - what we seek to value).	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
1565	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	616			Conceptualized' rather than 'conceived'?	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
1566	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	22	636	22	644	From the outset of this paragraph, establish a clearer binary between a focus on individual wellbeing, and focus on 'collective wellbeing' (line 642).	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened

1567	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	38	1102		on p 38 reference is made to Pachamama, without defining this allegorical figure. A useful reference is found in Joni Adamson 'Indigenous Literatures, Multinaturalism, and the Avatar: The Emergence of Indigenous Cosmopolitics' American Literary History 24 (2012) pp. 143-162.	Thank you for your comment. The chapter no longer makes reference to Pachamama, however, the reference has been considered to support reviews in other chapters.
1568	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	111			5.7 % of sources from arts and humanities seems disappointingly low for a study focussed on values. Does this reflect the disciplinary expertise of the authors involved?	10% of authors have at least a degree in a humanities subject (see p.103 of SOD). This means that the percentage of sources cited in humanities is lower than the percentage of authors having studied the subject.
1589	Samara Martins Silva	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	40			En desacuerdo con el uso del término "Highly" al momento de describir la diversidad de los valores de la naturaleza.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1590	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Enfatizar y poner explícito, determinados métodos de valoración visibiliza o no ciertos valores	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1591	Maria Cruz Gonzalez	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Traducción de los documentos, incluir traductores en plenarios de discusión. Hacer de este un trabajo conjunto, en donde se hacen repetidas revisiones para asegurarse que la traducción es lo más apropiada posible.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1592	Giovanni Ávila Flores	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Teoría de cambio como marco conceptual flexible. ¿Hacia donde va dirigido?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1593	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Enfatizar la presencia e importancia de los cambios que se generan por la inclusión en la perspectiva occidental de la concepción de los valores de la naturaleza por parte de grupos indígenas en latino America.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1594	Giovanni Ávila Flores	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Separación uso y edad entre NCP y SEE.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1595	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	721				Esquema piramidal: Entendida dentro del marco de la economía neoliberal. Valor = Precio. Pensar en indicadores economicos no monetarios, entendido con un paradigma diferente al utilitarista.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1596	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	Fig. 1.6			828	Comentario positivo: frente al reconocimiento de knowledge integration	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1840	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	24	688	25	725	How does this framework draw on established value theories such as theory of basic value (Schwartz) or value-belief-norm theory. A short explanation on how this value pyramid relates to other theories should be included here.	This figure has now been removed from chapter 1
1841	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	710	25	711	What is meant by "if for example only monetary indicators are used to express different value types". Do you mean that you can make values consumerable by using monetary indicators? It is unclear.	Now line 211: Values may be conemmerable using monetary and some non-monetary indicators. We have removed the explicit reference to monetary here to avoid confusion. These issues are expanding in chapterr 2
1842	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	25	712	25	713	"an individual is likely to possess values across the different levels of the pyramid (e.g., broad or specific values)" is confusing. I assumed that the pyramids reflect nestedness, i.e. that worldviews matters for the broad values people or organisations have, which minifest themselves as specific values that can be measured or assessed? Is this the same as held and assigned values? And what about the relationship between moral, values and beliefs?	We have replaced this figure with Fig 1.3, which helps to avoid the idea that different values types my be nested as this was not what we were aiming to potray.
1843	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	29	828	29	828	Figure 1.6. portray co-production as a way of capacity to recognize and include a greater diversity of values but this is not always the case. Co-production takes time, which means that fewer people could participate. On the contrary co-production of knowledge could result in concentration of power to the few who are representing the community or the public. Or, it may leave out the silent majority that is not actively participating in valuation processes.e.g. Greg Brown & Henry Eckold (2020) An evaluation of public participation information	This figure has been removed
1844	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	32	927	32	927	Isn't it more appropriate to refer to this type of decision-making as socio-cultural rather than socio-environmental?	The chapter uses socio-environmental as culture is often connected to the "social" and the types of decisions the assessment focuses on are about the environment.
1845	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	33	945	33	945	The use of civil society milieu is confusing when you have civil society as your actors as well. Remove civil society milieu?	Thank you for your comment, we've removed the reference to milieu when possible. Reference to this concept, however, remains in one of the Annexes only when needed.

1858	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	19	567			The term 'women' should be included like one of the groups of this assessment, given that valuation is different and is affected due to lack of access to lands, resources and decision-making processes	Issues of gender for Ch1 will be included in the Justice subsection
1859	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	127	3080			It is not only self-determination, but also rights over the land and rights referring previous fundamented consent (this last one is a way of expressing values of indigenous communities prior to a project)	Thank you for the comment. We discuss the issue of rights in more detail in Chapter 5.
1863	Fatima Manji	Government	UK	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	11	1	12	Suggest adding the prefix 'UN' Sustainable Development Goals in this first reference to them in the document. Also to note that references to the 'post-2020 biodiversity framework' are inconsistent throughout the report (sometimes including reference to CBD and sometimes excluding it - probably need to be careful as to what entity the 'post-2020 biodiversity framework' is linked to, and if that is indeed necessary (because those involved are many).	Thank you for your comment, this has been taken into consideration in the chapter and the references will be edited accordingly in the final version of the document.
1864	Fatima Manji	Government	UK	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	1	29	1	33	Could also reference the Dasgupta Review (and potentially) The Economics of Land Degredation (ELD) in the example list, noting these are first referenced (further down in the report) on pages 13 and 14 and to bring consistency.	We appreciate your comment, both documents are now included in the example list
1872	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	57	1586	57	1586	The map should be projected to the robinson projection (https://ict.ipbes.net/geoinformation/technical-guidelines/conversion-to-the-robinson-projection) and the underlying data should be within a data deposit package	Thank you for yur comment. All maps in the assessment will follow IPBES rules of procedure in their final preparation.
1873	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	105	2878	105	2882	The maps should be projected to the robinson projection (https://ict.ipbes.net/geoinformation/technical-guidelines/conversion-to-the-robinson-projection)	Thank you for yur comment. All maps in the assessment will follow IPBES rules of procedure in their final preparation.
1882	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	91	2552	92	2566	Figure: 1.17 - In the figure there is no shade yellow as mentioned in line 2566 of the text	Thank you for your comment, this has been corrected.
1883	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	106	2885	106	2885	Figure 1.24. - The name of the figure is not consistent with all the word cloud figures	We've revised this, the name of the figure is correct.

1884	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment	113	2943	113	2943	Figure 1.28. - The name of the figure is not consistent with all the word cloud figures	We've revised this, the name of the figure is correct.
1901	Samara Martins Silva	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		40			Disagree with the use of the term "Highly" when describing the diversity of nature's values.	Thank you for your comment, this term is no longer used in the Chapter.
1902	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Emphasize and make explicit, how some valuation methods make certain values visible or not	In ch1 this is covered in the discussions of plurality in valuation. Ch3 goes into more detail on this very topic
1903	Maria Cruz Gonzalez	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Translation of documents, include translators in plenary discussions. Make this a joint work, where repeated revisions are made to ensure that the translation is as appropriate as possible.	done.
1904	Giovanni Ávila Flores	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Theory of change as a flexible conceptual framework. Where is it headed?	The ToC section has been removed
1905	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Emphasize the importance of including the conception of the values of nature by indigenous groups in Latin America.	Thank you for the comment. We have dedicated a great effort in various chapter in the cross assessment case study of the philosophies of good living where Latin American perspectives of Indigenous groups are prominent.
1906	Giovanni Ávila Flores	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Separation of use and suitability between NCP and SEE.	Thanks We have discussed the links between NCP and ecosystem services in an appendix
1907	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		721			Pyramid scheme: Understood within the framework of the neo-liberal economy. Value = Price. Think about non-monetary economic indicators, understood with a different paradigm from the utilitarian one.	Pyramid figure is replaced with Fig 1.3. We do not suggest that value only equals price. In th assessment we also emphasis a range of non-monetary indicators that reflect different paradigms.

1908	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				828	Fig. 1.6 Positive comment: in front of the recognition of knowledge integration	This figure has been removed in the third order draft
1974	ESP-LAC - Andres Vargas	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					IPBES is normative (in its name) it is difficult to speak 'neutrally' in a document like this, because the themes pass through political positions. The theme of plural values means that there are people who do not agree with other approaches.	Thank you for this comment, it has been considered.
2086	Kamaljit Sangha	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					From chapter 1 page 57. Bias towards America, Asia you can find a lot of not monetary values, not many communities from Australia are reported, getting benefits from nature and not about human responsibilities towards nature	This graph is about the origin of experts, not about communities reported. Regional balance is achieved in the assessment although within regions, some countries are more represented than others.
2087	Kamaljit Sangha	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Looking at Ch. 1 p. 57. The diverse academic and cultural background of the authors. It is biased towards the Americas. Not much representation from Asia-Pacific, their views might not be fully represented. For example the IPBES CF not reflecting human responsibility towards nature.	This graph is about the origin of experts, not about communities reported. Regional balance is achieved in the assessment although within regions, some countries are more represented than others.
2089	Kamaljit Sangha	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					There are instrumental, relational values in bushfire management. They are also delivering ecosystem services to Australia. There are great examples in the North of Australia related to bushfire. Chapter 1 seems to be missing a lot related to that.	We aim to provide illustrative examples of the different value types; but it is not possible to cover all examples.
2092	Muniyandi Balasubramanian	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		93		95	For example, in India, there are number of cultures have followed by different types of community. Therefore, need some more clarity on culture ecosystem services and local decision making. How traditional cultural aspects consider at the decision.	Thanks This has been substantially revised
2093	Muniyandi Balasubramanian	Individual	Workshop - ESP (AP)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		110		111	How institutional (political or power) change impacts on integrating value of ecosystem services into the local decision making.	This has been significantly clarified
2098	Fernando Santos Martin	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Clearly present which are the new results presented by this Assessment in comparison with the Global and Regional Assessments. I have the feeling many of these topics and results were already covered on those assessments.	Figure 1.2 explains the main findings of the Regional and Global Assessments. The Values Assessment, unlike the Regional and Global Assessments, is a methodological assessment which provides very different types of information (see section 1.1.3). Figure 1.11 provides a more in-depth overview of the questions addressed throughout the VA.

2103	Kateřina Kaprová	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					If previous IPBES assessments were considered as stepping stones for this assessment, I wonder what are the plans for future steps - for now, IPBES reports sum up the state-of-the-art and defines the ways forward; and then we need quick action I suppose :-). - develop new methods and fill these "blind research spots" that the reports identified. I wonder how this is planned to be done, since IPBES perhaps does not aim for publishing "its own" research (?), but at the same time, a lot of researchers are members of IPBES - so perhaps through both pushing	The Values Assessment aims to provide conceptual and practical tools to aid policymakers in the recognition and accounting of nature's values in different decision-making contexts
2104	Katerina Kaprova	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		2242		2253	I guess it is already covered somewhere (the report is huge and I did not manage to go through everything); and this report is on global, not local level, but :-). While it is essential to stress out that there are other knowledge systems than western (which I agree dominates now the discourse of nature resources management AND the whole research), it would be nice to stress out that also some groups of subjects within the western countries hold different concept of "values" than "most of people" in	Thanks. This is extensively addressed in Ch2 and Ch4
2107	Stoyan Nedkov	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Conceptual-terminological issue: Values of nature is the main focus of this assessment. How does this relate to the benefits of nature within the whole nature.	Annex 1 now provides a wider discussion on different aspects of the values of nature
2110	Sebastian Villasante	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					How does the assessment address challenges and issues regarding multidimensional valuation in marine ecosystems?	Beyond the scope of Ch1. Chapter 3 provides additional information on different types of valuation
2111	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Include arts. Not very many chapters include it, so a review on the topic and how values are expressed in arts would be important.	Beyond the scope of Ch1. Chapter 2 touches upon this topic in more detail. Ch5 undertakes an interesting review of scenarios depict in art
2112	Vera Helene Hausner	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The assessment points to the need of having pluralistic valuation in a manner that respects others values and knowledge systems, while also facing multiple economic interests. Example of the Barnts Sea in Norway, where exploitation is done through ecosystem based management plans, local fisheries are also included, but what about the general public? You can also concentrate power in the hands of few. Need to recognise the risks of knowledge co-production in the context of plural valuation i.e., knowledge co-production can also lead	Ch1 touches upon the issue of power and power asymmetries in several places. However the following chapters touch upon this topic in much greater depth. See Ch2, Ch3, Ch4 and Ch6
2115	Hristina Prodanova	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Please consider the quality of the figures! A lot of them are not readable due to low resolution, small font size, etc. E.g. fig. 1.16 (ch.1); fig. 2.8 part 2 of 5 (ch. 2); fig. 3.4. (ch 3);..	Thank you for your comment. All figures will be improved in format for the final version.
2116	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		67		68	There seems to be some inconsistency between the definition of 'value monism' and what is stated here about single vs plural values/valuation. I think this one here is a more neutral and preferable way of addressing the question of single vs plural values.	Thanks this has been substantially revised

2117	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		100		101	I wonder whether trade is always a voluntary action. Or at least, the creation of markets, which can be a function of a public actor, may 'force' land-owners into the production of certain types of produce. This is the case of international markets driving land-use change and intensification (including deforestation) with important consequences for the environment and biodiversity. From a land-owner perspective making decisions on the land, this is likely not completely voluntary.	More discussion on this is found in Ch4. This is only a short summary
2118	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		213			A definition of "theory of change" is missing in the Glossary. Is the question of considering pluralistic values implicit in 'theory of change'? Isn't it a more generic methodology for better planning and evaluation of changes that we wish to achieve?	A deep review of the theory of change is now included in an Annex of Chapter 1.
2119	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		607		608	There may be circumstances in which the consequences of actions are not well-understood, it is not always a question of interest in economic values, for instance.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
2120	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		607		615	There are many steps where 'unsustainable' decisions are taken, and where may different values and motivations can be expressed from the production system of a product to consumption behaviours.	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
2121	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		630		631	Anthropocentric or anthropogenic? I think this refers to the latter. Also, the question of co-construction of NCP is confusing. One can imagine a range from complete natural function to substitution of the natural function by man-made structures. It is useful (and particularly didactic and informative) to be able to distinguish what is the contribution from nature (NCP) and what is the anthropogenic contribution. We need a new concept for the product that is the combination/co-production of nature and human action. It is very	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
2122	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		636			See my comments to the Glossary regarding the biological/ecological importance of life systems for humanity (which is independent on socially constructed (multiple) values. How do the value 'types' described in lines 729-730 relate to the fundamental importance of the integrity of the life system to support mankind? Are there some value types driven by ignorance or by an illusion that biodiversity is endless whatever kind of management we choose, or by simply a lack of understanding of the potential damaging power of technology and the	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
2123	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		802		809	please, see my earlier reference to value monism. I think how the question of pluralism and singularism is treated better here.	Noted
2124	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1099		1104	But sustainable practices by IPLCs (based on deep rooted values), do not exclude unsustainable use, in the case of for instance, population growth and/or lack of knowledge of long-term effects.	The text this comment refers to has been deleted.

2125	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1108		1109	the question of the physical footprint of humans on nature within or beyond sustainable use ranges is a non-anthropocentric feature.	We agree with this statement.
2126	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1110			The question about who bears the cost of unsustainable use is future mankind.	We agree with this statement.
2127	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1114			Technology and 'anthropogenic assets' cannot replace the role of human beings in the life-system.	We agree with this statement.
2128	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment		1170		1172	One can also think that a certain level of damage is acceptable and will vary in space and time. One could think of mechanisms that would decrease the risk by small-holders of loosing income (e.g. insurance against natural damage) rather than subsidizing the use of pesticides. So the question is identifying who pays the costs, but also to find new solutions to, in this case, the food production challenges. There is also considerable waste of food, so temporarily decrease in yields may not be as critical as it was understood earlier.	This is an interesting idea but we had to cut the length of this section as the chapter was already too long. We had no room to explore this suggestion.
2193	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Suggested ref on Transformation Folke, C., Polasky, S., Rockström, J. et al. Our future in the Anthropocene biosphere. <i>Ambio</i> 50, 834–869 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1007/s13280-021-01544-8	Thank you for your reference suggestion.
2224	Luthando Dziba	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The term "incremental change" is used as a step to...or equivalent to "transformative change"? If we have coined a concept like "transformative change" in Global 2019 my opinion is that we must be loyal to it and prefer it over others.	We appreciate your comment the term "incremental change" is no longer used in the chapter.
2225	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					"Values are representations of what people and society care about". It seems too simplified. Values is a complex concept that include beliefs, power, social political gendered pressures. Individuals are not free to care or not about something. Values can be imposed. As sometimes the possibility to care is constrained by several factors	We agree and yet how to portray this in a relatively simple way. Did our best to include this complexity in a simple way
2226	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Power, politics, gender are missing	We appreciate your comment, these topics are now included in the assessment.

2227	Graciela Rusch	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It is important to relate these conditions for plural value with the post normal science Funtowicz & Ravetz paper. Science for the post-normal age https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-3287(93)90022-L .	Yes this is now more clearly described and the reference is included
2228	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					and also CONTEXT	This sentence was deleted.
2229	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					There are huge amount of real cases in which public actors don't serve the 'public interest' but the "power" groups interests.	This paragraph has been deleted.
2230	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					delete "in the production of this assessment"	This sentence was deleted.
2231	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					"While the Values Assessment acknowledges that IPLCs do not inherently hold harmonious relations with nature..." I would change this statement to "While the Values Assessment acknowledges that IPLCs show diversity in their relations with nature",	This sentence was deleted.
2232	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					An effort must be made to expand the sources and be more diverse by incorporating other aspects, such as material from environmental NGOs, young people movements, animal rights groups, minorities, gender, etc ...	Thanks. We did try very hard, encompassing a much wider diversity than previous assessments but there are limits given by the rules of procedure, the time frame and many other constraints
2233	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The way the group of authors is described is very nice. Perhaps the MC should be briefly described.	Thanks. Done
2234	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					I would prefer not to use incremental, just TRANSFORMATIVE	We appreciate your comment the term "incremental change" is no longer used in the chapter.

2235	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					I would prefer to use transformative only	We appreciate your comment, we have made the changes according to your suggestion.
2236	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The title is not clear, needs rewriting	This sentence no longer exists.
2237	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					institutional, political, economical, ethnical that would...	This sentence was removed.
2238	GYBN Mexico	Organisation	GYBN Mexico	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The box with definitions is very clear	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2239	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The objectives are well described	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2240	Esther Turnhout	Organisation	Wageningen University, the Netherlands	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Table 1.1 is very clear	Thank you
2241	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The international policy docs are well described. A good introduction on non ipbes approaches to values	Thank you
2242	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Well described the values issues in the previous and ongoing IPBES assessments. It would be interesting to make a comparative weight of "values" in the different regional assessments. In some continents economics are prioritized while in others no.	Beyond the intended scope of the section, which is merely meant to provide a descriptive overview

2243	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Linking the Values Assessment to the IPBES conceptual framework...IS NICE!!!	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2244	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					"Human choices depend on the things that are considered important (or valued)" Is simplistic unreal. Human choices depends a lot on constrains, difficulties, scarcity at least in the global south	Thank you for your comment. The text in question has been removed as the section has been significantly shortened
2245	Sandra Díaz	Individual	CONICET & Universidad Nacional de Cordoba, Argentina	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Does the "non-human living world" include GMOs and Syntetic Biology Organisms?	We do not have specific evidence on this from our review. So, we are unable to specify this explicitly in th text
2246	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					"Among many IPLCs, nature is often viewed as inextricably linked to humans" it can include a quote by Eglee Zent	Thank you for your comment. Eglee Zent is quoted as part of the assessment, she is also a contributing author of this chapter and Ch. 3 and she is an author of Ch. 2. Her views are reflected in this document.
2247	Romarc Jannel	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					delete "people's"	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
2248	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Fig 1.6 is very clear (I love its colors)	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2249	Vera Helene Hausner	Organisation	UiT-the Arctic University of Norway	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					GREAT to have postnormal SCIENCE here! It would be great to have Silvio on board on the Values Asses.	Thank you
2250	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					the figure is very clear	Positive feedback is appreciated.

2251	Bibiana Vilá	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					IN PAGE 3 lines 99-102, there are only THREE interactions, and in this paragraph we have four, CONFLICT is here but not at the beginning of the doc.	This has now been edited.
2252	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Power relations can determine who and how many are the actors. This is very basic and is at the beginning of everything. Power allows some to participate or not.	The chapter only introduces the idea that power relations between different actors can influence what values are taken into account in the decisions made and influence the resulting outcomes. Chapter 2 and chapter 4 deal with issues about power relations and values more deeply.
2253	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It is time to think about degrowth in some arts of the world, isn't it?	We agree, and degrowth is now mentioned in section 1.3
2254	Rachel Nisbet	Individual	University of Leeds Postdoctoral Researcher	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					very interesting and challenging questions	Thank you for your comment.
2255	Rita de Cássia Santos de Souza	Government	Municipal Government of Angra dos Reis	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					the figure is clear and nice, I would present the words bogger	Thank you for your comment. Editorial aspects will be checked for the last version of the document
2256	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					fig 1.11 is well designed and clear	Thank you
2257	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					I would prefer not to give a lot of space for the incremental that some researchers think is a way of greenwashing. What about the "TRANSITIONS TO SUSTAINABLE PATHWAYS" of the GBOS? (in fact my opinion is that existing IPBES Global 2019, GBOS was unnecessary. The overlapping of those documents is a duplication of efforts	The text in question has been removed
2258	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					the double loop concept is very nice	Thank you

2259	Luthando Dziba	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Why we never include the degrowth ideas? Are they so subversive? This a question, a lot of people think is a good idea for the north. The document is a bit "conservative" with little space for different genealogy of ideas	Section 1.3 now mentions degrowth
2260	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					IPLC is well presented	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2261	Steven M. Alexander	Government	Government of Canada	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It would also be good to point out that most of the environmental martyrs are indigenous or from local communities.	Thanks for the comment. We haven't get into much detail but highlight the importance of indigenous peoples and local communities for environmental conservation
2262	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					In February 2021? This is not hapening	Thank you for your comment, this has been corrected.
2263	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					It would also be good to point out that most of the environmental martyrs are indigenous or from local communities.	This is mentioned on lines 464-467
2264	Demian Willette	Individual	Loyola Marymount University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					In general the chapter is very clear, a bit stuck at the beginning, the reading becomes more fluid towards the end. In my opinion it presents the theme/situation very well and generates a certain enthusiasm to read what comes next, an ideal condition for a first chapter. It is interesting how it sincerely presents its own biases, but since they are so clear, efforts should be increased to diversify the sources of information at least.	We thanks the review for this comment. We did try very hard to address the biases and to acknowledge them. That is the best we can do
2312	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					General: This Chapter reads very well. It makes a very strong positive impression as the opening chapter of the assessment. It achieves its purpose of setting the tone for the following chapters and for the assessment as a whole. The language is quite accessible and less jargony	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2313	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Should we not refer to JUST and more sustainable futures? A more just and sustainable future is need (not just a sustainable future that perpetuates the current social-ecological inequities and injustices). Similarly in line 26 and elsewhere where applicable. Again see lines 301-302. Yet elsewhere in the chapter, these two terms are used together. Perhaps a more consistent approach is needed to reflect the importance of these two concepts together and why in some respects they are inseparable (see lines 1054-1055 for the interdependencies	Thanks for noting this, the change has been made.

2314	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The following statement is rather confusing as a part of the definition of values in the key messages. Perhaps its missing the context provided inside the chapter. I rather suggest a phrasing that suggest that understanding values contributes to knowledge generation and such knowledge can be used in decision making via consensus building in negotiations etc etc	This sentence has been removed.
2315	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The inclusion of ILK and the explicit and elaborate effort to explain how this was done for the assessment is positive and reinforces what has been done in earlier assessments such as the GA. It also helps with expanding the world views considered by the assessment.	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
2316	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The Key Messages in the Executive Summary represent a more elaborate narrative of sections of the chapter. I suggest that as the Chapter is revised, these are kept more crisp and focus on the key messages that will eventually be in the SPM. It is a lot of work for the expert team to develop key messages for the Chapter and then some more for the SPM.	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary of this chapter was removed and the focus of the chapter, in the new version, is to present the core ideas that the reader can find on the rest of the assessment. As Chapter 1 presents an introduction to the overall assessment, key findings are not summarized in an executive summary as it is common practice in introductory chapters of IPBES assessments'.
2317	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Why is it necessary to include key message 7 in the Executive Summary? Is it to demonstrate the legitimacy of the diversity of values considered? This type of process related information would not belong to the Executive Summary in many assessments. It is adequately covered in the main text of the chapter	We appreciate your comment, the Executive Summary of this chapter was removed and the focus of the chapter, in the new version, is to present the core ideas that the reader can find on the rest of the assessment. As Chapter 1 presents an introduction to the overall assessment, key findings are not summarized in an executive summary as it is common practice in introductory chapters of IPBES assessments'.
2318	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The sections that review the use of "Values of nature in assessments not related to IPBES and in international policy documents" and "Values in previous and ongoing IPBES assessments" are quite comprehensive but high level. They enable one to see this work in context, including clear linkages to the IPBES Conceptual Framework.	Thank you
2319	Judith Fisher	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The language in parts quite deeply complex - I wonder whether this is necessitated by the fact that this is the first comprehensive assessment of values in IPBES and the need for a common typology for the assessment. I fear though that many non academic readers (especially policy makers) may get lost in the many definitions. I refer in particular to the necessary but complex differentiation between values, valuation and valuation methods.	The language has been simplified and is now more accessible to a very general readership.
2320	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The use of infographics in the chapter is excellent and enhances understanding of many rather complex concepts. A lot hangs on how the chapter explains the concepts that will be used in the assessment. A very good attempt has been made in this regard, which inadvertently also means the chapter tends to be heavy on jargon. It's a double edged sword. But the infographics carry very well the burden of simplifying the language used in the chapter.	Positive feedback is appreciated.
2321	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Figure 1.12 needs to be enlarged significantly (to be at least twice the current size to be eligible). The center of the SDG ring should perhaps have the SDG acronym for ease of reference for the reader not familiar with this area of work. Could the SDG wheel be slightly enlarged?	Thank you for your comment. All figures will be improved in format for the final version.

2322	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					In Figure 1.12, the use of transformative change is in the context of the values assessment. However, this is not clear. Perhaps a way to make this clear is needed.	Figure 1.12 has been removed
2323	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Consistency in the citation of IPBES SPMs and assessment reports. Some reports have names of editors, others don't. Some have weblinks while others don't. This is perhaps minor detail in the bigger scheme of things.	Thank you for your comment. References will be edited on the final version of the document.
2324	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					This is small but important reference to the IPBES Pandemics Report. Perhaps a stronger link to the Values Assessment will be made by the other chapters. The drivers of pandemics are at the core of the debate about the multiple conceptualization of values. Although the origins of the virus were quite local, its epidemiology has had devastating global impacts on social and economic systems. The impacts on biodiversity have not yet been fully quantified.	Despite the need to significantly shorten the chapter, a reference to the Workshop Report on Biodiversity and Pandemics of the Intergovernmental Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services has been kept in section 1.3
2325	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Please double check for consistency: is it transformative changes or transformational changes?	Noted
2326	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Figure 1.14 is very telling in terms of the representation of world views based on where the experts come from. I don't think any assessment can have an expert from each country but there are wide gaps in Africa and Asia. Is there a mechanism to ensure these wide gaps can be covered in terms of representation of the assessed world views and values?	Current IPBES process works at the region scale. Indeed, while regional balance is respected, authors tend to come from particular countries within those regions!
2327	Madhav Karki	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Annexures: This chapter is not long if the Annexures are left out of the chapter. The question that must be addressed is about the additional value the annexures add to the Chapter. The first three concept notes relate to components of the Conceptual Framework of IPBES. What additional information is added here other than what is in the chapter. The same question applies to the typology annexure and the other annexures.	The annexes are used to provide more detail on key aspects that directly relate to the main sections of the chapter.
2368	Austin Himes	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Indigenous and local knowledge (ILK) can also provide information, methods, theory and practice for sustainable use of wild species	Indeed. But this is not the mandate of this assessment
2369	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					Figure 1.23, To avoid political problem, remove borders between countries	Thank you for your comment. All maps in the assessment will follow IPBES rules of procedure in their final preparation.

2370	Juana Mariño	Individual	Policy Function Task Force	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Figure 1,14, To avoid political problem,remove borders between countries	Noted.
2371	Maria Cristina Weyland Vieira	Organisation	Association of Private Nature Reserves of Minas Gerais - Brazil	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				In this paragraph it is necessary also to allude to the Nagoya process (2010) regardind the Access and Benefit Sharing (ABS) related to the use of wild species	This topic is out of the scope of the Values Assessment, is more related to the Wild Species Assessment.
2372	Sian Sullivan	Organisation	Bath Spa University	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Need to give the definition of ABS in the document	The definition of ABS is in other UN documents and its beyond the scope of this assessment.
2373	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				In this paragraph, it is necessary also to allude to the loss of pollination and pollinators wich affects biodiversity and NCP and therefore the quality of life and human well-being. The loss of biodiversity and NCP could laid to the loss of Indigenous and Local Knowledge	This is an interesting idea but we had to cut the length of this section as the chapter was already too long. We had no room to explore this suggestion.
2374	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Need also to mention of another justice at the level of the human use of biodiversity and also at the level of the contribution of people to nature.	NCPs are already mentioned in that text. We do not understand what else is required to improve the paragraph.
2375	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				There is also a need to mention the rock engravings which reflect a great knowledge of ILPCs and also gives information about their lifestyle over time.	Thanks for the comment. We have now included several case studies across the chapters that reflect this and other human-nature interactions. This is explained in the ILK annex of Chapter 1.
2376	Mohamed Sghir Taleb	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Figure 1,22 To avoid political problem, remove borders between countries	Thank you for yur comment. All maps in the assessment will follow IPBES rules of procedure in their final preparation.
2377	Carolyn Lundquist	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment				Authors schould also explore evidence on how knowledge of the diverse range of values (including capturing ILK) might be used for successful ecosystems restoration.	Sounds really relevant but we did not have enough space to address this topic

2382	Luthando Dziba	MEP		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					This seems weak that environmental factors become subsumed by the three other human-centric typologies. There should be also the factors that decision making centers will consider the values solely from the environmental, natural and scientific (data based) perspective irrespective of how it impacts human orientated goals. This is missing from this values assessment.	Thank you We have tried to be as encompassing as possible and address the values of nature irrespective of human needs
2383	Kwame Fredua	Government	Environmental Protection Agency Ghana	Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					The instrumental values of nature is now missing in this values assessment.	In section 1.2.1 instrumental values are defined and placed alongside the other types of values covered in the assessment
2384	Guadalupe Yesenia Hernández Márquez	Individual		Chapter 1. Introducing the Values Assessment					To link values with nature, it should be included the values from science based perspectives.	We have added some text to make visible the different perspectives