

ID	Reviewer Name	Category	Affiliation	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comments	Response
17	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	49	2	49	UNDRIP is not explained or defined (rights of indigenous people)- suggest include in definitions/ acronyms list	Thanks for your suggestion. Accepted.
18	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There seem to be more than usual grammatical errors in this Chapter! E.g. line 117 'who's values', line 551 'what values that have been considered' (instead of what values have been considered), line 863-4 'works in some respects, for instance secures in encouraging efficiency and innovation', p44 'Scenario's -what are they', p69 'the ability of PAs to safeguards key habitats...are based on...' etc. Sorry to nitpick but it really detracts from the quality of the work!	Thank you for your comment. Wording has been improved and spelling has been corrected.
19	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	35		36		Figures (5.9) need a key to colour codes please	Thanks. We considered your suggestion for this figure.
20	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Would the incidence and/or frequency of natural hazards (floods, landslides, fires, zoonotic disease spread, etc) not provide leverage for changes in values and behaviour? I cannot find anything to this effect in this chapter.	Natural disasters could possibly be a powerful lever. However, our chapter is about what people and decision-makers can do - and that does not include natural disasters.
21	Brownlie, Susie	Individual	deVilliers Brownlie Associates	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Could futures works / visioning in SEA practice (as is the usual approach) not be used to good effect in transformation to improved consideration of nature/ NCP? Could this point perhaps be made?	The comment was unclear, however the section containing future works was improved.
258	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter talks about how to build the future from a justice perspective, but it is necessary to focus on the present to improve the specific injustices identified	Agreed, this is the focus of for ch4 and ch 6.
259	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not address the issue of Gender as the basis for the constitution of socio-environmental injustices. This is a serious problem because the report takes them in a very general and HOMOGENEOUS way. For example, categories such as "the indigenous" are spoken of as if they were homogeneous groups. It is also necessary to justify the way in which the consultations were made to certain indigenous groups in order to better represent a particular region.	This topic is further addressed in Chapter 4. There is a recognition of the gap regarding this topic in chapter 5.

260	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There is a lack of recognition of how certain groups such as women, youth or LGBT groups are taking the lead in conserving and valuing nature in radically different ways.	There is a recognition of the gap regarding this topic. However there was a collective effort to include this in the last version of the chapter.
261	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not take into consideration the role of violence and how it frames socio-environmental problems and conflicts.	This topic is further addressed in Chapter 4.
262	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Regarding Justice, the chapter does not question that there are values of nature that are detrimental to justice	Box 5.7 mentions trade-offs between different values and potential conflicts between different people holding different values
263	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The concepts of Justice and Sustainability are not explicitly defined. Just as the idea of VALUE is being built, it is necessary to co-construct the idea of Sustainability and Justice. It is suggested that this be incorporated at the beginning of the chapter	In section 5.1.2. all definitions are provided
264	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not explain where the different values of nature come from, and above all how they will contribute to generating more justice and sustainability.	Thanks for the comment, we have tried to refine the text in addressing this comment.
265	Ana de Luca	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There are no references in languages other than English. This denotes that there are problems to incorporate other voices around the assessment presented	An effort to include references in languages other than English was done across all of the assessment. In the cross chapter study on Good Living Philosophies, multiple languages were included and coded in English. All these references are available in the DMR.
266	Marcela Torres	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter assumes that government actors will seek environmental objectives incorporating new values, but the State is heterogeneous and sometimes contradictory. It does not capture how you can deal with the issue of political and economic elites (private actors, above all). Important actors and processes are lacking, such as the criminalization of social movements	We agree, even when this goes beyond the scope of the chapter we've tried to mention this matter. More information on this can be found in Chapter 6.
267	Azahara Mesa	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					It is not clear Who is the chapter aimed at?	Thanks for your comment, we've considered this while working in the final content of the chapter.

268	Azahara Mesa	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter should make an effort to explain explicitly how power and its asymmetries reduce the possibility that everything the chapter suggests will be put into practice.	Thanks for your comment. Power is now introduced more systematically in ch. 4 and here we refer more briefly to the challenges of incumbent powers
269	Azahara Mesa	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter seems to be all-encompassing, and the topic of NCPs falls short	Thanks for your comments. This was improved for the final version of the chapter.
270	Silvia Ruiz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					It is clear that the publication is the result of a great effort. However, for someone who is not an expert on the subject, it is very difficult to read. The summary of the chapter should make another effort to make it much clearer and shorter, especially considering that the target audience has different backgrounds, so it would be important to use simpler language and use clear images and figures to interpret	Thanks for your comment. The whole chapter went through a revision to make it clearer and easier to read.
271	Silvia Ruiz	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The Millennium Ecosystem Assessment model can be taken to make a clearer and more direct summary of both the chapter and the SPM. Also, it is necessary to land the ideas in non-prescriptive actions or lines of action, which can guide public policies, and thus go beyond a scientific discussion, which is very interesting and necessary, but many decision makers need examples or guides of what to do to address the situation	Thanks, for the comment, we how this assessment and its associated SPM will have the same effect
272	Rafael Calderón-Contreras	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Justify why the topic of "Transformative change" is included in this chapter	Thank you. The chapter is about futures and transformative change is now a critical agenda in futures literature.
273	Rafael Calderón-Contreras	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There is a disconnection of the title from the content of the chapter. Why, if "transformative change" has so much weight in the content, was it not included in the title?	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, the final version of the chapter's title was changed.
274	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					It is necessary to summarize the introduction making the key message clearer	Thanks for the comment. This text has changed substantially.
275	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter contains two different sections, and it is not clear how they are linked (Literature review and how assessment is retaken in decision-making for the future)	Thank you. We have made considerable effort in our revision to integrate these parts more effectively.

276	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					This chapter is missing the concept of "Scenario Planning" which is mentioned only once in a table. In many places it is referenced, but not clearly explained or defined. Having this conceptual approach could help to link various sections of the second part	Thanks for your comment. There was an effort to make this concept and its use clearer.
277	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Why is the concept of sustainability explained in this chapter? It should be part of the general introduction	Sustainability is also part of the general introduction. However, it is of particular relevance for this chapter and therefore is explained in more detail, especially in its relation to justice.
278	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					If the decision is to leave out the gender issue, make the reasons explicit	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
279	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Chapter 5 recreates the Global Assessment exercise that considered the issue of transformations, however it is not clear why these two parts are in one chapter	This section has been substantially reworked to balance and align the cases and we have added two further cases, no additional detail was possible.
280	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not take into consideration the issue of education, which is key to socio-environmental transformation.	We agree and performed changes in accordance to the reviewer suggestion.
281	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not mention that "Scenario planning" or the construction of scenarios should create spaces for discussion about what matters and what would be the implications of not properly assessing nature and its contributions to the quality of human life. Without these spaces for exchange and interrelation between actors and stakeholders, it is not feasible to achieve a transformation	Thank you for this comment, we have added text in line 374 which states that "Furthermore, they highlight a role for values in transformation and that scenario planning or futuring processes can assist in surfacing multiple values, creating spaces for negotiating and assessing trade-offs and synergies to identify opportunities for transformation.
282	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Don't use pie charts, better bar / line diagrams	Thanks. Your suggestion was considered when editing the diagrams.
283	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Figure 5.12 What is the relationship with values?	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.

284	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Section 5.2.2.4 Title should state Key gaps identified (word order)	Fixed. Thanks for pointing this.
285	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Transformation and education is not mentioned, when knowledge plays a very important role for the "values-knowledge-action-transformation"	Thanks for the suggestion. Formal and informal education are mentioned within 5.3.2.5. Yet we apologise we can not go very deep into this topic. However Chapter 6 also has a section on education.
286	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Transformation and political will are not mentioned, while the lack of political will has been the greatest obstacle to change	Thanks for your comment. This can now be found within section 5.3.3
287	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					It is necessary to summarize the chapter, it is too long	We have tried to performe the changes in accordance to the reviewer suggestion.
288	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					In transformations, you have to be more explicit about how values affect decision-making	Thank you for this suggestion. This is now mentioned specifically under sub-section 5.3.3., and is also emerging from the content of sub-section 5.3.
289	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					In Figure 5.4 it is not clear that there are two approaches, the blue arrow implies that it is a process that links the two approaches	Thanks. Your suggestion was considered when editing the figure.
290	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					In section 5.2.2.1 are sections b and c empty?	Thanks for pointing this. Hopefully the new structure of the chapter makes this clearer.
291	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The outline of the chapter doesn't really add anything, it is better to remove it for the extension, it is also included in section 5.2.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.

292	Melanie Kolb	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The section on values in archetypes is very interesting. It is suggested to make the implication for the "Scenario planning" more explicit using archetypes	Thank you for this comment, we have edited sections 5.2.2.3 and hope that this has addressed your comment
293	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter does not give a preamble for those who are only going to read the chapter. It does not make clear to whom it is intended and what theoretical or methodological tools are required to capture the message of the chapter more clearly. Perhaps the solution is to introduce the glossary at the beginning of the chapter	The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
294	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Starting from "Green economy" and "earth stewardship" does not contemplate more complex schemes that originate from southern social movements	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed. However, other case studies were integrated in the final text.
295	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter addresses very well the role of Art in embracing transformative change.	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
296	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Depending on the audience, the content could be defined (how technical and /or extensive it could be). You could think of the chapter content as part of a book or the chapter as a product in itself	Thanks for this valuable comment.
297	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					What is the period that is considered as the future horizon? If it's 2030, there should be a much longer vision of the future	We did not omit future scenarios based on their time spans, thus some scenarios did have shorter (e.g. 2030) horizons. We agree that a detailed look at scenarios with longer time spans may be of interest, but did not deem this a necessary component of this assessment.
298	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		31			How to understand "nature change"? Changes in the nature or nature of the changes	The original text read "nature of change" but has since been reworded.
299	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		51		62	FORMAT why is a number included?	Amended.

300	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		90		93	What exactly do the percentages refer to, study groups dedicated to these issues?	The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
301	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		121			Organized groups what type of organizations do you refer to? since there may be governmental organizations, as well as non-governmental organizations, etc.	We have tried to refer to a crosssection of organised people from the informal to the formal. Changes have been made for clarity.
302	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		141			In the case of Africa, is it underrepresented because there are not enough studies?	Indeed; fewer studies on Africa matched our search criteria than for other regions.
303	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		624			In "snowball-sampling" with whom or how was it used?	We relied on expert knowledge of assessment authors as well as reviewers (all suggested references were considered, although not all included). We also literally "snowballed" from source to source, especially for grey literature. The exact sources (e.g. which document the source was cited in) can be traced through our Data Management Report.
304	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642			Are PCNs not derived from ecosystem service studies? This is a concept that has only recently come into use, which is why it is rarely identified in the literature	Thanks for this comment. Population is a critically important variable but degrowth emphasizes aterial contraction in the affluent part of the world, where population is stabilizing and even expected to decrease. Hence population is not seen as a major barrier to degrowth. This has now been carified at the end of the scetion on degrowth
305	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		678			What is the difference between "regional (continental) to global" and "regional (continental)"?	Thank you for this question, we have reworked section 5.2.2.1 a geographic scales and coverage to minimise this confusion
306	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			In section 5.3. The contents of the figure are not clear especially VII and the information of VIII is not easy to understand	Thanks for your comment. The new structure of the section hopefully makes this clearer.
307	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		751			X) and XI) it is not clear what he refers to	The wording has been improved.

308	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		768			It is difficult to understand the information with this figure	Thanks. We considered your suggestion when re-drawing the figure.
309	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		796			Enlarge figure, the message cannot be understood	This figure was re-drawn.
310	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		897		915	Perhaps the graphical representation of this information would help to better understand how these trends are related or not.	Thank you for the suggestion. We hope our updated Section 5.2.2.3.1. including Table 5.2. and Figure 5.7, with overviews of the archetypes, makes the information comprehensible.
311	Gabriela de la Mora	Organisation	Workshop - Red Socioecos / SUSMAI	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		975			The graph is hard to understand. Are the material and individual components more present in all archetypes? And the most balanced are those that have to do with global and regional sustainability?	Thank you for the observation. We hope our updated Section 5.2.2.3.1. including Table 5.2. and Figure 5.7, with overviews of the archetypes, makes the information comprehensible.
379	Michael Bordt	Government	Fisheries and Oceans Canada (comments are my own)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	109	2171	109	2179	I suggest one limitation to the Green Economy Pathway is the lack of an implementation strategy. Fenichel et al., (linked above) suggests rethinking the System of National Accounts to incorporate the same principles. This focuses on oceans, but can be applied to NBP in general.	This section has been substantially reworked to balance and align the cases and we have added two further cases.
393	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	175	5	175	Although there are links later on to justice, conflict and biodiversity, this paragraph with would benefit from making an explicit link here. Also, there is a bit of dancing around the term "just transitions" although this is what the paragraph is implying and describing so it would be enhanced by adding that directly as well.	Thanks, the text has changed.
394	Alexandra Harrington	Individual	CISDL	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	9	300	9	313	Just a note to say that this is a brilliantly phrased paragraph.	Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors.
488	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	22	5	22	Add sub head to 5.2.2 ...! Different Human Development Scenarios	Amended.

489	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	144	6	144	Add sub-head ...5.3.5.6 ...'Different Governance models and scope for flexibility to incorporat Values in Decision-making'	Amended.
490	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	144	6	144	Swap the above suggested head with 5.3.5.5	Noted and modified.
491	Alka Bharat	Individual	Maulana Azad National Institute of Technology, Bhopal (M.P.), India	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	144	6	144	Add head ... 5.4 ... FAQs	Thanks for your comment, format and style were reviewed.
509	Diana Sietz	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	119	119	2511	2516	Archetype research offers methods (Sietz et al. 2019) to deliver evidence-based insights into recurrent agroecological causal schemes and generic leverage points for interventions (Chan et al. 2020). Considering various stakeholders' demands, preferences and livelihood strategies at and across social and geographical scales, archetypes can directly support the up-scaling, i.e. anchoring at higher institutional levels at which transformative change needs to be promoted. Refs: I31; Chan et al. (2020) Levers and leverage points for pathways to	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, the lines and pages provided by the reviewer do not match the explanation given in the text in the draft.
510	Diana Sietz	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	114	114	2313	2315	Another key challenge is to evaluate how effective biosphere reserves are, e.g. in terms of achieving biodiversity and livelihood goals. This essentially demands systematic reflections of multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people. Overall, the literature cited in this paragraph is quite old, more recent papers may be included.	Thank you for the suggestion, we've considered the evidence based on the review process that was followed for our chapter.
547	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	4	1	6	This "a" sentence is confusing, suggest rephrasing. How about "Assessing the multiple values that have been considered in the development of visions for the future (i.e. possible future scenarios) - particularly those relating to more just and sustainable futures"?	Thanks for the comment. The text has changed so probably the comment can not be reflected as suggested.
548	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	69	2	70	As this is the introductory summary of the chapter, I thought that this sentence was rather vague, especially pertaining the examples cited for types of values and dynamics (they lack context). I suggest that the examples should be explained a little better to state a full idea of how these values were classified as instrumental and relational, etc. If not explain the examples better, I suggest just omit the examples for now and dive into classifications on appropriate section further down text	Thank you, we have revised the introduction to improve clarity and precision
549	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	3	74	3	74	What is "futures materials"? Did you mean that you were comparing 'just and sustainable futures' with 'futures focussed on material gains (material benefits)? Or that you tried to identify 'just and sustainable futures' within all material you gathered depicting different possible futures?	thanks for the comment, we have cut back on the use of this term as well, but we respectfully disagree, and feel that this term and its use are correct within this context.

550	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	64	2	66	I dont think "Futures works" is the correct expression here. I believe you mean different types of information (whether journal articles, grey lit and untraditional knowledge) that imagine different futures based on different values. However 'futures work' looks like you are talking about a work that you will do in the future, because this expression is used for this purpose. I suggest rephrasing to say "We assessed multiple sources of knowledge and data (peer-reviewed, grey...) to understand the multitude of values used to develop different futures. We were able	thanks for the comment, we have cut back on the use of this term, but we respectfully disagree, and feel that this term and its use are correct within this context.
551	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	3	85	3	86	Again, I dont think "Future works" is not the appropriate expression. Suggest using a differnt expression or using the whole idea "Works that develop/imagine/create possible futures provide..."	thanks for the comment, we have cut back on the use of this term, but we respectfully disagree, and feel that this term and its use are correct within this context.
552	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	3	92	3	92	Standardise the parenthesis, either use "of futures" in all or omit these.	Thanks for your comment, format and style were reviewed.
553	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1		10		I thought the summary part of the chapter was difficult to follow. I understand that it is supposed to be direct and short, but perhaps a revision to include a bit more context into the points would be necessary.	Thanks for your comment. The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this easier to read.
554	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1		10		In the summary, or at least the beginning of introduction, I think it is necessary to remind the reader the definition of 'value'. This word is used 1400 times in the chapter, and I know that previous chapters are focussed in definitions, but the reader must be reminded of what it means. We go through the entire summary with information of how the values were assessed but we are not sure exactly what it means since it is such a comprehensive word that can be used for different meanings.	Thanks for the comment. This text has changed substantially.
555	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	21	649	21	649	Typo in "reviewd".	Amended.
556	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	23	677	23	678	Not clear what "Regional (continental) to global" means, since there is 'regional (continental)' and 'global' as stand-alone categories. I assume it is bigger than the other regional (continental) category, but not quite global. I suggest lump into regional (continental) since it is regional afterall, rename (for example 'regional (multi-continental)') or omit this 1% from the graph as it is confusing to have this repetitions. The same occurs to 'local to national', what is this? To me 'local to national' sound like simply sub-national as said on the previous text (line 673)	Thanks! Categorization adjusted to local - national - regional (continental) - global
557	Stella Manes	Individual	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	23	677	23	678	Why not show Figure 5.2 part iii as a map? Map showing the countries and colours indicating the number of futures work on each. Better to view spatially explicit information as a map	Thanks. We considered your suggestion when re-drawing the figure.

558	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	25	720	25	721	Not clear the difference of scenarios and pathway. What is pathway? It is not yet defined on the chapter and is usually used as a synonym of scenario (i.e. 'scenario pathways')	This issue have been expanded on in section 5.5
559	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	26	720	26	721	On Fig 5.3 vii, the first pizza graph is shown in percentages. The yellowish half of the pizza is expanded in detail, however there are numbers in each slice that are clearly not percentages (due to the proportions) but are not specified. What do these numbers mean? Is it number of future works that depicted each scenario? If so the math is wrong because the sum of the numbers shown is 484 (only 48% of data), whereas the legend states 257 future works were reviewed	These figures have been reworked for clarity.
560	Stella Manes	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	26	720	26	721	Fig 5.3 viii: What is this 113? Not included in any of the categories	Thanks! These are studies with no mention of specific political instruments. This has now been clarified in the figure.
581	Alla Aleksanyan, Levon Aghasyan	Government	Ministry of Environment of the Republic of Armenia	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1		249		It's abit strange for such a big chapter you used only 12 references	Thanks for your comment. The full list of references can be found at the end of the chapter.
586	Thant Shin	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	123	2596	123	2598	It should also be considered to educate ethnic minorities by using local languages	This sentence was revised and rewritten following the comments from the reviewer.
587	Anna Salomaa	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	97	1761	97	1762	"An expert-led review" there should be explanation of the review e.g. how done and/or reference.	We no longer refer to an "expert-led review". Section 5.3. relied on a systematic review of the literature, section 5.3.2 on individual behavior change did not conduct a separate literature review.
588	Anna Salomaa	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	98	1816	104	1992	This chapters could possibly also refer to social practise (Shove et al. 2012), socioecological transition (Fischer-Kowalski and Haberl 2007), transformational adaptation (Kates et al. 2012).	Thank you. Most references arise from a systematic process and this will inevitably leave out some relevant materials.
589	Anna Salomaa	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	98	1816	104	1992	Was there literature that did not see values important for transformation or that had evidence that values prevent transformation?	Yes, this is a good point. We have emphasised that some values are indeed seen as a barrier to transformations to sustainability

590	Anna Salomaa	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	194	6	215	Changing values through policies is very central for this assessment. However this kind of statements might need more/deeper justifications. Environmental policies are not often made explicitly to change values - would that be seen as manipulation by some industry sectors? Environmental policies traditionally often have other type of aims than behaviour change e.g. protecting certain land area.	Whilst we retain soe emphasis on changing values, there is stronger attention to ways of enabling people to act on values they already hold. That is less manipulative but equally important.
608	Tom Wild	Individual	University of Sheffield	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	109	2206	110	2214	Local environmental stewardship has been researched in the context of freshwater habitats, urban rivers in the following paper, which introduced the concept of ecologically informed 'place-keeping' for the first time Wild, T.C., Ogden, S. and Lerner, D.N., 2008, September. An innovative partnership response to the management of urban river corridors-Sheffield's River Stewardship Company. In 11th international conference on urban drainage. Edinburgh, ICUD.	Thanks for your comment. This reference was added to the text.
609	Tom Wild	Individual	University of Sheffield	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	132	2877	132	2882	The following point is well made and very welcomed. There is a need, therefore, to champion new approaches that are both flexible enough to address highly contextualized socio ecological systems (SES) and dynamic and responsive enough to adjust to complex, unpredictable feedback between social and ecological system components (Chaffin et al., 2014). Strong evidence for this point, and particularly regarding the reintroduction of nature into cities and post-industrial areas, is given in Wild, T.C., Henneberry, J. and Gill, L., 2017. Comprehending	Thanks, noted. The text was changed and improved.
668	Theresa Satterfield	Organisation	University (of British Columbia)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	11				The transformative change contribution of values is still largely untested and the largely speculative (and hopeful) spirit of chapter 5 comes across that way (appropriately so). While I don't at least hope this [transformation] is so, the needed evidence on this is still pending in the literature. We do not yet have studies that include 'counterfactual' evidence or evidence that pits values against other competing interests, needs, or tradeoffs. But study of the transformative potential that is evidence based is, again, still	Thank you for this valuable comment. Unfortunately, it is not clear to which page/lines this comment pertains. The revised executive summary uses "confidence terms" in order to categorize the experts' level of confidence in their findings.
669	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	entire chapter	entire chapter	entire chapter	entire chapter	A lot of valuable futures works are written as part of policy suport and aren't necessarily published in peer review journals, nor in English. How are they taken into account? Leaving these kind of futures works out of the analysis creates a large bias in the research.	Indeed. We have attempted to address this bias but are the first to admit that fully eradicating it was beyond the scope of this (or perhaps any) assessment. Our assessment does, however, integrate a systematic review of the grey literature, as well as discourses on the arts, private sector, and ILK. There were also attempts to integrate non-English literature. We were further helped by many reviewers suggestions on specific works.
670	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	45-46			text: the ideas are therefore important to us.	Deleted sentence.
671	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	51			It is not entirely clear what is enlisted (1-19). Are these the ideas of justice or the key findings o the report? Please clarify	Thank for the comment, we have adjusted the executive summary to highlight that these are key findings.
672	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	158			it states that four key features of transformatiev change are distinguished, But I count five requirement is the text underneath. So either the number is wrong or the text untherneath should be better structured, so it becomes clear what these key features are.	Thanks you for your comment, this was corrected in the last version of the chapter.

673	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	1	10	359	the readability of executive summary would benefit from a better structure. More white spaces, and sub titles and shorter paragraphs. It is not clear to the reader what the number 1-19 refer to (see comment above).	This was corrected.
674	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	13	453	13	455	Justice and sustainability are such key concepts in this work I would put more emphasis on them. Place it in a box, or start the paragraph with it. Now you really have to look where you can find a 'definition'.	Check this because the comment was not taken into consideration.
675	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	14	482	15	538	Transformative changes sounds logical but also impossible to realize. An example of a succesfull transformative change in the past could make the concept more concrete and manageable.	Comment is just a judgement with no argumentation.
676	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	26	734	26	734	Y-axis is missing a lable, making it hard to interpret the figure.	Amended.
677	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	25	720	25	720	The of 86 % of the futures works is academia. It would be interesting to know what the goal of these studies where: a purily scientific research question or supporting (local) policy. In the latter case you would expect more stakeholder involvement, and also more consideration on the values these stakeholders put forward.	In this analysis we have stayed focused on addressing the main questions and are unable to explore the multiple interesting tangents that such an analysis throws up. These ise are to a degree welt with in our analis
678	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	32	821	33	896	Economic optimism is described here as fairly negative for nature and NCP. But it can also be used to generate new business models for nature are creates a new forms of income for nature conservation. It depends of your starting point. You can also use this economic optimism to improve nature. This part needs a bit more nuance.	Thanks for the comment, we hope the relative weightings of the different archetypes is now clearer
679	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	34	916	36	945	Fig 5.9: Clarify: does the the bar mean that the SDG are mentioned in the future work are that the SDG would be reached in these futures works?	Two identical comments - 1129 and 2027; Thanks! Unfortunately, the reviewed documents did not provide enough evidence to assess to which extent the goals would be met under different scenarios. We have now clarified in the caption that the bar means that the goal is mentioned as targeted for in the respective futures work. This in an approach taken from the IPBES ECA assessment.
680	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	43	1115	46	1116	box 5.2: an important step that is missing in developping scenarios is wind-tunneling of the scenario's How robust are the scenario's for large unpredictable changes such as climate change, a pandemic, an economic crisis,.....	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into wind-tunneling

681	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	68	box 5.8	68	box 5.8	the paragraph starting with A rapid analysis... looks like it does not belong in this box.	Due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
682	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	69	box 5.8	69	box 5.8	I don't know what the following sentence means: The intactness of PA is underpinned on... or the entire removal of the protected status. Rewrite please.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
683	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	75	1242	79	1379	This paragraph would benefit greatly from a box describing an example of a successful planned transformative change, now it is too theoretical	This text has been rewritten to provide more examples
684	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	97	1778	98	1788	It is unclear to me whether it is a good or bad thing to consider the effect of stakeholder participation on debating alternative pathways. Please clarify	Generally stakeholder participation is seen as a positive thing to give voice to many actors and to ensure the inclusion of plural perspectives.
685	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	102	1950	102	1950	It is unclear to me what the link is between the failure of the energy transition and the procedural justice. Please explain a bit better.	Sentence rewritten and partly deleted.
686	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	103	1977	103	1978	One key element I'm missing in this discussion about economic growth versus economic degrowth is the increasing human population, Can you have degrowth if the human population is expected to grow even further? if so, explain. Or does economic degrowth automatically mean controlling the human population size. Please clarify.	Thanks for this comment. Population is a critically important variable but degrowth emphasizes a contraction in the affluent part of the world, where population is stabilizing and even expected to decrease. Hence population is not seen as a major barrier to degrowth. This has now been clarified at the end of the section on degrowth
687	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	104	2029	125	2694	It would increase readability if the explanation of the two pathways described, green economy and earth stewardship follow the same structure. Now it looks like they are written separately each with their own structure, making it hard to compare.	This section has been substantially reworked to balance and align the cases and we have added two further cases.
688	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	128	2755	137	3023	adding a few examples or case studies of successful governance structures that are suitable for transition to JSF would make this section easier to understand, now it is very theoretical.	This section was expanded and refined.

689	Helen Michels	Organisation	Institute for Forest and nature research	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	entire chapter	entire chapter	entire chapter	entire chapter	It is an interesting chapter which contains a lot of information and interesting ideas. It is however quite lengthy and it lacks structure and a common thread through the chapter, now it reads to much as different parts put together. So shortening the text to apply a clear structure would improve readability.	Thanks for the comment, we have really tried to shorten, focus to and integrate sections
690	Hun Park	Individual	Seoul National University	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	107	2091	107	2112	The authors make a strong case for lowering discount rates for natural goods and services compared to the rates applied to private consumption goods. However, the authors failed to compare different discount rates adopted by some key countries and regions. For example, the UK's 3.5% and the US's 3% and 7% adopted by Obama and Trump administrations could render a clearer view of how different discount rates lead to fundamentally different decisions in environmental conservation.	Thanks for the suggestion, but this is not the focus of this section and for brevity cannot be addressed here.
765	Crispin Swedi Bilombele	Organisation	Aube Nouvelle pour la Femme et le Développement (ANFD non profit NGO)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	348	5,2,2	350	5,3,1	Dear Madam or Sir, Greetings, Please, With regard of your e-mail addressed March 15th 2021 inviting the interested and qualified experts, to send comments in reviewing of the second order draft of the chapters and the first order draft of the summary for policymakers of the values assessment that was opened until 19 March 2021 see below an extract of my comment. The commentary introduces some of how humans use and benefit from	Noted.
834	Himangana Gupta	Organisation	United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	43	1115	45	1115	Box 5.2: Baselines and Indicators: Must specify what indicators should be based on? Here, it looks like direct and indirect drivers are the indicators.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
835	Himangana Gupta	Organisation	United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	67	0	67	0	Box 5.8: Is it possible to focus somewhere on biodiversity beyond protected areas and most effective valuation measures for such regions? Examples: https://satoyama-initiative.org/case_study/#start	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter this box is no longer in the text. Some of the content was kept for sections 5.3 and 5.5
836	Himangana Gupta	Organisation	United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	101	1897	101	1898	Please refer to the book: https://www.springer.com/gp/book/9789813367609	I don't think it is appropriate to cite your book here, as you provide not context and link to this work - reject
837	Himangana Gupta	Organisation	United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	134	2914	134	2914	Downscaling could also be a constraint. For effectively implementing a global policy at the local level, downscaling of global indicators is needed.	Agreed.
895	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Please refer to my comments on the life framework in chapter 2.	Thank you for the suggestion, we've considered the evidence based on the review process that was followed for our chapter.

896	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	0	241	0	The chapter has some very good and wellfounded sections - but it is far too long, and the biggest question mark I have is why have texts on governance (for transformation) in this chapter - it surely belongs in chapter 6? Furthermore, the texts on governance are very basic, more textbook type. The focus here should be on scenarios and the role of values in (the making of) scenarios (and associated pathways), and what role scenario development (particularly participatory versions) can have for understanding and making diverse value perspectives visible.	That's why the chapter focusses on JSF. We do not assume that governance for the inclusion of more plural values eo ipso is "better for nature" but we ask whose values and what kinds of values need to be better included to allow for just and sustainable futures (not only 'better for nature' but also 'better for people') [UE]
897	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	49	2	49	Human rights law should be added here - those are the most advanced international legal instruments, and constitute hard law rather than soft law as the SDGs and UNDRIP, thus much more binding and it is mentioned further down in the chapter. Economic and social human rights are extremely relevant for justice.	Accept. Human Rights Declaration is referred to in Box 5.7. Would be good to refer to in text also, though that may involve explicating the relation between the values people hold and their rights [Uta]
898	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	210	6	215	What is the rationale for having an analysis of the policy options made in the NBSAPs in this chapter? Unclear also later in the chapter, why not in the policy chapter? The same question goes for the sections on governance.	Here we look specifically at the extent to which behavior change (as part of transformative change processes) is addressed in the policy action plans of the NBSAPs. This can show gaps which future policies aimed at transformative change should take into account.
899	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	13	443	13	443	This is hardly a new proposal to consider ecological resources and biodiversity as global commons - it is decades older if not more - see, for example, the report Our Global Neighbourhood from 1995 (check year) etc. If other references in the report go back to 1972, then we should recognize the heritage of these ideas; they predate the Anthropocene.	Check this because the comment was not taken into consideration.
900	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	15	486	15	487	Why is incremental change put as the opposite of transformational? Incremental implies in small steps. There are theories arguing that also small steps can lead to transformational change (see, for example, work on small-wins by Katrien Termeer), but more relevant would be to use well-established terminology on change such as first order, second order etc.?	We agree and performed changes in accordance to the reviewer suggestion, hopefully the new structure of the chapter makes this clearer.
901	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	25	714	25	716	Unclear and even contradictory between the first and second part of the sentence. Is civil society included or not?	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
902	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	30	796	30	801	Figure 5.7. Somewhat surprising to put business as usual as mixed achievement of targets, text further below suggests very few of the 17 are met under this and none of the environmental ones.	This figure was re-drawn.
903	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	36	940	36	945	Figure text says coverage of goals - does it now also show the degree of meeting them? Assuming meeting the means filling the space to the edge of the circle, it shows in every single scenario how far away they are.	Thanks! Unfortunately not, as the reviewed documents did not provide enough evidence to assess to which extent the goals would be met under different scenarios. To avoid making judgements in the light of such uncertainty, we opted for rendering the proportion of scenarios that mention targetting a respective goal. The size of the bar towards each Sustainable Development Goal shows the proportion of futures targetting the respective goals (or their alikes), ranging from 0% (goal not targeted by any future scenario) to 100%

904	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	38	975	38	976	Useful figure. I am just wondering how relational values can be captured when all components are from the IPBES conceptual framework that only sees a one-way relationship between nature and people, where nature benefits people rather than the other way around.	Thanks! We have coded the scenario for value justifications included in them (instrumental, intrinsic, relational) separately from the value foci (on nature, on NCPs, on GQoL) and provide the information broken down for different archetypes in figure 5.10.
905	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	39	1018	30	1019	This seems to contradict what was stated earlier in the text about clustering.	Thanks! This part of analysis was updated in the light of more data points included.
906	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	41	1073	41	1075	The linkage between lack of whose values are considered and the missing analysis of 'winners and losers' eludes me. That make it sound as if it can only be egotistical values of personal gain that are relevant. If there are altruistic values, communal values...?	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
907	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	43	1115	51	117	Box 5.4 It is valuable to consider arts in scenarios, but the rationale for this long methodological box on including arts is not clear. This is not a scenarios methods assessment, so the rationale has to be clear about the explicit value to use arts to bring out values.. And so long boxes will mess up the storyline. It is, of course, relevant (and should perhaps be rather central in the chapter rather than many other things that seem to be sidetracks) is how to fill the gap that you establish in your systematic literature review in terms of lack of scenarios and methods	Thanks for the comment, we agree, this box have been substantially adjusted
908	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	62	1119	63	1120	The last paragraph of the box has several incomplete sentences. Not understandable, specifically the second and last sentence.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
909	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	64	1120	66	1121	Box 5.7. I am missing justification of why analysing only UN documents agreed by states as an illustration of trade-offs? Why not civil society declarations also, like the Earth Charter or later initiatives? Furthermore, the official name of the 1992 UN conference should be used (UNCED) rather than the Rio Earth Summit.	Accept [Uta]: There is a pragmatic reason for limiting ourselves to UN documents. We are not allowed to be normative ourselves. So we have to base the normative standards to which we refer on documents to which the addressees have already agreed.
910	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	74	1240	74	1241	Table 5.1. What is the source for this table? References?	The previous paragraph was rewritten to make this clearer.
911	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	77	1318	77	1319	This implies that spirituality comes from values based in culture, while many spiritual people would claim their values come from their source of spirituality, whether a religion with written sources or inspiration or... see work, e.g. historian Arnold Toynbee.	Thank you for this helpful point.

912	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	78	1328	78	1330	Education should ideally be unpacked into more aspects, formal, informal, values-based education etc. There is considerable research on this in networks such PERL (Partnership on Education for Responsible Living), there is emerging work on informal social movement pedagogy such as Cox L (2014) Movements Making Knowledge: A New Knowledge... Sociology 48 (5) 954-975.	Thanks for your comment. This reference was added to the text.
913	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	78	1342	79	1378	In this section and elsewhere where power is discussed, I miss the problematization of whose voices should be given more power. There is an underlying assumption that vulnerable voices will have 'good' values for nature - that may be so, but there are also strong counter-movements in many countries where extremism towards the right, racism, xenophobia, antidemocracy, antisience is growing among those who feel powerless (of course supported by people in power also). Not all social movements are 'good' in a sense many would	Whilst not privileging the values of any one group, the general view of the VA is that bringing plural values into dialogue is a good thing. That does not mean all values are aligned with the futures we want
914	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	80	1405	80	1406	Referring to sustainability aligned values as new and the 'bad' values as old is quite disrespectful to the ancient traditions in e.g indigenous communities who embrace these values, in many faith traditions with strong histories of sufficiency (world religions) and respect for life (e.g. Hindusim) and nature (all religions, see UNEP reports on the topic). It is the 'new' values of modernity of extreme materialism and economic growth that are the problems.	We agree and no longer refer to "old" vs. "new" values. The following sentence in the updated text captures exactly what you say "there is noteworthy agreement among researchers that pathways to sustainability will require shifts from broad values of individualism and economic profit to sustainability-aligned values of collectivism, care and equality."
915	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	81	1431	83	1432	Box 5.9. Reference Vinkhuyzen et al. (2014) should be Vinkhuyzen and Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen (2014). Also, this reference and others from the list, such as Choy, are missing from the reference list.	this was corrected
916	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	95	1700	95	1701	It stated earlier in the text that 10 NBSAPs were analysed, here it says four. Then which four? And why not ten?	Yes, 10 NBSAPs were analyzed by now. At the time of the SOD only four were ready and included in teh analysis.
917	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	96	1719	96	1723	Missing here what is mentioned later in the chapter is that specific policy choices can also erode values.	indeed, that is true and now mentioned in the text
918	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	97	1778	97	1781	This big gap in the literature seems to warrant a box on the work that the IPBES Task Force on Scenarios and Models is doing on narratives that explicitly unpack the role of values. Considering how their Nature Futures Framework aligns with much of the approach in the other chapters, including the first half of chapter 2 (see, e.g. fig 2.10) and the existing literature that figure builds on this cannot be omitted in the scenario chapter.	Thanks, noted.
919	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	98	1806	98	1807	Placing inner dimensions at the centre is also what the teachings of most faiths do - and many faiths are explicitly engaging in sustainability discourse, such as the Pope and his Laudatio XI, UNEP co-organised a conference on Faith For nature: Multi-Faith Action in Iceland in October 2020.	Thank you for this important point. The nature of our review means we have not selected faith-based sources such as the Pope.

920	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	104	1990	104	1992	Clarify the last sentence, what does 're-politicization of sustainability done in awareness' mean? Good to be clear in defining politics if it is used here.	Sentence rewritten and partly deleted.
921	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	104	2012	104	2013	The search for literature on historic transformations has not been broad enough. For example, consider the very deliberate transformation of the British Empire from the abolition of slavery, fought for over decades by small dedicated groups in the UK to start with then spreading across the world. This is a much better source of knowledge than socio-technical transformations referred to. Engage more historians in writing, and more examples will emerge.	Thank you, we have still not reviewed such historical cases in this text due to the limits of our methodology and search strings.
922	Lilibeth Acosta	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	109	2171	109	2179	The literature cited (Peters et al., 2011; Wiedmann et al., 2013) as evidence that no indication that growth in turning green is very outdated. There are many evidences of countries implementing green growth policies. As a means to measure green growth performance, the Global Green Growth Institute, in collaboration with many international organizations, is publishing annually Green Growth Index covering about 115 countries (https://greengrowthindex.gggi.org/?page_id=3126).	We have updated the reference list, including a reference to the Green Growth Index Report.
923	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	123	2598	2600	123	See earlier comment, also mention educational efforts from social movements and indigenous communities, these examples are quite urban and western.	This sentence was revised and rewritten following the comments from the reviewer.
924	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	125	2668	125	2672	There is a strong focus on place-based education with the historical context etc.; indeed, the whole Earth Stewardship direction is very place-based. This is obviously important, but it does raise questions of how to approach this for all those who voluntarily migrate or are forced to migrate from their original 'places'. It would be relevant to at least raise this issue - and if it is a gap in the literature, mention that.	Thank you for your comment, this sentences was revised and rewritten.
925	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	127	2711	128	2754	One the one hand, I doubt if all this text on governance and values belong in this chapter - it should be in chapter 6 - but wherever it is - the story portrays hierarchical governance as outdated and not relevant. This would exclude relying on a firm basis of the rule of law in a national and international context, something which many consider a bedrock not only of democracy but of effective biodiversity governance. Countless are those who advocate for a more effective rule of international law, including the work on strengthening followup	Thanks for your comments. This section was improved.
926	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	128	2774	128	2781	Please provide a reference for the statements of what values are associated with hierarchical, network, market governance. This is a very strong proposition that I doubt is well based on empirical research. Network governance can be inclusive, but it can also hide power differences, encourage friendship corruption, reduce transparency and accountability etc. Such sweeping statements should be well-founded.	Thanks for the suggestion. References were added to this section.
927	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	129	2786	129	2807	While still questioning having basic text on governance in this chapter (see general comment for chapter), this text here, as much of the governance text, has a strong local bias. And yes, conservation requires, of course, a strong local perspective, but one cannot leave out the role of national and international policy frameworks. The drivers for the degeneration of nature span these levels, and so the policies and governance equally need to. Furthermore, the governance text is based on very few Northern based authors - there must be work on	Thanks for your comments. There was an effort to improve this section taking into consideration the comments received.

928	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	135	2921	135	2922	Why is the international level not relevant?	Thank you for your comment. Added.
929	Sylvia Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen	Organisation	IPBES task force on scenarios and models	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	140	3093	141	3094	Consider adding work on competencies for addressing wicked problems such as Termeer, C. J. A. M., Dewulf, A., Karlsson-Vinkhuyzen, S. I., Vink, M., & Vliet, M. v. (2016). Coping with the wicked problem of climate adaptation across scales: The Five R Governance Capabilities. Landscape and Urban Planning, 154, 11-19. https://doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.landurbplan.2016.01.007	Thanks, noted.
1001	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					General comment: This Chapter assesses the role of multiple values for nature in supporting social-ecological transformations towards more JSFs, doing, indeed, a balancing act between assessing values of visions and scenarios of more just and sustainable futures, and assessing how more plural valuations of nature can push the governance for a transformation needed to reach these futures. Although the general structure as well as the specific contents of the Chapter supports the 'two-fold and mutually complementing task'	Reject, The commentary represents a view of the role of science that is incompatible with our scientific self-understanding. It cannot and must not be the task of science to select "appropriate values" and then impose them on others via governance. [Uta]
1002	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	156	5	175	Please insert sentence: "Co-production of knowledge is a key to a participative government of a transformative change."	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1003	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	176	6	193	Please add at end of sentence in line 193: "...and open up decision making for a co-production of knowledge".	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1004	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	12	408	12	413	The quote should be replaced or deleted instead: Whether the philosophies of Ivan Illich (for example of unschooling) are fit to the common ideas of policy development can be questioned.	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1005	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	15	509	15	512	The statement "This call for 'transformative' change - the view that profound societal change is necessary to escape from the current nexus of environmental emergencies (biodiversity, climate, novel diseases) - has rapidly become accepted within UN science-policy assessments as well as wider government and non-government bodies." is not correct for climate since the IPCC does not "call" for anything in line with its mandate not to be policy prescriptive. Please amend this sentence.	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1006	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	16	537	18	593	This section should emphasize more clearly how the chapters relate to one another: [add in line 593:] "The chapters interlock methodically and fertilize each other by functioning as if in a counter current exchange."	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.

1007	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	31	802	39	1006	Section "5.2.3.1. Archetypal Futures": This section appears fragmentary and unfinished, especially page 34 line 897 to line 915 and page 37 line 968 to 974! If this is the result of small sample, please formulate accordingly.	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1008	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	43	1115	43	ff	Box 5.2. Methods for developing scenarios: please add "...and co-production as a benefit of equal scenario development."	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1009	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	71	156	72	1195	The section "research questions" appears sudden and should be initiated.	Thank for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1010	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	72	1199	72	1204	Please consider that this section needs to be updated according to the language of the Updated Zero Draft, the First Draft or the post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework adopted by the COP-15 of the CBD (depending on date of final editing of the Values Assessment).	Thank you,
1011	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	72	1199	72	1204	A reference to the Long-term Approach to Mainstreaming and is related Action Plan (especially Strategic Areas I and III) which is currently under development under the CBD could be helpful (CBD/SBI/3/13 and CBD/SBI/3/13/Add.1).	thanks you for this suggestion
1012	Germany	Government	Germany	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	109	2179	109	2179	This section appears fragmented.	This section was expanded and refined.
1117	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0				General: Please give some more consideration about the value of/in nature in the Stewardship model. Many works in environmental ethics criticise 'stewardship' views as anthropocentric: stewardship creates a patriarchal, hierarchical relationship to nature, depicts humans at the centre of the world (managers/stewards) and as managers of all life on Earth (e.g. Page, 1996; Atfield, 1991; see e.g. Worrell and Appleby 1999 'Stewardship of natural resources' for discussion).	Thanks for your comment. New references were added to the text following the reviewer's comment.
1118	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		43		47	The UN sustainable development and the general principle of sustainability derived from there does not usually contain the idea of ecological justice / justice to non-human nature (see also summary for policymakers table SPM1). Please correct these passages to denote that this suggestion is much more recent and not yet mainstreamed, because the very idea of ecological justice hasn't yet mainstreamed (become commonly accepted). I highly endorse the deliberate choice to include ecological justice here in the reasoning and conception of	Thank you, yes, that's right. The term sustainable development is anthropocentric and does not include direct obligations towards non-human entities. However, the assessment is about multiple values of nature and for some peoples the idea of justice includes non-human entities. Therefore it was included in this sentence, without directly attributing it to Brundland report or the UN Process.

1119	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		468		471	The UN sustainable development and the general principle of ecological justice / justice to non-human nature (see also summary for policymakers table SPM1). Please correct these passages to denote that this suggestion is much more recent and not yet mainstreamed, because the very idea of ecological justice hasn't yet mainstreamed (become commonly accepted). I highly endorse the deliberate choice to include ecological justice here in the reasoning and conception of	Thank you, yes, that's right. The term sustainable development is anthropocentric and does not include direct obligations towards non-human entities. However, the assessment is about multiple values of nature and for some peoples the idea of justice includes non-human entities. Therefore it is included in this sentence, without attributing it to Brundland or the UN Process.
1120	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		1005			Figure 5.11. Please reconsider wording: The instrumental value of nature does not necessarily mean that nature or some of its resources would be considered substitutable - even instrumental may be unsubstitutable. (Consider clean water and fresh, breathable air.)	Thanks for your comment. There was no change in the figure, however the text for the figure was improved following your suggestion.
1121	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		1431			Box 5.9. In procedural justice, 'participation' would be more descriptive if it said 'participation opportunities and capacities' and 'equal access to decision-making' would be complemented with 'and related information'	Thank you for these suggestions, we have updated Box 5.6
1122	Olli Ojala (Tea Kortetmäki)	Government	Finnish Ministry of the Environment	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		1431			Box 5.9. Values regarding nature are now a bit unsynced with the typology and descriptions of Ch.2; ecocentrism does not necessarily entail the consideration of all living beings as individuals but the attention is more on the systemic level that enables the flourishing of individuals. Moreover, not all who embrace ethics of care embrace stewardship, for the latter may also involve patriarchal tendencies. See e.g. Environmental Stewardship: History, Theory and Practice-Workshop Proceedings	Thank you, we have worked with the Ch2 team to harmonise concepts used.
1216	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Généreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	A lot of valuable future works are written as part of policy support and aren't necessarily published in peer review journals, nor in English. How are they taken into account? Leaving these kind of futures works out of the analysis creates a large bias in the research.	Indeed. We have attempted to address this bias but are the first to admit that fully eradicating it was beyond the scope of this (or perhaps any) assessment. Our assessment does, however, integrate a systematic review of the grey literature, as well as discourses on the arts, private sector, and ILK. There were also attempts to integrate non-English literature. We were also helped by many reviewers suggestions on specific works.
1217	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Généreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	It is an interesting chapter which contains a lot of information and interesting ideas. It is however quite lengthy and it lacks structure and a common thread through the chapter, now it reads too much as different parts put together. So shortening the text to apply a clear structure would improve readability.	Thank you, we have shortened and improved the structure of the text, keeping attention to coherence
1218	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Généreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	1	10	359	the readability of executive summary would benefit from a better structure. More white spaces, and sub titles and shorter paragraphs. It is not clear to the reader what the number 1-19 refer to (see comment above).	Thanks for the suggestion, the executive summary has been adjusted, but we are confined to the format associated with IPBES chapters and assessments
1219	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Généreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	51			It is not entirely clear what is enlisted (1-19). Are these the ideas of justice or the key findings of the report? Please clarify.	Thank for the comment, we have adjusted the executive summary to highlight that these are key findings.

1220	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	45-46			Text: the ideas are therefore important to us.	Deleted sentence.
1221	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	158			It states that four key features of transformative change are distinguished, but I count five requirement in the text underneath. So either the number is wrong or the text underneath should be better structured, so it becomes clear what these key features are.	Thanks you for your comment, this was corrected in the last version of the chapter.
1222	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	13	453	13	455	Justice and sustainability are such key concepts in this work I would put more emphasis on them. Place it in a box, or start the paragraph with it. Now you really have to look where you can find a 'definition'.	5.1.2.2.: Maybe change order: First define just and sustainable and then explain that and why the two are necessary as reference points for Multiple values. [Uta]
1223	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	14	482	15	538	Transformative changes sounds logical but also impossible to realize. An example of a successful transformative change in the past could make the concept more concrete and manageable.	Comment is just a judgement with no argumentation.
1224	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	25	720	25	720	The of 86 % of the futures works is academia. It would be interesting to know what the goal of these studies where: a purely scientific research question or supporting (local) policy. In the latter case you would expect more stakeholder involvement, and also more consideration on the values these stakeholders put forward.	In this analysis we have stayed focused on addressing the main questions and are unable to explore the multiple interesting tangents that such an analysis throws up. These ise are to a degree welt with in our analis
1225	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	26	734	26	734	Y-axis is missing a label, making it hard to interpret the figure.	Amended.
1226	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	32	821	33	896	Economic optimism is described here as fairly negative for nature and NCP. But it can also be used to generate new business models for nature are creates a new forms of income for nature conservation. It depends of your starting point. You can also use this economic optimism to improve nature. This part needs a bit more nuance.	Thanks for the comment, we hope the relative weightings of the different archetypes is now clearer
1227	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	34	916	36	945	Fig 5.9: Clarify: does the bar mean that the SDG are mentioned in the future work are that the SDG would be reached in these futures works?	Two identical comments - 1129 and 2027; Thanks! Unfortunately, the reviewed documents did not provide enough evidence to assess to which extent the goals would be met under different scenarios. We have now clarified in the caption that the bar means that the goal is mentioned as targeted for in the respective futures work. This in an approach taken from the IPBES ECA assessment.

1228	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	43	1115	46	1116	box 5.2: an important step that is missing in developing scenarios is wind-tunnelling of the scenario's How robust are the scenario's for large unpredictable changes such as climate change, a pandemic, an economic crisis,.....	Thanks for this valuable comment. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into wind-tunneling
1229	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	68	box 5.8	68	box 5.8	the paragraph starting with A rapid analysis... looks like it does not belong in this box.	Due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1230	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	69	box 5.8	69	box 5.8	I don't know what the following sentence means: The intactness of PA is underpinned on... or the entire removal of the protected status. Rewrite please.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1231	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	75	1242	79	1379	This paragraph would benefit greatly from a box describing an example of a successful planned transformative change, now it is too theoretical	As above
1232	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	97	1778	98	1788	It is unclear to me whether it is a good or bad thing to consider the effect of stakeholder participation on debating alternative pathways. Please clarify	This sentence was rephrased.
1233	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	102	1950	102	1950	It is unclear to me what the link is between the failure of the energy transition and the procedural justice. Please explain a bit better.	Sentence rewritten and partly deleted.
1234	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	103	1977	103	1978	One key element I'm missing in this discussion about economic growth versus economic degrowth is the increasing human population, Can you have degrowth if the human population is expected to grow even further? if so, explain. Or does economic degrowth automatically mean controlling the human population size. Please clarify.	Thanks for this comment. Population is a critically important variable but degrowth emphasizes arial contraction in the affluent part of the world, where population is stabilizing and even expected to decrease. Hence population is not seen as a major barrier to degrowth. This has now been clarified at the end of the section on degrowth
1235	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	104	2029	125	2694	It would increase readability if the explanation of the two pathways described, green economy and earth stewardship follow the same structure. Now it looks like they are written separately each with their own structure, making it hard to compare.	This section has been substantially reworked to balance and align the cases and we have added two further cases.

1236	Jeroen Panis, Catherine Debruyne, Catherine Génèreux, Helen Michels, Wouter Van Reeth	Government	Belgium / Belgian Biodiversity Platform	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	128	2755	137	3023	adding a few examples or case studies of successful governance structures that are suitable for transition to JSF would make this section easier to understand, now it is very theoretical.	This section was expanded and refined.
1343	Ana Paula Aguiar	Individual		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	19		43		Please add to scenario database a relevant new scenario study: Harmáčková, Z. V., Blättler, L., Aguiar, A.P.D., Daněk, J., Krpec, P., Vačkářová, D., 2021. Linking multiple values of nature with future impacts: Value-based participatory scenario development for sustainable landscape governance. Sustainability Science (in press).	Thank you for the suggestion of this paper. We were not able to add it to our database for inclusion in our systematic analysis, but have included it as a reference.
1387	Noa Steiner	Individual	Kiel University	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	2	1	8	Just and Sustainable futures - the definition of just and sustainable futures is lacking in the first paragraph. Also, since this is a values assessment, it will be useful to clarify whose values you reviewed (plural values is a very general term for non-professionals) to define JSF, and how this links or synergises with the IPBES transformational change assessment. Semantic comment - too much use of the term 'Just and sustainable futures' in one paragraph (3 times).	The definition of JSF and the discussion of values are presented and explained in detail throughout the chapter. It is not possible to clarify all this in the first 8 lines. The redundancy of 'JSF' comes from the fact that the whole chapter deals with it - it is impossible to avoid using the word repeatedly.
1388	Noa Steiner	Individual	Kiel University	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	1	21	1	22	It is not clear from this sentence if the two pathways are necessarily two separate sets of (plural) values, can the pathways potentially mix into a hybrid or if there are any overlaps between the two pathways.	We have defined the term 'pathway' and also provided more analysis of areas of convergence between pathways. Thank you.
1389	Noa Steiner	Individual	Kiel University	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	2	49	2	49	UNDRIP - will be useful to spell out the acronym or say something about this. Many know the SDGs but this is the first time I heard about UNDRIP	Thanks for your suggestion. Accepted.
1390	Noa Steiner	Individual	Kiel University	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	3	87	3	101	Not clear how the future archetypes were grouped, and why just 7 groups. I am specifically missing technology optimism - just by reading this paragraph it is not clear if the technology optimists are nested within economy optimists? Also I disagree with the notion that just and sustainable futures need to have equally high regard for both material and non material benefits of nature - this in my view oversimplifies this complex issue. I am living in a western mindset society where consumption is high but people also meditate, this	Thank you for this observation and reflection. In order to create a bridge with other IPBES assessments, we used a similar archetype selection to allow for comparisons. Please see table 5.2 and Sitas et al. 2019
1491	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Explicitly describe and differentiate between the ecosystem services approach and the livelihoods framework.	Thank you for this comment, but this is beyond the scope of the work in this assessment as it is explicitly using an ecosystem service/natures contribution to people approach as per the IPBES conceptual framework articulated by Diz et al 2015
1492	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	The participation of different sectors is promoted, but in the end the visions are not included. There must not only be participatory processes, but also inclusive ones. It should be an inclusion of parity among diverse voices.	Thank you for this comment, we agree that processes need to be participatory AND inclusive and tried to capture this with our assessment in section 5.2 which looked at the inclusion of ILK and whether those that had diverse groups in the scenario development led to better outcomes for people and nature.

1493	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	It is necessary to integrate the values of 2 visions: urban and rural. Generally, valuation studies are carried out centrally in the cities and the rural environment is only taken into account to validate or participate in a limited way.	Thank you for your observation. We did not explicitly address whether the scenarios or values originated in rural or urban contexts, in part because there were already a number of prerequisites (i.e. "future scenarios" that address "values" as well as "nature, nature's contributions to people and good quality of life"). However, we did consider the origins of the future scenarios and visions, the stakeholders involved, and the ecosystems in question (e.g. Fig 5.3).
1494	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Concepts such as circular economy and welfare are not included in the green economy discussion. The measurement of well-being has been proposed as a way to go beyond GDP.	The concept of welfare is now more explicitly included in the green economy pathway; the circular economy in the 'degrowth' pathway.
1495	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	The problem or consequence of not giving a treat of peers in valuation studies is that decision-making can be biased and policies are then imposed on "others" or minorities.	This is discussed now in some depth in section 5.2
1496	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	In those schemes where the different types of values are presented, hopefully values that are less known or less conventional can be included (eg religious, spiritual, artistic-inspired values, etc.)	Our analysis builds on preexisting value typologies (that encompass e.g. spiritual values), but also integrates text data on each scenario (including descriptions of less conventional values).
1497	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Describe the analysis of future scenarios and how they differ from the construction of scenarios previously prepared by IPBES.	The analysis has been detailed in the updated chapter (Section 5.2, and further detailed in the data management report) and adopted scenario archetypes used in previous IPBES assessments.
1498	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	It should be recommended that valuations and their results have an inclusive perspective based on a treatment of peers to all actors, otherwise it will not be possible to move to a fair scenario in practice and there is a risk of being left alone in the discursive.	We agree, and feel that we have covered this issue sufficiently in the chapter in how it relates to scenarios and futures.
1499	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Include the relationship that the concept of "sustainable futures" has with others such as "sustainable pathways".	Futures are where the paths lead. In both cases, 'sustainable' means the same thing.
1500	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	0	0	0	0	Ensure that the topic of zoonoses and pandemics is explicitly mentioned, highlighting that the value of well-conserved ecosystems is critical to maintaining human health	Thanks, this topic was discussed within all of the assessment and can be found in different chapters, in Chapter 5 is mentioned in section 5.5.5

1501	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	176	5	177	It is mentioned that changing values and evaluation is necessary, but not sufficient, so I would add what is mentioned in the description about the need to "change the social conditions that allow or prevent the use of certain values" towards the desired futures based on sustainability and justice.	Yes, good point. This is made explicit under section 5.4.3.
1502	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	9	307	9	313	On governance, perhaps include that the models should not only be participatory, but INCLUSIVE as mentioned in the long chapter in the sense of having various actors from other sectors to achieve the recognition of other values and avoid dominance of a single type of values towards the construction of shared visions and where the values complement each other.	Thanks for your suggestion. Accepted.
1503	Mexico	Government	Mexico National Expert Workshop (NFP and experts)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	109	2180	126	2694	In section 5.3.4.2.3. the measurement of expenditures in favor / or in pressures towards biodiversity could be included. See SEEA Environmental Expenditure Account & BIOFIN Workbook 2018 Ch. 4.	Thanks for your comment. A new reference was added to the text following the comment from the reviewer.
1684	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	Comunidades negras	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1685	Marta Berbes	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	The Brundtland is important but this paragraph attributes to it the emergence of social justice goals. I think that prior to 1987 there have been others that have brought social justice to the core of environmental concerns, e.g., Robert Bullard (environmental justice), comes to mind but I'm sure that there are authors from the global South that have touched on this particular notion. Entonces, ampliar otros referentes afuera de Brundtland, ej. entendimientos de sostenibilidad desde perspectivas indígenas, o de la justicia ambiental.	The point here is not to claim that the Brundtland Report was the first to raise this issue. It was, however, the first time that a UN body agreed that inter- and intragenerational justice are worthy goals.
1686	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Concepto de desarrollo sustentable, como se ha desarrollado toda la discusión de manera breve. Resurgence of relationality: reflections on decolonizing and indigenizing 'sustainable development' 2020 (Andrea M Vasquez-Fernandez and Cash Ahenakew pii tai poo taa)	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1687	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	Respecto a la sustentabilidad incluir definiciones de sustentabilidad fuerte sustentabilidad débil con ejemplos.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1688	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Como podemos incluir el tema de sostenibilidad del paisaje. ¿Que queremos sostener el tiempo? los principios de la sostenibilidad del paisaje (Redondo et al., 2019) son la multifuncionalidad de los paisajes, la productividad de los mismos para mantener el bienestar a largo plazo (en el tiempo). Sección de conceptos introductorios. (Redondo, J. M., Bustamante-Zamudio, C., Amador-Moncada, J., & Hernandez-Manrique, O. L. (2019, November). Landscape sustainability analysis: Methodological approach from dynamical systems. In Journal of	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1689	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Esta es una observacion menor pero para asegurar que hay uniformidad con respecto a la presentacion: Make sure that all sections follow the same structure in terms of sub-headings, e.g. 5.3 outlines research questions, 5.2. doesn't.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1690	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Como ponderamos las visiones, muchas veces entra el criterio de los cuantos, a cuantas estoy afectando, cuanto poder tienen estas personas?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1691	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605	614	Sobre las preguntas se consideran complejas y difíciles de contestar, algunos integrantes de la sala consideran que por la pluralidad de visiones, lo deseable e indeseable del futuro	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1692	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605	614	Algunos valores pueden ser muy deseables, pero no son alcanzables por las comunidades	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1693	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Que podemos entender por sostenibilidad? cada una es distinta para cada región.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1694	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605	614	No está mal que se acepten diferentes tipos de sostenibilidades ni distintos tipos de valoración, diferentes contextos geográficos, medios de vida. Pluralidad que debe regir estos valores de sostenibilidad	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1695	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605	614	¿En función de qué criterios se pondera el poder de influencia de ciertos actores para definir una sostenibilidad "deseable o no deseable"?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1696	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Se debe integrar esta visión de gobernanza entre las diferencias para poder entender que los indicadores de sostenibilidad deben incluir los medios de vida y los aspectos biofísicos locales que influyen en las posibilidades de sostenibilidad local para escalarlo a lo global	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1697	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Crear una línea base de cómo los documentos académicos abordan la percepción de sostenibilidad desde lo local. Esta documentación servirá de base para vincular la sostenibilidad local hacia lo global. Siempre debe haber indicadores de cambio (cuantitativo y cualitativo), el enfoque integral y socioecológico dará mayor soporte a las propuestas	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1698	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Los escenarios están contruidos con base en información académica	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1699	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		608	611	Estructura de la pregunta. Sería mejor el ¿cómo encontrar éstos vínculos sobre diferentes tipos de valores de la naturaleza puede	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1700	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		627	629	It is not clear how the systematic review was carried: What keywords were used? We believe that there are a greater number of publications with a socio-ecological vision, since there are journals focused on the socio-ecological issue specifically.	Thank you for your comment. We have made our detailed search criteria available in the Data Management Report. We only assessed works that addressed all of: values, nature, NCPs, and quality of life. This criterium elaborated the vast majority of existing works.
1701	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		Enfoque socioecológico reducido en la gráfica. A partir de diferentes relaciones podríamos entender lo que queremos para la sostenibilidad. Necesidad de incorporar dinamismo y cambio de paisajes.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1702	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Enfoque socioecológico en los tipos de escenarios encontrados es muy poco, que queremos de sostenibilidad a escala de paisaje	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1703	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		La gráfica nos lleva a análisis que no corresponden. Deberían enfocarse en la fluctuación en el tiempo de cada uno de los enfoques. Sería más interesante ver las tendencias de cambio en el tiempo. El enfoque socioecológico va en aumento en el tiempo. Algunos discursos, enfoques o términos tienen más arraigo en el público. No sólo considerar lo que es bueno para la academia sino como se pueden comunicar las cosas	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1704	Jeancarlo Sánchez	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Como fluctua en el tiempo, el enfoque socioecológico es reciente? hay tendencias en el tiempo? como esta palabra es nueva	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1705	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Trabajo en Chiapas naturaleza-sistemas pecuarios, comunicación silvopastoriles es algo nuevo? MUCHAS COSAS QUE NO SE REFLEJAN EN EL PAISAJE CAMBIAN EN EL IMAGINARIO	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1706	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Foco socioecologico, explica mejor como es posible diferenciarlo de los analisis de escenario en donde se considera la interacción con el espacio natural. Todos los escenarios deberian considerar las dos esferas, no es posible pensar un escenario social sin pensar en el escenario ecologico	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1707	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					La inclusión de la sostenibilidad ambiental en el contexto urbano es muy importante porque las ciudades tienen un modelo de expansión periférica que absorbe nuevos territorios y prioriza la pavimentación e infraestructura industrial que difícilmente cumple con las normativas regulatorias en el ámbito ambiental y de soporte de la vida silvestre y humana. El mayor porcentaje de densidad poblacional se encuentra en las ciudades y serán las más vulnerables ante el cambio climático si no se considera una visión de resiliencia ambiental	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1708	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Algunos enfoques surgen en determinados momentos como un boom. Debido al impacto de los medios de comunicación. ¿cómo hacer visibles las visiones de diferentes productores? ¿cómo hacerlas confluir y políticamente generar fortalezas? Se hacen alarde de cosas que no existen. Debería existir una visión conjunta con indicadores	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1709	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642			Explicar a qué se refieren de manera específica cuando se habla de Future Focus	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1710	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Impacto del concepto silvopastoril. Existe un enfoque local y un enfoque empresarial, pero se desestiman relaciones de poder.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1711	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		700			También consideremos como se modifica el futuro en el tiempo, esta sería otra división de tiempo	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1712	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		720			Cambio de uso del suelo para el tema de construcción, esta tiene alta incidencia en las políticas y futuros de una ciudad. Se genera un bienestar pero con trade off	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1713	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Sobre como la academia no se menciona como un stakeholder	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1714	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Ademas de la escala geografica deberiamos escribir una escala temporal, a donde estan apuntando los futuros? Si hablamos del potencial de transformación como se ve en tiempo?	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1715	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Como incluimos ecosistemas urbanos, no es muy claro en el capitulo	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1716	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Sobre los centros urbanos la mayoría de la población esta en estas zonas, esta incluido su escenario en este analisis.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1717	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			Falta incluir la academia como future stakeholders. Donde estan estas contribuciones? En México no todos los gobiernos apoyan a la academia de manera declarada.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1718	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Debería hacer un énfasis más profundo en la temporalidad de las gráficas, para que se diferencie de otros capítulos que no hablan de futuro. Incluir además lecturas de conflictos socioambientales y de contextos regionales	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1719	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Incluir la cobertura forestal urbana y los contextos de cambio de estos ecosistemas. Alta presencia de exóticas y sus efectos ecológicos y económicos. Evaluar indicadores sobre coberturas forestales urbanas y su relación con el cambio climático y su influencia en la vulnerabilidad de las poblaciones urbanas. Es necesario mencionar esto al menos como comentario general	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1720	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Muy poca proporción de estudios de ordenamiento territorial o planes de manejo local con relación a la cantidad de estudios académicos. Los documentos de planes de ordenamiento o de manejo tienen mayor influencia directa en los tomadores de decisión.	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.

1721	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Identificar el papel de los constructores de infraestructura y cómo estas mejoras o efectos negativos se trasladan a los stakeholders y a los tomadores de decisiones	This comment has been translated to english to be addressed by experts. You will find responses in the english version of the comment.
1722	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		821		915	The narrative summary for the future archetypes is shown unenvely. For the economic optimism scenario, its premises is extensively discribed in topics (Values underpinning the archetype, Political, economic and technological development...). For the other scenarios, the premises are shown in short bullets points. We suggest the adoption of similar presentation for all the future scenarios.	The text has now been shortened and balanced.
1723	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		977		1004	It is not quite clear what the combinations A, B, C refers to. It would be good to illustrate what each combination is build on.	Thank you for this question, we have reworked section 5.2.2.3.2 which articulates that the key value combinations underpinning different archetypal futures based on value focus, i.e. the level of priority given to existing IPBES conceptual framework, particularly nature, nature's contributions to people and good quality of life (Figure 5.10). Which were then coded for by using our review framework (see https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4359655).
1758	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Issues of discounting seem to be missing from the chapter.	A paragraph on discounting is included in the green economy pathway.
1759	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The climate change literature is all about the future, it might be worth looking into studies on future thinking in there involving economics and values.	Thank for the comment. The IPCC deals extensively with these issues. This assessment is focused on vaues and nature. Where climate change literature has incorporated these core issues it has been included.
1760	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There are some confusions between 'economics' and 'finance' that need to be distinguished.	In the revised version of the green economy pathway, the term "finance" does not appear.
1761	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter would benefit from adding continuity to the initial analysis on futures throughout the chapter. Currently this is absent.	The new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
1762	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter states that transformational change is not possible through green growth because it is in the market paradigm, but this affirmation is not true, market based instuments have allowed to achieve transformations.	In a revised section 5.5 we treat teh 'green economy' incorporating market reforms as one pathway to transformative change

1763	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter would benefit from a description of what futures work is	We agree and performed changes in accordance to the reviewer suggestion.
1764	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The chapter would benefit from linking key issues, such as partnerships for transformation, with the concept of 'resilience' and "cooperation", which are key for transformation.	Thank you for this suggestion. Unfortunately at this late stage and given the available expertise we cannot delve very deeply into linking the issue of partnerships for transformation with the concept of resilience.
1792	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					The issue of scale speaks to what Ian B was talking about in relation to Nat cap approaches. That is relevant for the big picture, macro performance. not project decisions.	Thank you for your observation. We have indeed considered the geographic and temporal scale as important aspects of the future scenarios.
1793	Brooks Kaiser	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					There is also the special issue in ERE and I think one coming in JEEM? (re covid)	Thank you, without requesting a specific reference to be included it is hard to include a reference from this SI in this assessment
1794	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Disasters as an opportunity for improved environmental conditions : https://science.sciencemag.org/content/369/6502/379 https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2212420919305904 also useful, ecology, economics and pandemics :-)	Thank you for the suggestion. One of the links was broken; the other did not meet our criteria for inclusion (see line 642-645).
1795	Michaela Faccioli	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Yes, agree with the point about nat cap accounting and scale - I've recently worked on a natural capital accounting exercise at landscape scale that has showed (unexpectedly) that this method at a finer scale is quite challenging to implement and therefore the results can be only of limited usefulness/informativeness for policy-makers	Thanks for this valuable comment.
1796	Ben Balmford	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					We also have a paper on the parallels of Covid and climate change/biodiversity crises and the need for early intervention in all cases https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0960982220309362	Sorry it is not clear what is meant here, and there is no reference or explanation provided.
1801	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					to balance the chapter a review of the positive cases of transformational change within the green market paradigm, should be included.	We did our best to present positive cases. However, this necessarily remains somewhat piecemeal, as there is no case of a fully green economy that we could refer to. We clarify this in the revised text.

1802	Ben Groom	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					R&D could be a good area to think about, and it's relation to market. Although technological changes are seen across the assessment in contradictory manners, both as valuable asset or not necessarily a good thing.	Thank you for highlighting this point, many sections have highlighted the benefits and burdens of technology towards sustainability and justice
1803	Julia Touza	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Transformational change based on cooperation, use examples from game theory.	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed.
1806	Brooks Kaiser	Individual	Workshop - BIOECON Network	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Here are some overlooked pieces that reflect the way in which economists have engaged with different sources of value and tried to connect the science with policy in different natural resource management contexts ranging from Hawaii to the Arctic. The Assessment did not provide a nuanced account of how economic and other values can be brought together in a scientific and collaborative way to inform policy: Science and Policy Connectivity: Environmental Valuation and the Hawaiian Economy. The long-term research agendas	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
1857	Eirini Saratsi	Individual	University of Reading, UK	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	47		58		Box 5.3 nad 5.4 contain a lot of important information and points. Unfortunately I made aware of this review process last minute and I had no time to list here detailed comments. My point is that art, arts research and artists should be mentioned separately; they are not all the same and do not impact decisions and research about the environment on the same levels. Arts are not just a mechanism of communicating meanings and engaging people in order to express their values. Arts create values. See The diverse impacts of arts	We have made significant changes in the chapter, and have reworked these sections substantially. Separating this out was considered and felt to not be appropriate.
1870	Fatima Manji	Government	UK	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	5	159	5	163	It would be useful to provide examples of what transformative change might entail in practice.	Thank you for the suggestion. Examples of transformative changes in practice are given throughout the chapter, such as shifts in energy systems.
1871	Fatima Manji	Government	UK	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	6	202	6	204	It would be useful to provide examples of what these behaviour change interventions might be.	We will include a list of examples. In fact the whole section 5.3.4 is dedicated to mobilising values to enable individual behaviour change for sustainability transformations.
1898	Technical support unit on knowledge and data	Organisation	TSU Knowledge and Data	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable	26	720	26	722	Figure 5.3 viii) please change into a table for clarity and include what the blue and red box highlights indicate in caption	Thanks. We considered your suggestion when re-drawing the figure.
2006	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	The Brundtland is important but this paragraph attributes to it the emergence of social justice goals. I think that prior to 1987 there have been others that have brought social justice to the core of environmental concerns, e.g., Robert Bullard (environmental justice), comes to mind but I'm sure that there are authors from the global South that have touched on this particular notion. Then, expand other references outside of Brundtland, eg. understandings of sustainability from indigenous perspectives, or environmental justice.	The point here is not to claim that the Brundtland Report was the first to raise this issue. It was, however, the first time that a UN body agreed that inter- and intragenerational justice are worthy goals.

2007	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	Resurgence of relationality: reflections on decolonizing and indigenizing 'sustainable development' 2020 (Andrea M Vasquez-Fernandez and Cash Ahenakew pii tai poo taa)	Thank you for this suggestion, we have tried to include it.
2008	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Regarding the concept of sustainability, include definitions of strong sustainability, weak sustainability, with examples.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
2009	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		821		915	The narrative summary for the future archetypes is shown unevenly. For the economic optimism scenario, its premises is extensively discribed in topics (Values underpinning the archetype, Political, economic and technological development...). For the other scenarios, the premises are shown in short bullets points. We suggest the adoption of similar presentation for all the future scenarios.	The text has now been shortened and balanced.
2010	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		977		1004	It is not quite clear what the combinations A, B, C refers to. It would be good to illustrate what each combination is build on.	Thank you for this question, we have reworked section 5.2.2.3.2 which articulates that the key value combinations underpinning different archetypal futures based on value focus, i.e. the level of priority given to existing IPBES conceptual framework, particularly nature, nature's contributions to people and good quality of life (Figure 5.10). Which were then coded for by using our review framework (see https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4359655).
2011	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		40		50	Include the issue of sustainability of the landscape. What do we want to hold over time? the principles of landscape sustainability (Redondo et al., 2019) are the multifunctionality of landscapes, their productivity to maintain long-term well-being (over time). (Redondo, J. M., Bustamante-Zamudio, C., Amador-Moncada, J., & Hernandez-Manrique, O. L. (2019, November). Landscape sustainability analysis: Methodological approach from dynamical systems. In Journal of Physics: Conference Series (Vol. 1414, No. 1, p. 012010). IOP	While the suggested reference was not within the target of our assessment, we recognize the importance of sustainability at multiple scales and have assessed many scenarios that speak to landscape sustainability and implications for nature's contributions to people and good quality of life.
2012	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Make sure that all sections follow the same structure in terms of sub-headings, e.g. 5.3 outlines ressearch questions, 5.2. doesn't.	Fixed. Thanks for pointing this.
2013	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		627		629	It is not clear how the systematic review was carried: What keywords were used? We believe that there are a greater number of publications with a socio-ecological vision, since there are journals focused on the socio-ecological issue specifically.	Thank you for your comment. We have made our detailed search criteria available in the Data Management Report. We only assessed works that addressed all of: values, nature, NCPs, and quality of life. This criterium elaborated the vast majority of existing works.
2014	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					What can we understand by sustainability? each one is different for each region. Different types of sustainability, different types of valuation, different geographical contexts, livelihoods must be accepted. Plurality that should govern these sustainability values	Thank you for this comment, we agree and hope that this need for plurality and diverse values and valuation tools comes out strongly in this chapter, and whole assessment. We have used a definition of sustainability that is broad enough to be grounded in local contexts but encompasses notions of equity/justice which we feel are foundational to sustainability everywhere (see section 5.1.2.2)

2015	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	The questions are considered complex and difficult to answer, some members of the room consider that due to the plurality of visions, the desirable and undesirable of the future	Thanks for your comment, the questions were refined following suggestions.
2016	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	Some values may be very desirable, but are not achievable by communities	We do not dispute this; our objective was to indicate the values associated with (e.g. desirable) futures, not to assess whether they were achievable.
2017	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	As we weigh the visions, many times the criterion of how many enters, how many am I affecting, how much power do these people have?	Thanks for your comment, however this goes beyond the scope of the chapter. You can find more details regarding power in Chapter 4 of the assessment.
2018	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	Based on what criteria is the power of influence of certain actors weighed to define "desirable or undesirable" sustainability?	Thanks for your suggestion. The new structure provides a reference and a clearer explanation.
2019	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	The governance vision of different actors must be integrated in order to understand which sustainability indicators should be included. Consider local livelihoods and biophysical issues that influence local sustainability possibilities, then scale globally	Thanks for your comment. We do not provide the same examples, but the need to include plural visions and values in governance processes is precisely the point we make in the assessment.
2020	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		605		614	Create a baseline of academic documents that address sustainability from the local level. This documentation will serve as the basis for linking local sustainability to the global. There must always be indicators of change (quantitative and qualitative), the comprehensive and socio-ecological approach will give greater support to the proposals.	Thank you for the suggestion, but this would require an additional review process which is not possible at this time.
2021	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		608		611	Structure of the question, it would be better: how to find these links on different different types of values of nature can ...?	Thank you for the comment. Unfortunately we struggled to understand what you were suggesting but have refined our questions.
2022	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642			Reduced socio-ecological focus in the graph. From different relationships we could understand what we want for sustainability. Need to incorporate dynamism and change of landscapes.	Unfortunately we had difficulty understanding your comment (it was unclear which graph it referred to).

2023	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		Socio-ecological approach in the types of scenarios found is very little, we want sustainability at a landscape scale	Unfortunately we had difficulty understanding your comment. We did consider the scale of the scenarios (many of which were local-scaled, and of sustainable archetypes).
2024	Jeancarlo Sánchez	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		The graph should focus on the fluctuation over time of each of the approaches. It would be interesting to see the changing trends over time. The socio-ecological approach is increasing over time? Some speeches, approaches or terms have more roots in the public? Not only consider what is good for the academy but how things can be communicated	Thanks for the comment! Unfortunately, we could only include data here for our review sample as we do not have data for other time slices.
2025	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		Some things that change in the imaginary, but are not reflected in space. We must consider how this is included. Cases in Chiapas.	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
2026	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		Socio-ecological focus, explain how it differs from the scenario analyzes that consider the interaction with the natural space. All scenarios consider the two spheres (biophysical space and social aspects) it is not possible to think of a social scenario without thinking about the ecological scenario	Thank you for this comment, your comment is in line with the IPBES conceptual framework which views systems as coupled social-ecological systems. Some scenarios use a more linear approach looking only at the impact or people on nature, or nature on people and we wanted to foreground the importance of a more integrated approach.
2027	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				The inclusion of environmental sustainability in the urban context is very important, cities have a peripheral expansion model that absorbs new territories and prioritizes paving and industrial infrastructure. This hardly complies with regulatory standards in the environmental field and support of wildlife and human life. The highest percentage of population density is found in cities and they will be the most vulnerable to climate change if a vision of environmental resilience is not considered.	Thank you for this comment given the impacts of rapid urbanisation. We included "urban" as an ecosystem domain in section 5.2 and found a marked lack of futures works from urban systems. We have now highlighted this as an additional gap
2028	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Some approaches emerge at certain times as a boom. How to make the visions of different producers visible? How to make them converge and politically generate strengths? There should be a joint vision with indicators	Thank you for this comment, it is however beyond the scope of this assessment but will hopefully be explored in more detail in the transformations assessment
2029	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		642		Explain what they mean when talking about Future Focus. All scenarios are future, right?	Indeed. However, the indicated line did not address "Future Focus." Our updated text does not use this phrase.
2030	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		700		Consider how the future is modified in time, this would be another division of time	Thank you for this comment, we could only assess what was documented in the literature/ futures works, however your comment is useful for thinking about how transformations might unfold and how modifications to systems are "fed-back" into the system, and in turn can shape future outcomes.

2031	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		720			Why the academy is not a stakeholder	Thank you for this question, we included the academy/ researchers in a number of different ways in assessing evidence in 5.2. We captured whether researchers/the academy were behind the development of the scenario, and there was an option to capture researchers/academic institutions under the "individual" review category, or as "other" in the stakeholder category. Researchers/the academy were behind 25% of the scenarios developed that we assessed, but did not come out significantly as a stakeholder group.
2032	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Are urban ecosystems included? It is not very clear in the chapter	Thank you for this comment given the impacts of rapid urbanisation. We included "urban" as an ecosystem domain in section 5.2 and found a marked lack of futures works from urban systems. We have now highlighted this as an additional gap
2033	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Regarding urban centers, most of the population is in these areas. Is their scenario included in this analysis?	Thank you for this comment given the impacts of rapid urbanisation. We included "urban" as an ecosystem domain in section 5.2 and found a marked lack of futures works from urban systems. We have now highlighted this as an additional gap
2034	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			It remains to include academia as future stakeholders. Where are these contributions? In Mexico, not all governments support academia in a declared way.	Thank you very much for the suggestion, but a suggested reference would have been needed.
2035	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			Include urban forest cover and the contexts of change of these ecosystems. High presence of exotic species and their ecological and economic effects. Evaluate indicators on urban forest cover, its relationship with climate change and its influence on the vulnerability of urban populations. It is necessary to mention this at least as a general comment	Thank you for this comment, we included urban as an ecosystem domain in section 5.2 but there were only a few futures worked which were categorised as urban- we have reflected on this as a gap.
2036	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			Very little proportion of studies of land use planning or local management plans in relation to the number of academic studies. Management or management plan documents have the greatest direct influence on decision makers.	Thank you for this observation. We have integrated a review of grey literature in our final analysis, although our criteria (see Line 642-645) made it difficult to include very many.
2037	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		721			Identify the role of infrastructure builders and how these improvements or negative effects are transferred to stakeholders and decision makers	We do not understand what the reviewer means here.
2038	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable		720			The scenario analysis should include the temporalities found in the literature review. A future scenario is only thought of in time ranges that must be clear in the text.	Our literature review considered the time span of each scenario, although this aspect was not utilized in our final analysis.

2039	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					In addition to the geographic scale, we should write a timescale. If we talk about the transformation potential as seen in time?	Thank you it is a really interesting suggestion. However we have been limited by the content of the reviewed works which are rather imprecise on timescales.
2040	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					As it fluctuates over time, is the socio-ecological approach recent? are there trends over time? as this word is new	Concepts were refined, however there is no clear page or line to which the comment refers to.
2041	ESP-LAC	Individual	Workshop - ESP (LAC)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					How do we include urban ecosystems? It is not very clear in the chapter	Thank you for this comment given the impacts of rapid urbanisation. We included "urban" as an ecosystem domain in section 5.2 and found a marked lack of futures works from urban systems. We have now highlighted this as an additional gap
2160	Johannes Langemeyer	Individual	Workshop - ESP (ECA)	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					A comment regarding value creation for transformation: how do values shape up and how can they be influenced? The digital sphere of value creation has been widely ignored, while virtual communities must be assumed to be one of the core arenas for value creation /shaping nowadays (-> Calcagni et al., 2019)	That is a good point, thank you, we looked into it.
2192	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					I would question the idea of 'better' or 'more' just and sustainable futures across the report in contraposition to ILK knowledge and philosophies reflected in the assessment. For many indigenous cultures the idea of 'more' and 'better' is exactly the problem that has led to the current nature crises. For some indigenous philosophies like 'buen vivir' the idea of a linear and improved future of the western society is contested by the recognition of a more cyclical understanding of the contexts were they experience life and the objective is to 'live well' not	True, the idea of progress is one of Western modernity and could be seen as partly responsible for the ecological crisis. On the other hand, if we did not believe that a better world than the one we currently have was possible, why would we even write such a report for policy makers? That would be a performative self-contradiction.
2194	Sarai González	Organisation	La Ceiba S.C	Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Suggested ref on Transformation Folke, C., Polasky, S., Rockström, J. et al. Our future in the Anthropocene biosphere. <i>Ambio</i> 50, 834–869 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1007/s13280-021-01544-8	Thank you for this reference
2385	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					Please check if the scenario planning is the correct term to describe the message here. Scenario planning is a different from scenario analysis and I presume scenario analysis more suitable than scenario planning in this context. Scenario planning is a kind of strategic planning that utilizes a scenario analysis in the planning process, which is beyond the work done by the past, large scale environmental assessment, and seldomly used in the formulation of administrative planning by governments.	Thank you, we have broadened this to be about both scenario planning and analysis in our executive summary and explanatory text in 5.2
2386	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable					relation values -> relational values?	Thanks for the comment, this change has been made

2387	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				I am very much concerned about the use of "futures" or "futures work" across the chapter in describing the findings related mostly to the future "scenarios", which is not a standard IPBES terminology that previous and ongoing assessment follows. This could cause confusions among readers whether the text describes about future scenarios or not. It seems the what is described as "futures work" in this chapter mostly follows the definition of future scenarios and thus does not have to be differentiated from future scenarios: in this chapter, I	Thank you for this comment and reminder to keep definitions between assessments as aligned as possible. We originally only used the term future scenario in line with the IPBES definitions, but given the approach of including an assessment of various types of futures works e.g. arts-based/ creative visions or futures in addition to peer-reviewed future scenarios we decided to broaden the description. We have provided more explanation for using futures works in section 5.2. which now states: Futures works are therefore seen to
2388	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				the land degradation and restoration assessment as well as the methodological assessment on scenarios and models are missing in this text. The scenario archetypes used in this chapter was first introduced in the methodological assessment on scenarios and models before it was used by the Global Assessment.	Thank you for your comment, the reference was updated following your suggestion.
2389	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				I am very much concerned about the use of "futures" or "futures work" across the chapter in describing the findings related mostly to the future "scenarios", which is not a standard IPBES terminology that previous and ongoing assessment follows. This could cause confusions among readers whether the text describes about future scenarios or not. It seems the what is described as "futures work" in this chapter mostly follows the definition of future scenarios and thus does not have to be differentiated from future scenarios: in this chapter, I	Thanks for the comment! We use this terminology to address some of the previous review comments that using the term "scenarios" is discriminatory to other types of capturing potential futures. We now explain this in section 5.2.: "Futures works are therefore seen to incorporate 581 any form of evidence, including peer-reviewed or grey literature, arts-based or material from 582 indigenous and local knowledge that is future-orientated including future visions and scenarios."
2390	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				now this definition is recognized as IPBES glossary and thus I would recommend referring to IPBES terminology rather than the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment (https://www.ipbes.net/glossary?%5B0%5D=glossary_title_initials%3AS) to show the definition is following the standard IPBES definition. Following the IPBES definition is important in the adoption of the assessment report as the new terminology, if weakly defined, can be easily challenged by the member states.	Thank you for the suggestion, we've considered the evidence based on the review process that was followed for our chapter.
2391	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Please explain how the classification of the papers following the categories presented in this figure (e.g. future focus, nature focus, NCP focus, etc) was made in the assessment process. Please explain how the figure 5.1 was created based on systematic literature search by showing the keywords and time frame (publication years) used in the search, which is missing in this section.	Further details regarding this can be found in the following Data Management Report: Systematic review of association between values of nature, nature's contributions to people and good quality of life and futures in scenarios, visions and pathways (https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4359655).
2392	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				For figure 5.2, I would suggest referring to "O. Saito, C. Kamiyama, S. Hashimoto, T. Matsui, K. Shoyama, K. Kabaya, T. Uetake, H. Taki, Y. Ishikawa, K. Matsushita, F. Yamane, J. Hori, T. Ariga, K. Takeuchi (2019) Co-design of national-scale future scenarios in Japan to predict and assess natural capital and ecosystem services. Sustainability Science, 14-1, p.5-21." and "Hashimoto, S. et al., What are the futures of satoyama and satoumi? In Duraipappa et al (eds). Satoyama-Satoumi Ecosystems and Human Well-Being: Socio-Ecological Production	Thank you for the suggestions. Both references have been picked up by our review and their scenarios have been included in our analysis.
2393	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				It seems better to explain how "pathways" are distinguished from others (such as exploratory scenarios and target seeking scenarios) as information of "pathways" is often contained in "scenarios".	Thank you for your comment, the new structure of the chapter hopefully makes this clearer.
2394	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable				Please provide more explanation about how the value justification was extracted from the existing scenarios for clearer understandings. In many cases, the values are implicitly embedded and not clearly stated in the existing scenarios. So, the explanation about the process of how (implicit) values were extracted from existing scenarios are important to make this part more convincing and evidence based.	Thanks! We have clarified that we coded the scenarios based on the definitions of different types of values (foci, justifications, etc.) as defined in Chapter 2 in section 5.2.1 and in the data management report.

2395	Shizuka Hashimoto	MEP		Chapter 5. Incorporating multiple values of nature and nature's contributions to people for just and sustainable						This section is filled with boxed articles and not main text, which looks very odd and should be reformulated. Also, please consider sharing the rule for boxed articles (e.g. type of information to be captured in the boxed article) across the chapters.	Thanks for your comment, we've considered your suggestion, however due to significant changes in the chapter, it might be the case that the edits are no longer reflected in the final version of the chapter.
------	-------------------	-----	--	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--